



RESULTS REPORT 2012

SUPPORT TO TECHNICAL & VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING IN PALESTINE



ACRONYMS	3
1 INTERVENTION AT A GLANCE.....	4
1.1 PROJECT FORM	4
1.2 PROJECT PERFORMANCE.....	4
1.3 BUDGET EXECUTION	5
1.4 SUMMARY	5
2 ANALYSIS OF THE INTERVENTION.....	6
2.1 CONTEXT.....	6
2.1.1 <i>General context</i>	6
2.1.2 <i>Institutional context</i>	7
2.1.3 <i>Management context: execution modalities</i>	7
2.1.4 <i>Harmo-context</i>	8
2.2 OUTCOME.....	8
2.2.1 <i>Analysis of progress made</i>	8
2.2.2 <i>Risk management</i>	11
2.2.3 <i>Potential Impact</i>	13
2.2.4 <i>Quality criteria</i>	14
2.3 OUTPUT 1	17
2.3.1 <i>Analysis of progress made</i>	17
2.3.2 <i>Budget execution</i>	19
2.3.3 <i>Quality criteria</i>	19
2.4 OUTPUT 2.....	20
2.4.1 <i>Analysis of progress made</i>	20
2.4.2 <i>Budget execution</i>	21
2.4.3 <i>Quality criteria</i>	22
2.5 OUTPUT 3.....	23
2.5.1 <i>Analysis of progress made</i>	23
2.5.2 <i>Budget execution</i>	25
2.5.3 <i>Quality criteria</i>	25
2.6 OUTPUT 4.....	26
2.6.1 <i>Analysis of progress made</i>	26
2.6.2 <i>Budget execution</i>	27
2.6.3 <i>Quality criteria</i>	28
3 TRANSVERSAL THEMES.....	29
3.1 GENDER	29
3.2 ENVIRONMENT.....	30
3.3 OTHER.....	30
4 STEERING AND LEARNING.....	31
4.1 ACTION PLAN	31
4.2 LESSONS LEARNED.....	32
5 ANNEXES	34
5.1 ORIGINAL LOGICAL FRAMEWORK.....	34
5.2 UPDATED LOGICAL FRAMEWORK	36
5.3 MORE RESULTS AT A GLANCE	39
5.4 “BUDGET VERSUS CURENT (Y – M)” REPORT	39
5.5 RESOURCES.....	39
5.6 DECISIONS TAKEN BY THE JLCB AND FOLLOW-UP	41

Acronyms

AOC	Arab Occupational Classification
BTC	Belgian Development Agency
CCI	Chamber of Commerce and Industry
EU	European Union
EUR	Euro (European Currency)
GIZ	German Technical Assistance (Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit)
GU	Gender Units in MoE and MoL
ILO	International Labour Organization
ISS	Industrial Secondary School
JLCB	Joint Local Consultative Body
KAB	Know About Business
LMIS	Labour Market Information System
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MoE	Ministry of Education
MoEHE	Ministry of Education and Higher Education
MoHE	Ministry of Higher Education
MoL	Ministry of Labour
MoP	Ministry of Planning
NA	National Advisor
NGO-VET League	League of Non-Governmental Organizations providing Vocational Education and Training
oPt	Occupied Palestinian Territories
PA	Palestinian Authority
PFCCIA	Palestinian Federation of Chambers of Commerce, Industry and Agriculture
PMO	Project Management Office (Project Manager, Assistant, and)
PMS	Project Management System
POC	Palestinian Occupational Classification
PT	Palestinian Territories
SC	Steering Committee
SMCL	Structure Mixte de Concentration locale
TPDC	Technical Program Development Consultant
TNA	Training Needs Assessment
TPD	Training Program Development
TPDC	Training Program Development Consultant
TVET	Technical, Vocational Education and Training
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
VET	Vocational Education and Training
VS	Vocational School
VTC	Vocational Training Center
Welfare Association	Donor organization with headquarters in Geneva
Apprenticeship	Dual system between TVET institutions and private sector& Labour market

1 Intervention at a glance

1.1 Project form

Project Name	Support to TVET in Palestine
Project Code	PZA0401311
Location	Palestinian Territories, West Bank and Gaza
Budget	EUR 2.2 million
Partner Institution	BTC MoE, MoHE Mol, CCIs
Date of Implementation Agreement	Specific Agreement for 4 years signed on 27 Oct. 2005,
Duration (months)	48 Months, started on 2009, extended for one year to 2013
Target Groups	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Youth, including women and special emphasis on under privileged people Unemployed people seeking employment opportunities through training Workers and self-employed people requiring further education and training Drop-outs from schools ,colleges and universities
Impact	Sustainable economic diversification and increased income opportunities are generated through the provision of appropriate vocational training
Outcome	Youth and adults are enabled to acquire and update their competences on an equal basis through continuously adapting market-based vocational training programmes in some selected priority fields such as electro-technology and electronics, communications technology, information technology, and business administration.
Outputs	1) Linking training with the labour market
	2) Institutional capacity building
	3) Market-Based Training Program Development
	4) Developing and supporting initiatives of TVET stakeholders

1.2 Project performance

	Efficiency	Effectiveness	Sustainability
Outcome	A	B	B
Output 1	A	A	B
Output 2	A	A	B
Output 3	A	B	B
Output 4	A	B	B

1.3 Budget execution

Total Budget	Expenditure year 2012	Balance	Total Disbursement rate
1, 974,703 Euro	576,034	881,018	55%

Efficiency of the project was enhanced this year and disbursement rate for various activities was higher than planned, although disbursement of certain items were lower than planned due to delays envisaged by first the lengthy administrative procedures of procurement that has to go through the procurement departments of both ministries the MOE and the Ministry of Finance (MOF), and secondly due to the high number of public servants strike days and hence procurement process were delayed and suppliers contracts were not signed. Hence disbursements of items were delayed from Q3 and Q4 2012 to Q1 and Q2 2013

1.4 Summary

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Building the alliance between stakeholders on the local level led by CCI had been effective in implementing labour market-TVET linkages' related activities and in embedding R4 within the structure. Furthermore, the alliance structure was used in other TVET-Labour market linkages projects. <p>Note: R4: ("Developing and Supporting initiatives of TVET Stakeholders" a new result introduced based on MTR)</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Developing the training programs in specified fields through engagement of the private sector in training needs assessment (TNA), Validation and the different committees was important in developing market-relevant training programs, hence adhering to TVET strategy.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The involvement of various stakeholders including TVET public institutes and private enterprises of the labour market in multiple and joint activities has enabled "Attitude Change Process" towards TVET-Labour market linkages and could facilitate future sustainability, possibly outside the scope of the project.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A future element that could contribute to sustainability was in, first maximizing the capacity building of the market-relevant training program development process through involvement of multipliers that enabled training most if not all MOL and MOE VET teachers and trainers in more than 7 trainings, and second through increased activities of TVET-Labour market linkages conducted by stakeholders, with high involvement of teachers and directors of VET institutes.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The project was able during the year to accelerate achievements through various measures and to compensate for the delay encountered and changes MTR carried, yet the remaining year of the project 2013 should concentrate on achieving the outcomes and contributing to the impact, hence outputs as produced training program materials and developed training program process would need endorsing, furthermore the TVET-Labour market linkages would need further systemizing and embedding within the TVET institutes for increased effectiveness and sustainability.

National execution official ¹	BTC execution official ²

¹ Name and Signature

² Name and Signature

2 Analysis of the intervention³

2.1 Context

2.1.1 General context

The deteriorating economic status in the oPt had shed its effects on increasing unemployment and poverty of the population and of youth in particular throughout the years of project implementation, the deadlock of the peace process and the fiscal challenges the PA has faced during the last year has added further burdens to the economic situation of the population, the PA inability to pay salaries for its employees and the increasing PA employees strikes had its negative effect on the economy at large and the project in specific. Such context has affected the project in delaying some of the procurement processes due to the increased strikes. Furthermore the deteriorating economic status had its effect on increased unemployment of youth and VET graduates.

Nevertheless the TVET sector had increased attention from various donors and stakeholders, perceived as one of the tools that could address youth unemployment and increase of youth and women participation in the labour force, in addition to being a tool for economic development through providing the qualified human resources.

Various interventions for implementing the Palestinian TVET elements took place during the last year, with emphasis on aligning TVET with the labour market, various interventions were implemented that addressed TVET through MOL, MOE, MOHE, UNRWA and NGO-VET League, main donors and international partners were EU, GIZ, ILO, USAID and Welfare association.

Interventions were mainly integrating the LMIS, working on the Palestinian Occupational Classification (POC) that is validating the adopted Arab Occupational Classification (AOC) which was developed on the regional level, still under development. Both provided the information and the standardization needed, for developing the training programs in the future, the BTC support to TVET has provided the know-how in this manner, while the developed information and systems will be used for future sustainability.

Meanwhile the USAID support to TVET had multiple elements of support to NGO-VET Leagues institutes, including developing the training programs of six fields, four of which are not targeted by the project, this development provided a pilot for the current work of the project within this element. The other 2 were used as resources for the developed training programs.

The ILO development of Know About Business (KAB) element and integrating it into TVET institutes, saved developing the training programs in this regard and linked the developed life skills to it. While the Welfare support to TVET in Jerusalem has provided apprenticeship opportunities and link of TVET graduates to the labour market.

³ In this document: Impact is a synonym for global objective, Outcome is a synonym for specific objective, output is a synonym for result

2.1.2 Institutional context

The institutional Anchoring starting from the local structures, to the ministerial structure, up until it reaches the multi-stakeholders steering committee is very appropriate for implementing the project activities.

The TVET- labour market local alliances developed by the project in the four targeted governorates, constitute from TVET and labour market institutes, and led by CCIs, were spearheading the implementation of various project activities, and in the forefronts of coordinating national efforts for TVET and other supported projects in the field in their governorates.

The BTC – MoEHE cooperation, MoEHE and CCIs cooperation is very appropriate. Also, the steering committee composition of MOE, MOHE, MOL, MOP, Federation of CCIs and PFI further strengthens the progress of the project. It is considered a national effort towards the progress of all project activities.

Another change in institutional context; is the split in the MOEHE ministry into two ministries, the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Higher Education, as well as the TVET department that were split into two added extra constraints and complexity, nevertheless the MOE continued to be a partner in the project with same Minister acting as the head of the steering committee.

2.1.3 Management context: execution modalities

The Execution Modalities are very appropriate for implementing the project activities. The local committees represent stakeholders at the local level, while steering committee represent stakeholders at the policy level, such modality have its effect on the commitment of different stakeholders to carry out the required activities and lay the foundation for sustainable structure.

At the project management level, the project management is placed within the partner ministry premises, and in direct contact with the ministry and the BTC office in Jerusalem. Both provided the on-going support allowed for smooth operations and immediate solving of rising issues. The new project manager whom was an ex-official in TVET MOE has enabled communications with stakeholders and managing interlinked issues of the project. In addition the accompaniment of the national advisor to management with double roles of strategy and TVET advisor has added value to the modality, moreover the engagement of 2 TPDCs instead of one enabled planned achievement and the facilitation of the training program development through the participation of different stakeholders during the year. The planning meetings carried between PM, NA and BTC office on pivotal times enabled the strategic management of the project, the backstopping missions by the BTC education officer in Brussels has also added reflection on achievements, monitoring of progress and presented an opportunity for reviewing plans. The planning meeting between PM, NA and CCIs has enabled higher participation of the local alliance and the CCIs in project related decision making and have enhanced commitment and ownership.

Moreover the increase capacity in the PM office to include PM assistant and a driver has further enhanced implementation and allowed parallel work to cater for the delay, has enhanced communication and monitoring of implementation by the stakeholders alliance and the committees. The addition of the Technical Advisor for the education projects by the BTC in Dec 2012 is expected to further enable accelerating achievements towards the end of the project.

2.1.4 Harmo-context

The project is implemented in partnership with other actors, on various levels. On the governorates' or area level, the project cooperated highly with private sector and the labour market in different ways, in addition to cooperating with all professional unions within the targeted sectors, as well as the different TVET institutes governed by public, private, NGO and UNRWA. The year of 2012 has marked condensed participatory activities and processes that involved those actors, and enabled TVET institutes as well as the labour market to engage in developing the relevance of TVET, a national goal for TVET strategy and MOE. The project was able this year to upgrade the employers' data and integrate within the national LMIS system, in addition the CCIs websites were developed and linked with the national website, and moreover the conducted TNA was translated to English and published on the national website in Arabic and English and accessed by various stakeholders.

Furthermore; the project activities and results are part of the overall matrix used within the "Informal Donor Coordination Group" for TVET, in which various donors for TVET are part of, within such structure and matrix the Belgium support to TVET in Palestine is identified as the national training programs' development project implemented through systemized TVET-labour market engagement. For TVET national partners (MoL and MoE/HE) the project has set the Palestinian method for training program development in a participatory way, so that whenever other donor is involved in complementary training program development initiative they are referred to the method developed through the Project by the ministries. For the ministry of Labour this is the first market relevant training programs developed for their centers.

2.2 Outcome

2.2.1 Analysis of progress made

Outcome⁴: Youth and adults are enabled to acquire and update their competences on an equal basis through continuously adapting market-based vocational training programmes in some selected priority fields (Electro-technology, Electronics, Communication technology, Information technology, Business administration)						
Indicators⁵	Baseline value⁶ (2006)	Progress year 2010	Progress year 2011	Progress 2012	End Target 2013	Comments⁷
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The (self) employment rate 6 months after graduation in the fields with improved curricula is at least 60 % at the end of the second year, and 75 % at the end of the project (or at least 20% increase over the current employment rates of graduates). 	M:64.3% F: 43.2%		M: 90% F: 67% (source TNA)	M: 90% F: 67% (source TNA)	60% overall (M&F)	Baseline is based on 2006 study. National partners, do not have tracing system for graduates, A tracer study will be conducted in Q3 for the pilot group, 3 months after their graduation.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> At least 30 % of the learners in the selected specialisations are girls. 			4specializations out of 5 have women, less than 20% women	43%*	30%	Furthermore to achievements, It is expected that the addition of the new fields will introduce more women on the long run (beyond project) ,
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> At. Least 20% of Employer are better satisfied with trainees/ graduates competencies of the developed training programs 				Estimated 50%	60%	The estimated amount is based on verbal assessment of supported internships, apprenticeships by the program, The first pilot group would graduate in June 2013 employer satisfaction survey will be conducted in Q3 to measure this indicator.

⁴ Use the formulation of the outcome as mentioned in the logical framework (DTF) or the last version of the logical framework that was validated by the JLCB.

⁵ Use the indicators as shown in the logical framework

⁶ The value of the indicator at time 0. Refers to the value of the indicators at the beginning of the intervention

⁷ Comments about progress realised, namely assessment of the achieved value of the indicator at the end of year N compared to the "baseline" values (time 0) and/or the value of the preceding year, and compared to the expected intermediate value for year N. If the intermediate value is not available, the end target will be the reference. Comments should be limited to a minimum.

* Percentage of girls in the 5 piloted fields, female trainees is only present in 2 of the 5 fields women constitute around 20% in the 5 priority fields.

<p>Analysis of progress made towards outcome: Analyse the dynamics between the outputs achieved and the likely achievement of the Outcome:</p>	
<p><i>Relation between outputs and the Outcome. (How) Are outputs (still) contributing to the achievement of the outcome:</i></p>	<p>Firstly; establishing the stakeholder alliances at the local level in the four geographic areas led by the CCIs (R1) has constructed the base for conducting various TVET-Labour market linkage activities that is linked to all results in the project, leading to achievement of the outcome.</p> <p>Secondly; conducting the training needs assessment, which identified market relevant fields followed by the development of training programs in 15 market relevant fields within the priority sectors, in addition to enhancing TVET-Labour market linkages and capacities of TVET teachers/trainers and directors (R2&R3) would enable achieving the outcome of: <u>youth and adults acquire and update their competences on an equal basis through continuously adapting market-based vocational training programmes in some selected priority fields</u> . The identification of the new fields in the priority area and development of their programs would enable higher participation of women in the priority fields hoping to narrow the gender gaps in the field and allow equal access, hence contributing to the outcome.</p> <p>Lastly, R4 which supports TVET-Labour market initiatives would add to the achievements of the outcome, as it was carefully designed to contribute to the specific objectives and indicators.</p>
<p><i>Progress made towards the achievement of the outcome (on the basis of indicators):</i></p>	<p>The development of the market relevant training programs based on the assessed needs of the labour market is expected to lead to increasing employment of youth, as the conducted TNA revealed that one main reason for unemployment are the non-relevancy of skills to the market needs in addition to the limited job opportunities in their areas, within same regard employers mentioned that presence of qualified labour force in the identified skills would encourage them to enlarge their work or open branches in other areas. Moreover, although women VET graduates in the priority sector are 16% of the labour force, the demand for employing female VET graduates was much higher. In addition; the support for apprenticeship and internships conducted through R1 by the program was essential as one of the findings from the labour market whom were not employing graduates is the lack of real life experience, results indicated employment of the trained within the market graduates within same place of employment.</p> <p>Although it is evident that the output will contribute to achievement of the outcome, yet the progress is still beyond that planed due to the delay in starting the project and the time span needed for the effects to be realized, as an example the first group of graduates from the piloted training would be due this summer, hence indicators measuring their employment rates, employer satisfaction or increase in participation of women would need at least one more year, compensating for the delay in starting the program due to various political and structural reasons. Nevertheless it will be measured 3 months after graduation in Q3 so as an indication of the achievement is provided.</p>
<p><i>Issues that arose, influencing factors (positive or negative):</i></p>	<p>The delay in starting the program has affected negatively on realizing the outcomes within the life span of the project, yet it will be realized a year later, as evident from results achieved and preliminary indication of realizing the outcomes. However; the one year extension for 2013 would enable finalizing planned activities and start of realizing of the effects.</p> <p>Various measures were taken in various pivotal periods of the projects to accelerate the process and compensate for the delay, including contracting 2 TPDCs instead of 1, and introducing multipliers in most of the trainings.</p> <p>The link between equipment and implementing the training encouraged MOE and MOL to commit to piloting the developed training. Moreover, MOL were in desperate need for a structured market relevant curricula and training programs, such need has encouraged them to adopt part of the developed programs in their existing training in all the 8 VTCs they are supervising, and once they receive the equipment, they would adopt and implement more trainings.</p>

Unexpected results:

The addition of result 4, which was suggested in MTR, and then conceptualized and planned at the beginning of the year with the approval of the JLCB, would strengthen outcome achievement without deviation, the set criteria and selected projects accordingly would lead to increased employment opportunities for youth, increased access for women into TVET and to increased TVET-Labour market linkages.

Matching with other donors initiatives has increased the achievements, where the program has developed the data base for the LMIS system (supported by the GIZ), and has enabled the regionally trained trainers on methods of learning and teaching to deliver the training for 240 VET trainers and teachers.

The implementation of various VET projects with elements on review of curricula and upgrading training programs using the same developed methodology and trained staff added to the value of the project and would add to sustainability of the project.

The CCIs and the local stakeholder alliance developed dynamics through the project of VET-labour market linkages was able to use such developed dynamics in other outputs as implementing R4, and is also considered an address for VET-labour market relations at the local level by other donors and actors in TVET sector, same structure is currently implementing other projects as Jerusalem case, paving the way towards its sustainability.

2.2.2 Risk management

Risk Identification			Risk analysis			Risk Treatment			Follow-up of risks	
Description of Risk	Period of identification	Risk category	Probability	Potential Impact	Total	Action(s)	Resp.	Deadline	Progress	Status
<p>The instability in the political status of the oPt, with deadlock in the peace process and the daily measures carried by Israeli occupation on the PA and the Palestinians in oPt, such measures has its effects on mobility restrictions and high probability of isolations of areas. The status also affected resources for the PA and payment of salaries for civil servants employees, and hence raised the number of strike days by the employees including TVET staff and teachers. Such status disturbs the capacity building activities for teachers and the TVET labour market activities.in addition to the economic deterioration that affects employment of graduates, hence could jeopardize the achievement of the outcome</p>	TFF, TNA study and monitoring results	Political and Economic Situation	Medium	Low	A	The initial planning of the project and following activities has empowered the local structures lead by local CCIs.			Local Structures capacities are built and CCIs empowered	Ongoing monitoring and re-planning of activities
						Re-planning and rescheduling of activities to avoid effects of closures, and strikes. In addition the local conduction of training through multipliers have reduced mobility restrictions effects.	PM	Ongoing till Q3 2013	Various activities were rescheduled and relocated to avoid the political status implications.	
						To reduce the effect of unemployment on VET graduates, the project supported internships and apprenticeships of TVET targeted students, and would target in 2013 graduates from the piloted fields which could lead to increasing potential of graduates employment.	PM, and CCI	Q2 2013	In 2012 this action was piloted for current students in TVET: for 60 apprenticeship students from MOE and 240 MOL students for internships, 40% of graduates and 20% found employment in same economic establishment they trained in. In 2013 the pilot groups would be supported.	
						Ongoing monitoring of overall status and preparing contingency plans	PM and NA	Q3 2013	Monitoring of status took place during the year, new contingency plan needs to be prepared	
<p>The absence of the unified national body for VET, and changes in policy level, such as the separation of the ministry MOEHE into MOE and MOHE, shifts TVET decision making into non-TVET professionals affected by the societal negative attitude towards TVET and hence would jeopardize TVET achievement on the one hand, in addition to piling complexity and inefficiency in dealing with the different bodies of the ministries.</p>	TFF, implementation and monitoring results	Operational	Medium	Medium	B	The investment linkages to piloting was set in close interactions with stakeholders MOE, MOL	PM	Q3 2013	MOL and MOE are committed to start the piloting, MOE will implement in the non-formal tracks of VET in 2013, and MOL started implementing in 2012	MOL is piloting
						Involvement of Curricula Development center at MOE in the implementation, M&E and build their capacities	PM	Q3 2013	They have participated in developing the market relevant training programs in 2011/2012 and would participate in M&E in 2013	Part of the action plan for 2013
						Developing a manual guide for developing the TVET training programs according to the agreed and used one and endorsing it by SC for future national effort of accreditation	PM	Q3 2013	Trainers' manual has part of the process documented	in progress

Risk Identification			Risk analysis			Risk Treatment			Follow-up of risks	
Description of Risk	Period of identification	Risk category	Probability	Potential Impact	Total	Action(s)	Resp .	Deadline	Progress	Status
<p>The weak status of VET in the society and its effect on the policy level at MOE, and hence their future commitment to adopt the developed training programs, which was developed in partnership with the labour market.</p>	<p>Implementation and results monitoring</p>	<p>Cultural and Attitude Related to TVET</p>	<p>Medium</p>	<p>Medium</p>	<p>B</p>	<p>Publish and use received info from the labour market and TVET and use to advocate</p>	<p>NA & CCI</p>	<p>Q3 2013</p>	<p>The initial TNA data and findings were used in trainings and awareness plans and used for awareness and advocacy on the local level. Results were also published and made available on websites and were announced in 3 different workshops with stakeholders participation. the final results of the current TNA will also be advocated for on different levels</p>	<p>MOL adopted the developed training programs, MOE committed to implement in Sept 2013</p>
						<p>Supported different activities as exhibitions and open days</p>	<p>PM</p>	<p>Q2 2012</p>	<p>Conducted central exhibitions and open days in 2012</p>	
						<p>Show evident of TVET importance and value to youth and economy, and the importance of such training development method in improving relevance (support action research from research fund, and conduct a conference to illustrate studied pilots)</p>	<p>PM & BTC</p>	<p>Q3 2013</p>	<p>Not Started Yet</p>	
<p>Societal attitude towards women's work as a second source of income affects women participation in the labour force (being among the lowest in the world less than 16%) , and hence employment of female graduates.</p> <p>Women low acceptability in non-traditional vocations within the targeted professions (except office management), reduce employment of women graduates</p>	<p>Implementation and results monitoring</p>	<p>Cultural and Attitude Related to gender in VET and LM</p>	<p>Medium</p>	<p>Low</p>	<p>A</p>	<p>Awareness raising and advocacy training for TVET in the four areas conducted that resulted in 4 plans, and budget for implementation , plans included innovative activities and involved the media</p>	<p>CCIs</p>	<p>Q3 2013</p>	<p>Training conducted, plan prepared and some activities conducted</p>	<p>Have plans, ongoing implementation</p>
						<p>Integrated gender training in VET in VET institutes directors trainings, addressing gender as a human rights issue granted by all treaties</p>	<p>NA</p>	<p>Q2 2012</p>	<p>1/6 of the training on VET-Labour market linkages was on gender in VET, change attitude of some participants was witnessed</p>	<p>accomplished</p>
						<p>Conduct Gender training for trainers and multipliers</p>	<p>NA</p>	<p>Q2 2013</p>	<p>Not started yet</p>	<p>Not started</p>
						<p>Cooperate with MOL and MOE gender units to integrate increase awareness to women right in education and work in their initiatives and involve them in project local related activities</p>	<p>PM & NA</p>	<p>Q3 2013</p>	<p>Not started yet</p>	

All risks indicated above are development risks, The Risks which have scored B indicates the need for follow-up to ensure achievement of outcome and impact on the long run, action plan in section 4.1 of the report has included needed actions and measures (for both B and A scored risks), it would be implemented in 2013, furthermore actions were embedded in the attached 2013 action plan of the project, and hence in the planned 2013 budget of the project.

2.2.3 Potential Impact

The project with its support to improve the Technical and Vocational Education and Training and bringing relevance for employers and learners in the TVET sector will serve the economic diversification over the medium and long term. The project will also improve the income opportunities for learners, employees and other beneficiaries of such training programs. Lastly, the project institutionalized the enforced linkage relationship between the private sector and the TVET institutions through built stakeholders alliances led by the CCIs.

The identification of market relevant opportunities through a national survey that consulted 2298 stakeholders, half of them are employers have identified market relevant training opportunities, the relevant training programs were developed in further consultation with employers and currently being piloted, the outputs of the training would be producing qualified VET graduates with skills relevant to the labour market. The market relevant training program developed would lead to introducing new training fields within priority specializations that would support diversification of opportunities. Producing the VET graduates with market relevant skills will facilitate employment and increased income of the graduate and the employer; it would provide the employer with the required qualified labour force to develop and expand the business, furthermore the complementary result 4 was directed towards initiatives that would update workers competencies and increase employment for youth and graduates, hence contributing to the planned outcome and impact of the project, through immediate pilot projects.

The outputs and the outcome of the project is directly contributing to the national TVET strategy, revised and endorsed on 2011, under the name of “Winning for a Future, Chances for our Youth”, the revised strategy focused on labour market relevancy with various elements, including: “developing new and revising vocations” relevant to the market needs, to which this project is responding. The project outputs and the outcome clearly contributes to the fourth goal of the MOE strategy, on relevancy of education, which aims to gradually transform higher education, vocational and technical education from supply-oriented to demand – oriented education.

The project contribution to increased market relevance of TVET through “change process” that included setting structure, capacity building, and implementing directly part of the know-how gained through the project, in addition to piloting developed training and some project that reinforces TVET- labour market relations.

The piloting of some of the training of the developed training programs in the 8 VTCs they govern, and the commitment of the MOE to implement the developed market relevant programs in their schools within 2 of the three systems they are implementing is a clear evident of such contribution. The implementation by Q3 2013 will have to find its way into the MOE strategy M&E reporting.

2.2.4 Quality criteria

1. RELEVANCE: The degree to which the intervention is in line with local and national policies and priorities as well as with the expectations of the beneficiaries		
<i>In order to calculate the total score for this Q-criterion, proceed as follows: 'At least one 'A', no 'C' or 'D' = A; Two times 'B' = B; At least one 'C', no 'D' = C; at least one 'D' = D</i>		
1.1 What is the present level of relevance of the project?		
<input type="checkbox"/>	A	Clearly still embedded in national policies and Belgian strategy, responds to aid effectiveness commitments, highly relevant to needs of target group.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	B	Still fits well in national policies and Belgian strategy (without always being explicit), reasonably compatible with aid effectiveness commitments, relevant to target group's needs.
<input type="checkbox"/>	C	Some issues regarding consistency with national policies and Belgian strategy, aid effectiveness or relevance.
<input type="checkbox"/>	D	Contradictions with national policies and Belgian strategy, aid efficiency commitments; relevance to needs is questionable. Major adaptations needed.
1.2 As presently designed, is the intervention logic still holding true?		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	A	Clear and well-structured intervention logic; feasible and consistent vertical logic of objectives; adequate indicators; Risks and Assumptions clearly identified and managed; exit strategy in place (if applicable).
<input type="checkbox"/>	B	Adequate intervention logic although it might need some improvements regarding hierarchy of objectives, indicators, Risk and Assumptions.
<input type="checkbox"/>	C	Problems with intervention logic may affect performance of project and capacity to monitor and evaluate progress; improvements necessary.
<input type="checkbox"/>	D	Intervention logic is faulty and requires major revision for the project to have a chance of success.
2. EFFICIENCY OF IMPLEMENTATION TO DATE: Degree to which the resources of the intervention (funds, expertise, time, etc.) have been converted into results in an economical way (assessment for the whole of the intervention)		
<i>In order to calculate the total score for this Q-criterion, proceed as follows: 'At least one 'A', no 'C' or 'D' = A; Two times 'B' = B; At least one 'C', no 'D' = C; at least one 'D' = D</i>		
2.1 How well are inputs (financial, HR, goods & equipment) managed?		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	A	All inputs are available on time and within budget.
<input type="checkbox"/>	B	Most inputs are available in reasonable time and do not require substantial budget adjustments. However there is room for improvement.
<input type="checkbox"/>	C	Availability and usage of inputs face problems, which need to be addressed; otherwise results may be at risk.
<input type="checkbox"/>	D	Availability and management of inputs have serious deficiencies, which threaten the achievement of results. Substantial change is needed.
2.2 How well are outputs managed?		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	A	All outputs have been and most likely will be delivered as scheduled with good quality contributing to outcomes as planned.
<input type="checkbox"/>	B	Output delivery is and will most likely be according to plan, but there is room for improvement in terms of quality, coverage and timing.
<input type="checkbox"/>	C	Some output are/will be not delivered on time or with good quality. Adjustments are necessary.
<input type="checkbox"/>	D	Quality and delivery of outputs has and most likely will have serious deficiencies. Major adjustments are needed to ensure that at least the key outputs are delivered on time.

3. EFFECTIVENESS TO DATE: Degree to which the outcome (Specific Objective) is achieved as planned at the end of year N		
<i>In order to calculate the total score for this Q-criterion, proceed as follows: 'At least one 'A', no 'C' or 'D' = A; Two times 'B' = B; At least one 'C', no 'D' = C; at least one 'D' = D</i>		
3.1 As presently implemented what is the likelihood of the outcome to be achieved?		
<input type="checkbox"/>	A	Full achievement of the outcome is likely in terms of quality and coverage. Negative effects (if any) have been mitigated.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	B	Outcome will be achieved with minor limitations; negative effects (if any) have not caused much harm.
<input type="checkbox"/>	C	Outcome will be achieved only partially among others because of negative effects to which management was not able to fully adapt. Corrective measures have to be taken to improve ability to achieve outcome.
<input type="checkbox"/>	D	Project will not achieve its outcome unless major, fundamental measures are taken.
3.2 Are activities and outputs adapted based on the achieved results in order to the outcome (Specific Objective)?		
<input type="checkbox"/>	A	The project is successful in adapting its strategies / activities and outputs to changing external conditions in order to achieve the outcome. Risks and assumptions are managed in a proactive manner.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	B	The project is relatively successful in adapting its strategies to changing external conditions in order to achieve its outcome. Risks management is rather passive.
<input type="checkbox"/>	C	The project has not entirely succeeded in adapting its strategies to changing external conditions in a timely or adequate manner. Risk management has been rather static. An important change in strategies is necessary in order to ensure the project can achieve its outcome.
<input type="checkbox"/>	D	The project has failed to respond to changing external conditions, risks were insufficiently managed. Major changes are needed to attain the outcome.

3. POTENTIAL SUSTAINABILITY: The degree of likelihood to maintain and reproduce the benefits of an intervention in the long run (beyond the implementation period of the intervention).		
<i>In order to calculate the total score for this Q-criterion, proceed as follows: At least 3 'A's, no 'C' or 'D' = A ; Maximum two 'C's, no 'D' = B; At least three 'C's, no 'D' = C ; At least one 'D' = D</i>		
3.1 Financial/economic viability?		
<input type="checkbox"/>	A	Financial/economic sustainability is potentially very good: costs for services and maintenance are covered or affordable; external factors will not change that.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	B	Financial/economic sustainability is likely to be good, but problems might arise namely from changing external economic factors.
<input type="checkbox"/>	C	Problems need to be addressed regarding financial sustainability either in terms of institutional or target groups costs or changing economic context.
<input type="checkbox"/>	D	Financial/economic sustainability is very questionable unless major changes are made.
4.2 What is the level of ownership of the project by target groups and will it continue after the end of external support?		
<input type="checkbox"/>	A	The JLCB and other relevant local structures are strongly involved in all stages of implementation and are committed to continue producing and using results.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	B	Implementation is based in a good part on the JLCB and other relevant local structures, which are also somewhat involved in decision-making. Likelihood of sustainability is good, but there is room for improvement.
<input type="checkbox"/>	C	Project uses mainly ad-hoc arrangements and the JLCB and other relevant local structures to ensure sustainability. Continued results are not guaranteed. Corrective measures are needed.
<input type="checkbox"/>	D	Project depends completely on ad-hoc structures with no prospect of sustainability. Fundamental changes are needed to enable sustainability.

4.3 What is the level of policy support provided and the degree of interaction between project and policy level?		
<input type="checkbox"/>	A	Policy and institutions have been highly supportive of project and will continue to be so.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	B	Policy and policy enforcing institutions have been generally supportive, or at least have not hindered the project, and are likely to continue to be so.
<input type="checkbox"/>	C	Project sustainability is limited due to lack of policy support. Corrective measures are needed.
<input type="checkbox"/>	D	Policies have been and likely will be in contradiction with the project. Fundamental changes needed to make project sustainable.
4.4 How well is the project contributing to institutional and management capacity?		
<input type="checkbox"/>	A	Project is embedded in institutional structures and contributed to improve the institutional and management capacity (even if this is not a explicit goal).
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	B	Project management is well embedded in institutional structures and has somewhat contributed to capacity building. Additional expertise might be required. Improvements in order to guarantee sustainability are possible.
<input type="checkbox"/>	C	Project relies too much on ad-hoc structures instead of institutions; capacity building has not been sufficient to fully ensure sustainability. Corrective measures are needed.
<input type="checkbox"/>	D	Project is relying on ad hoc and capacity transfer to existing institutions, which could guarantee sustainability, is unlikely unless fundamental changes are undertaken.

Criteria	Score
Relevance	A
Effectiveness	B
Sustainability	B
Efficiency	A

In summary of the Q-criteria; it is obvious in comparison with previous years that efficiency of the project has been enhanced, as first year the project suffered, started to enhance in 2011, while it is catching up in 2012, and achieving more than planned in some activities due to increased efficiency. On the other hand effectiveness still needs attention; due to envisioned operational, and attitude related risks that are beyond project control, yet plans for 2013 were set to enhance effectiveness through different measures. Relevance still holding, as highly contributing to sector's strategies, and improved due to increased engagement of the other stakeholders (CCIs, unions, labour market) in addition to ministries, in addition to the fact that a revision for the Log frame in line with MTR findings took place during the year. The JLCB approved the reviewed Log frame.

Meanwhile sustainability although improved, especially on the local level by capacity building and introducing different piloted TVET-labour market linkages, but still needs improvement on the policy level commitment, 2013 plans were set to achieve further improvement of sustainability. Yet it would still need a special focus by stakeholders during the coming years (beyond the scope of the project), as the risk management plan indicates.

2.3 Output 1

2.3.1 Analysis of progress made

Output 1: Sustainable multi partner alliance established, linking training with the labour market						
Indicators	Base line value	Progress year 2010	Progress year 2011	Progress 2012	End Target 2013	Comments
At least 20 companies and 20 institutions or organizations collaborate with the local TVET providers in each area		13%*	50%	75%	100%	Some VET institutes are cooperating with more than 40 organizations, some have only 5, more activities will be done during the year 2013 to enhance the weaker ones collaborations.
Three years after project starts The number of internships of trainees from the TVET providers in companies has increased by 50%		19%*	25%	40%	50%	All MOL VTCs continued with their internships but year 2012 it was supervised by trainers as suggested by the labour market in the TNA, MOE schools also conducted the supervised internships for 2 of the 3 streams they have. Most VET institutes has a contact point with labour market and are linking trainees with the market
Three years after project starts more than 70% of TVET institutes has systematized linkages with the labour market in each area		15%	25%	50%	70%	Project is facilitating various actions that would lead to such achievement in 2013, (with special focus on MOE and MOL VET institutes) actions include exhibitions, training of trainees in the market, the implementation of R4 that is promoting the VET-Labour market linkages, in addition the training for VET directors resulted in a plan from each institute that would promote linkages.
Three years after project starts more than 50% of graduate employment is due to linkages with the labour market		19%*	25%	25%	50%	Hundreds of VET trainees were supported in their market training (internships and apprenticeships) in 2012 it was found that 40% of the MOE apprenticeship stream and 20% of the MOE and MOL graduates conducted internships were employed in same place of training.
The local TVET Coordination Committee meets regularly and agree and review an agenda of activities, which includes activities planned under project		60%	80%	95%	100%	There is a high commitment among stakeholders towards the project concept, and as various activities of the project is implemented locally committees headed by the local CCIs had to meet regularly and sometimes frequently.
Over 70% of TVET institutes uses updated Labour Market Database that is linked to national LMIS		-	-	50%	70%	Labour market data-base was only updated in 2012 and linked with LMIS, some started using it, it's planed that a workshop will be conducted by CCIs in 2013 to increase use of more TVET institutes to the LMIS system.

* Based on Training Needs Assessment (TNA) findings conducted in 2010, considered as base line data

-Notes: 1. the focus of the project is on the MOE and MOL VET institutes, although project benefits other TVET institutes.

2. the local committees are the committees lead by CCIs in each of the four target governorate, and is formed from VET institutes and Labour market representatives.

Progress of <u>main</u> activities ⁸	Progress:				Comments (only if the value is C or D)
	A	B	C	D	
1.5: Establish a data base in the CCI, link it with LMIS and PCBS		B			
1.6: Link Focal Point in CCI with private sector establishments		B			
1.8: Establish in each TVET institution a contact point for relations with CCI and companies		B			
1.9: Raise awareness on TVET with private sector and local communities		B			
1.11: Update the TVET website and link it with CCI's websites		B			
1.12: Conduct Training Needs Assessment and support surveys in companies and small workshops on labour market needs in the selected fields		B			

- Activities :1.5, 1.11 & 1.12 were finalized during 2012

Analysis of progress made towards output: Analyse the dynamics between the activities and the probable achievement of the Output (see Results Report Guide).	
<i>Relation between activities and the Output. (how) Are activities contributing (still) to the achievement of the output (do not discuss activities as such?):</i>	<p>Not only the various activities under this result contributed to its achievement, but also various activities within the other results are contributing to result 1 achievement, other results has also benefited from the alliance establishment, being a hub that initiated linkages.</p> <p>The result's activities: the increased capacities in training, library books, websites and resources accomplished under the project has enhanced available resources and capacities of CCIs leading the alliance, in addition the on-going activities allowing VET-Labour market interaction has allowed such achievement. Implementing the TNA (1.12) under the project have also allowed over 1000 employer to cooperate with the alliance, 22 thousands filled the data base questionnaires, in addition to over 200 employers participated in the other different activities carried by the project as training trainees in the enterprise, workshops and other activities.</p> <p>Many of projects' accomplished activities included in the other results, were implemented by the alliance, such as conferences and exhibitions, validation of outlines, training which required involvement of the alliance in its implementation, as well as contributed to the TVET-labour market linkages.</p>
<i>Progress made towards the achievement of the output (on the basis of indicators):</i>	<p>Sustainable multi partner alliance is fully established and functional (R1), and working on linking VET institutes with the labour market, other donors are linking with the training center in the CCIs the project had developed its capacity, CCIs head of training are also linking with VET institutes and enterprises for other VET support in their areas, Jerusalem CCI is a clear example on that working on other EU projects through the structure.</p> <p>On the other hand; VET-Labour market relations are strengthened through the alliance, yet systemizing the relation in the VET institutes would need further step to reach full achievement of the output, plans are set to address this issue.</p>
<i>Issues that arose, influencing factors (positive or negative):</i>	<p>The structure of the local committees lead by the CCIs has facilitated the VET-Labour market collaborations and served their interests as market representatives in partnering with VET institutes, the set-up structure of the local committees and the focal points in TVET institutes has also assisted in increasing collaborations between VET and the labour market,</p>

⁸ A: The activities are ahead of schedule
B: The activities are on schedule
C: The activities are delayed, corrective measures are required.
D: The activities are seriously delayed (more than 6 months). Substantial corrective measures are required.

	In addition to the above; the participatory role of the CCIs in managing the project and planning concepts and criteria through monthly meeting with PM and NA have also increased involvement, ownership and enhanced achievements of result. The change in plan post MTR of managing result 4 through the built alliance lead by the CCIs have also contributed positively to this result.
<i>Unexpected results (positive or negative):</i>	<p>The innovation in the TVET awareness plan in each area was a positive unexpected result, which has enabled debate and discussions on VET among stakeholders on local level with involvement of media, theatre and social media.</p> <p>The support to establishing a data-base in the four targeted areas to be linked with LMIS is complimenting a work conducted by GIZ in the establishing of the LMIS system, CCIs in other governorates are requesting similar support to establish their data-base.</p>

2.3.2 Budget execution

The “Budget versus Actual year to date” Report, which includes the data up to 31/12/2012, is attached in Annex 1. Disbursement rate was high in this result, due to increased activities of the alliance as planned.

2.3.3 Quality criteria

Criteria	Score
Efficiency	A
Effectiveness	A
Sustainability	B

2.4 Output 2

2.4.1 Analysis of progress made

Output 2: Improved capacities of all stakeholders -Institutional capacity building						
Indicators	Baseline value	Progress year 2010	Progress year 2011	Progress year 2012	End Target 2013	Comments
At least 30 core group people of the professional stakeholders are trained to be multipliers for upgrading capacity of other stakeholders.		-	40%	97%	97%	24 trained multipliers in pedagogic, management and policy training for the project, in addition to 5 trained through another TVET project could implement their multiplied training through the project by end of 2012
All training conducted is gender sensitive and have gender specific elements		30%	30%	30%	30%	All conducted training ensured gender access, yet not all conducted training have gender specific elements. Nevertheless some had, as TVET systems training for TVET directors and stakeholders had gender training part.
At least 30 % of those trained are women		10%	20%	31%	30%	In each training female teachers, trainers, directors and CCI representatives were involved.
At least 70% of trained TVET trainers are able to use new technology through capacity building by 2013		-	-	30%	70%	It is expected that the technical training to be conducted in 2013 will enable realizing this indicator as planned
At least 400 Stakeholders trained on developing & implementing market relevant training program development (Enterprises, TVET teachers & trainers, CCI training unit) per area by third year		20%	50%	90%	100%	Over 350 stakeholders (teachers, market representatives, VET institutes directors and principles, local committees and CCIs) were trained in pedagogic, training program development, management and TVET- labour market systems and linkages were trained
Annual conference to share lessons learned is conducted at end of each year		-	2 (one in North and one in South)	one in Ramallah	1	Annual exhibition was held in 2012 that supported TVET and labour market innovative initiatives, around 500 participants of different stakeholders participated in it, 30 projects that reflected cooperation between labour market and VET were illustrated.
Progress of <u>main</u> activities	Progress:				Comments (only if the value is C or D)	
	A	B	C	D		
2.3: Train teachers and trainers on developing occupational analysis		B				
2.4: Train teachers and trainers on developing curriculum outlines	A					
2.5: Train directors of TVET institutions in establishing links with enterprises for training activities		B				
2.7: Train managers and selected staff of enterprises in integrating feedback into TVET Programs			C		Activity 2.7 was delayed till training programs were ready	
2.9: Expose local TVET group members to TVET setting in other countries (regionally and internationally)		B				
2.11: Train all stakeholders on the method of and their role in monitoring and evaluation of enterprise-CCI-TVET institution cooperation at the local level		B				
2.12: Coach institutes to activate ongoing structures for TVET-Market relation on the professions levels		B				

Notes: 2.3, 2.5 activities were completed in 2012,
Although some of the conducted training in 2.4 was delayed but project was able to achieve much more than planned.

Analysis of progress made towards output: <i>Analyse the dynamics between the activities and the probable achievement of the Output (see Results Report Guide).</i>	
<i>Relation between activities and the Output. (how) Are activities contributing (still) to the achievement of the output (do not discuss activities as such?):</i>	Capacity building is an important element in the project for enhancing competencies of all professional stakeholders that can be reflected on the institutional building of stakeholders. CB for CCIs and local committees has enhanced their ability to sustain the alliance and implement project activities, in addition it has enabled the alliance to develop plans and understand VET-labour market relation contributing to VET relevancy concept. Trainers and teachers were trained on how to develop curricula and training programs, in addition they were provided with pedagogy training to enhance their delivery. Directors were provided with training that enhanced skills, developed attitudes and enabled developing plans to enhance their linkages with the labour market, and hence would have an effect on the VET institute. Most of the training were practical oriented and were followed by activities that ensured application of competencies and skills gained.
<i>Progress made towards the achievement of the output (on the basis of indicators):</i>	Progress towards the capacity building of stakeholders and institutes was evident, as the people trained in training program development were able to implement immediately, the multipliers were able to transfer the skills to others, and some directors started implementing some VET-labour market initiatives. Trained teachers were able to implement the pilot, the planned technical training to be conducted 2013 will further enhance their implementation. Private sector training and Monitoring committees will increase capacities of private sector and monitoring committees in their part of the project.
<i>Issues that arose, influencing factors (positive or negative):</i>	<p>Training directors of TVET institutions in the relation between TVET systems and the labour market was very important in building VET institutions that is aiming to increase linkages with the labour market, which is achieving the mind shift and the change at the local level, especially when part of the directors have conveyed the training as multipliers,</p> <p>The use of multipliers have increased the number of beneficiaries and spread the effect, the flexibility allowed for additional training to be implemented within the planned activities.</p>
<i>Unexpected results (positive or negative):</i>	<p>The project supported an exhibition titled “innovation and excellence for year 2012”. Approximately thirty (30) projects participated between both TVET institutions and the private sector will lead to hiring Information Technology (IT) graduates from TVET sector. The winning project was “Designing CNC Router”. One of the other projects participated in the exhibition has won international prize, indicating the innovation of VET students, and giving value to their training.</p> <p>Another positive unexpected result is the ability of the project to match GIZ support, were 5 trainers were trained by regional project supported by GIZ, were then enabled to implement the training to 240 VET teachers and trainers on “Modern Learning and Teaching Techniques”</p>

2.4.2 Budget execution

The “Budget versus Actual year to date” Report, which includes the data up to 31/12/2012, is attached in Annex 1. The financial report reflects Higher disbursements were achieved in output 2 due to increased and accelerated conducted activities based on the request of stakeholders and in-line with the project results and activities.

2.4.3 Quality criteria

Criteria	Score
Efficiency	A
Effectiveness	A
Sustainability	B

2.5 Output 3

2.5.1 Analysis of progress made

Output 3: Market-based Training Programs developed and implemented with companies and other partners						
Indicators	Baseline value	Progress year 2010	Progress year 2011	Progress 2012	End Target 2013	Comments
By the end of the project At least 16 training programs are developed for the 5 fields. Including occupational profiles, training program outlines and 3 training program materials including modules.		10%	30%	90%	170%	16 training programs are developed for the 5 fields, 1 life skills and sales that is integrated in all vocations. The 15 are new or revised training programs of vocations in the 5 fields. 83 modules were developed, compared to 45 targeted (170% of the targeted), development is in the final stages.
All developed training program materials are gender sensitive and allow participation of women and special needs groups		-	-	50%	100%	Gender sensitivity elements were integrated initially. Gender units in both ministries MOE and MOL will revise during 2013
400 market representatives in the targeted fields have integrated their input in training program development		-	100%	100%	100%	400 employers and market representatives have participated in validation of the training programs and some has participated in committees that developed and reviewed the training programs. So target is achieved.
A working methodology is laid down in a guidebook at the end of 2013		-	20%	70%	100%	Teachers manuals were prepared with guidelines, the guideline for policy level and future preparation would be prepared in 2013
At least 2 training programs per vocational field are new or revised and being implemented		-	30%	105%	125%	1-4 training program per field were new or revised, 5 programs are currently piloted (from 3 fields), so partly indicator has over achieved (150% and 200% for some fields) and partly underachieved (50% for one field, and implementation only in 67% of fields). It is expected that when MOE starts piloting at least 1-3 will be piloted from each field.
At the end of the project, all occupations with high demand (in the 5 vocational areas) are served by a new or revised training programme		-	-	100%	100%	15 programs selected according to TNA were prepared, of which 10 were new to MOE and MOL schools and VTCs, and 5 were revised and new skills integrated. Yet there are still more occupations that would need developing according to TNA, but resources limited the number of vocations to be developed.
Progress of <u>main</u> activities				Progress:		Comments (only if the value is C or D)
	A	B	C	D		
3.1 Do training needs assessment in the labor market for all taught occupations in different economic sectors			C			Activity was planned to be conducted through PCBS, but was not feasible, hence will be led by NA in cooperation with CCLs as previous study, TNA started Q4 and moving smoothly

3.4: Validate the occupational analyses with enterprises from different areas	A			
3.6: Set the training programs outlines in the different specializations		B		
3.20 Implement the training program for the first phase (4 professions) in all TVET institutes training the specializations			C	Implementation is done only in MOL institutes within available equipment and resources, MOE will implement in Q3 2013, MOE & MOL signed letter of commitment for implementation
3.21 Gather Resource of curricula and training materials from Palestine and different countries regional and international		B		
3.22 Prepare the training materials and required modules in the different specializations based on identified gaps			C	Delay is due to increased numbers of produced training materials.

Note: Activities 3.4, 3.6, 3.21 were completed during 2012, in 3.20 TPDC was involved to ensure ongoing coaching of first pilot in MOL.

Analysis of progress made towards output: Analyse the dynamics between the activities and the probable achievement of the Output	
<i>Relation between activities and the Output. (how) Are activities (still) contributing to the achievement of the output (do not discuss activities as such)?:</i>	<i>Developing market-based training programs with the active support of employers and the private sector would lead to achieving the output and would spread the benefit for all stakeholders. The engagement of the labour market through the TNA, the validation workshops and questionnaires, and involvement in the committees that developed and edited the training programs have lead to developing of market relevant programs in partnership with the labour market. The equipment purchasing would facilitate the implementation of the new developed fields and reviewed skills within the current ones.</i>
<i>Progress made towards the achievement of the output (on the basis of indicators):</i>	The activities allowed the development of market relevant training, and the implementation in all MOL VTCs in the reviewed taught vocations they have resources for (5 of 15), purchasing the planed equipment will allow the implementation of the new training programs in the VTCs. MOE will start implementation in 2 out of three streams in Sept 2013. It is expected by end of Q3 2013 implementation would be started in all MOE schools and MOL VTCs in the 16 developed training programs. If time permitted for additional year the training programs would integrate pilot results and the MOE schools would be coached in the implementation.
<i>Issues that arose, influencing factors (positive or negative):</i>	<p>The inclusion of criteria for selecting institutes that could benefit from support to equipment to facilitate implementation of the developed training programs and the commitment requirement and signing of the 2 ministries to the commitment letter could facilitate the implementation in the MOL VTCs and MOE schools.</p> <p>MOL VTC did not have any curricula or systematized way to deliver the training and assess the trainees, for MOL the developed training programs and modules filled an important gap, on the other hand MOE has 3 streams, the traditional school based one has its own curricula and outlines, while the developed training programs would serve the other 2 streams, that is based on internship and apprenticeship training.</p> <p><i>The involvement of the Curricula Center in the development of the training programs, has built their capacities in developing market-relevant training programs that reflects market demanded skills. This positive result could lead to future adaptation of MOE of the process for development of the formal stream the third stream (beyond project), and could lead to future development of training programs and curricula in other fields.</i></p> <p><i>The employment of 2 TPDCs instead of one has led to increased achievement and catered for previous delays in the process, and increased the achievements beyond the targeted one within limited available duration.</i></p> <p>Another planned issue to increase the benefit of the TNA findings at the end of the project is to publish it on web-site for other TVET stakeholders to use, and other future TVET projects and to link it with LMIS system after checking with MOL if possible.</p> <p>A negative influencing factor was the delay in receiving the equipment required for implementing new vocations, due to strikes and lengthy administrative procedures, although process started in August, such effect has limited the number of piloted training</p>

	and could affect the piloting.
<i>Unexpected results (positive or negative):</i>	Reviewing and developing market relevant training programs, which are flexible and could be integrated into different settings to meet labour market demands has allowed for its implementation outside the ministries and in training set-ups interlinked with the market, such as through upgrading courses for practitioners in the market or ex-graduates, and within different types of institutes, whether governmental, NGOs, UNRWA or private institute.

2.5.2 Budget execution

The “Budget versus Actual year to date” Report, which includes the data up to 31/12/2012, is attached in Annex 1. Disbursement rate of equipment was lower than anticipated due to the high number of strike days of public servants hence delaying the procurement and signing the contracts for the equipment items from Q4 2012 to Q1 2013. On the other hand higher disbursement of training material development reflected the increase in achievements and developing of 83 modules compared to 45.

2.5.3 Quality criteria

Criteria	Score
Efficiency	A
Effectiveness	B
Sustainability	B

2.6 Output 4

2.6.1 Analysis of progress made

Output 4: R4: Developing and Supporting initiatives of TVET Stakeholders							
Indicators	Baseline value	Progress year 2010	Progress year 2011	Progress 2012	End Target 2013	Comments	
Criteria, system, forms and mechanism are in place		-	-	100%	100%	Criteria, system, forms and mechanism were developed in participatory way with PM and CCI, prepared by NA.	
At least 8 projects implemented by entities (Company in cooperation with TVET institute), two in each area.		-	-	-	100%	9 projects were selected and would be implemented, 2 in each area, except Ramallah, there are 3 projects. (agreements were signed in Jan 2013)	
At least one piloted model of the implemented initiative would be up-scaled.		-	-	-	70%	Project will start implementing in Q1 2013, hence realization of the indicator is in Q3 2013, and time is very limited for up scaling, but hoping that time will allow realization of certain elements at the macro level. Projects plan for 27 employment opportunities once implemented.	
At least 30 employment and self-employment opportunity is generated, once initiative is accomplished		-	-	-	90%		
At least 5 TVET- Market cooperation is initiated in each area		-	-	80% to 240%	100%-260%	The number of applicants are: 6 in Nablus, 7 in Hebron, 12 in Ramallah and 4 in Jerusalem, hence achieving between 80% to 240% of the planned target, it is expected that implementation will encourage other partnerships, of at least one in each area	
At least 30% of female trainees and graduates are participating in the initiatives.		-	-	-	10%	Projects planned for the participation of 38 female youth out of 372 young people; hence female represents 10% of the beneficiaries. Graduates of the pilot training is only witnessed in June 2013	
The initiatives' lessons learned and successes is documented and disseminated		-	-	-	100%	The final workshop will present and disseminate the documents	
Progress of <u>main</u> activities				Progress:		Comments (only if the value is C or D)	
				A	B		C
4.1 Prepare and Confirm criteria, set mechanisms and system					B		
4.2 Collecting applications from applicants to implement proposals based on set criteria					B		
4.3 Selection of applicants based on approved criteria, and selection mechanism					B		
4.4 Signing contracts and project implementation					B		

4.5 Monitoring and Evaluation		B		
-------------------------------	--	---	--	--

Note: Activities 4.1, 4.2, 4.3 were completed during 2012

Analysis of progress made towards output: <i>Analyse the dynamics between the activities and the probable achievement of the Output</i>	
<i>Relation between activities and the Output. (how) Are activities (still) contributing to the achievement of the output (do not discuss activities as such)?:</i>	This output was newly introduced after the MTR in 2010, during 2012 conceptualizing and integrating this result within the set-up structure was done, meanwhile introducing transparent system was done. It was planned to serve the specific objective of the project, and to be implemented by the alliance build in R1, the criteria set and mechanisms were set to serve the specific objective and indicators. The process has encouraged TVET-Labour market partnerships, were 29 partnerships were established, and 9 will be implementing initiatives supporting TVET stakeholders.
<i>Progress made towards the achievement of the output (on the basis of indicators):</i>	Implementation of the projects will take place during the first 2 quarters of 2013 final year of the project, it is planned that projects' lesson learned will be documented, allowing for scaling up in the future but not necessary during the remaining lifetime of the project. Delay in implementing this result, related to agreeing on the concept of implementation, developed concept, related plans and upgraded Log-frame was agreed this year by the JLCB, following various suggestions and discussions.
<i>Issues that arose, influencing factors (positive or negative):</i>	The set Criteria and guidelines and the developed process enabled receiving proposals along the lines of the project and would lead to achieving the output and the outcome as well as realizing the indicators, TVET institutions and the private sector were able to commit cooperation by signing cooperation agreements. The implementation of R4 through the set alliance in R1 led by the CCIs had also contributed to developing partnerships. The activities of cooperation conducted by the alliance such as the exhibition have also paved the way for their role in stimulating partnerships and supporting its development. The transparent process was also an important positive influencing factor, the process included: a) setting the criteria for the initiative, b) setting the guidelines for application, assessment, implementation, M&E, c) announcing in the newspaper, d) distributing the application form and guidelines e) selecting an independent committee of three at the local level based on set criteria, f) preparing a template for the report and an excel program for assessing the project using somehow unified method, g) conducting a workshop for the assessors. The criteria and guideline was developed in participatory manner with PM and CCIs, the process was facilitated by NA, approved by JLCB, implemented by CCIs and the alliance, and monitored by PM.
<i>Unexpected results (positive or negative):</i>	Although the applications were in line with criteria and specific objectives, yet the small institutes without high capacity and ability for proposal writing could not provide a proposal, or their proposals were weak compared to others, if time and resources permitted coaching their proposal writing could have taken place, nevertheless; this element is a supporting element for TVET-labour market partnership and not a project by itself.

2.6.2 Budget execution

The "Budget versus Actual year to date" Report, which includes the data up to 31/12/2012, is attached in Annex 1. The financial report reflects lower disbursement rates due to the delay in starting this item where agreements were only signed Jan 2013, disbursement rate of this item would be high during the first two quarters of 2013.

2.6.3 Quality criteria

Criteria	Score
Efficiency	A
Effectiveness	B
Sustainability	B

3 Transversal Themes

3.1 Gender

Female participation in the Palestinian labour force is reportedly among the lowest in the world. Providing relevant TVET training programs for women is therefore considered a top priority, but the record-low labour market participation would indicate that factors other than skills also exert influence on female employment.

The specialization intended to increase access of women to VET through the revised and newly developed vocations, the TNA study was gender sensitive and considered encouraging and challenging factors for increase of women participation in the labour market. It was found that although their presence in the priority field is minimum (except for business administration), the demand was high for their employment, one of the important means for the female graduates' employment was internships and apprenticeships before graduation as study indicated, an element that project is promoting and aiming to systemize. Hence it is expected that on the long run, outside the scope of the project, the implementation of the developed programs within the different linkages with the labour market will provide better access of female graduates to the labour market.

On the other hand the TNA has indicated less professions are accessible for females compared to males in VET institutes, 4 of the 5 selected targeted professions are open for females, it is expected that the new added and developed fields if adopted would allow more access for females into VET professions.

Girls constituted 43% of the 5 piloted fields which is above that planned; nevertheless female trainees' constitute around 20% of the targeted vocational fields. Women constituted 31% of the trained stakeholders and in line with the targeted indicator. On the other hand although R4 will add 38 more female beneficiaries to the project, they only constitute 10% of the overall beneficiaries. In general indicators illustrate over or under achievements, and not necessarily sustainable.

Some project's activities have contributed to the positive change towards inclusion of women in VET and labour market, such as the awareness plans held at local levels, and gender training provided as part of training for the alliance and the VET directors are all supporting factors for increase of women's access to training and the labour market. "Gender in VET" training to be provided for multipliers and trainers is also planned for the coming period.

Yet there are still challenges and risks related to attitude towards women's role and ability that is reflected in the market and VET institutes. Nevertheless to encounter the challenges for women access to training and work in a sustainable manner, it is planned to include the established gender units in the ministries.

The inclusion of the existing "Gender Units" at the Ministry of Education (MOE) and the Ministry of Labour (MOL), in reviewing the curricula from gender perspective during 2013, and in monitoring gender related data in VET and employment for future monitoring outside the scope of the project would enhance sustainable inclusion of gender in VET

beyond the project lifecycle.

3.2 Environment

Integrating environment related elements into the developed training programs was taken into consideration by the project. Integrating techniques and elements that highlight environment concerns into the different modules of the training programs and within the developed materials was considered and conducted at various levels in a way that matches the type of developed module. This is in line with the world's shift towards the use of renewable energy in response to climate change rather than the traditional sources of energy in order to protect the environment, such shift was reflected in new technology used, and hence was requested as a new upgrade by the labour market. This upgrade was integrated in the developed training programs and modules. Skills integrated in the training programs and the modules were environment sensitive or directly related to environment, such as the increased use of solar energy in electric installations, testing gazes in auto-mechanics...etc.

The project has raised awareness among stakeholders and training program developers on the issue to reach a long term goal of mainstreaming environmental considerations as the foundation of all TVET programs. Occupational Health & Safety also formed the basis of all vocational learning and training developed during 2012. Also, the teacher/trainer would be trained during 2013 on environmental concerns and how to be a role model for students in all TVET programs.

Another important dimension of the environmental learning is the integration of specific measures and trade specific ones into the TVET training programs for each specific occupation. For example, the electrician should also know energy conservation methods and be able to use it in his future profession.

Therefore developed training programs and Modules took into consideration some relevant environmental concerns and during 2013 the planned technical training for trainers will include environment training elements for all professions to raise their awareness and to integrate environmental measures in implementing the trainings.

3.3 Other

4 Steering and Learning

4.1 Action Plan

In addition to the 2013 action plan attached the following points were raised from monitoring results, and were mentioned in various parts of the 2012 results report, hence became part of 2013 action plan as table below summarises:

Action plan	Source	Actor	Deadline
<i>Description of the action/decision to be taken</i>	<i>The sub-chapter to which the action refers (e.g. 2.4)</i>	<i>The person responsible for taking the decision/taking action</i>	<i>e.g. Q1, Q2, Q3 or Q4 of year N+1</i>
Activate the use of graduates tracking system, and conduct use to trace graduates of the pilot group in Q3, and employer satisfaction form to measure the indicators at outcome level (R 3.15)	2.2.1	NA, MOL and CCI	Q3 2013
Follow-up the outcome of the capacity building and the use of the training by the trainers , provide coaching when necessary (R2.2)	2.2.3	TPDC PMO	Q2 2013
Document the guidelines for policy use and Adopt documented guidelines on policy level through SC (R 2.2)	2.3.1, 2.2.2	TPDC PMO	Q3 2013
Gender training for the trainers and multipliers to improve gender awareness of trainers (R 2.4)	2.2.2 and 3.1	NA / GU	Q2 2013
Ensuring Technical training for teachers to include environment element (R2.4)	3.2 and 2.5.1	PMO	Q1 2013
Involve Gender Unit at MOE & MOL in review of prepared material, awareness activities, training to increase gender sensitivity of the project and ensure sustainable gender achievements (R 3.21)	2.2.2, 2.5.1 and 3.1	PMO/ GU	Q2 2013
Workshops for TVET institutes on use of LMIS to encourage its use systematically by TVET institutes (R 1.6)	2.3.1	CCIs	Q2 2013
Systemizing the TVET-LM relation: Develop systems and forms, and conduct Workshops with directors and focal points for TVET that trained in VET to gather info on systematized relations, and to multiply systematized linkages with market and TVET institutes. (R 2.2)	2.3.1	NA and Multipliers	Q3 2013
Internship and apprenticeship support for the piloted group (R1.8)	2.2.2	PMO	Q2 2013
Facilitate and Monitor the piloting into MoE vocational schools (R 3.15)	2.2.2	PMO	Q3 2013
Continue to conduct awareness activities on TVET, and on Gender and TVET (R 1.9)	2.2.2 and 3.1	CCI	Q3 2013
Document lessons learned from implementing the 9 initiatives of R4 to capitalize on success to increase linkages and in up-scaling and present in final workshop (R 4.5)	2.6.1	CCIs / projects	Q3 2013
Include relevant ministries' institutes (MOL, MOE-PCDC,...) in monitoring of the pilot, and in adopting the developed methodology for TVET training program	2.2.2	PMO	Q3 2013

development (R 3.15)			
Check with MOL how can the current TNA results be institutionalized (eg. feed into the LMIS system), in addition to publishing on the formal TVET website for other future TVET project and for use of stakeholders (R 3.1)	2.5.1	PMO & NA	Q3 2013

4.2 Lessons Learned

Lessons learned	Target audience
Engaging all stakeholders and identifying their role have enhanced their participation. The participatory approach used throughout the implementation has increased commitment and ownership of partners and stakeholders.	Stakeholders, BTC
The findings of the conducted TNA were used to develop the outputs of the project, and hence provide relevancy to the developed and reviewed training programs. Analysis of the local market needs of workers should be done on regular and continuous basis. It should also be directed towards enhancing the quality of training and education at TVET institutions. It should be a pre-requisite for projects and initiatives support in the sector.	Stakeholders, MOE/MOHE, MOL
The alliance building proved to be an effective hub and main base for supporting the initiation of TVET-Labour market linkages used for implementing various activities and results of the project, its currently an address for various donors working on the local level, and could serve as a hub for possible future BTC- Labour market initiatives, and other donors and stakeholders initiatives.	Stakeholders, BTC for future initiatives
Implementing the project has developed the Palestinian way for developing market relevant curricula development and program development that was used by various actors in the sector yet it is important to document the guidelines and endorse it, involve PCDC and to ensure implementation of the pilot by MOE and MOL.	Stakeholders, MOE/MOHE, MOL
Enabling management, financial and organizational structures are key factors in the progress of the project. In addition it was able to address the complexity of the project, addressing multiple actors and levels, in addition to dealing with the lack of a unified body representing TVET.	BTC, involved ministries
The project was able (through interacting in the TVET sector) to utilize the outputs of other initiatives provided with other donors in maximizing projects outputs, and was able to provide part of its output to other projects to utilize instead of duplicating.	Stakeholders, BTC
The selection process for R4 implementing initiatives conducted on a professional way and through clear criteria, guidelines, and selection of intendant assessment committee and providing them with relevant unified format was highly transparent and provided a capacity building process for stakeholders involved.	Stakeholders, BTC for future initiatives

<p>Gender sensitive measures were dealt with differently based on different trainer, program developer and stakeholder involved, in order to ensure the integration of gender sensitive measures in any future training and programs on a sustainable basis, MOL and MOE Gender Units will be involved in 2013 in the program and measures ahead, in line with their mandate and scope of work in their ministries, so that they can monitor progress beyond the project.</p>	<p>Stakeholders, MOEHE, MOL</p>
<p>The increasing involvement of actors in the TVET sector, with somehow similarities in part of the activities, would need systematized coordination among donors and stakeholders to avoid duplication.</p>	<p>Stakeholders, BTC</p>

5 Annexes

5.1 Original Logical framework

<i>intervention logic</i>	<i>Indicators</i>	<i>Sources of verification</i>	<i>Assumptions</i>
<p>Overall objective (Specific Agreement BTC Palestine, 27-10-2005)</p> <p>Sustainable economic diversification and increased income opportunities are generated through the provision of appropriate vocational training</p>	<p>Increased employability & self-employability rates of youth</p> <p>Note: The Steering Committee reviews the indicators at one of its first meetings:</p>	PCBS Statistics	Political & economic stability
<p>Specific objective (Specific Agreement BTC Palestine, 27-10-2005)</p> <p>Youth and adults are enabled to acquire and update their competences on an equal basis through continuously adapting market-based vocational training programmes in some selected priority fields (Electro-technology, Electronics, Communication technology, Information technology, Business administration)</p>	<p>The (self) employment rate 6 months after graduation in the fields with improved curricula is at least 60 % at the end of the second year, and 75 % at the end of the project (or at least 20% increase over the current employment rates of graduates).</p> <p>At least 30 % of the learners in the selected specialisations are girls at the end of the second year, and 50 % at the end of the project.</p> <p>At least 30 % of the learners in the selected specialisations are from marginalized urban and rural communities at the end of the second year, and 60 % at the end of the project.</p>	<p>Tracer Study of graduates within 6 months of graduation</p> <p>TVET institutes enrolment & graduates records</p> <p>Inquiries with graduates</p> <p>Tracer study</p> <p>Inquiries with employers</p> <p>Project reports</p> <p>Statistics at PCBS, MoL and Governorate-level Labour Offices</p> <p>Reports of MoEHE and MoL</p> <p>Reports of the participating CCI (moved from R3)</p>	<p>High priority for TVET on the agenda on the national level</p> <p>Effective & efficient bodies of the Palestinian TVET system (Higher Council & Executive Board) support the project and ensure its smooth implementation.</p> <p>Motivated & experienced project team and stakeholders.</p>
<p>Result 1</p> <p>Sustainable multi partner alliance established, linking training with the labour market</p> <p>Enterprises and other users collaborate actively with training providers on the local level in demand analysis, programme selection and ongoing development, accept trainees for internships and apprenticeships and employ TVET graduates.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Focal Point in each one of the five locations will be responsible for one of the five fields: Electro-technology, Electronics, Communication technology, Information technology and Business administration. One year after project start, at least 10 companies and 5 institutions or organisations collaborate with the local TVET providers (Technical College, Vocational Secondary School, Vocational Training Centre etc.). One year after project start, each TVET provider collaborates with at least 3 companies and 1 institution or organisation, in the selected field. Three years after project start, the number of internships of trainees from the TVET providers in companies has increased by 50 %. Three years after project start, more than 50% of graduates' employment is due to linkages with the labour market. Local TVET Coordination Committee meets regularly (once every month) and agrees and reviews an agenda of activities, which includes activities planned under the project. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Inquiries with Companies Project reports Reports of Chamber of Commerce and Industry and its Training Department Annual reports of TVET providers Reports of MoEHE and MoL Minutes of TVET Coordination Committee meetings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Company managers and owners are conscious of the advantages of improved qualification of candidates for jobs through well managed TVET institutions which offer quality training close to market needs and potentials Motivation of companies to participate in project activities Companies recognise the Chambers of Commerce and Industry as their representative and aide CCI President and Board members support active engagement of CCI Director and Training Department in TVET CCI Director and Training Department manager are competent and assume an active role in the project and give it a key priority place

INTERVENTION LOGIC	INDICATORS	SOURCES OF VERIFICATION	ASSUMPTIONS
<p>Result 2 - Improved institutional capacities of involved parties</p> <p>Members of coordination bodies and curriculum development groups (management, professional staff and consultants in training institutions, chambers of commerce and industry, enterprises and involved government departments at the national, regional and local level) are trained, have gained experience in curriculum development, and implement continuously TVET according to the new model.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All training conducted is gender sensitive and gender balanced At least 30 % of those trained are women 30 core group people of the professional stakeholders are trained to be multipliers for upgrading capacity of other stakeholders. Curriculum developers in 5 locations are trained. Stakeholders are trained and developing & implementing CBMT (Enterprises, TVET teachers & trainers, CCI training unit). Exposure of working groups to TVET-CBMT in 6 countries in region & international Annual conference is conducted at end of each year. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Evaluation of ongoing training Evaluation missions Project documentation CCI reports Official communication of TVET Development Centre, Executive Board and Higher Council Public reports on visits abroad in a comparative view Conference proceedings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Motivation of companies to participate in project activities Relevance of training contents for professional careers Recognition of formal "Training of Trainers" programmes Motivation of those trained to take an active role in implementation of new CBMT curricula and modules
<p>Result 3</p> <p>Market-based curricula developed and implemented with companies and other partners</p> <p>Training institutions provide relevant and effective training in the selected vocational fields, translating flexibly and continuously labour market needs into existing and new programmes, related to an efficient monitoring system and making use of the agreed methodology for adaptation and development of labour market oriented programmes and modules (including entrepreneurship)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All developed modules are gender sensitive and allow participation of women and special needs groups. 1 year after project start, at least 20 occupational profiles are developed for the 5 fields. 1 year after project start, in each of the 5 fields, occupational profiles, curriculum outlines and 1 training module are ready. The local Curriculum Development Working Groups work regularly, produce curriculum outlines and modules and follow up their implementation. 1 year after project start, the national Curriculum Team has proposed a working methodology, laid down in a guidebook. At the end of year 2, at least 2 curricula per vocational field are new or revised. At the end of the project, all occupations with high demand (in the 5 vocational areas) are served by a new or revised training programme. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Evaluation of modules Evaluation missions Developed occupational profiles, curriculum outlines and training modules Project documentation: reports from follow-up visits to implementation sites, from Project Manager and Project Advisor and from CCI Training Managers Guidebook on the working methodology of the national Curriculum Team and the local Working Groups 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Directors and teachers of TVET institutions accept to engage in the new direction. The Ministries in charge certify graduates and license TVET institutions. Transparency of project operations for all involved stakeholders Efficient policy making bodies of TVET that meets regularly (to avoid delays & deliver on time) and supports the project.
<p>Result 4</p> <p>Locally and internationally accredited qualification standards</p> <p>Occupational profiles and competence-based modular curricula are accredited and implemented on a national scale, based on technically justified proposals presented by the stakeholders in the multi-partner bodies of the TVET system (Higher Council and Executive Board – Private sector organisations, Ministries, NGO, UNRWA)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Within 6 months from project start-up, trained TVET unit at AQAC has issued its accreditation criteria / regulation for CBMT certifications. Within 6 months from project start-up, the Ministries in charge accept experimenting new CBMT curricula and modules. In the second year of project operation, CBMT curricula and modules go for implementation in the whole country. MoEHE and MoL certify graduates and accredit new training programmes. TVET Higher Council and Executive Board approve the new curricula and modules. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Regulation of CBMT certification Declarations and press statements of the MoEHE Project reports Text of certificates 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Existence of the TVET unit at AQAC in MoEHE with the participation of MoL and under supervision of TVET Higher Council. Availability of approved Labour-market based Job Classification TVET policy decision regarding entry & exit conditions of the levels, and training requirement. MoEHE, MoL and other supervisory ministries and administrations accept application of new curricula and modules. MoEHE, MoL and other supervisory ministries and administrations certify trainees and accredit training programmes Economic sectors collaborate actively in the multi-partner bodies and support project activities.

5.2 Updated Logical framework

Logical Framework Matrix- Revised and agreed by JLCB March and April 2012 “Support to Technical and Vocational Education and Training in Palestine”

<i>Intervention logic</i>	<i>Indicators</i>	<i>Sources of verification</i>	<i>Assumptions</i>
<p><i>Overall objective (Specific Agreement BTC Palestine, 27-10-2005) Sustainable economic diversification and increased income opportunities are generated through the provision of appropriate vocational training</i></p>	<p><i>Increased employability & self-employability rates of youth</i></p> <p><i>Note: The Steering Committee reviews the indicators at one of its first meetings:</i></p>	<p><i>PCBS Statistics</i></p>	<p><i>Political & economic stability</i></p>
<p><i>Specific objective (Specific Agreement BTC Palestine, 27-10-2005) Youth and adults are enabled to acquire and update their competences on an equal basis through continuously adapting market-based vocational training programmes in some selected priority fields (Electro-technology, Electronics, Communication technology, Information technology, Business administration)</i></p>	<p><i>The (self) employment rate 6 months after graduation in the fields with improved curricula is at least 60 % at the end of the second year, and 75 % at the end of the project (or at least 20% increase over the current employment rates of graduates). At least 30 % of the learners in the selected specialisations are girls. At least 20% of Employers are better satisfied with trainees/ graduates competencies of the developed training programs.</i></p>	<p><i>Tracer Study of graduates within 6 months of graduation TVET institutes enrolment & graduates records Inquiries with graduates Training Needs Assessments Inquiries with employers Project reports Statistics at PCBS, MoL and Governorate-level Labour Offices Reports of MoEHE and MoL Reports of the participating CCI (moved from R3)</i></p>	<p><i>High priority for TVET on the agenda on the national level Effective & efficient bodies of the Palestinian TVET system support the project and ensure its smooth implementation. Motivated & experienced project team and stakeholders.</i></p>

Note : Revision was made following MTR findings and requested from stakeholders, it was endorsed by JLCB in March 2012. Overall objectives and specific objectives were un-changed from original TFF file, while outputs 1-3 were revised. Output 4 were integrated later in April 2012, after developing the output's concepts and plans.

INTERVENTION LOGIC	INDICATORS	SOURCES OF VERIFICATION	ASSUMPTIONS
<p>Result 1 Sustainable multi partner alliance established, linking training with the labour market <i>Enterprises and other users collaborate actively with training providers on the local level in demand analysis, programme selection and ongoing development, accept trainees for internships and apprenticeships and employ TVET graduates.</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> At least 20 companies and 20 institutions or organizations collaborate with the local TVET providers in each area One year after project start, each TVET provider collaborates with at least 3 companies and 1 institution or organisation, in the selected field. Three years after project starts The number of internships of trainees from the TVET providers in companies has increased by 50% Three years after project starts more than 70% of TVET institutes has systematized linkages with the labour market in each area (send graduates, receive speakers, train employees,) Three years after project starts more than 50% of graduate employment is due to linkages with the labour market The local TVET Coordination Committee meets regularly and agree and review an agenda of activities, which includes activities planned under project Over 70% of TVET institutes uses updated Labour Market Database that is linked to national LMIS 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Inquiries with Companies Project reports Reports of Chamber of Commerce and Industry and its Training Department Annual reports of TVET providers Reports of MoEHE and MoL Minutes of TVET Coordination Committee meetings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Company managers and owners are conscious of the advantages of improved qualification of candidates for jobs through well managed TVET institutions which offer quality training close to market needs and potentials Motivation of companies to participate in project activities Companies recognise the Chambers of Commerce and Industry as their representative and aide CCI President and Board members support active engagement of CCI Director and Training Department in TVET CCI Director and Training Department manager are competent and assume an active role in the project and give it a key priority place
<p>Result 2 - Improved capacities of all stakeholders -Institutional capacity building Members of coordination bodies and stakeholders (management, professional staff and counsellors in training institutions, chambers of commerce and industry, enterprises and involved government departments at the national, regional and local level) are trained, have gained experience in training program development linked to labour market needs and development, new technology and methods of TVET-Labour market linkages)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> At least 30 core group people of the professional stakeholders are trained to be multipliers for upgrading capacity of other stakeholders. All training conducted is gender sensitive and have gender specific elements At least 30 % of those trained are women At least 70% of trained TVET trainers are able to use new technology through capacity building by 2013 At least 400 Stakeholders trained on developing & implementing market relevant training program development (Enterprises, TVET teachers & trainers, CCI training unit) per area by third year Annual conference to share lessons learned is conducted at end of each year 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Evaluation of on-going training Evaluation missions Project documentation CCI reports Public reports on visits abroad in a comparative view Conference proceedings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Motivation of companies to participate in project activities Relevance of training contents for professional careers Recognition of formal "Training of Trainers" programmes Motivation of those trained to take an active role in TVET-Labour market linkages and in implementing different market relevant training modes
<p>Result 3 Market-based training program developed and implemented with companies and other partners Training institutions provide relevant and effective training in the selected vocational fields, translating flexibly and continuously labour market needs into existing and new programmes, related to an efficient monitoring system and making use of the agreed methodology for adaptation and development of labour market oriented programmes and modules (including entrepreneurship)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> By the end of the project At least 16 training programs are developed for the 5 fields. Including occupational profiles, training program outlines and 3 training program materials including modules. All developed training program materials are gender sensitive and allow participation of women and special needs groups 400 market representatives in the targeted fields have integrated their input in training program development A working methodology is laid down in a guidebook at the end of 2013 At least 2 training programs per vocational field are new or revised and being implemented At the end of the project, all occupations with high demand (in the 5 vocational areas) are served by a new or revised training programme 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Evaluation missions Developed occupational profiles, training program outlines and training modules Project documentation: reports from follow-up visits to implementation sites, from Project Manager and Project Advisor, TPDCs and from CCI Training Managers Guidebook on the working methodology 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Directors and teachers of TVET institutions accept to engage in the new direction. The Ministries in charge certify graduates and license TVET institutions. Transparency of project operations for all involved stakeholders Efficient policy making bodies of TVET that meets regularly (to avoid delays & deliver on time) and supports the project.

INTERVENTION LOGIC	INDICATORS	SOURCES OF VERIFICATION	ASSUMPTIONS
<p>Result 4 Developing and Supporting initiatives of TVET Stakeholders <i>Initiatives implemented by Private sector or their representatives AND TVET institute in the area/ governorate jointly through partnership relation to enhance market relevant training and employment.</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Criteria, system, forms and mechanism are in place • At least 8 projects implemented by entities (Company in cooperation with TVET institute), two in each area. • At least one piloted model of the implemented initiative would be up-scaled. • At least 30 employment and self-employment opportunity is generated, once initiative is accomplished • At least 5 TVET- Market cooperation is initiated in each area • At least 30% of female trainees and graduates are participating in the initiatives. • The initiatives' lessons learned and successes is documented and disseminated 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The produced Criteria, system, forms and mechanism • Signed Contracts with entities • Companies-TVET Cooperation agreements • Entities implementing Initiative reports • Reports of Chamber of Commerce and Industry and its Training Department • Project reports • Reports of MoEHE and MoL • Minutes of TVET Coordination Committee meetings • Minutes of selection committee • Minutes of Steering committee • Documented lessons learned and successes 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Motivation of companies to participate in the initiative • Motivation of TVET institutes to participate in the initiative • Companies and TVET are willing to commit to cooperation and sign cooperation agreements • CCI training Departments and local committees are willing to participate actively in the process • Technical members are willing to engage in selection process • Transparency of selection and implementation for all involved stakeholders

5.3 MoRe Results at a glance

Logical framework's results or indicators modified in last 12 months?	Based on MTR, updated Log frame was approved in March and added R4 Log Frame part was approved in April by JLCCB, amendments and additions were based on MTR findings and recommendations of MOE
Baseline Report registered on PIT?	The TNA is considered as a base line report for the project,
MTR	Done in 2010
Planning ETR	Q3 2013 (Sept. 2013)
Backstopping missions since 01/01/2012	May 2012

5.4 "Budget versus current (y – m)" Report

On the next page

5.5 Resources

The conducted Training Needs Assessment by the project in 2010 that was used as a basis for analysis and program development was translated to English during the year 2012. The English and Arabic versions were published on the TVET official web-site used by MOE/MOHE/MOL, links are:

1. The English version:

<http://www.tvet-pal.org/en/content/qualitative-and-quantitative-training-needs-assessment-study-qualified-workforce-within>

2. The Arabic version:

<http://www.tvet-pal.org/sites/default/files/The%20Last%20Version-%20TNA.pdf>

Furthermore the English version is published on the BTC website:

<http://www.btccb.org/en/news/training-needs-assessment>

The webpages for the CCIs developed through the project are also announcing all workshops, agreements, training and achievements of the project, the links are:

- Nablus Chamber of Commerce and Industry: <http://nablus-chamber.org/?from=28&page=7>
- Ramallah Chambers of Commerce and Industry: <http://www.ramallahcci.org/Default.aspx>
- Jerusalem Chambers of Commerce and Industry: <http://jacci.org/>
- Hebron Chambers of Commerce and Industry: http://www.hebroncci.org/p/w/index.php?Lang_Direction=rtl

All activities of the project are also covered by the local media

5.4 “Budget versus curent (y – m)” Report

5.5 Decisions taken by the JLCB and follow-up

Provide an overview of the important strategic decisions taken by the JLCB and the follow-up of those decisions.

Decision to take					Action			Follow-up	
Decision to take	Period of identification	Timing	Source	Actor	Action(s)	Resp.	Deadline	Progress	Status
Endorsement of annual report including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Approval for new employment of PM assistant instead of procurement officer - The amended Log Frame to reflect changes in the program - 2012 action and financial plan 	March 2012	March 2012	SC	BTC,MoE, MoHE, MoL, MoP, PFICC	PM assistant was employed	PM			Completed
Changed the word innovative into initiative in R4 Announcement will be done in the 4 regions Criteria for project proposals will be prepared by PT and technical committees Selected proposals must be approved by SC Approved R4 action and financial plans and Log frame MOEHE approved TOR in principle of the international technical assistant	April 2012	Oct 2012	SC	BTC,MoE, MoHE, MoL, MoP, PFICC	Amendment taken into consideration, R4 criteria and guidelines developed	PM, NA and CCI			Completed
Criteria for selection of TVET Institutes to Pilot the Developed Training Programs:	July 2012	August 2012	SC	BTC,MoE, MoHE, MoL, MoP, PFICC	The criteria was used for selection of TVET institutes receiving the equipment	PM			Completed
Setting up a unified introductory for the developed training programs	August 2012	October 2012	SC	BTC,MoE	Used the introductory on all the training modules	TPDC			Completed
Approve selection of applicants based on approved criteria and selection mechanism for stakeholders' initiative projects. R4	October 2012	December 2012	SC	BTC,MoE, MoHE, MoL, MoP, PFICC	Measures taken to move ahead with project implementation				Completed