



BTC VIETNAM



RESULTS REPORT 2015

**INTEGRATED WATER MANAGEMENT AND URBAN
DEVELOPMENT IN RELATION TO CLIMATE
CHANGE IN BINH THUAN**



CONTENTS

1. INTERVENTION AT A GLANCE	3
1.1 INTERVENTION FORM.....	4
1.2 BUDGET EXECUTION.....	5
1.3 SELF-ASSESSMENT PERFORMANCE.....	6
1.3.1 <i>Relevance</i>	6
1.3.2 <i>Effectiveness</i>	6
1.3.3 <i>Efficiency</i>	6
1.3.4 <i>Potential sustainability</i>	6
1.4 CONCLUSIONS	7
2 RESULTS MONITORING	8
2.1 EVOLUTION OF THE CONTEXT.....	8
2.1.1 <i>General context</i>	8
2.1.2 <i>Institutional context</i>	8
2.1.3 <i>Management context: execution modalities</i>	8
2.1.4 <i>Harmo context</i>	8
2.2 PERFORMANCE OUTCOME	9
2.2.1 <i>Progress of indicators</i>	9
2.2.2 <i>Analysis of progress made</i>	9
2.2.3 <i>Potential Impact</i>	9
2.3 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 1	10
2.3.1 <i>Progress of indicators</i>	10
2.3.2 <i>Progress of main activities</i>	11
2.3.3 <i>Analysis of progress made</i>	11
2.4 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 2	12
2.4.1 <i>Progress of indicators</i>	12
2.4.2 <i>Progress of main activities</i>	12
2.4.3 <i>Analysis of progress made</i>	13
2.5 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 3	13
2.5.1 <i>Progress of indicators</i>	13
2.5.2 <i>Progress of main activities</i>	14
2.5.3 <i>Analysis of progress made</i>	14
2.6 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 4	15
2.6.1 <i>Progress of indicators</i>	15
2.6.2 <i>Progress of main activities</i>	15
2.6.3 <i>Analysis of progress made</i>	15
2.7 TRANSVERSAL THEMES.....	16
2.7.1 <i>Gender</i>	16
2.8 RISK MANAGEMENT	17
3 STEERING AND LEARNING	18
3.1 STRATEGIC RE-ORIENTATIONS.....	18
3.2 RECOMMENDATIONS	18
3.3 LESSONS LEARNED.....	18
4 ANNEXES	19
4.1 QUALITY CRITERIA.....	19
4.2 DECISIONS TAKEN BY THE STEERING COMMITTEE AND FOLLOW-UP	22
4.3 UPDATED LOGICAL FRAMEWORK	24
4.4 MORE RESULTS AT A GLANCE	24
4.5 REPORT ON BUDGET AS OF 31 DECEMBER 2015.....	25
4.6 COMMUNICATION RESOURCES	29

1. INTERVENTION AT A GLANCE

Personnel:

The Project Steering Committee established under Decision 2124/QD-UBND dated September 03, 2013 and Decision 2055/QD-UBND, includes the followings:

- Mr. Huynh Thanh Canh, Vice Chairman of PPC – SC Chair;
- Mr. Alain Devaux, Resident Representative, Belgian Development Agency (BTC) in Vietnam – SC Co-Chair;
- Ms. Vo Hong Anh, Specialist, Foreign Economic Relations Department - Ministry of Planning and Investment – Member;
- Mr. Nguyen Hoang Lam, Division Head, Department of Debt Management and External Finance – Ministry of Finance – Member;
- Mr. Nguyen Tuan Anh, Deputy Director, Department of Science, Education, Natural Resource and Environment, representative of the Technical Support Unit – Member;
- Mr. Nguyen Duc Hoa, Director, Department of Planning and Investment – Member;
- Mr. Kieu Dien, Director, Project Coordination Unit (concurrently the Secretary of Steering Committee) – Member;
- Mr. Nguyen Van Hoa, Deputy Director, Department of Finance – Member;
- Mr. Do Van Thai, Deputy Director, Department of Natural Resource and Environment – Member;
- Mr. Nguyen Van Hanh, Vice Chairman, Bac Binh DPC – Member.

The Project Coordination Unit established under Decision 1969/QD-UBND dated August 20, 2013 currently includes the following:

- Dr. Kieu Dien, Director;
- Mr. Phan Nguyen Hoang Tan, Deputy Director;
- Mr. Nguyen Minh Quan, Urban Planning Specialist;
- Ms. Pham Thi Thanh Thanh, Financial Management;
- Mr. Nguyen Minh Thong, Translator;
- Ms. Tieu Thi Suong, Administrative Assistant – Accountant;
- Ms. Ho Thi Anh Dao, Hydro-meteorological Specialist;
- Mr. Nguyen Thanh Truc – Driver;

Logistics:

The Project Coordination Unit has its office at P01 Ton Duc Thang street, Xuan An ward, Phan Thiet city, Binh Thuan province. The office is equipped with vehicle, office equipment and furniture and other facilities for the minimal working condition.

Key events:

The Specific Agreement was signed on June 20, 2013 between the Government of the Socialist Republic of Vietnam and the Government of Belgium.

- The first PSC meeting was held on April 04, 2014.
- The second PSC meeting was held on September 05, 2015.

1.1 Intervention form

Intervention title	Integrated water management and urban development in relation to climate change in Binh Thuan province
Intervention code	VIE1204311
Location	The Luy River basin, Bac Binh district, Binh Thuan province
Total budget	6,000,000 EUR, In which: - Aid fund: 5,200,000 EUR. - Counterpart fund: 800,000 EUR.
Partner Institution	The Project Coordination Unit of the project Integrated water management and urban development in relation to climate change in Binh Thuan.
Start date of Specific Agreement	June 20, 2013
Date intervention start / Opening steering committee	September 03, 2013
Planned end date of execution period	19/06/2019
End date of Specific Agreement	19/06/2020
Target groups	Government authorities, communities and institutions related to climate change.
Impact	To contribute to the sustainable development of Binh Thuan province
Outcome	To support the institutional capacity in the province in integrated water resource management and urban development in relation to Climate Change
Outputs	R1. The capacity of the authorities of the province in terms of Climate Change, Integrated Water Resources Management and urban planning are improved with appropriate monitoring and evaluation mechanisms in place.
	R2. A comprehensive strategy on CC is in place. It is based on various studies, including CC data and hydraulic modelling focused on operational impact on settlements of Luy river catchment and the revision of the existing master plans of Luong Son, Cho Lau and Phan Ri Cua towns, while key priorities of the CC action plan of the Luy river basin are defined.
	R3. Priority strategic pilot activities are developed for lessons learnt targeting one of the 3 target towns to increase resilience to CC, with appropriate operational and maintenance modalities.
	R4. The provincial CC strategy is supported by the active involvement of the communities and the private sector.
Year covered by the report	2015

1.2 Budget execution

Unit: EUR

	Total project budget	Planned budget for 2015	Expenditure/ Disbursement			Act. Disb vs plan for 2015	Balance	Cul. Disb vs total budget (end of 2015)
			2013	2014	2015			
Total	6,000,000	1,939,229	7,106	155,502	459,127	24%	5,378,265	8%
Results 1: The capacity in CC, IWRM and urban planning within the province are improved	1,035,000	301,304		48,077	67,748	22%	919,175	7%
Results 2 – A comprehensive CC strategy is in place	840,000	347,800		19	7,999	2%	831,982	1%
Results 3 - Pilot intervention to improve physical conditions of one target town	2,300,000	1,089,300		35	323,625	30%	1,976,340	14%
Results 4 - Active involvement of community and private sector	170,000	9,000				0%	170,000	0%
Contingencies	203,900						203,900	
General costs	1,451,100	191,825	7,106	107,371	59,755	31%	1,276,868	4%

1.3 Self-assessment performance

1.3.1 Relevance

	Performance
<p>The project is consistent with the CC action plan of Binh Thuan province for the period 2012 – 2015 and the period 2016 – 2020 issued under Decision 1175/QD-UBND dated 19/6/2012 of Binh Thuan PPC, in line with the national CC strategy. It also contributes significantly to mitigating CC impacts on socio-economy of the province.</p> <p>The project logical framework is relevant with the global objective and specific objectives of the project. Project indicators, risks and assumptions remain relevant. As a result of M&E workshops, the Binh Thuan PCU is finalizing the Baseline Report to be approved in the next PSC meeting, in April 2016 expectedly.</p>	A

1.3.2 Effectiveness

	Performance
<p>In 2015, PCU was adequately provided with financial resources and required working facilities/ equipment to implement the project. Recruitment of translator was completed. Recruitment of other specialists will be undertaken in 2016.</p> <p>In 2015, PCU accelerated progress of all activities. However, the activities were ongoing without any specific achievement made. Several activities are expected to be completed in 2016 for assessment of quality and effectiveness.</p>	B

1.3.3 Efficiency

	Performance
<p>To date, performance of project activities still ensures delivery of project results, relevance to CC situation in the area. Certain project activities are now still in the study and implementation stage.</p>	B

1.3.4 Potential sustainability

	Performance
<p>Possibility to maintain the funding resources for services and maintenance is very high, depending on local and provincial policies.</p> <p>So far, implementation of the project has been relied on PSC decisions, technical suggestions/recommendation of relevant agencies prior to approval, involvement of mass organizations and the public in community activities. However, the coordination mechanisms need improving.</p> <p>Sectoral policies have not impeded the activities during the project implementation.</p> <p>The project management was integrated into relevant agencies's activities. Capacity building is required for the implementation.</p>	B

1.4 Conclusions

1.4.1. Assessment of progress of project activities

In 2015, given supports from the Belgian Development Agency (BTC) and the Technical Support Unit (TSU), directions and guidance from the Provincial People's Committee and Department of Planning and Investment, attention and assistance from related agencies, operation of the Project Coordination Unit gradually became more well-organized. Almost all activities have been implemented but with some delay. As implicit in the brief of the 4 outputs for the planned year 2015 above, contribution to realizing 4 indicators of the outcome regarding support to the institutional capacity in Binh Thuan Province in integrated water resources management and urban development in relation to Climate Change was limited.

In 2016, the PCU will speed up progress of activities. Several activities are expected to be accomplished, which in turn contribute to materializing the project outcome.

PCU Binh Thuan



Kieu Dien

Project Director

BTC Vietnam



Alain Devaux

Resident Representative

2 Results Monitoring

2.1 Evolution of the context

2.1.1 General context

The project was deployed in the context the Government of Vietnam and Binh Thuan authorities were taking top priority activities to address and mitigate CC impacts, which have been adversely impacting on the socio-economic life, especially in the hinterlands of large rivers and coastal areas, as well as focusing on the mitigation of CC economic factors. Binh Thuan PPC has issued the action plan to respond to climate change for the period 2012 – 2015 and the period 2016 – 2020 and set forth CC adaptation and mitigation measures in Binh Thuan province.

According to the 2015 Socio-economic Report, achievement by the forestry sector with regards to forest protection and development met or exceeded the set target. Especially, planting of trees reached 133% compared to plan. Likewise, in the field of environment and natural resources, results relating to environmental criteria such as collection of solid waste, address of environmental pollution were implemented as foreseen in the plan. Such achievement contributed to reducing emission and effects of GHG, thus mitigating adverse CC impact on environment and socio-economic life of local people.

2.1.2 Institutional context

Certain amendments to Vietnamese legal regulations on construction, project management, procurement were made in the year. Such amendments did not cause significant effect on the implementation of project activities.

The fact that it took significant time for related agencies to provide technical advice and perform appraisals delayed progress of certain project activities.

2.1.3 Management context: execution modalities

The execution modalities engaged by PCU were based on TFF provisions and Vietnamese regulations, directions of BTC and PPC. The advantage enjoyed by PCU in 2015 was the timely supports given by TSU experts to the studies (Result 2), which helped PCU speed up progress of those activities.

The limit faced by PCU was the time-consuming process for obtaining technical advice and approval from provincial departments/ agencies, adversely affecting the progress of several activities.

2.1.4 Harmo context

Although POM has not been made available in 2015, PCU has been trying to follow Vietnamese management regulations and TFF to execute the project activities without obstacles. In addition, improvement in the coordination/ collaboration mechanism among BTC, TSU and PCU facilitated the implementation of the project.

PCU actively coordinated, collaborated with relevant provincial agencies to share and exchange information, improve institutional aspects to accelerate the project progress.

The change of TSU's key experts somewhat affected the technical support provided to PCU.

2.2 Performance outcome



2.2.1 Progress of indicators

No	Outcome - Indicators	Unit of measurement	Baseline value	Value 2014	Value 2015	Target 2015	Final target value
OUTCOME : To support the institutional capacity in Binh Thuan Province in integrated water resources management and urban development in relation to Climate Change.							
1	Number of documents issued which address CC	No.	tbc			tbc	tbc
2	Number of trained stakeholders or trained staff who contribute newly acquired CC knowledge to decision-making processes	No.	tbc			tbc	tbc
3	% of provincial budget is invested in activities related to CC	%	tbc			tbc	tbc
4	Measurable increase in institutional capacity with respect to assessment criteria from the TICA	Descriptive				Not required	

(Indicator values will be finalized for approval in the next PSC meeting, in April 2016 expectedly).

2.2.2 Analysis of progress made

- For the first indicator with regard to number of documents issued which address CC: no specific documents issued as at 2015.
- For the second indicator about number of trained stakeholders or trained staff who contribute newly acquired CC knowledge to decision-making processes: 50 staffs were trained in CC, integrated water management and urban development.
- For the third indicator with respect to ratio of provincial budget is invested in activities related to CC: to be surveyed and assessed in the Baseline Report.
- For the fourth indicator in terms of measurable increase in institutional capacity with respect to assessment criteria from the TICA: no concrete accomplishment was available as it was in the inception phase and seeking approval for packages.

2.2.3 Potential Impact

- Output 1: several activities concerning the 6 indicators have been undertaken with specific achievement made to the training activity.
- Output 2: three fourth of planned activities were carried out without any concrete achievement yet.
- Output 3: one drainage work of 03 kilometers was constructed.
- Output 4: initial planning for communication and community activities was started and awareness raising activities for agencies and local authorities were conducted, thus delivery of results for 7 indicators was not available.

As implicit in the brief of the 4 outputs for the planned year 2015 above, contribution to realizing 4 indicators for the outcome regarding support to the institutional capacity in Binh Thuan Province in integrated water resources management and urban development in relation to Climate Change was limited.

2.3 Performance output 1



2.3.1 Progress of indicators

No	Output - Indicators	Unit of measurement	Baseline value	Value 2014	Value 2015	Target 2015	Final target value
OUTPUT 1 : The capacity of the authorities of the province in terms of Climate Change, Integrated Water Resources Management and Urban Planning are improved with appropriate monitoring and evaluation mechanisms in place.							
1.1	Number of staff trained on climate change, integrated water resource management and/or urban development	No.	0	30	20	50	1000
1.2	Average change in scores on entry and exit tests	%	0				50%
1.3	Appropriate equipment and software systems are in place	System	tbc				
1.4	Responsiveness of data (CC-IWRM & UD) management system to the provincial users	%	tbc				tbc
1.5	Coordination and communication mechanism responds to the knowledge management need of the provincial authorities	%	tbc				tbc
1.6	New and relevant information is available from the expanded hydrological & meteorological monitoring network	%	tbc				tbc

(Indicator values will be finalized for approval in the next PSC meeting, in April 2016 expectedly).

2.3.2 Progress of main activities

Progress of <u>main</u> activities	Progress:			
	A	B	C	D
1. Capacity development for the Project Coordination Unit (PCU) in project management, procurement, M&E and reporting.		x		
- The Project Operation Manual (POM)			x	
- Trainings on project management		x		
- Development of an M&E strategy, training and coaching in coordination with central level, Resident Representative's office and TSU.		x		
2. Needs assessment of the institutional and technical capacities		x		
3. Capacity building in CC and IWRM and urban development for relevant authorities and partners		x		
4. Strengthening cooperation/coordination mechanisms among agencies with regards to CC, IWRM and urban development		x		
5. Data collection		x		
6. Support to hydro-meteorological monitoring stations		x		
7. Comprehensive database management through GIS		x		
8. Communication and dissemination of lessons learned		x		

2.3.3 Analysis of progress made

- Capacity building for the PCU in project management, procurement, M&E and reporting includes:
 - + Participating in the M&E workshop organized by BTC, providing feedbacks for development and finalization of the Project Operation Manual (POM).
 - + Development and finalization of the Project Operation Manual (POM) will take time. Final draft POM is being elaborated by TSU expert for submission to PSC for approval
- Technical and institutional capacity assessment: PCU delayed in development of TOR and approval of the outline - cost estimate for the Technical and Institutional Capacity Assessment (TICA) and Capacity Development (CD) Plan in water resources management and CC in Binh Thuan province. Evaluation of bids is on-going. Delivery of this activity is expected in the beginning of Q3.2016.
- Capacity building in CC and IWRM and urban development for relevant authorities and partners and involvement of community was still in line with the set schedule. Specifically, PCU sent staffs to attend workshop on communication and community, Green growth kick-off workshop, workshop on gender integration into action plan of REDD + Binh Thuan province (PRAP), workshop on awareness raising in integrated water resources organized by Ninh Thuan MCDU, the Australian study tour organized by TSU.

- Data collection: PCU completed the data collection from provincial agencies to develop TORs for the HH study and the CC study. PCU is now completing the Baseline Report to be approved in the PSC meeting in April 2016.

- Support to hydro-meteorological monitoring stations: Performance of survey and needs assessment for support to hydro-meteorological monitoring stations in Binh Thuan province and in the Luy River basin was in line with schedule. Specific support will be started after results of the HH and CC studies are made available.

- Comprehensive database management through GIS: As foreseen in the plan, PCU in coordination with TSU started collecting data with regard to human resources, equipment, necessity and capacity to apply GIS to CC activities from provincial agencies

- Communication and dissemination of lessons learned: PCU completed development of the general communication plan for the period 2016 – 2018 and detailed action plan for 2016 in line with schedule.

2.4 Performance output 2

2.4.1 Progress of indicators

No	Output - Indicators	Unit of measurement	Baseline value	Value 2014	Value 2015	Target 2015	Final target value
OUTPUT 2 : A comprehensive strategy on CC is in place							
2.1	Progress on the implementation of the studies	No.	tbc				tbc
2.2	A CC adaptation action plan is approved	%	tbc				tbc
2.3	Master plans (provincial, cities/town) revised with regard to CC	No.	tbc				tbc
2.4	Prioritised proposals on CC are developed	No.	tbc				tbc

(Indicator values will be finalized for approval in the next PSC meeting, in April 2016 expectedly).

2.4.2 Progress of main activities

Progress of <u>main</u> activities	Progress:			
	A	B	C	D
1. Comprehensive studies and modelling of the Luy River basin			x	
2. Support to revision of the CC strategy in a participative way based on the studies		x		
3. Master plans revision of towns and hinterlands along Luy river considering CC and SSP principles		x		
4. Priority action plan, methodology, tools and consultancy		x		

2.4.3 Analysis of progress made

- Comprehensive studies and modelling of the Luy River basin:
 - + PCU organized procurement of consultants for the hydraulic/ hydrologic modelling of the Luy river basin in relation to climate change and the climate change downscaling for water management in the Luy River basin, Binh Thuan province. BTC NOLs to the contractor selection result (bidding result) for the two studies are currently expected. Completion of the two studies are of crucial importance for development of a comprehensive integrated CC strategy. In 2015 the progress of the two studies was delayed due to extended time in approval and procurement.
 - + Other studies such as land degradation and desertification study, coastal salinity and erosion study were in the process of seeking approval to the outline, cost estimate and preparing for procurement as foreseen in the plan.
- Support to revision of the CC strategy in a participative way based on the studies were in line with schedule.
- Master plans revision of towns and hinterlands along Luy river considering CC and SSP principles:
 - + Currently, local floodings always take place during rainy season in Cho Lau while the existing drainage system fails to drain properly the area. Previously constructed drainage works were not synchronized and proved to be ineffective due to lack of a detailed drainage plan. Therefore, it is necessary to make the 1/2000 drainage planning for the northern center of Cho Lau town. The second PSC meeting on September 5, 2015 approved that this activity will be started after the HH study and CC downscaling study complete.
 - + Other plans will be implemented in the next phases.
- Priority action plan, methodology, tools and consultancy were still in conformity with schedule.

2.5 Performance output 3

2.5.1 Progress of indicators

No	Output - Indicators	Unit of measurement	Baseline value	Value 2014	Value 2015	Target 2015	Final target value
OUTPUT 3 : Priority strategic pilot activities are developed for lessons learned							
3.1	No of (pilot) investments implemented, complying with CC adaptation specifications	No.	0	0	1	1	4
3.2	Effective O&M is implemented for each priority investment	%	tbc			tbc	tbc
3.3	No. of lessons-learned documents prepared on innovative features of the priority investments and of other aspects of the Project	No.	tbc			tbc	tbc
3.4	No. of km fresh water supply system was built.	Km.	0	0	0	0	15
3.5	No of km drainage system was built	Km.	0	0	3	3	7
3.6	No of km river bank was built/upgraded	Km.	0	0	0	0	0.6

(Indicator values will be finalized for approval in the next PSC meeting, in April 2016 expectedly).

2.5.2 Progress of main activities

Progress of <u>main</u> activities	Progress:			
	A	B	C	D
1. Physical infrastructure to adapt 1 urban center and its close hinterland to CC.	x			
2. Support to appropriate O&M measures		x		

2.5.3 Analysis of progress made

- In 2015, PCU implemented the construction of Luong Son drainage work. The work was completed in January 2016 and will be handed-over to the local authority in March 2016. Seeking approval to, tendering for the construction of Cho Lau drainage work were completed. Preparation for the construction is ongoing.

Early implementation of investments for the drainage systems in Luong Son town and Cho Lau town is a flexible intervention aiming to support local authorities to improve the living conditions of the urban population vulnerable to CC. In the current context, Luong Son and Cho Lau are the worst affected towns in the project area where local floodings often occur during rainy season, physical infrastructures fail to meet the drainage demand. Design of the drainage system must be consistent with the overall planning of the towns and adaptable to climate change while sustainable aspects have been taken into consideration. Decisions with regard to operation and maintenance would suggest that authorities coordinate with mass organizations, communities, especially women union to ensure the sustainability and efficiency of the works.

This activity was approved by the Project Steering Committee and relevant agencies in the first PSC meeting. Relevant agencies provided technical advice to the survey, design and construction during the implementation, and the Department of Planning and Investment consolidated the advice and advised the PPC to approve the project.

- The second PSC meeting on September 5, 2015 approved the investment proposals for the Luy River embankment and the water supply system in Luong Son town. PCU is currently making investment preparation for the two works.

* Appropriate O&M measures will be developed in consistent with local management mechanisms. This activity will be implemented once construction of physical works complete.

2.6 Performance output 4

2.6.1 Progress of indicators

No	Output - Indicators	Unit of measurement	Baseline value	Value 2014	Value 2015	Target 2015	Final target value
OUTPUT 4 : The provincial CC strategy is supported by the active involvement of the communities and the private sector.							
4.1	A public CC awareness raising strategy is developed	No.	tbc			tbc	tbc
4.2	A disaster early warning system is developed	%	tbc			tbc	tbc
4.3	No. of beneficiaries of newly upgraded CC resilient houses	No.	tbc			tbc	tbc
4.4	No. of new people participating in CC credit program	No.	tbc			tbc	tbc
4.5	No. of people participating in newly established committees	No.	tbc			tbc	tbc
4.6	Sample evidence of attempts to involve communities and/or private sector	Descriptive				Not required	
4.7	Sample evidence of changed behaviour due to increased awareness	Descriptive				Not required	

(Indicator values will be finalized for approval in the next PSC meeting, in April 2016 expectedly).

2.6.2 Progress of main activities

Progress of <u>main</u> activities	Progress:			
	A	B	C	D
Awareness raising campaigns about CC impact, change of behavior, water & energy efficiency		x		
Set-up of platforms of dialogue for all major stakeholders		x		

Legend : A: The activities are ahead of schedule ; B: The activities are on schedule ; C : The activities are delayed ; D The activities are seriously delayed (more than 6 months).

2.6.3 Analysis of progress made

- In 2015, PCU developed a comprehensive communication strategy for the project. PCU started implementing communication and community activities with TSU support in terms of workshops, seminars and development of workplan. In 2016, PCU will perform all communication and community activities as planned.

2.7 Transversal Themes

2.7.1 Gender

In 2015 PCU engaged representatives of the Women Union in the communication and community workshops, e.g:

- + Workshop on finalization of the communication and community development strategy.
- + Communication workshop on water management and urban development in relation to CC.

2.8 Risk management

Risk Identification			Risk analysis			Risk Treatment			Follow-up of risks	
Description of Risk	Period of identification	Category	Probability	Potential Impact	Total	Action(s)	Resp.	Deadline	Progress	Status
Project Operation Manual (POM) not available	From start-up	JUR	Low	Low	Low	BTC, TSU support to develop POM	BTC, TSU, PCU	March 2016	Ongoing	
Devaluation of Euro currency	Start of 2015	FIN	Average	Average	Average	PCU need to balance budget lines in execution	PCU	End of 2016	Ongoing	
Site clearance (land acquisition) for works	June 2015	OPS	Average	Average	Average	Relevant agencies, local authorities advocate local people in support of site clearance/ land acquisition	PCU and local agencies	Q2 2016	On going	
Delays in feedbacks and approvals by provincial departments and agencies	April 2014	OPS	Average	Average	Average	Close coordination/ collaboration with the PPC and related departments through PCU, and TSU should facilitate the procedures	PPC, PCU and agencies	2016	On going	

3 Steering and Learning

3.1 Strategic re-orientations

On the basis of the analysis made, activities that will be done differently next year to achieve the objectives are as follows:

- Provide advice to fill up the vacancy of the PSC due to changes in organizational structure in the PPC and agencies/ localities.
- Completely fill up vacancies for the PCU and procure equipment as required.
- Continue enhancing capacity for PCU staffs.
- Improve relation, coordination with agencies to accelerate progress of project activities.
- Prepare achievable annual workplan for 2016 in consistent with the comprehensive workplan of the project.
- Closely monitor and follow up planned activities. Control and make sure disbursement are observed the plan.
- Review the TFF to ensure performance of activities are consistent with project objectives and appropriate to actual conditions in the context where CC becomes increasingly severe and the shrinkage of project budget due to devaluation of euro currency.

3.2 Recommendations

Recommendations	Actor	Deadline
Approval of the workplan and disbursement for 2016	Project Steering Committee	Q1, 2016
Approval of the Project Operation Manual (POM).	Project Steering Committee	Q1, 2016
Approval of the Baseline Report	Project Steering Committee	Q2, 2016

3.3 Lessons Learned

Lessons learned	Target audience
PCU staffs should study further TFF, POM, Vietnamese regulations, thereby closely monitoring the implementation of procedures and enhancing capacity and responsibilities in performing their tasks and duties.	PCU
Development of a highly effective workplan and disbursement plan.	BTC, PPC, TSU, departments.
Acceleration of the advice and approval to ensure the project progress	PCU and local agencies.

4 Annexes

4.1 Quality criteria

1. RELEVANCE: The degree to which the intervention is in line with local and national policies and priorities as well as with the expectations of the beneficiaries				
<i>In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as follows: 'At least one 'A', no 'C' or 'D' = A; Two times 'B' = B; At least one 'C', no 'D' = C; at least one 'D' = D</i>				
Assessment RELEVANCE: total score	A	B	C	D
	x			
1.1 What is the present level of relevance of the intervention?				
x	A	Clearly still embedded in national policies and Belgian strategy, responds to aid effectiveness commitments, highly relevant to needs of target group.		
...	B	Still fits well in national policies and Belgian strategy (without always being explicit), reasonably compatible with aid effectiveness commitments, relevant to target group's needs.		
...	C	Some issues regarding consistency with national policies and Belgian strategy, aid effectiveness or relevance.		
...	D	Contradictions with national policies and Belgian strategy, aid efficiency commitments; relevance to needs is questionable. Major adaptations needed.		
1.2 As presently designed, is the intervention logic still holding true?				
x	A	Clear and well-structured intervention logic; feasible and consistent vertical logic of objectives; adequate indicators; Risks and Assumptions clearly identified and managed; exit strategy in place (if applicable).		
	B	Adequate intervention logic although it might need some improvements regarding hierarchy of objectives, indicators, Risk and Assumptions.		
	C	Problems with intervention logic may affect performance of intervention and capacity to monitor and evaluate progress; improvements necessary.		
	D	Intervention logic is faulty and requires major revision for the intervention to have a chance of success.		

2. EFFICIENCY OF IMPLEMENTATION TO DATE: Degree to which the resources of the intervention (funds, expertise, time, etc.) have been converted into results in an economical way				
<i>In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as follows: 'At least two 'A', no 'C' or 'D' = A; Two times 'B', no 'C' or 'D' = B; at least one 'C', no 'D' = C; at least one 'D' = D</i>				
Assessment EFFICIENCY : total score	A	B	C	D
		X		
2.1 How well are inputs (financial, HR, goods & equipment) managed?				
X	A	All inputs are available on time and within budget.		
	B	Most inputs are available in reasonable time and do not require substantial budget adjustments. However there is room for improvement.		
	C	<i>Availability and usage of inputs face problems, which need to be addressed; otherwise results may be at risk.</i>		
	D	Availability and management of inputs have serious deficiencies, which threaten the achievement of results. Substantial change is needed.		

2.2 How well is the implementation of activities managed?	
	A Activities implemented on schedule
X	B Most activities are on schedule. Delays exist, but do not harm the delivery of outputs
	C Activities are delayed. Corrections are necessary to deliver without too much delay.
	D Serious delay. Outputs will not be delivered unless major changes in planning.
2.3 How well are outputs achieved?	
	A All outputs have been and most likely will be delivered as scheduled with good quality contributing to outcomes as planned.
X	B Output delivery is and will most likely be according to plan, but there is room for improvement in terms of quality, coverage and timing.
	C Some output are/will be not delivered on time or with good quality. Adjustments are necessary.
	D Quality and delivery of outputs has and most likely will have serious deficiencies. Major adjustments are needed to ensure that at least the key outputs are delivered on time.

3. EFFECTIVENESS TO DATE: Degree to which the outcome (Specific Objective) is achieved as planned at the end of year N				
<i>In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as follows: 'At least one 'A', no 'C' or 'D' = A; Two times 'B' = B; At least one 'C', no 'D' = C; at least one 'D' = D</i>				
Assessment EFFECTIVENESS : total score	A	B	C	D
		x		
3.1 As presently implemented what is the likelihood of the outcome to be achieved?				
	A	Full achievement of the outcome is likely in terms of quality and coverage. Negative effects (if any) have been mitigated.		
X	B	Outcome will be achieved with minor limitations; negative effects (if any) have not caused much harm.		
	C	Outcome will be achieved only partially among others because of negative effects to which management was not able to fully adapt. Corrective measures have to be taken to improve ability to achieve outcome.		
	D	The intervention will not achieve its outcome unless major, fundamental measures are taken.		
3.2 Are activities and outputs adapted (when needed), in order to achieve the outcome?				
	A	The intervention is successful in adapting its strategies / activities and outputs to changing external conditions in order to achieve the outcome. Risks and assumptions are managed in a proactive manner.		
X	B	The intervention is relatively successful in adapting its strategies to changing external conditions in order to achieve its outcome. Risks management is rather passive.		
	C	The intervention has not entirely succeeded in adapting its strategies to changing external conditions in a timely or adequate manner. Risk management has been rather static. An important change in strategies is necessary in order to ensure the intervention can achieve its outcome.		
	D	The intervention has failed to respond to changing external conditions, risks were insufficiently managed. Major changes are needed to attain the outcome.		

4. POTENTIAL SUSTAINABILITY: The degree of likelihood to maintain and reproduce the benefits of an intervention in the long run (beyond the implementation period of the intervention).				
<i>In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as follows: At least 3 'A's, no 'C' or 'D' = A ; Maximum two 'C's, no 'D' = B; At least three 'C's, no 'D' = C ; At least one 'D' = D</i>				
Assessment POTENTIAL SUSTAINABILITY : total score	A	B	C	D
		x		
4.1 Financial/economic viability?				
	A	Financial/economic sustainability is potentially very good: costs for services and maintenance are covered or affordable; external factors will not change that.		
X	B	Financial/economic sustainability is likely to be good, but problems might arise namely from changing external economic factors.		
	C	Problems need to be addressed regarding financial sustainability either in terms of institutional or target groups costs or changing economic context.		
	D	Financial/economic sustainability is very questionable unless major changes are made.		
4.2 What is the level of ownership of the intervention by target groups and will it continue after the end of external support?				
	A	The steering committee and other relevant local structures are strongly involved in all stages of implementation and are committed to continue producing and using results.		
x	B	Implementation is based in a good part on the steering committee and other relevant local structures, which are also somewhat involved in decision-making. Likelihood of sustainability is good, but there is room for improvement.		
	C	The intervention uses mainly ad-hoc arrangements and the steering committee and other relevant local structures to ensure sustainability. Continued results are not guaranteed. Corrective measures are needed.		
	D	The intervention depends completely on ad-hoc structures with no prospect of sustainability. Fundamental changes are needed to enable sustainability.		
4.3 What is the level of policy support provided and the degree of interaction between intervention and policy level?				
	A	Policy and institutions have been highly supportive of intervention and will continue to be so.		
x	B	Policy and policy enforcing institutions have been generally supportive, or at least have not hindered the intervention, and are likely to continue to be so.		
	C	Intervention sustainability is limited due to lack of policy support. Corrective measures are needed.		
	D	Policies have been and likely will be in contradiction with the intervention. Fundamental changes needed to make intervention sustainable.		
4.4 How well is the intervention contributing to institutional and management capacity?				
	A	Intervention is embedded in institutional structures and has contributed to improve the institutional and management capacity (even if this is not an explicit goal).		
x	B	Intervention management is well embedded in institutional structures and has somewhat contributed to capacity building. Additional expertise might be required. Improvements in order to guarantee sustainability are possible.		
	C	Intervention relies too much on ad-hoc structures instead of institutions; capacity building has not been sufficient to fully ensure sustainability. Corrective measures are needed.		
	D	Intervention is relying on ad hoc and capacity transfer to existing institutions, which could guarantee sustainability, is unlikely unless fundamental changes are undertaken.		

4.2 Decisions taken by the steering committee and follow-up

Decision taken					Action			Follow-up	
Decision taken	Period of identification	Timing	Source	Actor	Action(s)	Resp.	Deadline	Progress	Status
The first PSC meeting minute on April 04, 2014	2014 onwards	April, 2014	PCU, TSU, BTC	The Luy River basin and 02 target towns of Luong Son, Cho Lau	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Project Coordination Unit in collaboration with the Technical Support Unit (TSU) speeded up the progress of capacity development activities, studies of the Luy River basin, proposed investments including detailed drainage planning for the center area of Cho Lau town and development of investment projects for the drainage system in the towns of Luong Son and Cho Lau, development of investment project for the Luy river embankment. - Approval of the inception phase report and the workplan for the next 6 months. 	PCU	2014	Ongoing	
The conclusion announcement of the first PSC meeting on April 04, 2014 by Mr. Huynh Thanh Canh - Vice Chairman of the PPC	2014 onwards	June, 2014	PCU						
The second PSC meeting minute on September 15, 2015 and the Notification on	Sep 2015 to Q1 2016	Sep 2015	PCU, TSU, BTC	PCU	In-principle approval of the standard format of the Project Operation Manual (POM). The PCU to complete the provincial POM to its specific aspects for submission to PSC for approval	PCU	Q1 2016	Completed. To be approved in the next PSC meeting in Q2 2016	

implementation of PSC meeting notes by the PPC	After results of hydraulic/hydrologic study and CC downscaling study are made available.	2016 – 2017	PCU, TSU, agencies	Luong Son town, Bac Binh dist	Obtaining a consensus on development of 1/500 detailed planning for the unplanned part (25ha) of Luong Binh village and 1/2000 planning for Luong Hoa village, Luong Son town.	PCU		To be implemented	
	Sep 2015 to end of project	2016 - 2018	PCU, TSU, agencies	The Luy River basin and two target towns of Luong Son and Cho Lau	Obtaining approval to the investment proposals for the Luy River embankment and the expansion of the water supply system in Luong Son town.	PCU	2018	Preparation of paperwork	
	Sep 2015 to end of project	2016 – 2019	PCU	PCU	Reallocation of certain budget lines in TFF	PCU	2019	Ongoing	

4.3 Updated Logical framework

The logical framework remains unchanged against the Technical and Financial File

4.4 MoRe Results at a glance

Logical framework's results or indicators modified in last 12 months?	The logical framework remains unchanged against the Technical and Financial File
Baseline Report registered on PIT?	To be approved in the next PSC meeting in April 2016
Planning MTR (registration of report)	2016
Planning ETR (registration of report)	2019
Backstopping missions since 01/01/2012	

4.5 Report on budget as of 31 December 2015

Budget Code	Activities	FIN mode	Budget			Disbursement in the first year		Disbursement in the second year		Balance	
			Total	Belgian contribution	Vietnamese contribution	BEL	VN	BEL	VN	BEL	VN
A	Total		4,345,000	3,895,000	450,000	48,131		310,096	89,276	3,536,773	360,724
A 1	Results 1: The capacity in CC, IWRM and urban planning within the province are improved		1,035,000	1,035,000	0	48,077		67,748	0	919,175	
A 1 1	Capacity building for PCU in project management, procurement, M & E and reporting	OM	210,000	210,000		43,143		57,676		109,181	
A 1 2	Technical Institutional and Capacity Needs Assessment	PM	40,000	40,000		877		993		38,130	
A 1 3	Capacity building of related agencies and stakeholders in IWRM, urbanization and CC	PM	260,000	260,000		3,968		9,079		246,953	
A 1 4	Strengthen cooperation/coordination mechanism among agencies with regards to CC, IWRM and urban planning	PM	80,000	80,000		89				79,911	
A 1 5	Data collection (including baseline study)	PM	205,000	205,000						205,000	

A	1	6	Support to hydro-meteorological monitoring stations	PM	60,000	60,000					60,000		
A	1	7	Comprehensive database management through GIS	PM	100,000	100,000					100,000		
	1	8	Communication and dissemination of lessons learnt	PM	80,000	80,000					80,000		
A	2		Results 2 – A comprehensive integrated CC strategy is in place	PM	840,000	840,000		19		7,999	831,982		
A	2	1	Comprehensive studies and modeling of Luy river basin		610,000	610,000				6,853	603,147		
A	2	2	Support to revision of the CC strategy in a participative way based on the studies		50,000	50,000					50,000		
A	2	3	Master plans revision of towns and hinterlands along Luy river considering CC and SSP principles		150,000	150,000		19		1,146	148,835		
A	2	4	Priority action plan, methodology, tools, process and consultancy		30,000	30,000					30,000		
A	3		Results 3 - Pilot intervention to improve physical conditions of one target town	PM	2,300,000	1,850,000	450,000	35		234,349	89,276	1,615,616	360,724
A	3	1	Physical infrastructure to adapt one urban center and its close hinterlands to CC		2,250,000	1,850,000	400,000	35		234,349	89,276	1,615,616	310,724
A	3	2	Support to appropriate O & M measures		50,000		50,000					0	50,000

A	4		Results 4 - Active involvement of community and private sector	PM	170,000	170,000	0	0	0	0	0	170,000	0
A	4	1	Awareness raising campaigns about CC impact, change of behavior, water & energy efficiency		100,000	100,000						100,000	0
A	4	2	Set-up of platforms of dialogue for all major stakeholders		70,000	70,000						70,000	0
X			Contingencies		203,900	203,900	0	0	0	0	0	203,900	0
X	1		Contingencies		203,900	203,900						203,900	0
X	1	1	Contingencies Project Management	PM	162,900	162,900						162,900	0
X	1	2	Contingencies Own Management	OM	41,000	41,000						41,000	0
Z			General costs		1,451,100	1,101,100	350,000	67,904	46,572	32,372	27,383	1,009,327	276,045
Z	1		Human Resources	OM	950,400	677,200	273,200	13,803	22,878	20,339	26,418	651,561	223,904
Z	1	1	Technical assistance		396,000	346,000	50,000	3,790	0	4,713	0	346,000	50,000
Z	1	2	PCU Staff	PM	554,400	331,200	223,200	10,013	22,878	15,626	26,418	305,561	173,904
Z	2		Investments	PM	60,240	57,200	3,040	43,687	3,040			13,513	0
	2	1	Vehicles		34,040	31,000	3,040	28,692	3,040			2,308	0
	2	2	Office Equipment		11,200	11,200		7,109				4,091	0
	2	3	IT Equipment		10,000	10,000		6,742				3,258	0
	2	4	Office rehabilitation & LAN installation		5,000	5,000		1,144				3,856	0
Z	3		Operating costs	PM	302,960	229,200	73,760	9,348	20,654	11,324	965	208,528	52,141
	3	1	Office Rent		31,210		31,210		20,654			0	10,556
	3	2	Utilities		21,600	21,600		416		2,255		18,929	0
	3	3	Vehicle operating costs		36,000	36,000		1,556		2,249		32,195	0
	3	4	Communications including internet		10,800	10,800		215		431		10,154	0

	3	5	Operational costs		107,350	64,800	42,550	4,103		6,116	965	54,581	41,585
	3	6	Flights and per diem (to attend TSU activities)		84,000	84,000		2,681				81,319	0
	3	7	Provincial Steering Committee		12,000	12,000		377		273		11,350	0
Z	4		Audit, follow-up and evaluation	PM	137,500	137,500	0	1,066	0	709	0	135,725	0
	4	1	Backstopping		12,500	12,500		1,066		709		10,725	0
	4	2	Audit		55,000	55,000						55,000	0
	4	3	Mid-Term Review, final evaluation in collaboration with TSU and other 2 provinces		70,000	70,000						70,000	0
			Total		6,000,000	5,200,000	800,000	116,035	46,572	342,468	116,659	4,750,000	636,769

4.6 Communication resources

- The Technical and Financial File of the “Integrated water management and urban development in relation to climate change in Binh Thuan province” Project.
- The project documents.
- The first PSC meeting minute on April 4, 2014.
- The second PSC meeting minute on September 15, 2015 and the Notification on implementation of PSC meeting notes by the PPC
- Other documents, data and videos relating to the Project.