



**BTC**



## **RESULT REPORT 2016**

**INTERVENTION:  
“INTEGRATED WATER MANAGEMENT AND  
URBAN DEVELOPMENT IN RELATION TO  
CLIMATE CHANGE IN HA TINH PROVINCE”**

<b>ACRONYMS.....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>1 INTERVENTION AT A GLANCE .....</b>	<b>5</b>
1.1 INTERVENTION FORM.....	7
1.2 BUDGET EXECUTION .....	8
1.3 SELF-ASSESSMENT PERFORMANCE.....	9
1.3.1 Relevance.....	9
1.3.2 Effectiveness .....	9
1.3.3 Efficiency .....	10
1.3.4 Impacts .....	11
1.3.5 Potential sustainability.....	12
1.3.6 Potential sustainability.....	14
1.4 CONCLUSION .....	17
1.4.1 Technical & Financial Files (TFF) :.....	17
1.4.2 Institutional: .....	17
1.5 RECOMMENDATIONS.....	18
<b>2 RESULT MONITORING .....</b>	<b>19</b>
2.1 OVERVIEW OF THE CONTEXT .....	19
2.1.1 General context .....	19
2.1.2 Institutional context.....	19
2.1.3 Management context: Execution modalities.....	19
2.1.4 Hamor context .....	19
2.2 PERFORMANCE OUTCOME.....	19
2.2.1 Progress of indicators.....	21
2.2.2 Analysis of progress made .....	21
2.2.3 Potential impacts .....	23
2.3.1 Progress of indicators.....	24
2.3.2 Analysis of progress made .....	26
2.4 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 2.....	28
2.4.1 Progress of indicators.....	28
2.4.2 Progress of main activities .....	29
2.4.3 Analysis of progress made .....	29
2.5 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 3.....	30
2.5.1 Progress of indicators.....	30
2.5.2 Progress of main activities .....	31
#.....	31
Progress of main activities .....	31
2.5.3 Analysis of progress made .....	31
2.6 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 4.....	33
2.6.1 Progress of indicators.....	33
2.6.2 Progress of main activities .....	35
2.6.3 Analysis of progress made .....	35
2.7 TRANSVERSAL THEMES .....	36
2.7.1 Gender .....	36
2.7.2 Environment.....	36
2.7.3 Others .....	37
2.8 RISK MANAGEMENT.....	38
<b>3 STEERING AND LEARNING.....</b>	<b>39</b>

3.1	STRATEGIC RE-ORIENTATIONS .....	39
3.2	RECOMMENDATIONS .....	39
3.3	LESSONS LEARNED .....	39
<b>4</b>	<b>ANNEXES .....</b>	<b>40</b>
4.1	QUALITY CRITERIA .....	40
4.2	DECISIONS BY THE STEERING COMMITTEE AND FOLLOW-UP .....	46
4.3	UPDATED LOGICAL FRAMEWORK .....	48
4.4	MoRE RESULTS AT GLANCE .....	48
4.5	BUDGET REPORT .....	49
4.6	SOURCES OF INFORMATION.....	51

## ACRONYMS

BTC	Belgian Technical Cooperation
CC	Climate Change
IWRM	Integrated Water Resource Management
M&E	Monitoring & Evaluation
MPI	Ministry of Planning & Investment
MTA	Mid Term Review
OM	Own Management (Regie)
PM	Project Management
IWRM	Integrated Water Resource Management
M&E	Monitoring & Evaluation
PSC	Project Steering Committee
TOR	Terms of Reference
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
VUF	Viet Nam Urban Forum
WSP	Water and Sanitation Program

## 1 INTERVENTION AT A GLANCE

### Personnel:

Project Steering Committee, was established under Decision No. 2492/QĐ-People's Committee dated 08/14/2013 and the Decision 1243/QĐ-UBND dated 24/5/2016 regarding amendments to certain provisions of Decision No. 2492/QĐ-People's Committee, consists of six official members, as follow:

1. Mr. Dang Ngoc Son, Vice Chairman of Ha Tinh PPC – Chairman of PSC (Replacing Mr. Nguyen Hong Linh, Standing Vice Chairman of PPC)
2. Mr. Alain Devaux, Chief of BTC Representatives in Viet Nam- Co-Chairman of PSC
3. Mr. Nguyen Hoang Lam - Head of Bilateral division, Department of debt management and external finance, Ministry of Finance- PSC member
4. Mr. Chau Tran Vinh, Deputy of Water Resource Mangement Department, MONRE-PSC member;
5. Mr. Le Hung Nam, Deputy of Water Resource Management and Rural Water, Directorate of Water Resources-PSC member;
6. Mr. Le Viet Anh, Deputy Director, Department of Foreign Economic Relations, Ministry of Planning and Investment (replaced Ms. Vo Hong Anh, Deputy Director, Foreign Economic Relations, (MPI)-PSC member;

There are also unofficial members, include:

1. Mr. Nguyen Tuan Anh - Deputy Director of Department of Science, Education, Natural Resources and Environment (MPI);
2. Mr. Phan Thanh Bien, Director of SRDP-IWMC Ha Tinh PCU, Secretary of PSC

The Project Coordination Unit was established pursuant to Decision No. 2287/QĐ-UBND dated 26/7/2013 and Decision No. 3198/QĐ-UBND dated 15/10/2013 on revision on some articles of Decision No. 2287/QĐ-UBND; In 2016, project staff include:

Function	Name	First name	M/F	Start	End
Project Director (PD)	Bien	Phan Thanh	M	20/8/2013	30/6/2019
Deputy PD	Tai	Phan Van	M	20/8/2013	30/6/2019
Chief accountant	Huu	Doan Chinh	M	20/8/2013	30/6/2019
Coordinator	Quang	Tran Dinh	M	20/8/2013	30/6/2019
Interpreter/Translator	Thao	Tran Thi	F	21/01/2014	30/6/2019

Assistant	Thin	Nguyen Phi	M	20/8/2013	30/6/2019
Assistant	Phuong	Dang Huu	M	15/10/2013	30/6/2019
Assistant	Thuan	Tran Thi	F	01/7/2016	30/6/2019
Assistant	Hong	Nguyen Thi Thuy	F	01/7/2016	30/6/2019
Assistant	Dai	Vo Ta	M	01/9/2014	30/6/2019
Assistant	Yen	Phan Thi Hai	F	01/8/2016	30/6/2019
Assistant	Cuong	Trinh The	M	25/5/2015	30/6/2019
Technical staff on Environment	Loan	Hoang Thi	F	01/12/2015	30/6/2019
Accountant	Trang	Tran Quynh	F	15/10/2013	30/6/2019
Assistant	Hien	Dao Xuan	M	15/10/2013	30/6/2019
Cashier	Hoa	Ho Thi	F	15/10/2013	30/6/2019
Driver	Hoan	Nguyen Quoc	M	15/10/2013	30/6/2019

## Logistics

The Project Coordination Unit has office building in No. 12 Liem Vo Son, Ha Tinh, and procured project vehicles and equipment for project operation.

## Key events:

On July 12<sup>th</sup> 2016: Project Steering Committee meeting was held to review on the results of project implementation of 2015 and first semester of 2016; Addressing some obstacles to accelerate the progress of 2016;

## Components:

**Result 1:** Strengthening capacity of governments in climate change, integrated water resources management and urban planning (EURO 1.405.000);

**Result 2:** Overall strategy on Climate Change (EURO 990.000);

**Result 3:** Prioritized strategic piloting activities on Climate Change adaptation (EURO 3.280.000);

**Result 4:** Mobilization of communities' involvements (EURO 660.000);

### 1.1 INTERVENTION FORM

<b>Intervention title</b>	INTEGRATED WATER MANAGEMENT AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT IN RELATION TO CLIMATE CHANGE IN HA TINH PROVINCE.
<b>Intervention code</b>	VIE 1204411
<b>Location</b>	Ha Tinh province
<b>Total budget</b>	<b>Total budget: EURO 8,800,000</b> Of which: - Belgian Contribution: EURO 7,800,000 - Contribution of Viet Nam: EURO 1,000,000
<b>Partner Institution</b>	HA TINH Provincial People's Committee
<b>Start date Specific Agreement</b>	20/6/2013
<b>Date intervention start /Opening steering committee</b>	22/10/2013
<b>Planned end date of execution period</b>	JUNE 20 <sup>th</sup> , 2019
<b>End date Specific Agreement</b>	JUNE 20 <sup>th</sup> , 2020
<b>Target groups</b>	Communities, authorities and institutional policies related to Climate Changes.
<b>Impact</b>	To contribute to the sustainable development of Ha Tinh province
<b>Outcome</b>	To support the institutional capacity in Ha Tinh Province in integrated water resources management and urban development in relation to Climate Change

<b>Outputs</b>	<b>Result 1.</b> The capacity of the authorities of the province and Ha Tinh city in terms of Climate Change, Integrated Water Resources Management and urban planning are improved with appropriate monitoring and evaluation mechanisms in place.
	<b>Result 2.</b> A comprehensive strategy on CC is in place. It is based on various studies, including CC data and hydraulic modeling focused on operational impact on settlements of Rao Cai river catchment and the revision of the existing master plans of both Ha Tinh city and Hong Linh town, while key priorities of the CC action plan of the Rao-Cai river basin are defined.
	<b>Result 3.</b> Priority strategic pilot activities are developed for lessons learned targeting Tinh city to increase resilience to CC, with appropriate operational and maintenance modalities.
	<b>Result 4.</b> The provincial CC strategy is supported by the active involvement of the communities and the private sector.
<b>Period of report</b>	<b>2016</b>

## 1.2 BUDGET EXECUTION

	Budget	Expenditure		Balance	Disbursement rate at the end of year 2016 (%)
		Previous years	Year of report (2016)		
<b>Total</b>	<b>7,800,000</b>	<b>787,858</b>	<b>126,080</b>	<b>6,886,062</b>	<b>11,71</b>
<b>Output 1</b>	1,405,000	236,937	42,715	1,125,348	19,9
<b>Output 2</b>	990,000	394,399	43,391	552,210	44,22
<b>Output 3</b>	3,280,000	26,441	1,468	3,252,091	0,85
<b>Output 4</b>	660,000	443	2,524	657,033	0,44
<b>Contingency</b>	304,500	0	0	304,500	
<b>General means</b>	1,160,500	129,638	35,980	994,882	14,27



## 1.3 SELF-ASSESSMENT PERFORMANCE

### 1.3.1 Relevance

	Performance
<p><i>1. Clearly still embedded in national policies and Belgian strategy, responds to aid effectiveness commitments, highly relevant to needs of target group.</i></p> <p><i>2. Clear and well-structured intervention logic; feasible and consistent vertical logic of objectives; adequate indicators; Risks and Assumptions clearly identified and managed; exit strategy in place</i></p>	<b>A</b>

Relevance with development policies of Ha Tinh province up to 2020 “...Strongly develop industry and services, associated with high-tech, large-scaled agriculture in the direction of industrialization and modernization; investment in socio-cultural developmen and urban systems commensurate with economic development; environment protection; actively responding to climate change ... ”

Relevance with the needs for awareness raising of local communities on climate change and for the solutions / measures to mitigate and adapt to climate change impacts.

Relevance with the People's Committee of Ha Tinh and Ha Tinh city, Hong Linh town and the departments and institutions in improvement of the policy and flexibility to address the problems of water resource management, urban planning under the CC impact;

Innovation in requirements to integrate climate change factors into planning social economy, investment projects ...

### 1.3.2 Effectiveness

	Performance
<p><i>1. All inputs are available on time and within budget.</i></p> <p><i>2. Most activities are on schedule. Delays exist, but do not harm the delivery of outputs</i></p> <p><i>3. All outputs have been and most likely will be delivered as scheduled with good quality contributing to outcomes as planned.</i></p>	<b>B</b>

With the results of the project, the People's Committee of Ha Tinh city, Hong Linh town has saved a lot of time and fund to make sustainable and effective strategic decisions about CC adaptation; Integrated water resources

management; CC-integrated urban development.

During implementation, these inputs are completely adequate in terms of progress, however, due to many different reasons some of the outputs were behind the plan. The main causes are:

- Delays in recruitment of officials and experts for BTC and TSU;
- Some fields are lack of expertise due to staff have not been recruited;
- Delays in BTC’s NOL granting and too many stages of an activity required NOL.

Project Coordination Committee always seeks for ways to deploy the activities to achieve the highest performance; For example, in retention lake, PCU chooses the options of using excavated soil in place, minimal amount of concrete, in order to enhance the green areas and soil permeability, to meet principles of sustainable urban drainage system (SUDS) ... Thus, with minimal fund, the target outputs are ensured with good quality.

Some deliverables of consultants were submitted later than scheduled due to the unsatisfactory quality of the products. PCU requested for support of TSU experts in ensuring the quality of the research .

Counterpart contribution in terms of both personnel and finance were sufficiently provided by Ha Tinh province, enabling the PCU to complete tasks.

The project has 04 key studies whose outputs are the inputs for the other project activities, include:

- Technical & institutional capacity assessment (TICA);
- Study on mangroves;
- Study on climate change models;
- Study on hydraulic/ hydrology modeling;

Up to the present, PCU has completed all 4 studies and their outputs are the inputs for the effective operation of project. The later project activities will rely on at least one output of the studies. Effective use of study outputs will ensure the achievement of the project targets.

### 1.3.3 Efficiency

	<b>Performance</b>
<p>1. <i>Full achievement of the outcome is likely in terms of quality and coverage</i></p> <p>2. <i>The intervention is successful in adapting its strategies / activities and outputs to changing external conditions in order to achieve the outcome. Risks and assumptions are managed in a proactive manner.</i></p>	<b>A</b>

The outputs (study results) have been used effectively; Specific activities will be implemented based on the main study as TICA; H/H modeling in Rao Cai river; Study of mangroves;

For example, result of CC study was used for H/H model in Rao Cai river study whose results are used as inputs for other activities, such as climate change strategy, early warning system, priority investment projects, revision of Ha Tinh city master plan with integration of CC factors...;

The study results also help provincial, municipal People's Committee of Ha Tinh, Hong Linh Town and departments to have a better overall view of the CC adaptation strategy, a more realistic vision of urban planning...

Some activities which have not been deployed due to delay in granting of BTC's NOL include CC-resilient House Credit Facility, the priority investment projects...However, BTC, TSU and PCU offered solutions to tackle the delays in the remaining years and will not affect the overall progress of the project.

Up to the present, the achieved output of the project are relevant to the project strategy and the expected results of the project will completely meet the requirements of the project design.

Project stakeholders can access the existing outputs without any hindering factors. For example, the study outputs of mangroves and H/H model in Rao Cai river will be handed over to the Department of Agriculture and Rural Development, outputs of Climate Change study will be for Department of Natural Resources and Environment...Project outputs will systematize the data of climate, urban planning, water resources and will help the province's leaders making effective macro policies, and relevant departments can easily access the data with less time and resources.

So far the project has achieved highly strategic important results, built a solid foundation for the activities to be deployed later to ensure the achievement of project overall goals.

There have been some minor adjustments (no strategic adjustment) of project activities to fit the actual conditions of Rao Cai river and Ha Tinh City.

It is early to make the assessment on mitigation of CC's negative impacts at this point of time.

#### **1.3.4 Impacts**

<b>Performance</b>
--------------------

<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The study results have a major impact on the institutional changes of provincial and city government policies.</li> <li>2. Communities change their perceptions and skills in CC mitigation and adaptation.</li> <li>3. Changes to environmentally friendly lifestyle, smart consumers.</li> <li>4. The technical and institutional capacity of relevant agencies enhanced; impact on more flexible measures to response to climate change scenarios; better meet the needs of the people.</li> </ol>	<p><b>A</b></p>
---	-----------------

The results of the project have strong impact to Ha Tinh province with the following specific aspects:

Impact on provincial/cities governments in the issuance of institutional policies to integrate climate change issues and a strategy on Climate Change will be issued in order to minimize the negative impacts of climate change.

Impact on the communities: Awareness raising on CC mitigation and adaptation enhanced as well as aware of green living and environmental friendliness; An early warning system, a system of priority investment projects supported in order to limit the damage caused by natural disasters;

Impact on enterprises: Enterprises are more aware in reducing greenhouse gas emissions and producing more environmentally friendly and green products;

Social organizations: Social organizations are more aware of climate change and promote more green activities;

The most obvious impact is the impact on the provincial /city government and communities;

### **1.3.5 Potential sustainability**

	<b>Performance</b>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Financial/economic sustainability is potentially very good: costs for services and maintenance are covered or affordable; external factors will not change that.</li> <li>2. The steering committee and other relevant local structures are strongly involved in all stages of implementation and</li> </ol>	<p><b>A</b></p>

<p>are committed to continue producing and using results.</p> <p>3. Policy and institutions have been highly supportive of intervention and will continue to be so.</p> <p>4. Intervention is embedded in institutional structures and has contributed to improve the institutional and management capacity</p>	
---	--

The research results are handed over to the People's Committee of Ha Tinh province, Ha Tinh City People's Committee and relevant government departments at all levels; Based on initial findings, the annual PPC will direct to PC of Ha Tinh city and related departments to update data for more complete database and put into the geographic information system (GIS), accessible to the relevant authorities and also investors, developers and researchers. PPC can fully provide funding for annual data update to long-term stability of the databases.

**Economic /Financial sustainability:**

The projects will support to develop sets of operation & maintenance (O&M) regulations for construction investments, and handover to the People's Committee of Ha Tinh city for management. City People's Committee will use local budget and assign relevant units to be in charge of O&M. The annual funding for operation and maintenance of priority investment projects is not large (about € 8,000/ per public works/per year), the People's Committee of Ha Tinh city is fully capable to provide the fund for O&M to ensure sustainability

The agencies are equipped and ensure the funds for operation and maintenance and exploitation.

For the research results, PPC assigned the relevant departments to manage and provide information to partners when necessary.

**Local requirements are satisfied and maintained after the project completion**

Technical & institutional capacity assessment identified the institutional vulnerabilities, policies and capacities. Based on study results, the project supports a part of capacity building training and procurement of equipment for the related departments. PPC will investigate and issue appropriate policies to finalize the mechanisms and policies on water resources management and urban planning in line with the state of climate change increasingly unpredictable.

The study of mangroves correctly identified the decrease of mangrove forest area and proposed strategies to maintain mangrove forests sustainably.

CC downscaling study and hydro/hydraulic modeling in Rao Cai river basin have given PPC and city PC a strategic vision for water management and urban planning with integration of climate change factors.

The priority investment projects which implemented on the basis of hydro/hydraulic modeling in Rao Cai river basin have fully met the needs drainage, landscape and environment friendly to the nature.

Based on the above analysis, it is clear that the activities of project have met the needs of Ha Tinh province and cities so far and will be sustainable in the long term.

Supported the potential sustainability of the benefits and results

The results of studies will be approved by the PPC and delivered to relevant departments for utilization, maintaining and sharing to other beneficiaries.

For priority investment projects, the project will support PC of Ha Tinh city in drafting Regulation on management, operation and maintenance, as well as establishment of O&M team. The operational cost for this team will be allocated from the budget of the City People's Committee.

Other activities will be handed over to the relevant authorities in order to sustain the results achieved.

Thus, the results of project will be sustained on the basis of management of the provincial agencies for long-term utilization.

However, fund is required to strongly promote the achievements from local and foreign investment for updating data by times and implementation of investments recommended by the studies.

### **1.3.6 Potential sustainability**

#### **Gender equality**

Gender equality is very important for the results and impact of development interventions and essential for enhancing development effectiveness. One strategy to consider the integration of cross-cutting issues in the decision-making, from planning to evaluation and feedback for the new decision making process, the effectiveness of impact of these decisions related to gender issues has been reviewed by the Project Coordination Unit.

In recent years, the project has really focused on gender issues, such as over 30% of women participating in seminars, training, study tours; In particular, Eco-House Credit Facility was placed under the management of Ha Tinh city Women's Union. Over 65% of women participated in the meeting on resettlement for Dap Bot retention lake between the Project Coordination Unit, People's Committee of Ha Tinh province and relevant households. Communications and community development activities also focused on gender issues and gender equality.

So far, the involvement of women in the project activities is completely normal because:

- People's Committee of Ha Tinh province is focused on promoting the ownership of women;

- PCU Ha Tinh has 14 years of experience in mobilizing women to participate in the project activities, and there has been no difficulties in mobilizing women to participate in IWMC project activities.

- An analysis of clear and transparent accountability, obligations and rights of women to participate in the project is a very important condition in mobilizing women.

### **Environment issues**

The project is focused on environmental remediation and environmental contamination; the priority investment projects focused on drainage, environmental pollution treatment and landscaping for recreational activities of the communities.

The goals and results of the project is very much related to environmental issues. Therefore PCU Ha Tinh has special focus on environment in both 2 project fields including integrated water resources management and urban planning:

1. For integrated water resources management, PCU Ha Tinh should focus on the following:

- For the integrated water resources management, Ha Tinh PCU has special attention to the following:

- Through TICA, consultants should be responsible for proposing the coordinating mechanism of the departments in the management of surface water, groundwater and wastewater;

- Through hydro/hydraulic modeling in Rao Cai river basin and

mangroves assessment in Rao Cai river basin, consultants should highlight the water quality management of Rao Cai river and the neighboring rivers in the priority investment strategy;

To implement the following academic studies::

➤ Study on quality applying the Water Quality Index (WQI) to evaluate the water quality of Rao Cai river water;

➤ Study the impact of climate change on groundwater resources. Recommended solutions for fresh water storage and supply to the coastal rural areas in Ha Tinh;;

➤ Assessment on the impacts of climate change and sea level rise on the irrigation infrastructure of the coastal communal areas in Cua Sot river mouth, Ha Tinh province;

2. For urban planning, PCU aims at the following:

- Through TICA, consultants should be responsible for proposing the coordinating mechanism of the departments in the management of appropriate environmental green urban planning;

- In the framework of the project, PCU Ha Tinh developed a set of criteria / standards and sample design for Eco-house for each climate area of Ha Tinh city in approaches of water and energy efficiency and clean environment;

- To integrate climate change factors into city planning, hydraulic/hydrologic consultant must come up with a model and inundation maps corresponding to different rainfall scenarios in order to adapt and minimize environmental pollution caused by flooding;;

- To organize training courses and seminars on sustainable development and environmental management issues in order to give all levels of government, social organizations, the civil society and the private sector a general slogan "green environment" and "green culture" fit to the particular local context and potentials.

3. With regard to the priority investment projects, PCU aims at:

The priority investment projects should be used with the available, environmentally friendly construction materials, balanced volume of excavated soil in place to minimize the transportation of soil from other places; minimize the volume of concrete and increase green coverage, respecting nature and enhancing the surface water permeability of natural soil.



## 1.4 CONCLUSION

### 1.4.1 Technical & Financial Files (TFF) :

Basically, content and activities are consistent with long-term goals and objectives of the project. Logical framework of the project is appropriate. Monitoring indicators of impacts, Outcome, Outputs were agreed; However, activities need to be annually re-evaluated for adjustments and supplements related to activities, results, fund allocation to achieve the expected goals (outcome).

### 1.4.2 Institutional:

TSU basically recruited enough technical experts therefore the biggest challenge in term of communication between PCU with BTC and TSU was solved. A communication mechanism between PCU and TSU was established to support TSU to contribute to preparation of activity before submitting to BTC for approval. Roles of BTC and TSU become clearer and more supportive to accelerate activities. Should promote positiveness of this communication mechanism in the remaining years of the project to accelerate the implementation and effectiveness of the project.

Fund disbursement of 2016 reached 7,86% of annual plan. Although the rate of fund disbursement is not high, the studies have completed, giving favourable and stable conditions for later implementation of activities.

Main causes of low rate of fund disbursement include:

- Collaborations between BTC, TCU and PCU are not consistent, the content of activities and process of deployment are new therefore lack of experience in planning and implementing of activities ;

- The process of evaluation on proposals and issuance of Non-Objection Letter takes considerably long, causing delays in the implementation of activities

- Although the Specific Agreement and TFF agreed that project should be implemented under National Executive Modality (NEX); However NEX modality has not been fully applied. This has been reflected in the facts that NOL of BTC must be applied for many stages, causing delays in the project implementation

- The recruitment of experts and technical staff capable for project

implementation has faced many difficulties.

### **1.5 Recommendations**

- Relevant parties should implement the cooperation mechanism as specified in the TFF;

- Reduce the quantity of requesting for NOL for some stages because the expenditures have been strictly monitored by the State Treasury of Ha Tinh province and audit for every 6 months. If there is some violations, it will be timely prevented and handled;

- Respect the time framework for issuance of NOL as specified in TFF;

**National executioner staff**

**BTC executioner staff**

**Phan Thanh Bien**

implementation has faced many difficulties.

### 1.5 Recommendations

- Relevant parties should implement the cooperation mechanism as specified in the TFF;

- Reduce the quantity of requesting for NOL for some stages because the expenditures have been strictly monitored by the State Treasury of Ha Tinh province and audit for every 6 months. If there is some violations, it will be timely prevented and handled;

- Respect the time framework for issuance of NOL as specified in TFF;

National executioner staff



Phan Thanh Bien

BTC executioner staff

## 2 RESULT MONITORING

### 2.1 OVERVIEW OF THE CONTEXT

#### 2.1.1 General context

The intervention has been implemented in the context that the Government of Vietnam and Ha Tinh province are giving priorities to reducing the impacts of climate change to economy and society; as well as focusing on minimizing factors of economic activities impacting to the climate change;

#### 2.1.2 Institutional context

The project is implemented under the agreement signed between the Government of Vietnam and the Government of the Kingdom of Belgium dated 20/06/2013; regulations follows TFF and the current laws of Vietnam.

The Project Operation Manual (POM) has not been in place, while this document is the legal and institutional basis for operation, procedures, and coordination mechanisms between the projects in the program. In order to ensure a smooth operation of the project without POM, BTC and Ha Tinh province has applied the laws of the Government of Vietnam and the Government of the Kingdom of Belgium to establish a legal corridor for implementation of project activities. Up to the present, POM has been developed with the cooperation between PCU and TSU and been awaiting for approval;

#### 2.1.3 Management context: Execution modalities

The program consists of four interventions and the organizational design of the program helps ensuring a physical link between the projects. Ha Tinh PCU has maintained a good coordination, experience sharing between BTC, TSU and PCU, therefore in 2016, despite the low disbursement rate, Ha Tinh PCU has evenly deployed the planned activities of year 2016.

#### 2.1.4 Hamor context

The project have been operating with two parallel systems/regulations of the Government of Vietnam and BTC.

PCU, BTC and TSU agreed a cooperation mechanism to accelerate the progress of project activities, such as:

- TSU monthly shares a work plan of TSU to PCUs to agree on the cooperation between TSU and PCU;
- TSU and PCU quarterly organize meetings on implementation of activities and solutions for obstackles and further accelaration of project progress;

### 2.2 PERFORMANCE OUTCOME





### 2.2.1 Progress of indicators

Results - Indicators		Baseline value	Value 2014	Value 2015	Value 2016	Target 2016	Final target value	Unit
OC 1	Number of documents issued which address CC	11	0	0	01	01	16	Document
OC 2	Number of trained stakeholders or trained staff who contribute newly acquired CC knowledge to decision-making processes	0	0	0	0	0	50	Staff
OC 3	% of provincial budget is invested in activities related to CC	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC
OC 4	Measurable increase in institutional capacity with respect to assessment criteria from the TICA	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC

### 2.2.2 Analysis of progress made

<b>Results - Indicators</b>		<b>Baseline value</b>	<b>Value 2014</b>	<b>Value 2015</b>	<b>Value 2016</b>	<b>Target 2016</b>	<b>Final target value</b>	<b>Unit</b>
OC 1	Number of documents issued which address CC	11	0	0	01	01	16	Document
OC 2	Number of trained stakeholders or trained staff who contribute newly acquired CC knowledge to decision-making processes	0	0	0	0	0	50	Staff
OC 3	% of provincial budget is invested in activities related to CC	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC
OC 4	Measurable increase in institutional capacity with respect to assessment criteria from the TICA	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC

- OC1. Number of documents issued which address CC:

At the present, IWMC Ha Tinh is in the stage of implementing consultancy activities related to CC such as CC downscaling study for Ha Tinh province, H/H modelling in Rao Cai river basin, and the coming study such as vulnerability assessment, revision of Ha Tinh city master plan...Up to the present, CC study with the overall objectives of offering the inputs of climate, temprature and basis rainfall and future CC scenarios of Ha Tinh city ((The scenario of temperature rise, sea level rise scenarios) for development of H/h modeling in Rao Cai whose study was completed. The final report was granted BTC's NOL and approved by PPC (Decision No. 3492/QD-UBND dated 02/12/2016).

- OC2. Number of stakeholders or trained staff using the trained CC knowledge to decision-making processes.
- OC3. % of provincial budget has been invested in activities related to CC: TBC
- OC4. The institutional capacity can be measured by using the assessment criteria of TICA: On the basis of TICA activities which were granted BTC’NOL and approved by PPC, the intervention is on process of purchasing the equipment for some of the provincial departments, as well as organizing Capacity building training courses for provincial authorities.

### **2.2.3 Potential impacts**

Project activities will strongly improve the awareness of provincial authorities in their policies for CC adaptation, especially for IWRM and UB.

Besides of policies, provincial budget for CC related activities will be more focused.

Private sector, beneficiaries will be more accessible to policies, increasing the level of investment from non-budgetary resources for a better adaptation to CC.



## 2.3 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 1



### 2.3.1 Progress of indicators

<b>OUTPUT 1: Capacity of Ha Tinh province and city department on CC, IWRM and UD enhanced with appropriate M &amp; E mechanism</b>							
<b>Indicators</b>		<b>Baseline value</b>	<b>Value 2015</b>	<b>Value 2016</b>	<b>Target 2016</b>	<b>Final target value</b>	<b>Unit</b>
1.1	Number of staff trained on climate change, integrated water resource management and/or urban development	0	0	50	50	132	Trainee
1.2	Average change in scores on entry and exit tests	0	0	20	20	80	%
1.3	Appropriate equipment and software systems are in place	0	0	01	01	3	System
1.4	Responsiveness of data (CC-IWRM & UD) management system to the provincial users	0	0	0	0	70	%
1.5	Coordination and communication mechanism responds to the knowledge management need of the provincial authorities	0	0	0	0	80	%

1.6	New and relevant information is available from the expanded hydrological & meteorological monitoring network	0	0	0	0	90	80
-----	--	---	---	---	---	----	----

### 2.3.2 Analysis of progress made

Progress of key activities	Progress			
	A	B	C	D
1. Number of staff trained on climate change, integrated water resource management and/or urban development		X		
2. Average change in scores on entry and exit tests	X			
3. Appropriate system of equipment and software are in place	X			
4. Responsiveness of data (CC-IWRM & UD) management system to the provincial users		X		
5. Coordination and communication mechanism responds to the knowledge management need of the provincial authorities		X		
6. New and relevant information is available from the expanded hydrological & meteorological monitoring network		X		

In 2016, study activities and investment preparations have mostly completed in 2016 includes:

- Indicator 1.1 and 1.2: TICA: On the basis of TICA activities which were granted BTC'NOL and approved by PPC, the intervention is on process of purchasing the equipment for some of the provincial departments, as well as organizing Capacity building training courses for provincial authorities.
- Indicator 1.3 Appropriate equipment and software systems are in place: Equipment and software including hydro/hydraulic-completed in 2016; GIS in 2017 (expected), early warning system in 2018 (expected). Therefore, target values of this indicator were described as above.
- Indicator 1.4. Database management system (CC-IWRM & UD) management system to serve the provincial users: this system will be established in 2016 basing on results of studies and supplemented data, and will be finalized and put in use in 2017.
- Indicator 1.5. Coordination and communication mechanism responds to the knowledge management need of the provincial authorities: Currently, CC adaptation has been using state-managed steering mechanism therefore there is no specialized body nor mechanism. Recommendations and activities of Coordination and communication mechanism will be studied

for implementation from 2017 onwards after completion of the official studies and database.

- Indicator 1.6 New and relevant information is available from the expanded hydrological & meteorological monitoring network: These networks will be set up and extended after completion of H/H study in Rao Cai river basin and other CC studies (expectedly to be implemented in 2018)

## 2.4 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 2

### 2.4.1 Progress of indicators

<b>OUTPUT 2: Comprehensive CC strategy established</b>							
<b>Indicators</b>		<b>Baseline value</b>	<b>Value 2015</b>	<b>Value 2016</b>	<b>Target 2016</b>	<b>Final target value</b>	<b>Unit</b>
2.1	Progress on the implementation of the studies	0	0	01	01	01	Number
2.2	A CC adaptation action plan is approved	0	0	0	0	01	Number
2.3	Master plans (provincial, cities/town) revised with regard to CC	0	01	0	0	01	Number
2.4	Prioritised proposals on CC are developed	0	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC	Number

### 2.4.2 Progress of main activities

Progress of key activities	Progress			
	A	B	C	D
1. Progress of implementation of studies: H/H study		X		
2. Vulnerability assessment on the socio-economic and personal, public property, building action plans to respond to climate change		X		
3. Revision of the master plan of Ha Tinh city and vicinity based on climate change strategies and SSP		X		

### 2.4.3 Analysis of progress made

Indicator 2.1 Progress on the implementation of studies: Final report of Hydro/hydraulic modelling in Rao Cai river basin was completed and reviewed by TSU, now being revised by consultants accordingly to some contents of TOR;

Indicators 2.2 and 2.3: TOR and cost estimates of these studies are being developed by TSU experts together with PCU, however it's still behind the scheduled.

## 2.5 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 3

### 2.5.1 Progress of indicators

<b>OUTPUT 3: Prioritized strategic piloting activities are developed for lessons learned</b>							
<b>Indicators</b>		<b>Baseline value</b>	<b>Value 2015</b>	<b>Value 2016</b>	<b>Target 2016</b>	<b>Final target value</b>	<b>Unit</b>
3.1	No of (pilot) investments implemented, complying with CC adaptation specifications	0	0	01	01	4	Number
3.2	Effective O&M is implemented for each priority investment	0	0	01	01	4	Number
3.3	No. of lessons-learned documents prepared on innovative features of the priority investments and of other aspects of the Project	0	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC	Number
3.4	Number of hectares of mangroves area restored and developed	0	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC	ha

## 2.5.2 Progress of main activities

#	Progress of main activities	Progress			
		A	B	C	D
1	No of (pilot) investments implemented, complying with CC adaptation specifications	x			
2	Effective O&M is implemented for each priority investment	x			
3	No. of lessons-learned documents prepared on innovative features of the priority investments and of other aspects of the Project	x			
4	Number of hectares of mangroves area restored and developed	x			

## 2.5.3 Analysis of progress made

- Indicators 3.1 and 3.2 Relevant to investment items and attached O&M mechanism: Including 04 piloting investment items;  
Site survey and planning of Dap Bot retention lake completed, awaiting for PPC's approval on construction investment project.  
Ben Da retention lake: Awaiting for BTC's NOL on TOR and cost estimates, master planning, design, project planning;  
Drainage system in the west of Ha Tinh city: site survey, cost estimate, project planning, design were approved by PPC and BTC; Bid plan was PPC and awaiting for BTC's NOL on Bid document;  
Dap Hau sluice gate: TOR, site survey, project planning, design, cost estimates approved by PPC and BTC. Bid plan approved by PPC;
- Indicator 3.3 Number of lessons-learned documents prepared on innovative features of the priority investments and of other aspects of the Project: will be identified and put in use after the completion of of prioritized investment items;
- Indicator 3.4 Number of hectares of mangroves area restored and developed: Assessment and Survey of mangroves in Rao Cai river basin completed and final report was granted BTC's NOL. Preparation for mangroves restoration and expanding: Basing on the mangroves



restoration plan which was granted BTC's NOL, PCU has prepared the next steps include:

- + Design and establish the mangroves nurseries;
- + Organize technical training course on mangroves nurshing and planting;
- + Restore and expand the mangroves in Rao Cai river basin;

## 2.6 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 4

### 2.6.1 Progress of indicators

<b>OUTPUT 4: The provincial CC strategy supported with active involvement of communities and private sector.</b>							
<b>Indicators</b>		<b>Baseline value</b>	<b>Annual value 2015</b>	<b>Annual value 2016</b>	<b>Annual target 2016</b>	<b>Final target</b>	<b>Unit of measurement</b>
4.1	A public CC awareness raising strategy is developed	0	0	01	01	01	Number
4.2	A disaster early warning system is developed	0	0	0	0	01	Number
4.3	No. of beneficiaries of newly upgraded CC resilient houses	0	0	300	300	400	Number
4.4	No. of new people participating in CC credit program	0	0	0	0	TBC	Number
4.5	No. of people participating in newly established committees	0				No target required	Number
4.6	Proof of attempts to involve communities and/or private sector	0				No target required	Description

4.7	Proof of behaviour changed due to increased awareness	0				No target setting required	Description
-----	---	---	--	--	--	----------------------------	-------------

## 2.6.2 Progress of main activities

#	Progress of implementation of main activities	Progress:			
		A	B	C	D
1	A public CC awareness raising strategy is developed		x		
2	A disaster early warning system is developed	x			
3	No. of beneficiaries of newly upgraded CC resilient houses		x		
4	No. of new people participating in CC credit program		x		
5	No. of people participating in newly established committees		x		
6	Proof of attempts to involve communities and/or private sector		x		
7	Proof of behaviour changed due to increased awareness		x		

## 2.6.3 Analysis of progress made

- Indicator 4.1 A public CC awareness raising strategy in place: Deployment of activities in annual workplan 2016 : project videos developed; activities cooperated with Newspapers, radios for making project bulletins; communication activities cooperated with schools in Ha Tinh city;
- Indicator 4.2 A disaster early warning system is developed: Expected to implement in 2017 after having results of H/H study, CC downscaling study and vulnerability assessment.
- Indicator 4.3 and 4.4 Regulations of management and operation of CC-resilient House Credit was granted BTC's NOL and approved by PPC. Awaiting for BTC's NOL on the Funding Agreement between IWMC Ha Tinh and Ha Tinh city Women's Union.
- Indicator 4.5 ; 4.6 ; 4.7: A proposal on 7 investments for Ha Tinh city was developed to replace this activity

## **2.7 TRANSVERSAL THEMES**

### **2.7.1 Gender**

Gender balance is very important for the results and impact of development interventions and essential for enhancing effectiveness. One strategy to consider the integration of crosscutting issues in the decision-making process, from planning to evaluation and feedbacks to the new decision-making process, to review the effectiveness and impact of these decisions of PCU related to gender issues.

In recent years the project has really focused on the issue of gender balance, typical percentage of women participating in seminars, training, study tours experience reached over 30 %; In particular, CC-resilient House Credit Facility is under the management of the Women's Union of Ha Tinh city. 65% of participants were women in the meeting, for discussing about ground clearance to build Dap Bot Retention Lake, between the Project Coordination Unit, Ha Tinh city People's Committee of Ha Tinh and households,

So far, mobilizing women's participation in project activities is completely normal, due to:

- Ha Tinh PPC focuses on promoting ownership of women;
- Ha Tinh PCU has 14 continuous years of experience in mobilizing women to participate in the project activities, therefore IWMC project has hardly faced any difficulties in this issue.
- Clear arrangement and transparent defining of accountability, obligations and rights of women when participating in project activities are significant conditions for mobilizing the involvement of women.

### **2.7.2 Environment**

The objectives and results of project are very much related to environmental issues. Therefore, PCU Ha Tinh specially focuses on the two important fields include integrated water resources management and urban planning:

For integrated water resources management, Ha Tinh PCU focused on the following aspects: Through the technical and institutional capacity assessment, consultants to propose responsibilities, coordination mechanisms of the departments in the management of surface water, groundwater, and wastewater; Through studies for hydro/hydraulic modeling and mangroves status in Rao Cai river basin, consultants to emphasize in the prioritized investment strategy about management of river water quality of Rao Cai river and the neighborhood rivers;

For urban planning, PCU would focus on the following aspects: Through the technical and institutional capacity assessment, consultants to

propose responsibilities, coordination mechanisms of related agencies in management of green environment urban planning; In the framework of project, PCU Ha Tinh builds a set of criteria/standards and template designs for eco-house adaptive to climate conditions of Ha Tinh city and energy/water effective and for a clean living environment; To integrate climate change issues into city planning, research consultants of hydraulic/hydrologic modeling to give a model and an inundation map corresponding to different rainfall scenarios, in order to mitigate and adapt to environmental pollution caused by flooding; To organize training courses and seminars on sustainable development and environmental management issues in order to give the authorities, social organizations, civil society and the private sector a common slogan of "green environment" and "green culture" in accordance with the particular context and potentials of the area.

### **2.7.3 Others**

## 2.8 RISK MANAGEMENT

Risk Identification			Risk analysis			Risk Treatment			Follow-up of risk	
Description of Risk	Period of identification	Risk category	Probability	Potential impact	Total	Actions	Responsible	Deadlines	Progress	S
Existing data not accurate, up-to-date and/nor made available		OPS	Medium	Medium	Medium	Capacity building of the related departments.	PCU	31/12/2016	On-going	
						Share all the needed data at from the start of the project	TSU-PCU	31/12/2016	On-going	
						Use experience from CAPAS project	TSU-PCU	31/12/2016	Unexcuted	

### 3 STEERING AND LEARNING

#### 3.1 STRATEGIC RE-ORIENTATIONS

The implementation of Ha Tinh IWMC project has been fully compliant to the Specific Agreement between the two governments and the current law of Vietnam, under the direction of BTC, Project Steering Committee, PPC.

#### 3.2 RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendation	Responsible	Deadline
Recruit experts for IWRM and C&CD to support demands of the province	BTC	
BTC to accelerate the process of issuing NOL	BTC	
Establish communication mechanism through website of Ha Tinh PCU: Progress reports of the activities awaiting for BTC's NOL; demands for expertises;...	BTC, TSU, PCU	

#### 3.3 LESSONS LEARNED

Lessons learned	Target audience
From end of 2015, PCU Ha Tinh and TSU established a monthly communication mechanism on progress of activities, request for expertises or experts...This communication mean is very supportive to accelerate the implementation of activities.	BTC, TSU, PCU



## 4 ANNEXES

### 4.1 QUALITY CRITERIA

<b>1. RELEVANCE: The degree to which the intervention is in line with local and national policies and priorities as well as with the expectations of the beneficiaries</b>				
<i>In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as follows: 'At least one 'A', no 'C' or 'D' = A; Two times 'B' = B; At least one 'C', no 'D' = C; at least one 'D' = D</i>				
<b>Assessment RELEVANCE:</b>	<b>A</b>	<b>B</b>	<b>C</b>	<b>D</b>
<b>total score</b>	<b>X</b>			
<b>1.1 What is the present level of relevance of the intervention?</b>				
X	<b>A</b>	Clearly still embedded in national policies and Belgian strategy, responds to aid effectiveness commitments, highly relevant to needs of target group.		
	<b>B</b>	Still fits well in national policies and Belgian strategy (without always being explicit), reasonably compatible with aid effectiveness commitments, relevant to target group's needs.		
	<b>C</b>	Some issues regarding consistency with national policies and Belgian strategy, aid effectiveness or relevance.		
	<b>D</b>	Contradictions with national policies and Belgian strategy, aid efficiency commitments; relevance to needs is questionable. Major adaptations needed.		
<b>1.2 As presently designed, is the intervention logic still holding true?</b>				
X	<b>A</b>	Clear and well-structured intervention logic; feasible and consistent vertical logic of objectives; adequate indicators; Risks and Assumptions clearly identified and managed; exit strategy in place (if applicable).		
	<b>B</b>	Adequate intervention logic although it might need some improvements regarding hierarchy of objectives, indicators, Risk and Assumptions.		
	<b>C</b>	Problems with intervention logic may affect performance of intervention and capacity to monitor and evaluate progress; improvements necessary.		
	<b>D</b>	Intervention logic is faulty and requires major revision for the intervention to have a chance of success.		

**2. EFFICIENCY OF IMPLEMENTATION TO DATE: Degree to which the resources of the intervention (funds, expertise, time, etc.) have been**

<b>converted into results in an economical way</b>					
<i>In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as follows: 'At least two 'A', no 'C' or 'D' = A; Two times 'B', at least one 'C', no 'D' = C; at least one 'D' = D</i>					
<b>Assessment EFFICIENCY :</b>		<b>A</b>	<b>B</b>	<b>C</b>	<b>D</b>
<b>total score</b>		<b>X</b>			
<b>2.1 How well are inputs (financial, HR, goods &amp; equipment) managed?</b>					
X	<b>A</b>	All inputs are available on time and within budget.			
	<b>B</b>	Most inputs are available in reasonable time and do not require substantial budget adjustments. However there is room for improvement.			
	<b>C</b>	Availability and usage of inputs face problems, which need to be addressed; otherwise results may be at risk.			
	<b>D</b>	Availability and management of inputs have serious deficiencies, which threaten the achievement of results. Substantial change is needed.			
<b>2.2 How well is the implementation of activities managed?</b>					
	<b>A</b>	Activities implemented on schedule			
X	<b>B</b>	Most activities are on schedule. Delays exist, but do not harm the delivery of outputs			
	<b>C</b>	Activities are delayed. Corrections are necessary to deliver without too much delay.			
	<b>D</b>	Serious delay. Outputs will not be delivered unless major changes in planning.			
<b>2.3 How well are outputs achieved?</b>					
X	<b>A</b>	All outputs have been and most likely will be delivered as scheduled with good quality contributing to outcomes as planned.			
	<b>B</b>	Output delivery is and will most likely be according to plan, but there is room for improvement in terms of quality, coverage and timing.			
	<b>C</b>	Some output are/will be not delivered on time or with good quality. Adjustments are necessary.			
	<b>D</b>	Quality and delivery of outputs has and most likely will have serious deficiencies. Major adjustments are needed to ensure that at least the key outputs are delivered on time.			

<b>3. EFFECTIVENESS TO DATE: Degree to which the outcome (Specific Objective) is achieved as planned at the end of year N</b>	
<i>In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as</i>	

<i>follows: 'At least one 'A', no 'C' or 'D' = A; Two times 'B' = B; At least one 'C', no 'D' = C; at least one 'D' = D</i>				
<b>Assessment</b>	<b>A</b>	<b>B</b>	<b>C</b>	<b>D</b>
<b>EFFECTIVENESS : total score</b>	X			
<b>3.1 As presently implemented what is the likelihood of the outcome to be achieved?</b>				
X	<b>A</b>	Full achievement of the outcome is likely in terms of quality and coverage. Negative effects (if any) have been mitigated.		
	<b>B</b>	Outcome will be achieved with minor limitations; negative effects (if any) have not caused much harm.		
	<b>C</b>	Outcome will be achieved only partially among others because of negative effects to which management was not able to fully adapt. Corrective measures have to be taken to improve ability to achieve outcome.		
	<b>D</b>	The intervention will not achieve its outcome unless major, fundamental measures are taken.		
<b>3.2 Are activities and outputs adapted (when needed), in order to achieve the outcome?</b>				
X	<b>A</b>	The intervention is successful in adapting its strategies / activities and outputs to changing external conditions in order to achieve the outcome. Risks and assumptions are managed in a proactive manner.		
	<b>B</b>	The intervention is relatively successful in adapting its strategies to changing external conditions in order to achieve its outcome. Risks management is rather passive.		
	<b>C</b>	The intervention has not entirely succeeded in adapting its strategies to changing external conditions in a timely or adequate manner. Risk management has been rather static. An important change in strategies is necessary in order to ensure the intervention can achieve its outcome.		
	<b>D</b>	The intervention has failed to respond to changing external conditions, risks were insufficiently managed. Major changes are needed to attain the outcome.		

<b>4. POTENTIAL SUSTAINABILITY: The degree of likelihood to maintain and reproduce the benefits of an intervention in the long run (beyond the implementation period of the intervention).</b>					
<i>In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as follows: At least 3 'A's, no 'C' or 'D' = A ; Maximum two 'C's, no 'D' = B; At least three 'C's, no 'D' = C ; At least one 'D' = D</i>					
<b>Assessment</b>	<b>POTENTIAL</b>	<b>A</b>	<b>B</b>	<b>C</b>	<b>D</b>
<b>SUSTAINABILITY : total</b>	X				

score				
<b>4.1 Financial/economic viability?</b>				
X	A	Financial/economic sustainability is potentially very good: costs for services and maintenance are covered or affordable; external factors will not change that.		
	B	Financial/economic sustainability is likely to be good, but problems might arise namely from changing external economic factors.		
	C	Problems need to be addressed regarding financial sustainability either in terms of institutional or target groups costs or changing economic context.		
	D	Financial/economic sustainability is very questionable unless major changes are made.		
<b>4.2 What is the level of ownership of the intervention by target groups and will it continue after the end of external support?</b>				
X	A	The steering committee and other relevant local structures are strongly involved in all stages of implementation and are committed to continue producing and using results.		
	B	Implementation is based in a good part on the steering committee and other relevant local structures, which are also somewhat involved in decision-making. Likelihood of sustainability is good, but there is room for improvement.		
	C	The intervention uses mainly ad-hoc arrangements and the steering committee and other relevant local structures to ensure sustainability. Continued results are not guaranteed. Corrective measures are needed.		
	D	The intervention depends completely on ad-hoc structures with no prospect of sustainability. Fundamental changes are needed to enable sustainability.		
<b>4.3 What is the level of policy support provided and the degree of interaction between intervention and policy level?</b>				
X	A	Policy and institutions have been highly supportive of intervention and will continue to be so.		
	B	Policy and policy enforcing institutions have been generally supportive, or at least have not hindered the intervention, and are likely to continue to be so.		
	C	Intervention sustainability is limited due to lack of policy support. Corrective measures are needed.		
	D	Policies have been and likely will be in contradiction with the intervention. Fundamental changes needed to make intervention sustainable.		
<b>4.4 How well is the intervention contributing to institutional and management capacity?</b>				
X	A	Intervention is embedded in institutional structures and has contributed to improve the institutional and management capacity		

		(even if this is not an explicit goal).
	<b>B</b>	Intervention management is well embedded in institutional structures and has somewhat contributed to capacity building. Additional expertise might be required. Improvements in order to guarantee sustainability are possible.
	<b>C</b>	Intervention relies too much on ad-hoc structures instead of institutions; capacity building has not been sufficient to fully ensure sustainability. Corrective measures are needed.
	<b>D</b>	Intervention is relying on ad hoc and capacity transfer to existing institutions, which could guarantee sustainability, is unlikely unless fundamental changes are undertaken.



## 4.2 DECISIONS BY THE STEERING COMMITTEE AND FOLLOW-UP

Decisions					Actions			Follow-up	
Made decisions	Identified Time	Time	Source	Responsible	Actions	Responsible	Deadlines	Progress	Status
Approval on AWP&Budget 2016	Feb 2016	Feb 2016		PCU	Approval on AWP&Budget 2016	PCU		Completed	
BTC's NOL and approval of PPC on the baseline report;	2016	2016		BTC	Approval of Baseline report	BTC		Completed	
Ha Tinh has difficulties in recruiting the long-term technical advisers, therefore, BTC allowed to recruit the advisers in the province and this is on progress. In case of impossible to recruit, the option of short-term contract/technical lump-sum contract will be applied	2016	2016		PCU	Two potitions recruited, include : - Urban Planning technical staff ; - Environment and CC technical staff ;			Two technical staff on Meteorology and GIS need to be recruited	
Actively working with TSU to finalize POM; and steps of getting BTC's NOL and PPC's approval on POM;	2016	2016		TSU, BTC and PCU	In the process of finalizing and submitting for BTC's NOL	PCU		On-going	
In cooperation with Ha Noi National University to support	2016	2016		PCU		PCU		On-going	

Decisions					Actions			Follow-up	
Made decisions	Identified Time	Time	Source	Responsible	Actions	Responsible	Deadlines	Progress	Status
WAMADE during the implementation in Ha Tinh									



### 4.3 UPDATED LOGICAL FRAMEWORK

### 4.4 MoRe Results AT GLANCE

Logical framework's results or indicators modified in last 12 months?	M&E and logical framework being developed therefore there is no change
Planning of final MTR (registration of report)	June 2019 (estimate)

## 4.5 BUDGET REPORT

### BUDGET REPORT UP 31/12/2016

M	Activities	FIN mode	Budget	Belgium	Vietnam	Figure in: EUR			
						Fund disbursement up to 31/12/2016		Remaining fund	
						BEL	VN	BEL	VN
A	Specific objective: "To support the institutional capacity in Ha Tinh Province in integrated water resources management and urban development in relation to CC in Ha Tinh province"		6.847.800	6.335.000	762.800	658.220	0	5.676.780	512.800
A	1		1.405.000	1.405.000	0	172.900	0	1.232.099	0
A	2	PM	990.000	990.000	0	524.416	0	465.583	0
A	3	PM	3.792.800	3.280.000	512.800	29.741	0	3.250.258	762.800
A	4		660.000	660.000	0	2.985	0	657.014	0
X	Contingency		304.500	304.500	0	0	0	304.500	0
Z	General means		1.792.700	1.160.500	632.200	134.406	176.856	1.026.093	60.343



#### **4.6 SOURCES OF INFORMATION**

1. Technical and Financial Files of “Integrated water resources management and urban development in relation to Climate change in Ha Tinh province”;
2. Project Document of “Integrated water resources management and urban development in relation to Climate change in Ha Tinh province”;;
3. Implementation report of 2014 and AWP &B of 2015 of “Integrated water resources management and urban development in relation to Climate change in Ha Tinh province”;;
4. Contents of second meeting of PSC dated on 12/01/2015.