



Belgische Technische Coöperatie nv
Coopération Technique Belge sa

FOLLOW-UP EVALUATION REPORT

The Development and Implementation of an Integrated Management Plan of Kilombero Valley Flood Plain Ramsar Site.

Intervention code : TAN 04 011 11, NN: 19891/11

BASIC INFORMATION ON THE PROJECT.

Country : **Tanzania**

DAC Sector and subsector : **410-41030 (Environment)**

National or regional institution in charge of the execution: **Ministry of Natural Resources and
Tourism – Wildlife Division**

Agencies in charge of the execution : **Belgian Technical Cooperation** :

Number of BTC international cooperation experts: **1**

Duration of the project (according to SA/SC) : **4 years**

Start date of the project:

according to SA/SC : **24/11/2004**
effective : **1/11/ 2006**

End date of the project :

according to SA/SC : **23/11/2010**
estimate : **1/11/2010**

Project management methods : **Co-management**

Project total budget : **Euro 1,950,000.00**

Report covering the period : **November 2006 to December 2006**

Annexes	Yes	No
1. Results summary	x	
2. Planned activities for the year 2006		x
3. Planned activities year 2007	x	
4. Situation of receipts and expenses for the year 2007	x	
5. Budgetary estimates year 2007	x	
6. Disbursement rate of the project		x
7. Personnel of the project	x	
8. Subcontracting activities and invitations to tender	x	
9. Equipments		x
10. Backers	x	

PART ONE: APPRAISAL

Evaluate the relevance and the performance of the project by means of the following assessments:

- 1. - Very satisfactory*
- 2. - Satisfactory*
- 3. - Non satisfactory, in spite of some positive elements*
- 4. - Non satisfactory*
- X. - Unfounded*

Write down your answer in the column corresponding to your function during the execution of the project.

	National execution official	BTC execution official
RELEVANCE¹ (cf. PRIMA, §70, p.19)		
1. Is the project relevant compared to the national development priorities?	1	1
2. Is the project relevant compared to the Belgian development policy?	1	1
3. Are the objectives of the project yet relevant?	1	1
4. Does the project meet the needs of the target groups?	1	1
5. Does the project rely on the appropriate local execution organs according to the objectives?	1	1

¹ According to the PRIMA, §70, p.19, it is a matter of «appreciating if the choices relative to the objectives, the target groups and the local execution organs remain relevant and consistent according to the general principles of a useful and efficient aid, and according to the execution of the local, regional, international and Belgian development policies and strategies».

	National execution official	BTC execution official
PERFORMANCE² (PRIMA, §71, pp.19-20)		
1. Did the project results contribute to the carrying out of its objectives ³ ? (efficiency)	1	1
2. Assess the quality of the intermediate results. (efficiency)	NA	NA
3. Are the management methods of the project appropriate? (efficiency)	2	2
4. Are the following resources appropriate (efficiency) :		
a. Financial means?		
b. Human resources?	1	1
c. Material and equipment?	1	1
5. Are the project resources effectively used and optimized in order to reach the foreseen results? (efficiency)	Too early to evaluate	Too early to evaluate
6. Is the project satisfactory on a cost-efficiency approach in comparison to similar interventions? (efficiency)	Too early to evaluate	Too early to evaluate
7. According to the execution planning, assess the speed of the execution. (respect of deadlines)	Too early to evaluate	Too early to evaluate

Indicate your global evaluation concerning the project by means of the following appreciations:

- 1.** - *Very satisfactory*
- 2.** - *Satisfactory*
- 3.** - *Non satisfactory, in spite of some positive elements*
- 4.** - *Non satisfactory*
- X.** - *Unfounded*

² According to PRIMA, §71, pp. 19-20, it is a matter of « appreciate and measure the foreseen performances agreed during the preparation traineeships according to the 4 criteria and the indicators established during the formulation ». (The 4 criteria are efficiency, suitability, respect of deadlines and quality of the personnel).

³ See annex 1 for further information

	National execution official	BTC execution official
Global evaluation of the project	NA	NA

Comment your evaluation, which can be broader than the strict framework of the above mentioned relevance and performance criteria and differ from the given evaluation.

For the period under review the project was implemented for only two months with only a Local Technical Advisor and an Project Manager for half a month. It was therefore too early to assess performance.

National execution official	BTC execution official
Julius Wandongo	Peter Chisara

PART TWO: ACTIVITIES SUMMARY .

1. Based on the project Intermediate Results (IR), list the main project activities and realizations in comparison to its objectives and to the activities plan for the year considered (+ comments).

During the reporting period of two months, November 2006 to December 2006 very little has been done.

- Recruitment of LTA
- Recruitment of PM
- Introduction to the project districts.
- Launching of tender for procurement of vehicles and the project equipments.

The Project Manager and the Technical Advisor managed to organize two mission trips to the project site to introduce to Kilombero and Ulanga District Authorities. Also the same project personnel attended a two day orientation workshop which was organized by BTC and facilitated by the International Consultant

2. Comment, if necessary, the main project receipts and expenses influencing the above mentioned question, in comparison to the budget estimates of the year 2006

At the end of 2006 the project was in the start-up phase and the activity plan had yet to be drawn up.

3. Which are the main appropriation mechanisms and activities implemented by the project during the year 2006.

As no 2 above

PART THREE: COMMENTS AND ANALYSIS.

1. What are the major problems and questions influencing the project execution?

The project is just in two months of the inception phase

- Prolonged and cumbersome procurement procedures
- Recruitment of project manager

2. What caused the calendar and the foreseen results to be delayed?

The project started a year later than planned due delays in the process leading up to approval of the TFF. The project started effectively with the recruitment of the Local Technical Advisor (LTA). Following the recruitment of LTA further delay occurred due to a delay in recruiting other project staff, particularly the project manager (PM).

3. How can one solve the problems identified above? Expose the recommended measure(s). Specify the person who should be in charge of it/them. Indicate, approximately, the execution time and the resources needed for these measures to be executed.

The project manager was recruited in the mid of December and activities are in progress. Proper procurement plan to be made by the project team.

4. Are the start assumptions (or hypotheses) yet relevant?

The start (initial) assumptions are still relevant.

5. Are the project indicators yet valid?

The project indicators are still valid for the time being although the percentages indicated as sign of measure to some cases may look ambitious. A proper review of the indicators will be done during the development of the mentoring plan which will be an exercise to be done immediately after the work plan and budget exercise at the end of April 2007.

6. What are the factors which have influenced the project realization? Were some of them new, i.e. not foreseen beforehand and capable of modifying the whole project?

The project had just started; it was too early to carry out such assessment

7. What is the opinion of the target groups on the project?

Referring to the villages visited, the beneficiaries are very positive to the project objectives and its style of implementation. We may conclude by saying that the villagers or the beneficiaries of this project have accepted the project with some expectations.

8. If the project has been evaluated, how were the recommendations taken into account?

The project had not been evaluated.

9. What are the project main successful outcomes?

Recruitment of LTA and PM (lengthen it)

10. What are your recommendations as for the continuation of the project?

The project has just started it is not feasible to make useful recommendations.

National execution official	BTC execution official
Julius Wandongo	Peter Chisara

PART FOUR. ANNEXES.

ANNEX 1. Results summary

ANNEX 2. Planned activities for the year 2006

ANNEX 3. Activities planning year +2007

ANNEX 4. Situation of receipts and expenses for the year 2006

ANNEX 5. Budget estimates year 2007

ANNEX 6. Disbursement rate of the Project

ANNEX 7. Project personnel

ANNEX 8. Subcontracting and invitations to tender

ANNEX 9. Equipments

ANNEX 10. Backer's interventions

ANNEX 1. Results and activities summary

Intermediate results	Indicators	Progress
IR. 1.Integrtrd Management Plan(IMP)developed/put in place	<p>Integrated Management Plan in place in two years from commencement of the project</p> <p>Number of key management decisions made based on Data from Natural Resources Information System during preparation of district strategic and annual plans</p> <p>Strategies identified in the IMP incorporated in District Strategic/development Plans by the end of the project and funds for their implementation allocated</p> <p>Key species habitats fully rehabilitated and maintained from the base line status</p>	The project is at very starting phase
IR. 2.IMP implemented	<p>Inter District Coordinating Committee functioning efficiently by Year 4</p> <p>Strategies identified in IMP are included in the District Strategic Plans and translated to activities in Annual Plans by the end of the project.</p> <p>Number of land use plans prepared and implemented</p> <p>Number of By laws formulated and enforced.</p> <p>Progress of implementation of Land Use plans at village level monitored at least twice / year</p>	The project is at very starting phase

	<p>Levels and sources of conflicts in pilot villages reduced by 50% from the current base (monitored at least twice / year).</p> <p>Full council approves by-laws governing village land use plans.</p>	
IR. 3 Livelihood of the target communities improved	<p>Livestock numbers maintained within approved stocking rates in the selected villages within the Ramsar site by end of project.</p> <p>Amount of yields of major crops per unit area increased by 30 % by end of the project.</p> <p>Number of beekeepers from selected villages within the Ramsar site increases by a maximum of 100 from baseline survey by end of project.</p> <p>Significant increase in production (quantity and quality of bee products/</p> <p>Three fisher folk associations formed and operational by end of the project period.</p> <p>Annual fish production in Year 4 increased over baseline value in Year 1</p>	The project is at very starting phase
IR.4 Project Implemented effectively and efficiently	<p>Annual work plans and budgets timely approved by JLPC</p> <p>Activities implemented according to approved work plans</p> <p>Increased level of performance while spending same levels of funds for similar activities at the beginning of the project as compared to the end of the project</p>	Project successfully recruited Local Technical Advisors and the Project Manager.

ANNEX 2 : Planned activities for the year 2006: NA.

	Month 1	Month 2	Month 3	Month 4	Month 5	Month 6	Month 7	Month 8	Month 9	Month 10	Month 11	Month 12
IR 1.												
Activities 1												
Activities 2												
Activities n												
IR 2.												
Activities 1												
Activities 2												
Activities n												
IR N.												
Activities 1												
Activities 2												
Activities n												

ANNEX 3 : Planned activities year 2007.

Activity Plan 2007	Starting-up				Main implementation phase							
RESULT AREA 1	J	F	M	A	M	2007 J	J	A	S	O	N	D
Development and Implementation of an integrated Management Plan of Kilombero Valley Ramsar Site.												
Activities												
Collect and collate existing baseline information (social, cultural, economic, physical and ecological characteristics) on												
Carry out baseline and inventory studies to fill gaps identified in activity R1A1												
3. Carry out annual livestock census in the wetland to establish wet and dry season status and distribution												
Carry out a systematic wet and dry season aerial surveys (in yrs 1 and 3) to establish status and distribution of wildlife populations in the Ramsar site.												
Conduct survey of fisheries to determine number of villagers, fisher folks, and annual use patterns of												
Conduct awareness training on Ramsar convention obligations at village level.												
Preparation of village land use plans and resource management zones for the selected villages in the Ramsar site.												
Carry out a strategic environmental assessment on major economic activities in the Ramsar site (targeting KVTC, Illovo, large scale rice farms, fisheries, livestock production etc.)												
Support establishment of conflict arbitration and resolution committees at village level.												
Preparation of by-laws governing wise use of natural resources in each participating village.												
RESULT AREA 2												
Implementation of the IMP of the Kilombero Valley Flood Plain Ramsar Site initiated												
Activities												
Educate resource users on Village Land Act and policies on land utilization												
Training in Good Governance/leadership skills												
Establish resource user associations												
Train user associations on sustainable use of resources (land, water, fishery, Livestock, wildlife, beekeeping and forestry)												
Establish natural resource management committees.												
Create awareness on wetland values and management at village level												
wardening												
Contribution and wise use of the wetland resource in local economy of the Kilombero Flood Plain Ramsar Site is increased and sustained.												
Support formation of Income generating /market groups, (Youth, Females and Males) in the pilot villages												
Establish Natural resource based income generating activities in selected villages (improving farming, fishing, beekeeping practices, tree												
Result area 4												
Purchase of equipment												
Mobilization of Project Team												
Mobilization of National Government staff												
Mobilization of District Staff												
Operation / maintenance of transport												
Operation and maintenance of project office												
Monitoring and evaluation												

**ANNEX 4: SITUATION OF RECEIPTS AND EXPENSES FOR THE
YEAR 2006**

Budget Code	Budget Headings description	Task Code	Sector Code	TOTAL COST BELGIAN CONTRIBUTION	CUMULATED EXPENSES	EXPENSES YEAR 2007
PART Z: General means 01						
01/01	Employment of project team			262,520	5,530	256,990
01/07	Operation and maintenance of project			69,000	80	68,920
01/10	Bank Charges			0.00	90	-90
Grand Total				331,520	5,700	325,820

ANNEX 5 : Budget estimates year 2007

BUDGET 2007						
DisplayDesc	BudLineValid	BudLineFinMet	Budget	Bud Lin eLe vel	Estimated Expenditu re YR 1	Balance Remaining
A RESULTS				1		
01 Integrated management plan of the Kilombero Valley Flood Plain Ramsar Site is developed				2		
01 Baseline: collect & collate data and carry out survey	COGEST	11,000.00			9,000.00	2,000.00
02 Annual livestock inventory	COGEST	6,000.00			-	6,000.00
03 Wet and dry season aerial surveys	COGEST	26,100.00			-	26,100.00
04 Survey of Kilombero fishery	COGEST	8,900.00			-	8,900.00
05 Ramsar awareness	COGEST	65,100.00			-	65,100.00
06 Land use plans and resource management zones	COGEST	140,000.00			-	140,000.00
07 Preparation of strategic environmental assessment	COGEST	24,000.00			-	24,000.00
08 Conflict resolution	COGEST	12,000.00			-	12,000.00
09 Development of village by-laws	COGEST	20,000.00			-	20,000.00
10 Develop integrated managment plan	COGEST	100,000.00				100,000.00
11 Technical backstopping	REGIE	30,000.00			-	30,000.00
12 Establishment of wildlife management areas	COGEST	25,000.00		-		25,000.00
	SUB TOTAL	468,100.00			9,000.00	459,100.00
02 Management Plan of the Kilombero Valley Flood Plain Ramsar Site is implemented				2		

01 Launch integrated management plan	COGEST	4,700.00	3		4,700.00
02 Awareness/training land act: need assessment, preparation, train, raise awareness	COGEST	60,600.00	3	-	60,600.00
03 Training in good governance/leadership skills: need assessment, preparation, train	COGEST	25,000.00	3	24,100	900.00
04 Exchange visits (technical)	COGEST	20,000.00	3		20,000.00
05 Resource user groups: establishment & training	COGEST	112,000.00	3	7,000.00	105,000.00
06 Natural resources committees: establishment	COGEST	23,400.00	3	-	23,400.00
07 Promotion of Ramsar site	COGEST	46,500.00	3	-	46,500.00
08 Wetland wardening	COGEST	27,000.00	3	-	27,000.00
09 Technical backstopping	REGIE	17,800.00	3		17,800.00
	SUB TOTAL	337,000.00		31,100.00	305,900.00
03 Contribution and wise use of the wetland resources in local economy of the Kilombero Flood Plain Ramsar Site is increased and sustained			2		
01 Income generating groups: support establishment	COGEST	20,000.00	3	-	20,000.00
02 Associations in business management: training	COGEST	125,100.00	3		125,100.00
03 Income generating activities: establish natural resources based IGA	COGEST	74,900.00	3	-	74,900.00
04 Improve fishery management	COGEST	80,000.00	3	-	80,000.00
05 Technical backstopping	REGIE	37,800.00	3		37,800.00
	SUB TOTAL	337,800.00		0.00	337,800.00
Z General means			1		
01 General Means			2		

01 Employment of project team	REGIE	262,500.00	3		262,500.00
02 Purchase of equipment	COGEST	258,600.00	3	-	258,600.00
03 Mobilization of project team	COGEST	32,700.00	3	-	32,700.00
04 Mobilization of district staff	COGEST	20,800.00	3	-	20,800.00
05 Operation/maintenance of transport	COGEST	70,100.00	3	-	70,100.00
06 Strengthening capacity of JLPC/IDCC	COGEST	3,000.00	3	2,000	1,000.00
07 Operation and maintenance of project	COGEST	69,000.00	3	-	69,000.00
08 Project supervision and backstopping	REGIE	24,800.00	3	6,200.00	18,600.00
09 Monitoring and evaluation	REGIE	65,600.00	3	16,400.00	49,200.00
10 bank charges and fees	REGIE	0.00	3		0.00
11 bank charges and fees	COGEST	0.00	3		0.00
	SUB TOTAL	807,100.00		24,600.00	782,500.00
	GRAND TOTAL	1,950,000.00		64,700.00	1,885,300.00

ANNEX 6. Disbursement rate of the project: NA

FINANCIAL SUMMARY						
Source of financing	Budget estimates (year)	Cumulated budget	Real expenses (year)	Real cumulated expenses	Disbursement rate (year)	Disbursement rate (cumulated)
Direct Belgian Contribution						
Partner Country Contribution						
Counterpart Funds Contribution						
Other source						

ANNEX 7. Project personnel

Personnel type (title, name and gender)	Duration of recruitment (start and end dates)	Comments (recruitment period, profile relevance ...)
<p>1. National personnel put at disposal by the Partner Country</p> <p>Project Manager;</p> <p>Julius Wandongo (M)</p> <p>Assistant Director responsible for Wetland Unit (M)</p> <p>Principal Game Officer, International Obligations(F)</p>	<p>Four years</p>	
<p>2. Support personnel, locally recruited</p> <p>District Executive Director(DED) ;</p> <p>Kilombero (F)</p> <p>DED Ulanga (M)</p> <p>2 District Planning Officers</p> <p>2 District Natural Resources Officers</p> <p>2 District Game Officers</p> <p>2 District Forestry Officers</p> <p>2 District Fisheries officers</p> <p>2 District Beekeeping Officers</p> <p>2 District Agriculture and Livestock Officers</p> <p>2 District Land Officers</p> <p>2 District Community</p>		

Development Officers 2 Drivers		
3. Training personnel, locally recruited NA		
4. International personnel (outside BTC)	NON	
5. Expert in International Cooperation (BTC) International consultant Ms. Isbell vonOertzen (F)	November 2006	
6. Local experts recruited by BTC Local Technical Advisor Mr. Peter Chisara (M) Accountant/Administrator	November 2006 February 2007	

ANNEX 8. Subcontracting and invitations to tender for year 2006

Procurement of Three Project Vehicles

Tendering mode	: Competitive Open Tender
Date of the invitation to tender	: 16/11/2006
Start date of the subcontracting	:
Name of the subcontractor (or of the company)	:
Subject of the contract	: Procurement of Selous three project vehicles
Cost of the contract	: -
Duration of the contract	: -

Results obtained during the year 2006:

Evaluation of Tender and the awarding was postponed to 2007 due to Christmas holidays.
The evaluation panel proposed **M/S TOYOTA GILBRATAR STOCK HOLDINGS LTD** to supply the vehicles

ANNEX 9. Equipments

Equipment type	Cost		Delivery date		Remarks
	Budget	Real	Planned	Real	
NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	As stated above the project is just in the start-up phase

ANNEX 10. Backers interventions

Interventions of other backers for the same project or for project pursuing the same specific objective.

Backers playing a part in the same project				
Backers	Intervention name	Budget	Main objectives	Comments
	NA	NA	NA	NA
Backers contributing to a similar specific objective				
Backers	Intervention name	Budget	Main objectives	Comments
Ministry of Natural Resources and Tourism – Wildlife Division.	The Development and Implementation of an Integrated Management Plan of Kilombero Valley Flood Plain Ramsar site	EUR 720,000.00	Livelihood of the Kilombero Valley's population is improved through sustainable conservation and utilization of wetland's resources	The project is at starting phase.
Kilombero District Council	-do-	EUR 115,000.00	-do-	
Ulanga District Council	-do.	EUR 100,000.00	-do-	