



**CTB**

**AGENCE BELGE  
DE DÉVELOPPEMENT**

## **ANNUAL REPORT 2010**

**KILOMBERO VALLEY FLOOD PLAIN RAMSAR SITE PROJECT IN TANZANIA -  
TAN0401111**

## Table of contents

<b>1 PROJECT FORM .....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>2 SUMMARY .....</b>	<b>4</b>
2.1 ANALYSIS OF THE INTERVENTION .....	6
2.2 KEY POINTS .....	10
2.3 LESSONS LEARNED AND RECOMMENDATIONS .....	10
<b>3 EVOLUTION OF THE CONTEXT .....</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>4 ANALYSIS OF THE INTERVENTION .....</b>	<b>12</b>
4.1 INSTITUTIONAL ANCHORING AND EXECUTION MODALITIES .....	12
4.2 SPECIFIC OBJECTIVE .....	12
4.2.1 Indicators .....	13
4.2.2 Analysis of progress made .....	14
4.2.3 Risks and Assumptions .....	14
4.2.4 Quality criteria .....	15
4.2.5 Impact .....	16
4.2.6 Lessons learned and recommendations .....	16
4.3 RESULT .....	18
4.3.1 Indicators .....	18
4.3.2 Evaluation of activities .....	24
4.3.3 Analysis of progress made .....	27
4.3.4 Risks and Assumptions .....	27
4.3.5 Budget execution .....	29
4.3.6 Lessons learned and recommendations .....	32
<b>5 BENEFICIARIES .....</b>	<b>33</b>
<b>6 FOLLOW-UP OF THE DECISIONS TAKEN BY THE JLCB .....</b>	<b>34</b>
<b>7 ANNEXES .....</b>	<b>35</b>

## 1 Project form

Country	Tanzania
DGCD intervention number:	19891/11
Navision code BTC formulation number	TAN 04 0111 01
Navision Code BTC Execution	TAN0401111
Partner institution:	MNRT –WD of Tanzania
Duration of intervention:	48 months
Duration of Specific Agreement:	72 months
Tanzanian contribution:	EUR 935,000
Begin contribution:	EUR 2, 001,487
Total contribution:	EUR 2, 936,487
Intervention sector	410 – 41030 (Environnement)
Start date of project	According to S/A 24/11/2004
	Effective date 01/11/2006
End date of Project	According to S/A 23/11/2011
Period under Review	January – December 2010

## 2 Summary

The Kilombero Valley Flood Plains Ramsar Site Project is set to develop and implement an Integrated Management Plan (IMP). It is therefore the project expectation to reduce the levels of land use conflict and improving the livelihoods of communities that depend on the wetlands for their socio-economic well-being. It specifically wants to achieve that at the end of the project, the livelihood of communities is significantly improved through wise use principle and utilization of the wetland's resources. The strategies to achieve this include:

- (i) Resolving land use conflicts through improved land use planning activities;
- (ii) Establishing natural resource based income generating activities at village and household level;
- (iii) Establishing local institution(s) to coordinate manage and develop key sectors of the local economy at the village and district level (e.g. beekeeping, forestry, agriculture, and fisheries); and
- (iv) Improving the efficiency of the District Councils to implement the IMP in terms of the Ramsar Convention.

In view of the above, a number of activities were implemented for the period between January and December 2010. The implementation made in line with the Mid Term Review recommendations and the focus made on finalization of the initiated activities and those essentially meant to facilitate preparation of the IMP document. A total of 26 activities with 57 sub-activities were planned and approved for implementation in the reporting period. The target was met by 70% by implementing 19 activities with 40 sub-activities as summarized below:-

**A\_01 IMP Developed:** Most activities implemented focused on finalization of collection of baseline information and setting up the institutional base necessary for learned management of the Ramsar site. A full-scale livestock survey was undertaken along with the Caprine Bovine Pleura Pneumonia vaccination to easy counting of cattle, the main livestock on it accused for the cause of major degradation in Ramsar site. Other important activities include initiation of the IMP document preparation process through which the draft IMP document has been prepared and is under review process, setting up and approval of bylaws governing resources management, CEPA prototypes and materials development, finalizing SEA consultancy draft report review by PMT and stakeholders, sensitizations and surveys on areas for establishment of wildlife management areas, land use planning and awareness on wetlands and environmental management including village decisions to reserve some identified wetlands.

PFT meeting for training on CEPA prototypes preparation was held and the Consultant is finalizing the CEPA report with developed

prototypes inclusive. It was however not possible to finalize report on Strategic Environmental Management (SEA) on major economic activities following the given Stakeholders' suggestions on necessary information required for inclusion in the report. Moreover, GIS database has not yet finalized despite the reminder letter and mini agreement entered between the PMT and the Facilitator in an effort to instigate finalization of the work by the Facilitator.

**A02 IMP Implemented:** The January – December 2010 implementation focused on local-based institutional strengthening and organizational development for enhancement of management capacities and promotion of various socio-economic and conservation initiatives. Training to village natural resources committees at Likuyu Sekamaganga, purchasing of VGS uniforms and bicycles, on job training to village scouts at village level, mobilization of resources user groups and household income generating activities and backstopping on implementation of conservation initiatives were among the key deliverables under this result area.

**A03 Conservation contribution to improved livelihoods increased:** Emphasis as suggested by the Mid Term Review was put on finalization of initiated income generating activities and setting up the appropriate legal linkages to make them effective. Groups were supported to prepare constitutions, communal forest management plans of which some have been finalized and support promotion of Farmers Field Schools interventions particularly improvement of local chicken production using improved cockerels and paddy production, beekeeping and fish farming.

**Z\_01 Project Management:** Various items and services were purchased to facilitate activity implementation. Parallel to this, Final Project Evaluation was conducted for the period under review.

Despite the above progress made the project experienced some challenges during the implementation. These include:-

- Unnecessary delay in the delivery reports by Consultants;
- Accelerate the immigration of pastoralists and farmers in the KQRS as a result of weak enforcement of existing laws and village by-laws coupled with political influence;
- Some indicators that were developed during the project design being difficult to measure, hence, difficulties assessment of the project performance. Similarly, no baseline information established for comparison with progress made by the project;
- Most areas demarcated for WMAs establishment during the Land Use planning exercise fall under Game Controlled Areas. (GCAs), hence, calling for their degazettement by MNRT prior proceeding with WMAs establishment; and
- The likelihoods of KQRS degradation as a result of FAMOGATA and Kilimo Kwanza policy unless deliberate efforts are taken to identify the risks or negative impact that might be experienced with focus on sustainable

management of the wetlands.

## 2.1 Analysis of the intervention

Intervention logic	Efficiency	Effectiveness	Sustainability
<p><b>Specific objective</b> At the end of project, <i>the Livelihood of the Kilombero Valley's population is improved through sustainable conservation and utilization of wetland resources</i></p>	<p>Despite the fact that the project strived to adhere to its planned activities and the efficient use of allocated resources in order to achieve the expected results within the project life span/timeframe. However, the expected results could not fully be realised partly due to delayed implementation in the first year and accomplishment of various consultancy assignments meant to avail basic information for IMP development.</p>	<p>Looking at the local community standard of living since the project inception to date, there is some clear evidence of livelihoods improvement. However, it is difficult to rule out that such changes are attributed to the project interventions. The reason behind this is that, field monitoring have shown increased community awareness and positive attitudes towards conservation and understanding of Ramsar concepts as a result of the project initiatives, but little in terms of direct measurable contribution to their livelihoods improvement.</p>	<p>The fact that until this period under review, the IMP document is still in Draft form, it creates uncertainty if it can fully be mainstreamed into the DDPs within the shortest remaining project period. Moreover, IDCC has not yet established and structurally integrated in the institutional landscape as stipulated in the exit strategy. This may largely hamper the future project sustainability. However, a number of capacity building have been made with clear evidence of profound change in communities' and other</p>

			stakeholders' positive attitude towards conservation. This coupled with established local based institutions like VGS and VNRECs implicitly sets the avenue for project sustainability.
<b>Result 1:</b> IMP Developed	The project has been efficient in using resources set for IMP development despite the delayed time which accounts as a shortfall in this aspect. However, it is important to note that IMP draft document is in place subject for final review and approval. Assertively, this has a considerable effect accounting for more than 60% achieved efficiency in this result area.	The effectiveness has been realised in this particular result area. This is substantiated by the collected baseline data/information and effective stakeholders' participation which essentially contributed in the development of IMP draft document.	The project has made efforts to ensure sustainability of this intervention through wider scope involvement of various stakeholders in all stages of IMP development.
<b>Result 2:</b> IMP Implemented	As per TFF, the IMP will be implemented in parallel with its development and not in isolation. In this case, the project efficiency has to a large extent been achieved through implementation of some activities in tandem with IMP development.	Despite the fact that IMP document is still in a draft form, a number of activities have been implemented including capacity building, Land Use Planning and establishment of local-based institutions all of which implying for the project's effectiveness in this	The project efforts made towards the local institutions establishment and capacity building/strengthening implicitly is an indication for the project's interventions sustainability.

		result area.	
<b>Result 3:</b> Conservation contribution to improved livelihoods increased	The project carried out a number of activities that have direct link with communities' livelihoods with focus on efficient use of human, time and financial resources planned and made at its disposal. Basically, these include demarcation of community forests, establishment of Income generating Activities (IGAs) and capacity building initiatives for management of the interventions more profitably and sustainably.	The project's effectiveness is reflected by the locally established economic groups like fish pond farming, beekeeping, BMUs and cockerels intervention which in the long run will contribute to the local community livelihoods improvement.	Certainly, there is evidence for sustainability, as the established Natural Resources-based economic ventures are individually and/or communally owned, hence, high sense of commitment and ownership by the beneficiaries.
<b>Result 4:</b> Project managed effectively and efficiently	The project implementation rested on the two District Councils' availability. The project maximized the use of resources made available to it for efficient mobilization and use of the Districts' staff potentials to generate the expected results.	In a number of ways the project mobilised and built the district staff's capacity to promote effectiveness and efficiency not only for the execution of the project activities, but also mainstreaming into the district councils' operational and administrative systems. This increased the districts, effectiveness to a certain extent as is reflected in the districts' planning and reporting.	The mainstreaming of the project's activities particularly in the planning and reporting systems through which the District Project Coordinators are now asked by the Districts to present the plans and reporting of the project progress is a clear indication for sustainability.



## Summary of Expenditure 2010

Result Area	Total Project Budget (€)	Total Expenditure up to Dec. 2009	2010 Annual Plan (€)	Total Annual Expenditure (€) as at 31 Dec. 2010.	Project Budget Balance (€) at 31 Dec. 2010	Execution rate
A1	449,200	231,074	156,830	126,268	91,858	81%
A2	353,000	255,254	67,540	62,913	34,833	93%
A3	213,800	78,111	69,490	48,529	87,160	70%
Z1	934,000	656,407	178,640	173,900	103,693	97%
<b>Total</b>	<b>1,950,000</b>	<b>1,220,845</b>	<b>472,500</b>	<b>411,610</b>	<b>317,545</b>	<b>87%</b>

## 2.2 Key points

## 2.3 Lessons learned and recommendations

During the project implementation the following lessons and the allied recommendations were gathered:-

- Consultancy work took unnecessary delay in the delivering reports. This affected the project implementation in one way or another. The good example is Land Use Planning and Baseline survey study. In this respect, it is recommended that it is crucially important to assess the internal capacity prior to decision for outsourcing. This will not only avoid unnecessary delays, but also enhance the districts' internal capacity and promote ownership of the information;
- Collaboration with other actors with common synergies is an aspect that was not considered seriously by the project. Likewise, harmonisation of the project with other BTC similar project was not adequately addressed. This should in the future be taken as a important aspect in enhancing project staff capacities through experience exchange and sharing of knowledge and skills;
- The weak enforcement of existing laws and village by-laws coupled with political influence accelerate the immigration of pastoralists and farmers in the KVRS, hence, the degradation of natural resources. To address this problem, it is recommended that the responsible authorities should stand on existing laws and village by-laws enforcement. Additionally, deliberate efforts should be taken to undertake the valuation of KVRS wetland and assess the losses that emanating from the current trend of degradation and its impact to the livelihoods of the present and future generation. This initiative will also be of great help in sensitising the decision-makers about the values and functions of the KVRS wetland.
- Some of the indicators developed during the project design are hard to measure in a practical sense. It is therefore important not to define the clear and measurable indicators, but also to develop M & E system that is based on SMART principles.
- No baseline information established before the project commencement. This made it difficult to assess the project performance progress. In this case, it is hereby recommended that prior to commencement of the project, baseline information should necessarily be established;
- Although Land Use Planning was conducted, most areas demarcated for WMAs establishment fall under Game Controlled Areas. (GCAs). Such situation calls for the degazettement of the GCAs demarcated by communities for WMAs establishment; and
- The Kilimo Kwanza policy and FAMOGATA might have detrimental effects on the natural resources management in the KVRS unless treated carefully. It is therefore important to identify the risks that might result from the implementation and develop effective mitigation measures to reduce the risks.

### 3 Evolution of the context

The project aims to develop an IMP for the Ramsar Site and through the implementation of the IMP to reduce levels of land use conflict and improve the livelihoods of communities that depend on the wetlands. Its specific objective is : ***Livelihood of the Kilombero Valley's population is improved through the sustainable conservation and utilisation of the wetlands' resources.*** In the course of implementation, some institutional and policy linked aspects that pushed and/or are likely to pull back the project's efforts were experienced. Specifically, the project experienced a political pressures that call for judicious efforts to make Morogoro region a National Granary with literal Swahili translation '*Fanya Mkoa wa Morogoro kuwa Ghala la Taifa* (FAMOGATA). This coupled with 'Kilimo Kwanza' policy suspiciously may have negative effect against the project efforts unless is treated with careful consideration to ensure effective integration of natural resources management. The reason behind this phenomenon is that, the execution Kilimo Kwanza Policy and FAMOGATA undoubtedly require the agricultural intensification with the use of agro-chemicals which without proper attention and control will result into KVRS ecological character degradation, let alone the impact that will add on demand for water and land resources usage. This coupled with the current trend of human activities encroachment particularly livestock keeping and farming increasingly poses a negative effect to the project efforts.

Moreover, with the 2010 General Election, the project experienced some hitches in the pace of implementation as most of district staff were tightly engaged in the preparations and execution of activities related to the General Elections. Nonetheless, the efforts were made for the review and accommodation of priority activities with considerable impact on the achievement of the project expected results

## 4 Analysis of the intervention

### 4.1 Institutional anchoring and execution modalities

The institutional anchoring the project together with its execution modalities is a bit complex in a practical sense. While the role for technical coordination and supervision of the project implementation rests to the Ministry of Natural Resources and Tourism (MNRT), the two District Councils (Kilombero and Ulanga) have the responsibility to implement the project. Undoubtedly, this complies with Wildlife Policy of 2007 on management of wetland resources which emphasis on the need for transfer of rights to manage and utilise natural resources from central or district government down to user groups at village level. Conversely, the fact that, District Council relies on PMO-RALG as the Ministry with an overseeing mandate to Local Government Authorities. This has a limitation effect not only on the project coordination by the MNRT, but also has drawbacks and complex in both the planning and reporting system since the District Councils have little link for reporting to the MNRT. This scene behind this fact is widened by the situation whereby the MNRT representative at field level is neither directly responsible to the District Council nor to the PMO-RALG. This situation leads to an assertion that the Institutional anchoring the project is not appropriate, hence, requires reforms not only for enhanced accountability, but also for ensuring the project's efficiency and effectiveness.

Moreover, the lack of standalone policy on wetlands management and harmonisations with other line policies is another aspect that perhaps contributes to lack of appropriate strategies for effective integration of wetlands issues in other sectors. Additionally, it would have been more appropriate to have a person with direct responsibility for wetlands management at the Local Government Authorities contrary to the current situation where this responsibility is under the District Lands, Natural Resources and Environment Officer (DLNREO).

### 4.2 Specific objective

The project wanted to see that the ***Livelihood of the Kilombero Valley's population is improved through the sustainable conservation and utilisation of the wetlands' resources*** following the implementation. Consistently, this meant to feed the general project objective and the realisation of expected results. The extent at which this has been achieved is illustrated through the use of descriptive and/or quantitative indicators in the table below.

### 4.2.1 Indicators

Specific objective: <i>Livelihood of the Kilombero Valley's population is improved through the sustainable conservation and utilisation of the wetlands' resources</i>					Progress:
Indicators	E	G	Baseline	Progress year in 2010	Comments
At least one Wetland reserve established in each District by end of the project.	x		The Ramsar convention and need for wetland conservation was very low before the project	A total of 51 wetlands identified and listed in 10 villages of Ulanga and 35 in 21 villages of Kilombero and preliminary management strategies developed to ensure sustainable conservation	The identification of the wetlands and laying down of management strategies implies for increased community awareness and understanding of the need for conservation compared to the time before the project
Source of income at household level increased by five folds by the end of the project over the start up base line value.	x	x	No baseline value set for the indicator before the project	Monitoring and Final project evaluation results showed an increased positive change towards community livelihoods improvement which implies for increased change in income.	It is hardly difficult to affirm that the observed change is solely due the project initiatives. In this respect the progress made might be graded as <b>Unsatisfactory</b> due to lack of vivid evidence.

#### 4.2.2 Analysis of progress made

A number of activities outlined in each result area have been implemented with considerable effect to the achievement of the specific objective. However, that fact that it took long to develop IMP document and so delay in its mainstreaming into the DDPs contributed to the drawbacks in realising the specific objective more profoundly. The delay in the project implementation in year 1 coupled with delayed in delivery of consultancy reports and lack of comprehensive monitoring system with SMART indicators contributed to the observed project performance. Moreover, deliverable effort geared to enhance harmonisation of different project with common synergies within BTC and collaboration with other actors would enhance the chances for experience, knowledge and skills sharing and exchange, hence, widened scope for achieving the project specific objective.

Nonetheless, the project initiatives in establishing and/or strengthening the existed natural resources-based IGAs such as beekeeping, fish pond farming and the like, have considerable contribution in the promotion of sustainable natural resources conservation on a gender-based perspective.

#### 4.2.3 Risks and Assumptions

Assumptions and risks are external conditions or situations that influence the success or the failure of the project implementation. They cannot be directly influenced by the project but should be monitored safeguard the success of the project. Basing on this conceptual understanding, the project observed an increased influx of livestock keepers from various places outside the KVRS, hence, increasing the risk for over-degradation of the natural resources in the KVRS. Partly, this is due to political influence and also lack of comprehensive strategies to mitigate the livestock keepers influx particularly at the local level. Moreover, just recently, there has been a political push to make Morogoro region a national granary by maximising the use of areas with high potentials for agriculture, Kilombero valley being one of the sites. This coupled with 'Kilimo Kwanza' policy may largely hamper the realisation of the project objectives unless deliberate efforts are taken to identify the risks that are likely to occur and develop the required mitigation measures.

Apart from the above, in the course of implementation the project experienced drawbacks in accessing some of villages due to prolonged flooding conditions. This situation being beyond the project's scope necessitated the occurrence of unnecessary delay, the review and rescheduling of activities, hence, negative effect on timely realisation of the project results.

#### 4.2.4 Quality criteria

	Score	Comments
<b>Effectiveness</b>	C	A number of activities have been implemented with contribution to the realisation of the specific objective. However, unlike other developmental interventions, it is difficult to realise the contribution of natural resources to the livelihood improvement with significant evidence in a relatively short-term.
<b>Efficiency</b>	B	The project used the resources made at its disposal in an efficient manner to realise the expected results despite some delays in implementation attributed to the reasons beyond the project scope.
<b>Sustainability</b>	C	There is a positive response towards the intervention at the district and community level. This is demonstrated by the integration of wetlands activities in the district plans and reporting system and the undertaking of the project intervention and its inclusion in most of project village plans such as regular patrols, demarcation of communal forests, and establishment of IGAs an approval of village by-laws governing the natural resources is a reflection of the project sustainability.
<b>Relevance</b>	A	The project relevance is very satisfactory for the reason that it is still in consistency with Tanzania strategy for Economic Growth and Poverty Reduction and the fact that is a member of Ramsar convention, hence, obliged to adhere with the convention principles.

<sup>1</sup> **Descriptions:** A: Very satisfactory; B: Satisfactory; C: Very satisfactory; D: Very unsatisfactory and X: Criteria has not been assessed

---

#### **Descriptions:**

A: Very satisfactory; B: Satisfactory; C: Very satisfactory; D: Very unsatisfactory and X: Criteria has not been assessed

#### 4.2.5 Impact

The achievement of the specific objective will not only contribute to realisation of National Strategy on Economic Growth and Poverty Reduction in consistent to the Joint Assistance Strategy for Tanzania, but also to the enhancement of natural resources contribution in improving the livelihoods of the poor communities as per Wildlife Policy of 2007 and reforms for decentralising the management of natural resources. The realisation of the impact envisaged during the project formulation is still guaranteed only that effort is still required to ensure effective mainstreaming of the project interventions into the DDPs. Moreover, there is a need for the shift of coordination role to the district with the MNRT remaining as an overseer of technical aspects essential for the implementation. The impact would again have been strengthened by having a standalone policy on Wetlands and appointment of an individual say Wetlands Officer at the District to oversee day to day functions linked to wetlands issues.

Despite the stated likelihood of the project contribution towards the achievement of the sectoral objective, there no or little evidence (indicator) that can justify the contribution of the project in the households income although there is an appreciation the improvement in the living conditions of the local communities in the project area.

#### 4.2.6 Lessons learned and recommendations

In the course of the project implementation, the following lessons were gathered:-

Lesson Learned	Public	Capitalisation in the project cycle
Some of the indicators that were set to measure results as described in the logical framework are not measurable looking at the field practical conditions. In this case it is critically important to set SMART indicators to enhance effectiveness assessment of the project results.	This lesson is of paramount importance at the project level, BTC HQ & representation and other development partners.	The gained lesson must be taken into account during the project identification and formulation phases.
No baseline information put in place before the project inception to create a base for comparable assessment of the project contribution. Hence, it is highly recommended that before the next phase of the project, baseline information should be established both in the	The lesson has significance importance the project level, BTC HQ & representation and other development partners.	This should be taken into account before or early at the beginning of the project implementation



project and nearby non-project villages as a base the assessment of the project performance.		
A stand alone policy on Wetlands is an important aspect that must be considered to ensure the existence of effective strategies that are geared to promote sustainable management of wetlands and its harmonisation with other policies.	The lesson is important to BTC HQ & representation and MNRT, Local Government Authorities and other development partners	The lessons should be taken into account during the planning phase.
The existence of political influence on the current trend of high influx of livestock keepers in the KVRS. Moreover, FAMOGATA and Kilimo Kwanza Policy might have strong negative effect to the sustainable management the KVRS ecological character. Hence, necessary efforts are required to ensure that the risks that are likely to occur due to that are identified and mitigation measures developed in advance.	The lesson is important to the policy decision-makers, representation, Kilombero and Ulanga District Authorities and BTC HQ.	It is important to consider this lesson in the formulation and planning of next phase of the project.

## 4.3 Result

### 4.3.1 Indicators

<b>Result 1: Integrated management plan of the Kilombero Valley Flood Plain Ramsar Site Developed.</b>					Progress:
<b>Indicators</b>	<b>E</b>	<b>G</b>	<b>Baseline</b>	<b>Progress year in 2010</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Integrated Management Plan in place in two years from commencement of the project	x		At the inception of the project there was uncoordinated development efforts towards NR conservation	Until the end of 2nd year of implementation IMP was not in place. However, the project managed to develop IMP draft document in 2010.	The delayed implementation in year 1 coupled with the delay in delivery of consultancy contributed to the observed snag.
Strategies identified in the IMP incorporated in District Strategic/development Plans by the end of the project and funds for their implementation allocated	x		Little knowledge of the district about wetlands management and Ramsar convention as a whole.	Increase awareness experienced at the two districts such that aspects for natural resources management have been included in their 2011 -13 District Strategic Plans.	Efforts are still required to ensure effective mainstreaming of IMP strategies in the DDPs and funds for the implementation allocated before the project ends.
Key species habitats fully rehabilitated and maintained from the base line status	x		Experienced high level of species habitats degradation in the KQRS.	Project villages in the two districts identified a total of 51 wetlands that requires effective management strategies for their sustainable conservation.	The villages through their local based institutions have been facilitated to lay down strategies that will ensure sustainable conservation of the identified wetlands.
Number of key	x		No baseline	A number of	Operationalisation

<b>Result 1: Integrated management plan of the Kilombero Valley Flood Plain Ramsar Site Developed.</b>					Progress:
<b>Indicators</b>	<b>E</b>	<b>G</b>	<b>Baseline</b>	<b>Progress year in 2010</b>	<b>Comments</b>
management decisions made based on Data from Natural Resources Information System during preparation of district strategic and annual plans			information set to measure this aspect.	decision taken including Full Council approval of village by-laws to govern management of natural resources in all 92 villages of Ulanga and also the inclusion of the project interventions into the districts' strategic plans and reporting system.	of Natural Resources Information Database is critically important aspect. However, there has been a delay of the Facilitator/TAWIRI in accomplishing the task.

<b>Result 2: Implementation of the Integrated Management Plan of the Kilombero Valley Flood Plain Ramsar Site initiated.</b>					Progress:
<b>Indicators</b>	<b>E</b>	<b>G</b>	<b>Baseline</b>	<b>Progress year in 2010</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Inter District Coordinating Committee functioning efficiently by Year 4.	x	x	Non-existence of IDCC at the beginning of the project.	Responsibilities of IDCC established and member to form the IDCC identified in 2010.	The modalities and resources to ensure an efficient functioning of IDCC after the project is still an important subject for consideration before the project ends.
Strategies identified in IMP are included in the District Strategic Plans and translated to activities in Annual Plans by	x	x	Little knowledge of the district about wetlands management and Ramsar convention as a whole.	Increase awareness experienced at the two districts such that aspects for natural resources management	Efforts are still required to ensure effective mainstreaming of IMP strategies in the DDPs and funds for the implementation

<b>Result 2: Implementation of the Integrated Management Plan of the Kilombero Valley Flood Plain Ramsar Site initiated.</b>					Progress:
<b>Indicators</b>	<b>E</b>	<b>G</b>	<b>Baseline</b>	<b>Progress year in 2010</b>	<b>Comments</b>
the end of the project.				have been included in their 2011 -13 District Strategic Plans.	allocated before the project ends.
Progress of implementation of Land Use Plans (LUP) at village level monitored at least twice/year	x	x	Existence of land use conflicts due to lack of LUP.	All project villages have LUP in place and its implementation is monitored regularly.	Despite the existence of LUP in the project villages, land use conflicts have been reported in some villages and PMT collaboratively work with District Authorities to resolve the conflict.
Levels and sources of conflicts in pilot villages monitored at least twice / year.	x	x	High levels and sources of conflicts existed before the project.	The levels and sources of conflicts in pilot villages are regularly monitored by the project Management Team and PFT.	Observed findings are shared and discussed as they occur and during the regular planning meeting to work on strategies to resolve the conflicts.
Full council approves by-laws governing village land use plans.	x		Non-existence of by-laws village land use plans	In 2010 Ulanga Full Council approved village by-laws with and for adoption in all villages including non-project villages. Similarly, Kilombero District Council has approved by-laws governing village land use plans.	It is critically important for the District Councils to ensure the enforcement of the by-laws for reduced conflicts. This should go along with regular monitoring of its implementation and collection of lessons for shared-learning.

<b>Result 3: Contribution and wise use of the wetland resource in local economy of the Kilombero Flood Plain Ramsar Site is increased and sustained.</b>					Progress:
<b>Indicators</b>	<b>E</b>	<b>G</b>	<b>Baseline</b>	<b>Progress year in 2010</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Livestock numbers maintained within approved stocking rates in selected villages within Ramsar site by end of project.	x		No baseline data on the number of livestock existed before the project.	Full livestock census conducted in 2010 through the project support and found that the number of livestock available in the area is beyond the land carrying capacity.	There is a need for joint efforts by the responsible authorities to restrict current increasing trend of livestock keepers' influx in the KVRS. Moreover, efforts are required for technical capacity building livestock keepers on good husbandry practices to ensure productivity of livestock on the basis of existing land carrying capacity.
Amount of yields of major crops per unit area increased by 30 % by end of the project.	x	x	No baseline information made available before the project commencement.	It has been so difficult to measure the indicator due to lack of baseline data.	It is critically important to establish baseline information linked to measurable indicators prior to the project commencement. This should be taken as a lesson for the future undertaking.
Number of beekeepers from selected villages within Ramsar site increases by a maximum of 100 from baseline survey by end of project.	x	x	No baseline information made available before the project commencement.	Although the project has supported beekeeping intervention, it is however, difficult to affirm that the number of beekeepers have increased	There is a critical need to establish baseline data before the project inception to enable effective monitoring and evaluation of the project contribution.

<b>Result 3: Contribution and wise use of the wetland resource in local economy of the Kilombero Flood Plain Ramsar Site is increased and sustained.</b>					Progress:
<b>Indicators</b>	<b>E</b>	<b>G</b>	<b>Baseline</b>	<b>Progress year in 2010</b>	<b>Comments</b>
				by a maximum of 100 since no baseline information established before the project inception.	
Three fisher folk associations formed and operational by end of the project period.	x	x	No baseline information made available before the project commencement.	Efforts taken to strengthen Beach Management Units although up 2010 none of them had reached the level of forming the association.	More efforts are still required in this aspect.
Annual fish production in Year 4 increased over baseline value in Year 1	x	x	No baseline information made available before the project commencement.	Fishery survey was expected to be conducted in 2010 although could not be able to establish a comparison on the basis of logical framework indicator due to lack baseline data before the project.	This gives a lesson for the need to establish baseline information before the project inception phase.
Number of farmers accessing agricultural inputs timely increased by 25% from the baseline by the end of the project.	x	x	No baseline information made available before the project commencement.	The expectation is that, increase in households' income levels would increase the level of access to agricultural inputs. However, the lack of baseline data made it difficult to assess the	Establishment of baseline data is an important aspect that should be considered before commencing any project in the future.

<b>Result 3: Contribution and wise use of the wetland resource in local economy of the Kilombero Flood Plain Ramsar Site is increased and sustained.</b>					Progress:
<b>Indicators</b>	<b>E</b>	<b>G</b>	<b>Baseline</b>	<b>Progress year in 2010</b>	<b>Comments</b>
				progress.	

<b>Result 4: Project Implemented effectively and efficiently</b>					Progress:
<b>Indicators</b>	<b>E</b>	<b>G</b>	<b>Baseline</b>	<b>Progress year in 2010</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Activities implemented according to approved work plans	x		No baseline data established	In most cases activities have been implemented on the basis of approved work plans.	In instances review of the work plans could be conducted to accommodate practical field conditions.
Annual work plans and budgets timely approved by JLPC Increased level of performance while spending same levels of funds for similar activities at the beginning of the project as compared to the end of the project	x		JLPC minutes mark good records for monitoring of this aspect.	In some cases JLPC meeting held late than were scheduled. This often made the project to continue with the implementation and later get approved.	It is important for the JLPC meeting to be held as per schedule to facilitate timely approval of work plans and budget.
Results of impact monitoring are used in preparation of annual work plans	x		Regular planning meetings and progress reports made this possible.	The project progress was reviewed quarterly and annually through which the lessons gained were used in preparation of annual plans.	The monitoring has substantially contributed to the improvement of annual plans with focus on realistic conditions and available resources.

**Descriptions:** **E:** an indicator is sensitive to Environment and **G:** an indicator is sensitive to Gender

### 4.3.2 Evaluation of activities

Activities	Progress:				Commentaires (only if the value is -)
	++	+	+/-	-	
1.0 Collect and collate baseline data and carry out surveys to fill gaps				-	It took too long for the consultant to submit the final report. This had negative impact the development of IMP due to lack of information that would feed the IMP development process.
2.0 Carry out annual livestock census in the wetland to establish wet and dry season distribution			+/-		
3.0 Carry out systematic wet and dry season aerial surveys			+/-		
4.0 To conduct survey of fisheries to determine number of villager fisher-folks and annual use patterns of Kilombero river				-	This activity has not been conducted and based on the 6 <sup>th</sup> JLPC decisions, the activity should be dropped out.
5.0 Conduct awareness on Ramsar convention obligations	++				
6.0 Prepare land use plan and resource management zones		+			
7: To carry out strategic environmental assessment on major economic activities in the Ramsar site				-	The final report is yet to be finalised although the draft report contributed to the information used in IMP development.
8.0 Support establishment of conflict arbitration and resolution committees		+			



Activities	Progress:				Commentaires (only if the value is -)
	++	+	+/-	-	
at village level					
9.0 Preparation of by-laws governing wise use of resources in each participating village		+			The by-laws established in all project villages and approval made by Ulunga Full Council while in Kilombero is yet on-going task to be accomplished.
10.0 Develop an Integrated management plan for Ramsar site.				-	Delay in the 1 <sup>st</sup> year implementation coupled with the delay in collection of data essential for IMP development are the major factors contributed to the experienced delay.
11.0 Establishment of WMAs				-	LUP is one of key aspect that determines the establishment of WMAs. However, there have been some delays in the approval of LUP and in some villages areas set for WMAs fall within Game Controlled Area, hence, need for degazettement by MNRT.
12.0 Launch IMP				-	The launching is still subject to

Activities	Progress:				Commentaires (only if the value is -)
	++	+	+/-	-	
					the approval of the IMP document.
13.0 : Educate resource users on village land Act and policies on land utilization		+			
14.0 : Establish and train resources users associations		+			
15. Establish natural resource management committees	++				
16.0 Create awareness on wetland values and management at village level	++				
17.0 Support formation of income generating/market groups, (Youth, Females and Males) in the pilot villages			+-		
18.0 Train user association in groups management, roles responsibilities and dynamics				-	No associations established so far.
19.0 Establish Natural resource based income generating activities in selected villages (improving farming, fishing, beekeeping, tree planting, livestock keeping and wildlife farming practices).		+			
20.0 Train fisher persons on resource management and use of modern fishing and processing techniques.		+			

<sup>2</sup> **Descriptions:** ++: the activity are ahead of schedule; +: the activity are on schedule; +/-: the activity are 3 to 6 months behind schedule; -: the activity are more than 6 months behind schedule

### 4.3.3 Analysis of progress made

Despite the delay experienced in the implementation of activities under Result 1, the current trend under which the IMP draft document is in place is an indication for the likelihood of achieving the expected results. This has a close linkage with the realisation of Result 2 although in actual sense a number of activities have been implemented in tandem to the IMP development process. Moreover, natural resource-based IGAs facilitated by the project have a practical implication to the improvement of the local communities' livelihoods, hence, achievement of Result 3. On top of this, capacity building efforts and awareness creation made at both local community and district levels made it possible for these institutions to consider wetlands issues in their planning and other administrative systems with the likelihoods for increased efficiency and effectiveness.

### 4.3.4 Risks and Assumptions

Table below describes the current status of risks emanating from the TFF.

<b>Result 1: Integrated management plan of the Kilombero Valley Flood Plain Ramsar Site Developed</b>		
<b>Risks</b>	<b>Current level</b>	<b>Comments</b>
District Councils (DCs) and Village Governments (VG) reject the IMP	A	The DCs, VGs and other key stakeholders were effectively involved in the IMP development process through consultation and participation in the IMP stakeholders' workshops.
Professional staff at National and/or District level, including resources, may not be available as needed for planning and implementation of component activities	B	Despite the project's efforts and direct involvement of DCs in the planning process, yet their contribution in terms of cash has been experienced as a bottleneck and requires more attention to ensure that DCs mainstream IMP interventions into their DDPs.
<b>Result 2: Implementation of the Integrated Management Plan of the Kilombero Valley Flood Plain Ramsar Site initiated</b>		
<b>Risks</b>	<b>Current level</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Formation of resource user associations fails	D	Communities' sensitisation on the importance of forming resource users associations conducted, but it has been difficult to reach the level of forming associations. More efforts are still needed to

		strengthen IGAs interventions which will ultimately realise potential productivity and make it easier to facilitate resource users associations.
Uncontrolled immigration of pastoralists and farmers continues	D	There increased trend of pastoralists and farmers immigration with noticeable degradation in the KVRS partly due to political influence and weak by-laws/laws enforcement by the responsible authorities. There is a need for KVRS wetland 'valuation' for easy demonstration of the wetland value against other economic ventures that lead to its degradation.
<b>Result 3: Contribution and wise use of the wetland resource in local economy of the Kilombero Flood Plain Ramsar Site is increased and sustained.</b>		
<b>Risks</b>	<b>Current level</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Political interference with the functioning of District Councils / Natural Resources Advisory Bodies.	B	There is a strong need to create more awareness to the decision-makers not only on the ecological values and functions of the KVRS, but also on the negative impact that is attributed to its degradation for the benefit of the present and future generation.

**Description for the grading of the current status:**

A – Weak, B – Moderate, C- High and D- Very High

### 4.3.5 Budget execution

The Table below provides a detailed overview of actual financial expenditure versus Financial plans for the period of January – December 2010

Result area	Budget line	Activity Description	Financial Mode	Project Budget	Total Annual Plan 2010(€)	Total Expenditure 2010 (€)	Expenditure Vs Plan 2010(%)
A1		IMP prepared		449,200	156,830	126,268	81%
1	A01_01	Baseline: collect & collate	COGEST	24,000	9,260		0%
2	A01_02	Annual livestock inventory	COGEST	8,200	4,900	4,893	100%
3	A01_03	Wet and dry season aerial Survey	COGEST	21,800	3,500	3,460	99%
4	A01_04	Survey of Kilombero fishery	COGEST	14,000	0		
5	A01_05	Ramsar awareness	COGEST	65,100	21,900	18,878	86%
6	A01_06	Land use plans	COGEST	130,300	59,500	56,832	96%
7	A01_07	Preparation of Strategic Environmental Assessment	COGEST	20,500	10,000	1,623	16%
8	A01_08	Conflict resolution	COGEST	26,800	290	245	84%
9	A01_09	Dev of village by-laws	COGEST	13,500	5,760	4,963	86%
10	A01_10	Develop integrated mgt. plan	COGEST	70,000	26,120	23,411	90%
11	A01_11	Technical backstopping	REGIE	30,000	0		
12	A01_12	Establishment of Wildlife	COGEST	25,000	15,600	11,963	77%

Result area	Budget line	Activity Description	Financial Mode	Project Budget	Total Annual Plan 2010(€)	Total Expenditure 2010 (€)	Expenditure Vs Plan 2010(%)
		Mgt Areas					
A2		IMP implemented		353,000	67,540	62,913	93%
1	A02_01	Launch integrated	COGEST	27,700	11,800	10,290	87%
2	A02_02	Awareness /training land	COGEST	27,600	3,640	2,308	
3	A02_03	Training in good Governance	COGEST	8,000	0	24	
4	A02_04	Exchange visits(technical)	COGEST	12,000	4,000	3,967	
5	A02_05	Resource User groups	COGEST	56,000	6,700	6,674	100%
6	A02_06	Natural resources	COGEST	80,400	27,500	27,592	100%
7	A02_07	Promotion of Ramsar site	COGEST	55,500	12,500	10,729	86%
8	A02_08	Wetland Wardening	COGEST	68,000	1,400	1,330	
9	A02_09	Technical backstopping	REGIE	17,800	0		
A3		Conservation contribution to livelihoods		213,800	69,490	48,529	70%
1	A03_01	Income Generating groups	COGEST	12,000	6,470	3,666	57%
2	A03_02	Associations in business	COGEST	55,100	20,500	11,623	57%
3	A03_03	Income Generating groups	COGEST	65,900	21,100	21,127	100%
4	A03_04	Improve fishery	COGEST	43,000	21,420	12,115	57%
5	A03_05	Technical	REGIE	37,800	0		

Result area	Budget line	Activity Description	Financial Mode	Project Budget	Total Annual Plan 2010(€)	Total Expenditure 2010 (€)	Expenditure Vs Plan 2010(%)
		backstoppi ng					
<b>Z1</b>		<b>General Means</b>		<b>934,000</b>	<b>178,640</b>	<b>173,900</b>	<b>97%</b>
1	Z01_01	Employment of project team	REGIE	256,000	46,100	46,358	101%
2	Z01_02	Purchase of equipment	COGEST	207,500	15,930	10,332	65%
3	Z01_03	Mobilization of project staff	COGEST	43,700	21,500	20,950	97%
4	Z01_04	Mobilisation of district staff	COGEST	25,800	6,500	6,492	100%
5	Z01_05	Operation/maintenance of Motor vehicles.	COGEST	178,100	52,000	59,532	114%
6	Z01_06	Strengthening capacity of	COGEST	18,000	0		
7	Z01_07	Operations / maintenance of Project	COGEST	106,500	23,070	22,018	95%
8	Z01_08	Project supervision and backstoppi ng	REGIE	24,800	7,800	7,148	92%
9	Z01_09	Monitoring and evaluation	REGIE	65,600	5,000	450	9%
10	Z01_10	bank charges and fees	REGIE	6,500	400	333	83%
11	Z01_11	bank charges and fees	COGEST	1,500	340	288	85%
		<b>Regie</b>		<b>438,500</b>	<b>59,300</b>	<b>54,288</b>	<b>92%</b>
		<b>Cogest</b>		<b>1, 511,500</b>	<b>413,200</b>	<b>357,322</b>	<b>86%</b>

Result area	Budget line	Activity Description	Financial Mode	Project Budget	Total Annual Plan 2010(€)	Total Expenditure 2010 (€)	Expenditure Vs Plan 2010(%)
		<b>Grand Total</b>		<b>1, 950,000</b>	<b>472,500</b>	<b>411,610</b>	<b>87%</b>

#### 4.3.6 Lessons learned and recommendations

The overall expenditure in the January – December 2010 period was 97% of the annual plan as indicated in the summary table below. For some reason beyond the project scope, some few activities could not be implemented as planned in some quarters. For instance, the General Election might in one way or another affected the speed of implementation as some district staff were tight with some responsibilities tied to the election preparations. Furthermore, a change in the BTC reporting format and requirements for the access to cash calls from Brussels delayed funds release from Brussels and consequently transfers to the project and approval of actions plans at project level although along the way the problem was resolved. Indeed, the analysis on implementation of the Government of Tanzania contribution could not be undertaken as the expenditures were done under the Districts accounts except for the funds from the Ministry of Natural Resources and tourism (20,000,000/=) expensed by the project.



## 5 Beneficiaries

Through monitoring, it was realised that capacity building conducted for VGS, Village Natural Resources and Environmental Committees and Village Government Leaders at Lekuyu Sekamaganga contributed to their strengthened capacities in sensitising communities on the importance of sustainable conservation of natural resources. This was demonstrated by their joint efforts in developing village plans with focus on management of natural resources in their localities. The good example is the schedule VGS patrols. Moreover, the project enabled to establish IGAs interventions mainly beekeeping with 43 groups, Fish pond farming with 5 groups and 38 households, introduction of improved 200 Cockerel for improvement of local chicken production, demarcation of community forests. All these implies for the benefits that can be reaped from the established interventions. Moreover, by-laws governing land use plans and also natural resources management were approved making it easier for the district and village authorities to coordinate the management of natural resource and reduction of land use conflicts.

## **6 Follow-up of the decisions taken by the JLCB**

The JLPC decision together with MTR recommendations were taken on board particularly in the planning, budgeting and reporting system. Moreover, the project made a proposal for request of no cost project extension which was presented at the 4<sup>th</sup> JLPC meeting and ultimately approved. In the same JLPC, the project was directed to set budget that would facilitate the establishment and implementation of IGAs activities for the benefit of direct beneficiaries. This was executed and contributed to the establishment of IGAs and strengthening the local capacity. The good example is the purchase of 64 bicycles that were distributed in the project village to enhance VGS patrols against poachers and illegal harvesters of natural resources.

Nonetheless, it is a compulsory to document in the minutes all directives that are given by JLPC and present in each consecutive meeting the way the project has responded to the directives and results obtained.

## 7 Annexes

### *Operational plan and budget for the period up to June 2011*

S/N	Description	Budgetline	N	A	N		Amount due TZS	USD	Euro equivalent
1	COGEST								
1.1	Signed contracts and commitments								
1.1.1	Baseline survey consultancy final payments	A_01_01					16,667,000		9,259
1.1.2	Communication, Education, Participation and Awareness (CEPA) Consultancy	A_01_05					2,450,000		1,361
1.1.3	Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) Consultancy	A_01_07					14,780,000		8,211
1.1.4	Natural Resources Management (NRM) Information System GIS Database assignment	A_01_10					3,600,000		2,000
1.1.5	KVRS Integrated Management Plan consultancy	A_01_10						15,700	11,410
1.1.6	Ticket refunds VNRC members traveling back after training at the Community Base Conservation Training Centre, Likuyu	A_02_06					1,085,000		603

S/N	Description	Budgetline	N	A	N	.	Amount due	USD	Euro equivalent
							TZS		
	Sekamaganga								
1.1.7	Payments to 186 pairs of Village Game Scouts Uniforms	A_02_08					20,832,000		11,573
1.1.8	Project Manager Rent/allowance	Z_01_03					3,000,000		1,667
1.1.9	Payments to bank charges	Z_01_10					250,000		139
	Sub-total						62,664,000	15,700	46,223
1.2	<b>Planned sub-activities</b>						-		
1.2.1	Finalization of land use planning documents editing and approval process in three villages	A_01_06					2,000,000		1,111
1.2.2	Follow-up Gazettement process in the Government Gazette for finalized village land use plans, backstopping								
1.2.3	SEA document approval Stakeholders meeting	A_01_07					4,140,000		2,300
1.2.4	Finalize preparation of village bylaws	A_01_09					3,820,000		2,122
1.2.5	Council Management Team meetings for IMP mainstreaming and integration	A_01_10					5,700,000		3,167

S/N	Description	Budgetline	N	A	M	.	Amount due	USD	Euro equivalent
							TZS		
	in Ulanga and Kilombero DDPs								
1.2.7	Facilitate establishment of three Wildlife Management Areas	A_01_12					170,000,000		94,444
1.2.8	Purchase of tents for use by village game scouts (tender costs and 31 tents)	A_02_08					21,700,000		12,056
1.2.9	Support cockerel project including provision of cockerels	A_03_03					15,000,000		8,333
1.2.10	Mobilization of PMT-day to day project implementation including participation in meetings and workshops	Z_01_03					12,000,000		6,667
1.2.12	Mobilization of District staff	Z_01_04					3,000,000		1,667
1.2.13	Vehicle/transport means maintenance, purchase of spares and fuel	Z_01_05					20,000,000		11,111
1.2.14	Facilitate start up and operations of an Inter-District Coordination Committee	Z_01_06					9,400,000		5,222

S/N	Description		N	A	N	.	Amount due		
		Budgetline					TZS	USD	Euro equivalent
1.2.15	Operation and maintenance of project office -day to day running of project office including stationary support to activities, computers, telephone, internet, water, electricity bills etc.	Z_01_07					8,000,000		4,444
	<b>Sub-total</b>						<b>274,760,000</b>	-	<b>152,644</b>
<b>2</b>	<b>Regie</b>						-		
S/N	Description						Amount due		
		Budgetline					TZS	USD	Euro equivalent
<b>2.1</b>	<b>Signed contracts and commitments</b>								
2.1.1	Personnel emoluments - salaries, allowances and terminal benefits	Z_01_01					45,000,000		25,000
2.1.2	JLPC meetings, quarterly monitoring visits by JLPC members and end of project (project closure) costs	Z_01_08					20,581,800		11,434
2.1.3	Final Project Evaluation consultancy	Z_01_09					50,000,000		27,778
2.1.4	Payment of Bank charges	Z_01_11					140,000		78
	<b>Sub-total</b>						<b>115,721,800</b>	-	<b>64,290</b>
	<b>Total -COGEST</b>						<b>337,424,000</b>	<b>15,700</b>	<b>198,868</b>

S/N	Description		N	A	N	.	Amount due		
		Budgetline					TZS	USD	Euro equivalent
	Total - REGIE						115,721,800	-	64,290
	Grand-total						453,145,800	15,700	263,158
	Exchange Rate Equivalent (TZS - estimated, USD of 27/02/2011 rate)						1,800	1.376	

251,748      346,405