# RESULTS REPORT 2012

## PROJECT: WATER SUPPLY AND SANITATION PROGRAM IN BINH DINH PROVINCE – VIE0703511

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

# Acronyms

| | |
|---|---|
| AFD | Agence Française the Développement (the French bilateral development cooperation agency) |
| AR | Awareness Raising |
| BTC | Belgian Development Agency |
| CD | Capacity Development |
| CM | Coordination Mechanism |
| DARD | Department of Agriculture and Rural Development |
| DD | Detailed Design |
| DGDC | Directorate General of Development Cooperation |
| DoC | Department of Construction |
| DoF | Department of Finance |
| DoNRE | Department of Natural Resource and Environment |
| DPC | District People's Committee |
| DPI | Department of Planning and Investment |
| DPIU | District Project Implementation Unit |
| DSWMP | District Solid Waste Management Plan |
| DTF | District Task Force (a local implementation structure established for coordinating the Awareness Raising component of the project at district level) |
| ECTeam | Environmental Communication Team (a local implementation structure established for coordinating the Awareness Raising component of the project at commune and school level) |
| EPA | Environmental Protection Agency under DoNRE |
| EU | European Union |
| EUR | Euro |
| EIA | Environmental Impact Assessment |
| GoB | Government of Belgium |
| GoV | Government of Vietnam |
| hhs | Householders |
| IOCA | Institutional Organizational Capacity Assessment |
| ISWM | Integrated Solid Waste Management |
| ITA | International Technical Advisor |
| IP | Investment Plan |
| JLCB | Joint Local Consultative Body (JLCB is synonym of PSC) |
| M&E | Monitoring and Evaluation |
| MoF | Ministry of Finance |
| MPI | Ministry of Planning and Investment |
| ODA | Official Development Assistance |
| pCERWASS | Provincial Center for Rural Water Supply and Sanitation |
| PC-TP RWS | Phu Cat – Tuy Phuoc Rural Water Supply (scheme) |
| PC | Peoples Committee (of province, district, town or commune) |
| PMU | Project Management Unit |
| PPMU | Provincial Project Management Unit |
| POM | Project Operation Manual |
| PPC | Provincial People's Committee |

| | |
|---|---|
| PSC | Project Steering Committee (PS is synonym of JLCB) |
| RWS | Rural Water Supply |
| PSWMP | Provincial Solid Waste Master Plan (Solid Waste Management and Plans in urban / industrial zones of Binh Dinh Province until 2020) |
| SC | Steering Committee |
| SPSC | Standing Project Steering Committee |
| SWM | Solid Waste Management |
| SWRC | Solid Waste Resource Center |
| TFF | Technical and Financial File |
| TOR | Terms of Reference |
| VAT | Value Added Tax |
| VND | Vietnamese Dong |
| WSSP | Water Supply and Sanitation Program in Binh Dinh Province |
| WU | Woman Union |

# 1 Intervention at a glance

## 1.1 Project form

| | |
|---|---|
| Project name | Water Supply and Sanitation Program in Binh Dinh Province |
| Project Code | VIE0703511 |
| Location | Quy Nhon and 6 Districts of Binh Dinh Province - Vietnam |
| Budget | Total Contribution: EUR 8,950,000<br>GOV Contribution: EUR 1,450,000<br>Belgian Contribution: EUR 7,500,000 |
| Partner Institutions | Binh Dinh Provincial Peoples Committee<br>pCERWASS and DPIU for PC-TP RWS<br>DPC of Hoai Nhon District and DPIU for sanitation<br>DPC of Tay Son District and DPIU for sanitation<br>DPC of Phu My District and DPIU for sanitation and DPIU for Hoc Mon Reservoir rehabilitation<br>PC of An Nhon Provincial town and DPIU for sanitation |
| Date of implementation Agreement | 5 December 2008 |
| Duration (months) | Duration of intervention: 60 Months (August 2009 – July 2014)<br>Duration of Specific Agreement: 72 Months (August 2009 – July 2015) |
| Target groups | PPMU of WSSP<br>pCERWASS<br>DoNRE and Environmental Protection Agency under DoNRE<br>DoC<br>DPC of Hoai Nhon District and CPC and populations of 2 towns and 15 communes<br>DPC of Tay Son District and CPC and populations of 1 town and 14 communes<br>DPC of Phu My District and CPC and populations of 2 towns and 17 communes<br>PC of An Nhon Provincial town including populations of 2 towns and 13 communes<br>DPC of Phu Cat District and CPC and populations of 5 communes<br>DPC of Tuy Phuoc District and CPC and populations of 2 communes<br>DTF of 6 districts<br>ECTeams of 15 communes<br>ECTeams of 30 schools |
| Impact[1] | Poverty reduction, enhancing public health and improving quality of life |
| Outcome | Living condition of population improved through the provision of sufficient drinking and irrigation water throughout the year & operational solid waste treatment systems |
| Outputs | Result 1: Agencies in charge of planning, design, implementation, of the rural water schemes and solid waste management systems are reinforced, with efficient operation & maintenance modalities for the new investments and secured funding |
| | Result 2: A strategy to raise awareness on the use of safe drinking water and on resource preservation, as well as on environment protection through proper collection and treatment of solid waste is set up |
| | Result 3: Cost efficient rural water systems designed for both flooding and dry seasons, for 5+2 communes are implemented, while, possibly Hoc Mon dam, its spillway and the related irrigation canals are rehabilitated |
| | Result 4: Infrastructure to treat solid waste for the target areas of all or part of 4 districts |

## 1.2 Project performance

[1] Impact is a synonym for global objective, Outcome is a synonym for specific objective, output is a synonym for result

| | Efficiency | Effectiveness | Sustainability |
|---|---|---|---|
| **Outcome** | A | C | B |
| **Output 1** | A | B | A |
| **Output 2** | A | C | A |
| **Output 3** | A | C | B |
| **Output 4** | A | C | B |

## 1.3 Budget execution

| Total Budget (EUR) | Expenditure year N | Balance | Total Disbursement rate |
|---|---|---|---|
| 7,500,000 | 2,993,598 | 4,506,402 | 40% |

## 1.4 Summary

- During 2012, considerable progress has been made in the project with the Capacity Development component, including the institutional analysis and the institutional improvements in two sectors, as described hereunder:
  - RWS: the IOCA of the RWS sector in Binh Dinh was completed and pCERWASS was formally selected as future operator of the PC-TP RWS scheme. pCERWASS proposed a suitable model for managing the service and for O&M of the infrastructure.
  - Sanitation: a coordination mechanism for SWM was prepared; the coordination mechanism is now being adopted by PPC and it will be used for the whole province. Districts set up Steering Committees, comprised of representatives of all stakeholders and communes, which are in charge of executing the DSWM strategy and implementing the action plans.
  - The request for ODA funding for a provincial SWRC, proposed in the DSWMPs, has been completed and submitted to the donor.

- After completion (in 12/2011) of the pilot phase of the AR programs, for both RWS and SWM, the extension of these two programs was prepared and approved. The extension runs until the end of the project and includes communication through District Radio in the 6 districts and Awareness Raising activities in 15 communes and 30 schools.
- The Awareness Raising activities for RWS cover 7 communes and 14 schools and deliver messages about clean water use and water resource protection. The number of communes was increased from 5 to 7, in order to reach every commune that receives clean water from PC-TP RWS scheme.
- For SWM they cover 8 communes and 16 schools and deliver messages about the importance of solid waste reduction, collection, treatment and recycling. The number of communes had to be reduced from 21 to 8, due to insufficient budget available for this program.

- The construction of PC-TP RWS scheme progressed as planned and reached 80% completion; the system will be ready for putting into use as from June 2013.

- The Detailed Design of 2 sanitary landfills and the Basic Design and Investment Plan of the third sanitary landfill have been completed; however a thorough review of the proposed leachate treatment systems is still necessary. As this is a new sector in Vietnam, most local design consultants do not yet have enough capacity to plan such sensitive and complicated infrastructures.

- Detailed design of the rehabilitation works for Hoc Mon Reservoir and Irrigation Scheme has been completed and approved. Before approval, international consultants performed an appraisal of the design of the dam, in view of the possible effect of climate change on its safety. The design also includes the Clean WS network for My Chau commune, but the latter will not be constructed by the project, due to insufficient project budget available for investment.

| National execution official[2] | BTC execution official[3] |
|---|---|
| BAN QUẢN LÝ DỰ ÁN CẤP NƯỚC VÀ VỆ SINH<br>**Nguyen Thanh Hai** | **Jozef De Smet** |

[2] Name and Signature
[3] Name and Signature

# 2 Analysis of the intervention[4]

## 2.1 Context

### 2.1.1 General context

The MTR of the project was completed in December 2011, with the final report of the MTR approved in June 2012. During 2012, the project has implemented quasi all the recommendations of the MTR, which were approved at PSC5.

One important recommendation of the MTR related to the preparation of a collaborative, unified Capacity Development Approach and long term overall budgeted plan with schedule for both, the Capacity Development component and Awareness Raising component of the project. This collaborative, unified Capacity Development Approach and both overall budgeted plans have indeed been prepared. As a side effect, the whole project team was able to put more emphasis on the project's soft components.

However, despite the high quality of the work implemented, the project still suffers from slow progress, due to two principal reasons:

- Firstly, there is a Human Resources problem at the PPMU; the MTR noticed that the specific tasks required for Awareness Raising in the project require the services of a full-time specialist and that the TOR for the National Awareness Raising and Capacity Development Specialist (CAS) should be amended to cover Awareness Raising activities only. But, for budgetary reasons, it is not possible to recruit a separate specialist for Capacity Development for the PPMU and thus, this recommendation cannot be followed. Unfortunately, the CAS does not have enough competence with regard to Capacity Development and this task must be taken over by the Project Coordinator, with assistance from the ITA and JAs. Furthermore, the Awareness Raising component of the project suffers from slow progress, due to weak performance of the CAS, even for Awareness Raising.
- Secondly, the NEX administrative processes for implementing the project remain complicated. For example, procurement procedures are slow and difficult. The Project PPMU and project partners could not follow all procedures regulated in the POM, before changes were made, while at the same time procurement procedures based entirely on the Vietnamese procurement law, as regulated in the TFF, are still not accepted by BTC (see also 2.1.3 below).

### 2.1.2 Institutional context

The institutional context of the project design is appropriate, because it meets the requirements of the partners:

- Ownership of the PC-TP RWS Component by pCERWASS continues to be satisfactory and this partner is very reliable and competent. The IOCA confirmed that pCERWASS should be the future operator of the clean water service delivered by new PC-TP RWS scheme. Assisted by the project, pCERWASS thoroughly prepared the water safety plan management model, which they propose for providing this service. The model takes into account not only technical criteria, but also local institutional, organizational, social and economical conditions.
- Ownership by the Districts of the Sanitation Component of the project is also highly appropriate. The investments in this sector were postponed in the initial stages of the project, as it as necessary to preliminary make the DSWMPs and build enough

[4] In this document: Impact is a synonym for global objective, Outcome is a synonym for specific objective, output is a synonym for result

capacity for the DPC's staff to implement the sub-projects. However, as the MTR pointed out, there is a risk that construction of the landfills will extend beyond the scheduled ending date of the project. That risk still exists.

- Although, in 2012, there has been a change in the administrative status of one of the 4 partner districts (An Nhon), by which this district raised in level, from "district" to "provincial town", there will be no or little impact from this change on the expected project outcome; the leaders of what is now An Nhon provincial town continue to participate in the specific project activities relating to them in the same way as previously agreed. Even though An Nhon provincial town will not receive a sanitary landfill from project budget (per decision of PSC4, due to lack of project funds), they continue to demand for the CD and AR activities of the project and wholeheartedly participate in them.
- Ownership by Phu My district of the sub-project for the rehabilitation of Hoc Mon Reservoir and Irrigation System is also appropriate. Prior to the current project, Phu My district has benefitted from VIE0402211 (Phu My irrigation project, for the rehabilitation of two reservoirs), which content was almost identical to the one under WSSP for Hoc Mon Reservoir, and they are now well capable to implement this sub-project. Unfortunately, the district handled the procurement procedures for design of the rehabilitation works and the design process itself poorly and this has resulted in serious delays with the investment. Completion of this component risks extending beyond the scheduled end of the project.
- The location of the PPMU under DPI is suitable and advantageous. The PPMU is itself the owner of the Capacity Development and Awareness Raising components of the project. This allows an adequate approach that can raise the level and quality of the work. However, as mentioned above there is a problem with Human Resources at the level of the PPMU.

### 2.1.3 Management context: execution modalities

The project is implemented under NEX execution modality, which is appropriate for this project; however in reality, it is only possible to apply NEX very partially, as is illustrated by the following:

- First of all, the TFF specifies that the program follows mainly NEX modalities, but that the technical responsibility should be shared between both parties (co-management). The co-management approach is also reflected in the Task Description of the ITA.
- Secondly, procurement cannot be implemented according to the Vietnamese Laws, which slows down the progress of the project considerably. Although the project should apply Vietnamese procurement procedures, the project must also follow added procedures to the Vietnamese bidding law, in order to satisfy some Belgian procurement rules, either formally or informally. This situation complicates and delays project implementation and it is sometimes difficult to obtain BTC's non-objection due to this.

### 2.1.4 Harmo-context

During 2012, the project was not able to formally make much use of discussions and networking with other donors and projects in the area, in order to exploit lessons learned; there has been only one meeting with UNESCAP and one GIZ project visited WSSP.

The project did participate in one workshop of another project in 2012, while at the same time other projects/donors were invited once to a workshop organised by WSSP in 2012. Mainly time constraints or workload and budgetary reasons limit these kinds of exchanges.

But, the PPMU keeps itself well informed about the technical evolution and methodological progress realised in other similar projects in Vietnam and elsewhere.

Project staff maintained a suitable level of methodology and approach, through visits to other projects, many informal contacts (including with UNESCAP, GIZ and World Bank) and use of internet search and networking. The strategies implemented by the project follow good (international) practice, as well as tested methods and official Vietnamese policies, as illustrated by four examples below:

- First, the management model for PC-TP RWS, proposed by pCERWASS is based on the Water Safety Plan model, a management model proposed by the World Health Organization and recommended by MARD.
- Second, the Coordination Mechanism for SWM, implemented by the project, follows the example of an Inter-province Coordination Mechanism on Solid Waste Management proposed by the World Bank and piloted in Ben Tre province.
- Third, the Strategic plans for the District Solid Waste Management meet the principles of ISWM and 3R and they focus more and more on decentralized and small scale initiatives. These policies are in line with current good international practice.
- Fourth, the PIM methodology, introduced by the project, mirrored a methodology used by AFD and successfully implemented in Ninh Thuan province. However, the MTR recommended halting this program, due to lack of sufficient funds.

## 2.2 Outcome

The project is intended to improve living condition of the population of 31 communes in Phu Cat, Phu My, Tuy Phuoc, Tay Son, An Nhon, and Hoai Nhon districts, through the provision of sufficient drinking water throughout the year (7+1 communes) and irrigation water (2 communes) & operational solid waste treatment systems (21 communes); it is likely that this outcome will be mostly realised before the end of the project:

- With regard to the provision of sufficient drinking water throughout the year for 7 communes in Phu Cat and Tuy Phuoc districts, the project has already realised more than 80% of the necessary infrastructure and the remaining is being built; the entire infrastructure should be 100% complete in June 2013. However, pCERWASS, the owner of this sub-project, must speed up contract award for the last remaining package under this component (e.g. supply of electro-mechanical equipment), if the delivery of the drinking water supply service is to start mid 2013. The institutional and organizational capacity of the sector in the project areas has been analysed and the management infrastructure for delivery of this service is being prepared, while at the same time, the population of each commune already participates in clean water awareness raising activities, organised by the project. These AR activities focus on improving knowledge, attitude and behaviour of community inhabitants and students, so that households understand their responsibilities towards the importance of clean water and safe use of water. The MTR found that the AR activities of the project had already started to generate a change in behaviour among the targeted population. The AR program will continue until the end of the project and it covers all 7 communes under the PC-TP RWS scheme. Capacity Development for all related stakeholders will also continue, in particular the training of the related management and operational staff of key stakeholders.
- With regard to the provision of sufficient irrigation water throughout the year, through the rehabilitation of Hoc Mon Reservoir and Irrigation Scheme, the detailed design for these rehabilitation works has been completed and construction will start early 2013. Nevertheless, the benefits of improved irrigation services from the upgraded Hoc Mon dam for My Chau and My Duc communes will be somewhat reduced, as the project lacks the resources to implement a PIM program in support of this upgrading (MTR recommendation 22), even though this program was recommended by the final evaluation of Phu My Irrigation Project (VIE0402211) and that the project initiated it in 2011.
- The provision of sufficient drinking water throughout the year for My Chau commune

in Phu My district, based on the rehabilitated reservoir, cannot be realised. This sub-project has been cancelled, due to lack of funds. Only the detailed design of the WS network was made under the project. The district should build it, using other fund sources (cfr. decision of PSC4).

- With regard to the provision of operational solid waste treatment systems, the project has realised impressive results. While the expectations of the partners initially focussed primarily on building a sanitary landfill in each of the 4 partner districts, the project is now working with a much broader approach, involving a comprehensive strategy for district solid waste management. The 4 partner districts of the project, with the help of the PPMU, prepared and approved each their own DSWMP. These are long term (15 year) strategic SWM plans, with a 5-year action plan. The DSWMPs cover all aspects of ISWM, including: collection of the waste, transport and/or treatment (i.e. resource recovery, processing, disposal, etc...), awareness raising, capacity development, etc... Furthermore, the project focused also strongly on the institutional aspects, with the development of a much needed Coordination Mechanism for SWM at provincial level. Beside, the districts have started developing feasible, sustainability and effective Management Models for the operation of the SWM schemes in their geographical area. The designs for the investments have been done and the PPMU prepares to supply equipment for the solid waste collection and for operating the landfills.

Assuming that the implementation of the project can continue in the same way as described above, it is likely that the intended outcome will be achieved, however, the number of communes reached will be somewhat altered when compared to the initial plans:

- The PC-TP RWS component will reach the population of 7 communes (5 communes in Phu Cat en 2 communes in Tuy Phuoc district). This includes an extension by 2 from the initial focus of 5 communes, planned in the TFF.
- Also the Environmental Awareness Raising program for RWS extends fully to these 7 communes.
- But another commune under a separate sub-project in Phu My district, My Chau commune, will not be served, because the project does not have sufficient budget to build the infrastructure necessary for the My Chau RWS system.
- The sanitation component of the project itself is comprehensive and the SW services provided by the 4 districts will reach their total territorial area. Therefore, 66 towns and communes instead of 21 will receive SWM services in the future (i.e. by 2025).
- But the project funds for AR are not sufficient to cover more than 8 communes with the Environmental Awareness Raising program for SWM, instead of 21 planned. However, the districts have committed that they will continue and extend the AR activities after the end of the project and they will reach the area where they provide SWM services totally.

### 2.2.1 Analysis of progress made

| **Outcome:** Living conditions of population improved through the provision of sufficient drinking and irrigation water throughout the year and operational solid waste treatment systems | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Indicators** | **Baseline value** | **Progress yr N-1** | **Progress year N** | **Target year N** | **End Target** | **Comments** |
| By 2014, around 80,000 people in Phu Cat and Tuy Phuoc Districts, Binh Dinh province derive improved public health and quality of living environment benefits through all year access to sufficient drinking water | The population of the target communes of the PC-TP RWS component of the project, 5 communes in Phu Cat District (<br>Cat Thang, Cat Chanh, Cat Tien, Cat Nhon, Cat Hung) and of two communes in Tuy Phuoc District (Phuoc Hoa, Phuoc Thang), have access only to low quality water from wells and open water bodies, such as rivers and canals;<br>pCERWASS prepared TID and tendered for the DD of the PC-TP RWS scheme covering these 7 communes | PC-TP RWS system which will supply 5,000 $m^3$/day clean water to about 80,000 people in 7 communes, is under construction (progress 35%)<br>The pilot phase of the AR program is implemented in Cat Tien Commune and Phuoc Hoa Commune; it covers 1 hamlet and 1 primary school and 1 secondary school in each commune | 80% construction progress on PC-TP RWS system<br>pCERWASS has been selected as the future operator of the RWS service to hhs and they propose the Water Safety Plan management model for delivering the clean water service and O&M;<br>The extension phase of the AR program is implemented in Cat Thang, Cat Chanh, Cat Tien, Cat Nhon, Cat Hung, Phuoc Hoa, Phuoc Thang Communes; it covers most hamlets and 1 primary and 1 secondary school in each commune | 80% construction progress on PC-TP RWS system<br>pCERWASS is selected as the future operator of the RWS service and the Water Safety Plan management model is decided;<br>The extension phase of the AR program is implemented in Cat Thang, Cat Chanh, Cat Tien, Cat Nhon, Cat Hung, Phuoc Hoa, Phuoc Thang Communes; it covers most hamlets and 1 primary and 1 secondary school in each commune | The construction of PC-TP RWS system with capacity 5,500$m^3$ is completed and works have been accepted and handed over to pCERWASS;<br>PC-TP RWS system has stated providing clean water to hhs;<br>In 2014, house connections and pipes for about 7,000 hhs were made and they will reach more than 14,641 hhs in 2018;<br>pCERWASS has started using the Water Safety Plan management model for the clean water service delivery and system O&M;<br>Districts deliver the AR program to students and the public in Cat Thang, Cat Chanh, Cat Tien, Cat Nhon, Cat Hung, Phuoc Hoa, Phuoc Thang Communes | 7 communes (5 initial plus 2 additional) were considered in the detail design of PC-TP RWS scheme;<br>All 7 communes have access to the network;<br>According to TFF, this component would be phased according to fund availability, with priority being given to the original 5 communes;<br>However, in reality all 7 communes are served under the first phase, thanks to an increased contribution by the counterpart fund, which share was raised from 20% initially to 30% now;<br>The network supplies water to 10,689 hhs for the first 5 communes and 3,952 hhs for both added ones |

| | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| By 2014, around 10,000 people in My Chau and My Duc commune, Phu My District, Binh Dinh province derive improved agricultural production benefits through all year access to sufficient irrigation water | Storage capacity of Hoc Mon Reservoir is insufficient, the dam has no reliable spillway and the irrigation network on 104 ha is in bad condition, delivering only partial benefit to some farmers of My Chau and My Duc commune;<br>There is a dispute between My Chau and My Duc commune about the rights of each commune to use the water from the reservoir;<br>Phu My DCIPMU prepared TID and tendered for the DD of the rehabilitation works for Hoc Mon Reservoir and canal system, including a drinking water system for the population of My Chau commune | DD for the rehabilitation works of Hoc Mon Reservoir, Canal System and Drinking Water System for My Chau commune is ongoing;<br>Analysis of stakeholders in PIM development in Binh Dinh is completed, with Phu My as pilot district | DD for the rehabilitation of Hoc Mon Reservoir, Canal System and Drinking Water System for My Chau commune is completed;<br>Review of dam safety by external consultant completed;<br>Tender plan for construction and Tender documents under preparation | DD for the rehabilitation of Hoc Mon Reservoir, Canal System and Drinking Water System for My Chau commune is completed;<br>Review of dam safety by external consultant completed;<br>Tendering for construction completed, contract for works awarded and works started in December 2012 | Rehabilitation works of Hoc Mon reservoir completed;<br>Reservoir capacity increased to 2,8 Million m3;<br>Main Irrigation Canal system rehabilitated;<br>Irrigation water from Hoc Mon Reservoir is delivered to 290 ha agricultural land | Due to lack of budget under the project, it wasn't possible to include the My Chau drinking water scheme in the investment, although My Chau RWS component was included in the DD;<br>PIM component cancelled by MTR (recommendation 22) because of lack of sufficient project funds |

| | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| By 2014, around 300,000 people in An Nhon, Phu My, Tay Son and Hoai Nhon Districts, Binh Dinh province derive improved public health and quality of living environment benefits through access to more sustainable solid waste management services | The DPC's of the 4 partner districts Hoai Nhon, Phu My, An Nhon and Tay Son and some communes themselves operate waste collection services in the markets and main streets only in about 33 towns/communes, covering 17% of population and collecting about 21% of waste generated, while about 11% of waste generated is sold to itinerant waste collectors as recyclables;<br>All waste collected is deposited in about 10 open dumpsites or temporary landfills operated by the district or commune | Partner districts continue waste services as previous;<br>The DPC's of the 4 partner districts prepared comprehensive DSWMPs, with strategic vision up to 2025 and with a 5 year action plan;<br>Capacity for planning of district leaders improved considerably, as well as their understanding of ISWM, 3R and need to reduce waste to landfill;<br>Consultants are being selected for the design of sanitary landfills in Phu My, Tay Son and Hoai Nhon Districts;<br>The construction of a sanitary landfill in An Nhon district has been cancelled, due to insufficient budget under the project | Partner districts continue waste services as previous, however, they now each have an approved DSWMP and action plan;<br>Phu My and Tay Son Districts approved the DD design of sanitary landfills;<br>Hoai Nhon District approved the IP, EIA and basic design sanitary landfills and appointed the consultant for continuing with the DD;<br>PPMU proposed the budget and the list of collection equipment to be procured from project funds to the 4 partner districts | Partner districts continue waste services as previous, however, they now each have an approved DSWMP and action plan;<br>Phu My and Tay Son Districts approved the DD design of sanitary landfills;<br>Hoai Nhon District approved the IP, EIA and basic design sanitary landfills and appointed the consultant for continuing with the DD;<br>PPMU proposed the budget and the list of collection equipment to be procured from project funds to the 4 partner districts | 4 partner districts operate adequate waste collection equipment and 3 districts (Phu My, Tay Son and Hoai Nhon) operate a sanitary landfill;<br>By 2014, the SW collection service reaches 64 towns/communes, covering around 250,000 people or 36% of the total population in the 4 target districts and 90% of families reached pay the service fee;<br>About 64% of all waste generated is treated, including 11 % sold to recyclers, 14% treated at source and 38% collected and treated in landfills;<br>District solid SWM services in the 4 partner districts continue to develop: by 2025, the service covers all 66 towns/communes and reach 65% of the total population, or 450,000 people | Province and districts disagree with the proposal in the TFF that Tay Son and An Nhon share the same landfill |

**Analysis of progress made towards outcome:**

| | |
|---|---|
| *Relation between outputs and the Outcome. (How) Are outputs (still) contributing to the achievement of the outcome:* | Outcome: Living conditions of population improved through the provision of sufficient drinking and irrigation water throughout the year and operational solid waste treatment systems<br>Outputs:<br>1. Agencies in charge of planning, design and implementation of the rural water schemes and solid waste management systems are |

| | |
|---|---|
| | reinforced, with efficient operation & maintenance modalities for the new investments and secured funding<br>The contribution of this output to the outcome is very relevant and prompt and it is likely to produce long lasting and increasing benefits, which continue also after the project has ended.<br>The completion and approval by the districts of their DSWMPs has already contributed, and will continue to contribute considerably to improved understanding, planning and service provision for waste collection and treatment in 66 towns and communes in Phu My, Tay Son, An Nhon, and Hoai Nhon districts;<br>The detailed analysis of the institutions in charge of RWS and SWM in Binh Dinh province, followed by several improvement activities implemented by the project, such as the creation of a coordination mechanism for SWM, as well as the definition and promotion of clear and detailed management models for public service provision, both for clean water and waste collection and treatment, combined with the training of the management and operation staff of the key stakeholders, is likely to ensure lasting improvements for the beneficiary populations of 7 + 66 towns and communes in Phu Cat, Phu My, Tuy Phuoc, Tay Son, An Nhon, and Hoai Nhon districts<br>2. A strategy to raise awareness on the use of safe drinking water and on resource preservation as well as on environment protection through proper collection and treatment of solid waste is set up<br>The contribution of this output to the outcome is also very relevant and prompt.<br>The project's AR program using three means: i) public communication and production of IEC materials, ii) direct communication with communes and iii) direct communication with students of primary and high schools, delivering targeted messages about clean water use and water resource protection in all 7 communes of Phu Cat and Tuy Phuoc districts and delivering targeted messages about the importance of solid waste reduction, collection, treatment and recycling in 8 participating communes of Phu My, Tay Son, An Nhon, and Hoai Nhon districts, has already changed the behavior of a fraction of the population and of the students participating in the pilot phase and it will continue to do so in the extension phase, for an increasingly larger fraction of the population and more students.<br>On several occasions, the districts themselves have expressed their commitment to continue and extend these AR activities after the project, based on the communication structures created during the project and using provincial and district budgets.<br>3. Cost efficient rural water systems designed for both flooding and dry seasons, for 7 communes are implemented, while, Hoc Mon dam, its spillway and the related irrigation canals are rehabilitated The infrastructure built by pCERWASS for PC-TP RWS, under the project, meets the needs of the population and is being built following good practice, proper designs and good Vietnamese standards. The infrastructure built by Phu My DPIU for Hoc Mon dam, its spillway and the related irrigation canals, will also meet these criteria, while external consultants have verified the designs for safety and resilience against climate change. Both infrastructures are very relevant and necessary in order to realize the expected outcome of the project.<br>4. Infrastructure to treat solid waste for the target areas of all or part of 4 districts<br>The partner districts will have good institutional and organizational frameworks and good management models for implementing the SWM service for domestic waste in their geographical area and the SCs they established will properly implement the DSWMPs. These DSWMP are based on sound principles of ISWM and 3R and reflect the need to reduce waste to landfill. By 2014, many families in each district will understand the need to separate waste at source and they collaborate in measures to reduce waste to landfill, while markets will most likely also collaborate with the treatment at source programs.<br>The landfills built by the DPIUs of Phu My, Tay Son, and Hoai Nhon districts will be built following good practice, proper designs and good Vietnamese standards, while external consultants will have verified the appropriateness of the landfill's leachate treatment plants, in order to ensure that they are easy to operate and affordable, while at the same time cleaning the water sufficiently to meet the health and safety standards. The three landfills are relevant and required in order to realize the expected outcome of the project. |

| | |
|---|---|
| | The project also supplies necessary waste collection equipment to the 4 partner districts. |
| *Progress made towards the achievement of the outcome (on the basis of indicators):* | The status of current indicators shows that good progress is being made towards achieving the outcome of the project;<br>A Coordination Mechanism for SWM exists, districts appointed SCs in charge of implementing the DSWMPs and started preparing their management models for delivering the service;<br>Consultants finalized the DD design of sanitary landfills in 2 districts (Phu My, Tay Son Districts) and<br>the IP and basic design of the sanitary landfill in 1 district (Hoai Nhon District), but a revision of the leachate treatment system's design is still ongoing;<br>PPMU proposed the budget and the list of collection equipment to be procured from project funds to the 4 partner districts;<br>Delays are likely to occur in the investment components of the landfills as well as for the rehabilitation of Hoc Mon Reservoir and Irrigation System. |
| *Issues that arose, influencing factors (positive or negative):* | Budget constraints made that the project could not invest in My Chau RWS in Phu My districts and also not in Anh Nhon Sanitary landfill;<br>Budget constraints also have prevented that the PIM component recommended by the FE of VIE0402211 (Phu My Irrigation) is implemented and this will reduce the benefits of improved irrigation services from the upgraded Hoc Mon Reservoir and canal system for My Chau and My Duc communes;<br>Budget constraints also caused the number of communes and schools that participate in the AR activities during the lifetime of the project are reduced. However, commitment by the province districts to take over these AR activities will eventually allow that more people can still be reached ultimately after the end of the project. |
| *Unexpected results:* | The PPC of Binh Dinh province adopted the Coordination Mechanism for SWM and implemented it for the whole province, including Quy Nhon City, An Nhon provincial town and 10 districts;<br>DoNRE of Binh Dinh province adopted the concept of the SWRC; it will continue to provide Capacity Development to the entire province, based on the lessons learned from the project and its own experience.<br>The PPC of Binh Dinh province requested that the project would support at least one partner district to be the pilot for SWM in the province, while |

### 2.2.2 Risk management

| Risk Identification | | | Risk analysis | | | Risk Treatment | | | Follow-up of risks | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Description of Risk | Period of identification | Risk category | Probability | Potential Impact | Total | Action(s) | Resp. | Deadline | Progress | Status |
| Delay in investment for the rehabilitation of Hoc Mon reservoir and Canal System will cause this component to extend beyond the scheduled duration of the project | Q1 2012 | C | High | Medium | | Improve efficiency of tendering process | Phu My DCIPMU | Q1 2012 | PPMU requested the Project owner to speed up the process | |
| | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | |
| Delay in investment for Phu My sanitary landfill will cause this component to extend beyond the scheduled duration of the project | Q4 2012 | B | Medium | Medium | | Speed-up the design review of the leachate system | | | | |
| | | | | | | Improve efficiency of tendering process | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | |
| Delay in investment for Tay Son sanitary landfill will cause this component to extend beyond the scheduled duration of the project | Q4 2012 | B | Medium | Medium | | Speed-up the design review of the leachate system | | | | |
| | | | | | | Improve efficiency of tendering process | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | |
| Delay in investment for Hoai Nhon sanitary landfill will cause this component to extend beyond the scheduled duration of the project | Q1 2013 | C | High | Medium | | Speed-up the design review of the leachate system | | | | |
| | | | | | | Speed-up the EIA and design | | | Use Counterpart fund to allow faster procurement of the DD consultant | |
| | | | | | | Improve efficiency of tendering process | | | | |
| Delay with BT's no-objection and contract award for package 2HH of PC-TP RWS will cause delay for putting into service the network | Q4 2012 | A | Medium | Low | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | |

### 2.2.3 Potential Impact

It is expected that the project will impact both, the RWS and SWM sectors in Vietnam, as follows:

RWS:

The introduction of the Water Safety Plan Model by pCERWASS, which meets MARD recommendations, is still used only scarcely in the country. A successfull application of this model in Binh Dinh may become exemplary for Vietnam.

SWM:

A Coordination Mechanism (CM) for SWM at provincial level was developped by the project; PPC adopted the CM for the whole province. This coordination mechanism can become a model also for other provinces in the country. In the same way, the SWM approach adopted by the 4 districts in their DSWMPs is based on source separation as targetted in the National SWM strategy and, if succesfull, Binh Dinh can become one of the first provinces where this objective is actually put into practice on a scale other than within the frame of a pilot project.

### 2.2.4 Quality criteria

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| **1. RELEVANCE: The degree to which the intervention is in line with local and national policies and priorities as well as with the expectations of the beneficiaries** | | |
| *In order to calculate the total score for this Q-criterion, proceed as follows: 'At least one 'A', no 'C' or 'D' = A; Two times 'B' = B; At least one 'C', no 'D'= C; at least one 'D' = D* | | |
| **1.1 What is the present level of relevance of the project?** | | |
| ☒ | **A** | Clearly still embedded in national policies and Belgian strategy, responds to aid effectiveness commitments, highly relevant to needs of target group. |
| ☐ | **B** | Still fits well in national policies and Belgian strategy (without always being explicit), reasonably compatible with aid effectiveness commitments, relevant to target group's needs. |
| ☐ | **C** | Some issues regarding consistency with national policies and Belgian strategy, aid effectiveness or relevance. |
| ☐ | **D** | Contradictions with national policies and Belgian strategy, aid efficiency commitments; relevance to needs is questionable. Major adaptations needed. |
| **1.2 As presently designed, is the intervention logic still holding true?** | | |
| ☐ | **A** | Clear and well-structured intervention logic; feasible and consistent vertical logic of objectives; adequate indicators; Risks and Assumptions clearly identified and managed; exit strategy in place (if applicable). |
| ☒ | **B** | Adequate intervention logic although it might need some improvements regarding hierarchy of objectives, indicators, Risk and Assumptions. |
| ☐ | **C** | Problems with intervention logic may affect performance of project and capacity to monitor and evaluate progress; improvements necessary. |
| ☐ | **D** | **I**ntervention logic is faulty and requires major revision for the project to have a chance of success. |

| |
|---|
| **2. EFFICIENCY OF IMPLEMENTATION TO DATE: Degree to which the resources of the intervention (funds, expertise, time, etc.) have been converted into results in an economical way (assessment for the <u>whole of the intervention</u>)** |
| *In order to calculate the total score for this Q-criterion, proceed as follows: 'At least one 'A', no 'C' or 'D' = A; Two times 'B' = B; At least one 'C', no 'D'= C; at least one 'D' = D* |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| **2.1 How well are inputs (financial, HR, goods & equipment) managed?** | | |
| ☐ | **A** | All inputs are available on time and within budget. |
| ☒ | **B** | Most inputs are available in reasonable time and do not require substantial budget adjustments. However there is room for improvement. |
| ☐ | **C** | Availability and usage of inputs face problems, which need to be addressed; otherwise results may be at risk. |
| ☐ | **D** | Availability and management of inputs have serious deficiencies, which threaten the achievement of results. Substantial change is needed. |
| **2.2 How well are outputs managed?** | | |
| ☐ | **A** | All outputs have been and most likely will be delivered as scheduled with good quality contributing to outcomes as planned. |
| ☐ | **B** | Output delivery is and will most likely be according to plan, but there is room for improvement in terms of quality, coverage and timing. |
| ☒ | **C** | Some output are/will be not delivered on time or with good quality. Adjustments are necessary. |
| ☐ | **D** | Quality and delivery of outputs has and most likely will have serious deficiencies. Major adjustments are needed to ensure that at least the key outputs are delivered on time. |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| **3. EFFECTIVENESS TO DATE: Degree to which the outcome (Specific Objective) is achieved as planned at the end of year N** | | |
| *In order to calculate the total score for this Q-criterion, proceed as follows: 'At least one 'A', no 'C' or 'D' = A; Two times 'B' = B; At least one 'C', no 'D'= C; at least one 'D' = D* | | |
| **3.1 As presently implemented what is the likelihood of the outcome to be achieved?** | | |
| ☐ | **A** | Full achievement of the outcome is likely in terms of quality and coverage. Negative effects (if any) have been mitigated. |
| ☒ | **B** | Outcome will be achieved with minor limitations; negative effects (if any) have not caused much harm. |
| ☐ | **C** | Outcome will be achieved only partially among others because of negative effects to which management was not able to fully adapt. Corrective measures have to be taken to improve ability to achieve outcome. |
| ☐ | **D** | Project will not achieve its outcome unless major, fundamental measures are taken. |
| **3.2 Are activities and outputs adapted based on the achieved results in order to the outcome (Specific Objective)?** | | |
| ☐ | **A** | The project is successful in adapting its strategies / activities and outputs to changing external conditions in order to achieve the outcome. Risks and assumptions are managed in a proactive manner. |
| ☒ | **B** | The project is relatively successful in adapting its strategies to changing external conditions in order to achieve its outcome. Risks management is rather passive. |
| ☐ | **C** | The project has not entirely succeeded in adapting its strategies to changing external conditions in a timely or adequate manner. Risk management has been rather static. An important change in strategies is necessary in order to ensure the project can achieve its outcome. |
| ☐ | **D** | The project has failed to respond to changing external conditions, risks were insufficiently managed. Major changes are needed to attain the outcome. |

| |
|---|
| **3. POTENTIAL SUSTAINABILITY: The degree of likelihood to maintain and reproduce the benefits of an intervention in the long run (beyond the implementation period of the intervention).** |
| *In order to calculate the total score for this Q-criterion, proceed as follows: At least 3 'A's, no 'C' or 'D' = A ; Maximum two 'C's, no 'D' = B; At least three 'C's, no 'D' = C ; At least one 'D' = D* |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| **3.1 Financial/economic viability?** | | |
| ☐ | **A** | Financial/economic sustainability is potentially very good: costs for services and maintenance are covered or affordable; external factors will not change that. |
| ☒ | **B** | Financial/economic sustainability is likely to be good, but problems might arise namely from changing external economic factors. |
| ☐ | **C** | Problems need to be addressed regarding financial sustainability either in terms of institutional or target groups costs or changing economic context. |
| ☐ | **D** | Financial/economic sustainability is very questionable unless major changes are made. |
| **4.2 What is the level of ownership of the project by target groups and will it continue after the end of external support?** | | |
| ☒ | **A** | The JLCB and other relevant local structures are strongly involved in all stages of implementation and are committed to continue producing and using results. |
| ☐ | **B** | Implementation is based in a good part on the JLCB and other relevant local structures, which are also somewhat involved in decision-making. Likeliness of sustainability is good, but there is room for improvement. |
| ☐ | **C** | Project uses mainly ad-hoc arrangements and the JLCB and other relevant local structures to ensure sustainability. Continued results are not guaranteed. Corrective measures are needed. |
| ☐ | **D** | Project depends completely on ad-hoc structures with no prospect of sustainability. Fundamental changes are needed to enable sustainability. |
| **4.3 What is the level of policy support provided and the degree of interaction between project and policy level?** | | |
| ☒ | **A** | Policy and institutions have been highly supportive of project and will continue to be so. |
| ☐ | **B** | Policy and policy enforcing institutions have been generally supportive, or at least have not hindered the project, and are likely to continue to be so. |
| ☐ | **C** | Project sustainability is limited due to lack of policy support. Corrective measures are needed. |
| ☐ | **D** | Policies have been and likely will be in contradiction with the project. Fundamental changes needed to make project sustainable. |
| **4.4 How well is the project contributing to institutional and management capacity?** | | |
| ☒ | **A** | Project is embedded in institutional structures and contributed to improve the institutional and management capacity (even if this is not a explicit goal). |
| ☐ | **B** | Project management is well embedded in institutional structures and has somewhat contributed to capacity building. Additional expertise might be required. Improvements in order to guarantee sustainability are possible. |
| ☐ | **C** | Project relies too much on ad-hoc structures instead of institutions; capacity building has not been sufficient to fully ensure sustainability. Corrective measures are needed. |
| ☐ | **D** | Project is relying on ad hoc and capacity transfer to existing institutions, which could guarantee sustainability, is unlikely unless fundamental changes are undertaken. |

| Criteria | Score |
|---|---|
| **Relevance** | A |
| **Effectiveness** | B |
| **Sustainability** | A |
| **Efficiency** | C |

## 2.3 Output 1

### 2.3.1 Analysis of progress made

| Indicators | Baseline value | Progress yr N-1 | Progress year N | Target year N | End Target | Comments |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Output 1: Agencies in charge of planning, design, implementation, of the rural water schemes and solid waste management systems are reinforced, with efficient operation & maintenance modalities for the new investments and secured funding** | | | | | | |
| **Water supply** | | | | | | |
| By 2012, an Institutional-Organizational Capacity Assessment (IOCA) of the Rural Water Supply Sector is conducted and IOCA recommendations are agreed upon by all stakeholders involved | The province already implemented several RWS schemes under the NTP;<br>However, no formal institutional set-up existed yet for the future PC-TP RWS scheme. | Consultant recruited and IOCA of RWS sector in Binh Dinh started | IOCA for RWS completed and PPMU accepts final IOCA report in June 2012;<br>Stakeholders accept IOCA recommendations in workshop on 15 June 2012 | By March 2012, IOCA for RWS completed and final IOCA report accepted;<br>Stakeholders accept IOCA recommendations | Stakeholders implement IOCA recommendations;<br>Institutional-Organizational Capacity for RWS improved | Preliminary to this, BTC RR conducted a training on 27-28 September 2010, for Project actors of 3 BTC projects having a CD component, on "how to" design and conduct a capacity needs analysis; capacity building strategies |
| By 2012, PPC assigns the most appropriate owner and operator of the Phu Cat - Tuy Phuoc Rural Water Supply system | PPC assigned pCERWASS to implement the investment component of the PC-TP RWS scheme<br>The province already implemented several RWS schemes under the NTP and PPC assigned pCERWASS as operator of 3 of these RWS schemes | pCERWASS is the future owner of the PC-TP RWS infrastructure and expects to become the future operator of the clean water supply service as well | IOCA confirms pCERWASS as most appropriates operator of the PC-TP RWS service | PPC assigns pCERWASS as future operator of the PC-TP RWS service | pCERWASS, under DARD, is the owner and operator of PC-TP RWS system;<br>PPC allocates sufficient funds to pCERWASS for the management and O&M of PC-TP RWS | pCERWASS implements/owns the full cycle, from the design to the construction, to the O&M and the management of the PC-TP RWS clean water service |
| By 2012, the most appropriate participatory Rural Water Supply Management Model is selected for the service delivery, with a suitable | pCERWASS plans to maintain and operate the PC-TP RWS service in the same way as it already operates 3 other RWS projects | pCERWASS plans to maintain and operate the PC-TP RWS service in the same way as it already operates 3 other RWS projects; | pCERWASS and other related provincial, districts and commune staff made a study tour of similar management models for RWS in | pCERWASS conducts study of management models for RWS in Vietnam and selects suitable management model for providing the | pCERWASS has set up a suitable management organization for PC-TP RWS and employs the necessary staff;<br>pCERWASS implements | The Water Safety Plan Management model, which was initially , proposed by the World Health Organization, is a participatory |

| Indicators | Baseline value | Progress yr N-1 | Progress year N | Target year N | End Target | Comments |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| organization set up for O&M of the Phu Cat - Tuy Phuoc Rural Water Supply scheme | | PPMU asked pCERWASS to make a study of RWS management models used in Vietnam, compare it with their own experience and select and propose a suitable model for PC-TP RWS system | Vietnam;<br>IOCA proposed the Water Safety Plan Management model for the PC-TP RWS service;<br>pCERWASS prepared the detailed report on the management model selected;<br>A peer review by external consultants of the proposed management model is ongoing | PC-TP RWS service;<br>PPMU organizes a peer review and a workshop to discuss the model with the stakeholders, before requesting PPC's approval and decision on implementation of the model | the Water Safety Plan Management model and operates a good O&M program for the PC-TP RWS infrastructure;<br>DARD and PPC approved the water tariffs proposed by pCERWASS | management model for supply of clean water services to rural communities;<br>MARD recommends the Water Safety Plan Management model;<br>Phu Cat district is only involved as stakeholders, while pCERWASS supplies the water directly to the hhs;<br>Tuy Phuoc district is involved as stakeholders, but it also procures some of the water from pCERWASS and then the district themselves organizes the supply of this water to some hhs |
| By 2012, Capacity Building Strategy Concept & Costed Action Plan 2011-2014 is prepared and approved; | The TFF does not provide a CD strategy related to the Districts Phu Cat, Tuy Phuoc and Phu My | The PSC3 approved the project's Capacity Building Strategy Concept, but this concept is not fully owned by all parties involved;<br>Detailed action plans approved by every PSC cover only 6 months at a time;<br>There is no agreed long term budgeted action plan | PPMU, with the help of a backstopping mission from BTC HQ completes the Collaborative Capacity Building Approach and Overall Budgeted Action Plan for the project, with schedule for 2012-2014;<br>This report is ready for approval at next PSC | idem | The project's Capacity Building Strategy & Action Plan 2011-2014 was implemented | The CD component of the project not only covers training for staff and community representatives, but also promotes institutional and organizational development related directly to the RWS sector and more in particularly related to the management and O&M of the new infrastructure implemented by the project |
| By 2013, carry out a training needs assessment and roadmap for the | pCERWASS participates in ad hoc training related to RWS in other schemes | pCERWASS participates in ad hoc training related to RWS | PPMU prepared ToR for a consultant to carry out TNA of the key staff of the stakeholders, O&M | Consultant recruited to carry out TNA and develop a Road map for implementing the | Road map completed and implemented | In 2010, a consultant employed by the PPMU carried out a TNA of DoC, pCERWASS and |

| Indicators | Baseline value | Progress yr N-1 | Progress year N | Target year N | End Target | Comments |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| provincial and district agency staff and community representatives for service delivery and O&M of the Phu Cat - Tuy Phuoc Rural Water Supply Scheme | | | staff and community representatives and develop a Road map for implementing the proposed management model for PC-TP RWS | proposed management model for PC-TP RWS | | EPA , but the TNA report was too much skills oriented, without linking it neither to the institutional context not to the internal processes of these organizations;<br>PPMU requested the consultant to clarify what behaviors and attitudes impede on capacity and skills and what processes and physical assets prevent the smooth working of the organizations, but the consultant failed to meet expectations |
| By 2014, training provided for the Water Safety Plan Team, focusing on data collection, reporting and customer relations | The PC-TP RWS has not been built yet;<br>The Water Safety Plan Team does not exist | - | - | - | Related authorities, grass organizations and local people participate in operational monitoring, management and operation of PC-TP RWS, through the water safety plan team | Awaiting PPC decision on Management model;<br>Also awaiting completion of TNA and roadmap |
| By 2014, training provided for pCERWASS general management and district staff, focusing on management, water resource protection and customer relations | pCERWASS participates in ad hoc training related to RWS in other schemes | - | - | - | Training provided and pCERWASS general management and district staff have suitable behaviors and attitudes, duly focusing on management, water resource protection and customer relations | Awaiting PPC decision on Management model;<br>Also awaiting completion of TNA and roadmap |
| By 2014, training provided for Scheme Management Staff (white collar) on human | pCERWASS participates in ad hoc training related to RWS in other schemes | - | - | - | Training provided and pCERWASS handles all issues related to human resources, financing, | Awaiting PPC decision on Management model;<br>Also awaiting completion |

| Indicators | Baseline value | Progress yr N-1 | Progress year N | Target year N | End Target | Comments |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| resources, financing, accounting and planning | | | | | accounting and planning related to PC-TP RWS in the best possible way | of TNA and roadmap |
| By 2014, training provided for operational staff (blue collar), focusing on Operation & Maintenance and Network | The PC-TP RWS has not been built yet;<br>Blue collar staff for PC-TP RWS has not been recruited, or transferred from other schemes yet | - | - | - | Training provided and pCERWASS operational staff assigned to the O&M of the water plant and water supply network handle all issues related to O&M, water testing, user fee collection, etc…properly | Awaiting PPC decision on Management model and recruitment of staff;<br>Also awaiting completion of TNA and roadmap |
| By 2014, training provided for commune and hamlet staff , focusing on network management and protection, data collection, reporting and customer relations | The PC-TP RWS has not been built yet | - | - | - | Training provided and Commune and hamlet staff supervise network management and protection, collect data, prepare the required reports and promote good customer relations | Awaiting PPC decision on Management model;<br>Also awaiting completion of TNA and roadmap |
| **Solid waste** | | | | | | |
| By 2011, the development of approved District Solid Waste Management Plans for the Districts of An Nhon, Phu My, Tay Son and Hoai Nhon, while reviewing the global strategy for solid waste collection in the Province | In September 2009, PPC approved the Master Plan for Solid Waste Management in urban and industrial zones in Binh Dinh Province until 2020 (PSWMP);<br>District and commune officials are not yet well informed about the content of the master plan;<br>Sanitation and environmental concerns are not yet on the mind of the target districts and commune officials | District officials received on the job training and participated in workshops on national and provincial SWM policies, ISWM,3R and how to make a DSWMP;<br>4 Partner districts developed their DSWMPs,<br>The DSWMPs are comprehensive and were developed in a highly participatory manner, with the support of the PPMU and consultants;<br>The DSWMPs endorse | 4 Partner districts understand, own and approve their comprehensive DSWMP, but the districts still await further support from PPMU before starting their implementation fully | All relevant provincial and District staff, involved in the provision of solid waste management services, understand and adopt the DSWMPs and start their implementation | Comprehensive DSWMPs and action plans are being implemented following the principles and timeframes therein decided | Currently implementation of the action plans agreed in the DSWMPs is still slow. More work is required to build the institutions and organizational set-up for SWM at district level;<br>Project support provided to the districts, for setting up pilot projects and other demonstrations is still insufficient due to lack of budget |

| Indicators | Baseline value | Progress yr N-1 | Progress year N | Target year N | End Target | Comments |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | the strategy and key principles adopted in the PSWMP | | | | |
| By 2012, the Institutional Arrangements for the implementation of the four District Solid Waste Management Plans are finalized and approved | A Government Decree relating to SWM and a National Strategy on Integrated Solid Waste Management have been issued respectively since 2007 and 2009;<br>These documents establish the principles to be applied in solid waste management and a.o. regulate state management on solid waste and promulgate requirements for the planning and investment in solid waste management, but decisions by provinces and districts to implement it are still insufficient | DSWMPs insufficiently cover the institutional; aspects of SWM at provincial level;<br>PPMU prepared TOR for a consultant to establish the necessary institutional-organizational structures for solid waste management in Binh Dinh province and the 4 partner districts; | The Coordination Mechanism for SWM in Binh Dinh Province was developed, approved and PPC issued implementation decision;<br>The 4 districts prepared manuals for clarifying their own coordination mechanism at district level and below | The Coordination Mechanism for SWM relating to the 4 partner districts of the project was developed, approved and PPC issued implementation decision;<br>The 4 districts clarify their own coordination mechanism at district level and below | The Coordination Mechanism for SWM from district up to provincial level is implemented;<br>The 4 districts have implemented their own coordination mechanism at district level and below | The province adopted the Coordination Mechanism for SWM in Binh Dinh province prepared by the project for the whole province |
| By 2012, the Capacity Building Strategy Concept & Costed Action Plan 2011-2014 is prepared and approved; | The TFF does not provide a CD strategy related to SWM;<br>Institutions and organizations for SWM and district staff's knowledge about modern concepts of DSWM and about national legislation, strategies and regulations are still weak | The PSC3 approved the project's Capacity Building Strategy Concept, but this concept is not fully owned by all PPMU staff and partners;<br>Detailed action plans approved by every PSC cover only 6 months at a time;<br>There is no agreed long term budgeted action plan | PPMU, with the help of a backstopping mission from HQ completes the Collaborative Capacity Building Approach and Overall Budgeted Action Plan with schedule for 2012-2014 for the project;<br>This report is ready for approval at next PSC | idem | The project's Capacity Building Strategy & Action Plan 2011-2014 was implemented | The CD component of the project not only covers training for staff and community representatives, but also institutional and organizational development related directly to the management of Solid Waste by the districts and of the new equipment and infrastructure supplied by |

| Indicators | Baseline value | Progress yr N-1 | Progress year N | Target year N | End Target | Comments |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | | | | the project |
| By 2014, decision to establish a Provincial Solid Waste Resource Center and selection of the appropriate owner, with establishment of the Center; using ODA funds | No Provincial Solid Waste Resource Center exists, neither any plans to set up such a center. | The DSWMPs propose that the Binh Dinh province establishes a provincial Waste Resource Centre | PPC and DoNRE have adopted the concept and prepared a project funding request for supporting this SWRC during its first two years of operation;<br>PPC submitted the request to the Belgo-Vietnamese Study and Consultancy fund for financing | idem | DoNRE established the SWRC, with support from the Belgo-Vietnamese Study and Consultancy fund;<br>The PPMU helps the SWRC at start-up;<br>The SWRC supports the strategy, development of technology and data management for SW in the target districts of the project and Binh Dinh province as a whole | The PPC requests that the SWRC provides technology development support for SWM and Capacity Development to the entire province, including to Quy Nhon town and all districts of the province, based on the lessons learned from the project and its own experience |
| By 2013, the establishment of the District Steering Committees for SWM, including the development of an implementation manual; | No District Steering Committees for SWM or implementation manuals exist in the targeted districts. | The DSWMPs propose that the Districts set up a District Solid Waste Management Board or Steering Committee | The 4 partner districts created Steering Committees and prepared manuals for coordinating and supervising the DSWMPs at district and commune level;<br>The SCs comprise of representatives of all stakeholders, including representatives of the communes | idem | Districts Steering Committees coordinate and supervise the implementation of the DSWMPs and action plans at district and commune level | |
| By 2013, District Management Models for the solid waste service delivery in the four targeted districts are finalized and approved; | Districts essentially only operate partial waste collection systems, either in own management or under contracts with private service providers | - | PPMU requested the four partner districts to develop their Exploitation & Management Model for their Solid Waste Management Sector;<br>PPMU also prepared ToR for local experts to support each District with this task | idem | Districts operate appropriate Management Models for the solid waste service delivery in their geographical area | |

| Indicators | Baseline value | Progress yr N-1 | Progress year N | Target year N | End Target | Comments |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| By 2013, a training needs assessment and roadmap for the training of related provincial and district agency staff and community representatives for solid waste service delivery and O&M in the four targeted districts; | | | | | Consultants carried out TNA and developed a Road map for implementing the proposed SWM management models;<br>PPMU supports the partner districts for the implementation of the roadmap | Awaiting PPC decision on Management model |
| By 2014, training provided on Management for district leaders and SC members (white collar) | The stakeholders participated already in ad hoc training related to solid waste management | The PPMU implements on the job training activities and many ad hoc CD activities, in particular for preparing the districts on how to draft their DSWMP, ISWM, 3R, through seminars, workshops and study tours | Several workshops and consultations to define institutional arrangements for district SWM implemented;<br>Study trip on Solid Waste and Water Supply Management in Belgium implemented with visit to the Regulator Agency, responsible for waste management and prevention and to a service provider for SWM<br>Study tour to 4 small scale national landfills implemented | define institutional arrangements for district SWM;<br>Organize study tours on institutional aspects of on Solid Waste and Water Supply Management in Belgium;<br>Visit small scale landfills in Vietnam | District leaders and SC members are qualified to implement the DSWMPs properly | More specific Human resources development awaiting completion of TNA and roadmap, as well as PPC decision on Management model |
| By 2014, training provided for drivers, collectors, operators (blue collar), including on-the-job coaching | - | - | - | - | Technical staff was appointed and apply good O&M practices with the solid waste collection equipment and on the sanitary landfills | More specific Human resources development awaiting completion of TNA and roadmap, as well as PPC decision on Management model |
| By 2014, 2 day seminar and on the job training provided to community representatives | | - | - | - | Community representatives in the towns communes of the 4 target districts understand and promote | More specific Human resources development awaiting completion of TNA and roadmap, as well as PPC decision on |

| Indicators | Baseline value | Progress yr N-1 | Progress year N | Target year N | End Target | Comments |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | | | suitable solid waste collection and treatment practices | Management model |

| Indicators | Baseline value | Progress yr N-1 | Progress year N | Target year N | End Target | Comments |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|

| **Progress of <u>main</u> activities** | **Progress:** | | | | **Comments** (only if the value is C or D) |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | A | B | C | D | |
| **Rural Water Supply** | | | | | |
| Establish effective institutional arrangements, based on the Institutional-Organizational Capacity Assessment (IOCA) to ensure an efficient and appropriate institutional-organizational framework for the Phu Cat - Tuy Phuoc Rural Water Supply Plant | | | C | | The IOCA consultant submitted the final report approximately with 6 months delay; However, in collaboration with pCERWASS, the consultant already included the proposed management model for PC-TP RWS in the IOCA report |
| Assessment of the most operationally capable and efficient agency to take over the investment projects regarding the service delivery and O&M of the Phu Cat Rural Water Supply Plan | A | | | | PPC selected pCERWASS as most operationally capable and efficient agency to take over the PC-TP RWS service; The IOCA confirmed this choice |
| Support project partners in developing and implementing an appropriate participatory Rural Water Supply Management Model for the service delivery and O&M of the Phu Cat - Tuy Phuoc Rural Water Supply Scheme | | | C | | Since the proposed management model for PC-TP RWS is included in the IOCA report, pCERWASS did not have to implement the study of the different management models currently in use in Vietnam; Based on the IOCA, pCERWASS prepared their proposed management model for PC-TP RWS; PPMU employed an external consultant to appraise pCERWASS's proposal, but this activity was delayed and this in turn also delayed PPC's final decision on approving/implementing the model |
| Conduct a detailed Training Needs Assessment (TNA), prepare a comprehensive and costed training strategy and develop a roadmap for the provincial and district agency staff and community representatives for the service delivery and O&M of the Phu Cat - Tuy Phuoc Rural Water Supply Scheme | | B | | | |
| Develop a comprehensive and approved Capacity Building Strategy Concept & Costed Action Plan 2011-2014 | | | C | | PSC3 approved the project's Capacity Building Strategy Concept in 02/2011, but this concept was not fully owned by all PPMU staff and partners; A backstopping mission from HQ helped the project to make a new and collaborative CD strategy and costed action plan |

| Indicators | Baseline value | Progress yr N-1 | Progress year N | Target year N | | | End Target | Comments |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Organize seminars and study tours in Vietnam related to the good management practices in rural water supply | | | | | B | | | |
| Supervise, evaluate and provide training to the Water Safety Plan Team, focusing on data collection, reporting and customer relations | | | | | B | | | |
| Supervise, evaluate and provide training for pCERWASS general management and district staff, focusing on management, water resource protection and customer relations | | | | | B | | | |
| Supervise, evaluate and provide training for scheme management staff (white collar) on human resources, financing, accounting and planning | | | | | B | | | |
| Supervise, evaluate and provide training for operational staff (blue collar), focusing on O&M and Network | | | | | B | | | |
| Supervise, evaluate and provide training for commune and hamlet staff, focusing on network management and protection, data collection, reporting and customer relations. | | | | | B | | | |
| **Solid Waste Management** | | | | | | | | |
| Guidance on the development of a the four District Solid Waste Management Plan in the 4 targeted districts of An Nhon, Tay Son, Phu My and Hoai Nhon | | | | | | C | | Due delays in several phases of the consultancy contract, completion and approval of the DSWMPs was about 12 months behind schedule |
| Assessment of the most operationally capable and efficient agency to take over the investment projects regarding solid waste management (landfills) | | | | | B | | | |
| Establish effective institutional arrangements to ensure an efficient institutional-organizational framework for the implementation of the four District Solid Waste Management Plans | | | | | B | | | |
| Develop a comprehensive and approved Capacity Building Strategy Concept & Costed Action Plan 2011-2014 | | | | | | C | | The project's Capacity Building Strategy Concept prepared in 02/2011 was not fully owned by all PPMU staff and partners;<br>A backstopping mission from HQ helped the project to make a new CD strategy and costed action plan |
| Assessment of the most appropriate agency to run the Provincial Solid Waste Resource Center | | | | | B | | | |
| Support the selected agency in establishing the Provincial Solid Waste Resource Center | | | | | B | | | |
| Support project partners (the four target districts) in establishing the four district steering committees, including the development of an implementation manual | | | | | B | | | |
| Support project partners (districts) in finalizing the four district management models for the solid waste service delivery in the four target districts | | | | | B | | | |

| Indicators | Baseline value | Progress yr N-1 | Progress year N | Target year N | | End Target | Comments |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Conduct a detailed Training Needs Assessment (TNA), prepare a comprehensive and costed training strategy and develop a roadmap for the provincial and district agency staff and community representatives for solid waste service delivery and O&M in the four target districts | | | | B | | | |
| Organize seminars and study tours in Vietnam and regional countries related to the good management practice on solid waste Issues | | | | B | | | |
| Supervise, evaluate and provide training on management for district leaders and SC members (white collar) | | | | B | | | |
| Supervise, evaluate and provide training for drivers, collectors, operators (blue collar) | | | | B | | | |
| Supervise, evaluate and provide a 2-day seminar and on the job training to community representatives | | | | B | | | |

**Analysis of progress made towards output:**

| | |
|---|---|
| *Relation between activities and the Output. (how) Are activities contributing (still) to the achievement of the output (do not discuss activities as such?):* | The activities implemented by the project up to now, including the ad hoc trainings, workshops, seminars and study tours in Vietnam and abroad, most of which took place before the finalization of a comprehensive Capacity Development plan for RWS and SWM, have contributed substantially to improve the capacity for reinforced planning, design, implementation, management and operation skills of the rural water schemes and solid waste management systems as well as the delivery of such public services;<br>The PSWMP was reviewed during the preparation of the DSWMPs; it was not deemed necessary to recommend any changes to the approved PSWMP |
| *Progress made towards the achievement of the output (on the basis of indicators):* | Since the start of the project, a lot of effort has been put in the analysis and improvement of the institutional framework as well as in the organizational aspects related to these services;<br>In the remaining time of the project, the management models for service delivery will be finalized and the training of all levels of related stakeholder's staff, operators and commune representatives will be emphasized;<br>It is expected that the project can complete these activities within the timeframe of the project |
| *Issues that arose, influencing factors (positive or negative):* | The PPMU has encountered some difficulty for preparing a collaborative, unified capacity building approach and overall budgeted plan with long term schedule. Only a concept CD strategy was agreed among the PPMU members and it was approved at PSC3 in 02/2011, but no long term costed action plan existed until September 2012;<br>With the help of a backstopping mission from BTC HQ, the PPMU agreed on the project's Collaborative Capacity Building Approach and Overall Budgeted Action Plan with schedule for the period 2012 – 2014 in September 2012;<br>Until then, CD activities of the project, although implemented with a clear vision and well identified TOR and long term objectives, had been planned semester by semester, based on the progress already achieved and the needs identified at the moment |
| *Unexpected results (positive or negative):* | The project realized a participatory activity for preparing institutional-organizational arrangements in solid waste management for the four target districts in Binh Dinh province, which produced a "Coordination Mechanism For Domestic Solid Waste Management";<br>Upon completion, Binh Dinh PPC decided that they would apply this Coordination Mechanism for the whole province, including Quy |

| Indicators | Baseline value | Progress yr N-1 | Progress year N | Target year N | End Target | Comments |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | Nhon City, An Nhon provincial town and 10 districts, not only the 4 partner districts of the project;<br><br>The DSWMPs prepared by the districts foresee in the setting up of a SWRC at the level of Binh Dinh province. PPC and DoNRE adopted the concept and prepared a project funding request for finding supporting to this SWRC during its first two years of operation. PPC submitted the request to the Belgo-Vietnamese Study and Consultancy fund for financing; The SWRC will continue to support the districts with the implementation of the DSWMPs after the project has ended;<br><br>The PPC of Binh Dinh province requested that the project would support at least one partner district to become the pilot for SWM in the whole province, while the SWRC would continue to provide Capacity Development to the entire province, based on the lessons learned from the project and its own experience. | | | | |

### 2.3.2 Budget execution

| Output 1 | Item | Budget | Actual up to year N-1 | Actual up to year N | Balance | Progress up to now % |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| NatEx | Capacity building | 285,000 | 49,294 | 72,180 | 212,820 | 25% |
| Regie | Technical assistance | 360,000 | 315,473 | 355,089 | 4,911 | 99% |

Note 1: The progress rate of the disbursement (currently 25%) may appear to be less than expected. This is explained as follows: Until the middle of 2012, the costs of consultants and facilitators used for CD workshops, seminars or trainings were paid from the Regie Consultancy budget line under the General Means of the project, while only the cost of logistics, per diems, etc... for these workshop and training events were booked under the CD budget lines. Such was decided, in order to increase the project's total budget available for CD activities. The amount booked under REGIE in this way amounts to at least 90,000 Euro. It is only after the REGIE consultancy budget was exhausted that the costs of consultants for CD activities that the PPMU recruit consultants for CD under the NatEx budget.

Note 2: the cost of the ITA is booked 2/3 under output 1 and 1/3 under output 2. Total budget for Technical assistance under output 1 has been practically exhausted.

### 2.3.3 Quality criteria

| Criteria | Score |
|---|---|
| **Efficiency** | A |
| **Effectiveness** | B |
| **Sustainability** | A |

## 2.4 Output 2

### 2.4.1 Analysis of progress made

| Indicators | Baseline value | Progress yr N-1 | Progress year N | Target year N | End Target | Comments |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Output 2: A strategy to raise awareness on the use of safe drinking water and on resource preservation as well as on environment protection through proper collection and treatment of solid waste is set up** | | | | | | |
| By 2012, prepare an approved Adapted Awareness Raising Strategy, Guidelines & Costed Action Plan 2011-2014 for the Extension Phase, detailing the delivery mechanisms, messages, support materials and training for all provincial and district agency staff and community representatives involved in the awareness raising activities supporting project rural water supply schemes in Phu Cat and Tuy Phuoc; and solid waste management in Hoai Nhon, Phu My, Tay Son and An Nhon; | An adapted AR strategy, Guidelines & Costed Action plan for AR does not exist | The pilot phase on environmental awareness raising program is completed;<br>About clean water, it covered 2 communes and 4 schools in two districts;<br>About solid waste, it covered 4 communes and 8 schools in four districts is completed;<br>And internal and external evaluation of the pilot phase was carried out;<br>The MTR commented that the pilot phase has produced good results and yielded sustainable outcomes, but recommended that the cost of the delivery mechanism should be reduced and that not as many communes as planned could be reached | The plan for the extension of the environmental awareness raising program is prepared taking into account the recommendations of the MTR and of the external evaluation;<br>The plan is approved and covers the period 2012-2014;<br>The component about clean water use and water resource protection is delivered in 7 communes and 14 schools;<br>This component about the importance of solid waste reduction, collection, treatment and recycling is delivered in 8 communes and 16 schools | idem | The plan for the extension of the environmental awareness raising program is implemented in 15 communes and 30 schools;<br>Districts continue and extend the AR activities to more communes and schools | Unlike during the Pilot Phase, the PPMU no longer uses the services of the subcontractor pCERWASS and DoNRE/EPA for the extension phase, but signed contracts directly with the DTF's and ECTeams, because the previous delivery mechanisms was considered too expensive (MTR recommendation 11);<br>The extension phase targets the same communes (6) and schools (12) from the pilot phase, in order to consolidate the results already achieved and it extends the activities to 9 additional communes and 18 additional schools (2 schools per commune) |
| By 2012, establishment and training of the 6 District Task Forces (DTF), 30 Environmental | There are no DTFs or ECTeams | DTFs and ECTeams have been established, members trained and they are able to carry out | Additional ECTeams have been established, members trained and they are able to carry out | idem | idem | |

| Indicators | Baseline value | Progress yr N-1 | Progress year N | Target year N | End Target | Comments |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Communication (EC) Team schools and 15 ECTeam in communes | | AR activities of the pilot phase independently;<br>The component about clean water use and water resource protection has 2 DTFs and 6 ECTeams;<br>The component about the AR activities about the importance of protecting the environment with proper recycling, disposal and treatment of domestic solid waste has 4 DTFs and 12 ECTeams | AR activities independently;<br>The component about clean water use and water resource protection has 2 DTFs and 21 ECTeams;<br>The component about the AR activities about the importance of protecting the environment with proper recycling, disposal and treatment of domestic solid waste has 4 DTFs and 24 ECTeams | | | |
| By 2013, the appointment of hamlet communicators in most of the hamlets in the participating communes in the 6 target districts | There are no hamlet communicators | The AR program for the pilot phase does not yet use hamlet communicators | 224 hamlet communicators have been appointed | idem | Hamlet communicators have been appointed in most of the hamlets in the participating communes in the 6 target districts; | Hamlet communicators in the hamlets further communicate the AR messages to the wider public |
| Annually, the 6 DTFs develop their supervision plan, sign a contract with PPMU for financing and provide support to the ECTs (school & communes) for implementation of Awareness Raising Activities | There are no DTFs and ECTeams | 6 DTFs develop their supervision plan, sign a contract with PPMU for financing and provide support to the ECTs (school & communes) for implementation of Awareness Raising Activities; | 6 DTFs sign a contract with PPMU for financing and provide support to the ECTs (school & communes) for implementation of Awareness Raising Activities | The 6 DTFs develop their supervision plan, sign a contract with PPMU for financing and provide support to the ECTs (school & communes) for implementation of Awareness Raising Activities | idem | |
| Annually, the 30 ECTs (schools) and 15 ECTs (communes) develop a budgeted communication plan, sign a contract with PPMU for financing and | There are no DTFs and ECTeams | 12 ECTs (schools) and 6 ECTs (communes) develop a budgeted communication plan during the pilot phase of AR; | 30 ECTs (schools) and 15 ECTs (communes) develop a budgeted communication plan, sign a contract with PPMU, in November | 30 ECTs (schools) and 15 ECTs (communes) develop a budgeted communication plan, sign a contract with PPMU for financing and | idem | The modification of the delivery mechanism for the AR program of the project, between the pilot phase and the extension phase, has taken a long |

| Indicators | Baseline value | Progress yr N-1 | Progress year N | Target year N | End Target | Comments |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| implement the Awareness Raising activities | | pCERWASS for clean water and EPA for sanitation signed a sub-contract with PPMU for the pilot phase;<br>The two subcontractors support, finance and supervise schools and communes to implement the Awareness Raising activities | 2012, for financing and implement the Awareness Raising activities | implement the Awareness Raising activities | | time;<br>The contract cover the period 5/2012 -12/2012 and must be renewed for the following years |
| By 2012, development of the Information-Education-Communication Materials to support the Awareness Raising Activities and the Radio Programs | pCERWASS has a limited set of Information-Education-Communication Materials on the use of clean water;<br>There are practically no Information-Education-Communication Materials and there are practically no radio communications on sanitation | pCERWASS, EPA and the PPMU prepared Information-Education-Communication Materials on the use of clean water and on the AR activities about the importance of protecting the environment with proper recycling, disposal and treatment of domestic solid waste;<br>A program of communication on local radio and TV is implemented | The PPMU elaborated the Information-Education-Communication Materials for communes and schools;<br>A program of communication on local radio is implemented | Education-Communication Materials prepared during the pilot phase are used;<br>A program of communication on local radio is implemented | Information-Education-Communication Materials to support the Awareness Raising Activities and the Radio Programs are available and being used | The time needed to prepare additional Information-Education-Communication Materials for schools, delayed the signing of the contracts between PPMU and DTFS/ECTeams |
| By 2014, 85% of students in participating classes of the 30 targeted schools endorse hygienic behaviors that recognize the importance of clean water use, water resource protection and the importance of solid waste reduction, collection, treatment and recycling | | The external evaluation of the pilot phase shows that 85% of students in the 12 participating classes of the 12 targeted schools endorse hygienic behaviors that recognize the importance of clean water use, water resource protection and the importance of solid waste reduction, | No new surveys about the impact of the extended AR raising activities are available yet, so data about changes in behavior are also not available yet | 85% of students in participating classes of the 30 targeted schools endorse hygienic behaviors that recognize the importance of clean water use, water resource protection and the importance of solid waste reduction, collection, treatment and recycling | idem | AR activities will continue with the same schools in 2013 and 2014, in order to consolidate and deepen their impact |

| Indicators | Baseline value | Progress yr N-1 | Progress year N | Target year N | End Target | Comments |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | collection, treatment and recycling | | | | |
| By 2014, 70% of the population in the participating hamlets of the 15 target communes endorse hygienic behaviors that recognize the importance of clean water use, water resource protection and the importance of solid waste reduction, collection, treatment and recycling | The baseline survey shows that hygienic behavior of the population in the targeted districts is not well developed | The external evaluation of the pilot phase shows that 70% of the population in the participating hamlets of the 6 target communes endorse hygienic behaviors that recognize the importance of clean water use, water resource protection and the importance of solid waste reduction, collection, treatment and recycling | No new surveys about the impact of the extended AR raising activities are available yet, so data about changes in behavior are also not available yet | 70% of the population in the participating hamlets of the 15 target communes endorse hygienic behaviors that recognize the importance of clean water use, water resource protection and the importance of solid waste reduction, collection, treatment and recycling | idem | AR activities will continue with the same communes in 2013 and 2014, in order to consolidate and deepen their impact and to extend the activities into more hamlets for these communes |

| **Progress of <u>main</u> activities** | **Progress:** | | | | **Comments** (only if the value is C or D) |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | A | B | C | D | |

| Indicators | Baseline value | Progress yr N-1 | Progress year N | Target year N | | End Target | | Comments |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Assessing the agencies involved in awareness raising issues, to ensure that the coordination of the awareness raising component is being coordinated by the appropriate agencies | | | | | B | | | |
| Develop an adapted awareness raising strategy and guidelines (based on the Awareness Raising Strategy of the Pilot Phase) related to both water resources and solid waste with short, medium, and long-term, costed action plans | | | | | B | | | |
| Establish and provide training to the 6 DTFs, 30 ECTeams (schools) and 15 ECTeams (communes) | | | | | C | | | Modification of the delivery method of the AR program, between the pilot phase and the extension phase, caused about 6 months delay in the establishment of the new DTFs and ECTeams, including preparing the communication plans and signing the delivery contracts between these teams and the PPMU |
| Appoint the hamlet communicators in most of the hamlets in the participating communes in the 6 targeted districts | | | | | C | | | Idem for the appointment of the hamlet communicators |
| Supervise and support the development of the supervision plans of the 6 DTFs and arrange the necessary contracts | | | | | B | | | |
| Supervise and support the development of the budgeted Communication Plans of the 30 ECTeams (schools) and 15 ECTeams (communes) and arrange the necessary contracts | | | | | B | | | |
| Develop IEC Materials and supervise the Radio Programs | | | | | B | | | PPMU revised the IEC Materials from the pilot phase during the extension phase |
| Supervision, follow-up and evaluation of the Awareness Raising Activities at district, commune and hamlet level. | | | | | B | | | |

**Analysis of progress made towards output:**

| | |
|---|---|
| *Relation between activities and the Output. (how) Are activities contributing (still) to the achievement of the output (do not discuss activities as such?):* | Both, the MTR and an external evaluation organised by the PPMU, of the pilot phase of the project's AR component, reported good results, with behavioural changes starting to take place among the participating populations and students |
| *Progress made towards the achievement of the output (on the basis of indicators):* | The extension phase of the project is ongoing, but the programme has been somewhat delayed, due to the need to change the delivery method of the pilot phase for the extension phase;<br>DTFs and ECTeams acquired considerable skills to carry out the project's AR programs, but continued support during the remaining time of the project is still necessary, in order to strengthen these skills; |

| Indicators | Baseline value | Progress yr N-1 | Progress year N | Target year N | End Target | Comments |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | It is also necessary to support more the hamlet communicators, in order for the AR messages to reach a larger fraction of the population; | | | | |
| *Issues that arose, influencing factors (positive or negative):* | | During the pilot phase, the project piloted the strategy as well as the institutional structure suitable for delivering the AR message. This strategy delivered good results, but the MTR recommended that the delivery method of the project was expensive and should be changed in order to reduce costs (MTR recommendation 11);<br>During the extension phase, the PPMU still applies the same strategy and the same delivery method at district level and with communes and schools, but at provincial level, the service of pCERWASS and EPA as subcontractors respectively for AR in RWS and AR in SWM are no longer used. Instead, the project signed contracts directly with the DTFs and ECTeams of communes and schools;<br>During the extension phase, pCERWASS and EPA became advisors of the PPMU for implementing the project's AR programs;<br>The role of the provincial WU and DoET as advisors to the DTFs and ECTeams for their AR activities has been reinforced during the extension phase;<br>The project's budget constraints obliged it to reduce the number of participating schools and communes respectively to 15 and 45, which is less than initially planned;<br>It is not yet clear how both these factors will finally affect the outcome of the project | | | | |
| *Unexpected results (positive or negative):* | | The demand by the districts to receive the project's support for AR activities is larger than expected | | | | |

### 2.4.2 Budget execution

| Output 2 | Item | Budget | Actual up to year N-1 | Actual up to year N | | Progress to now in % |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| NatEx | Awareness raising | 250,000 | 83,085 | 88,774 | 161,226 | 36% |
| Regie | Technical assistance | 180,000 | 0 | 88,349 | 91,651 | 49% |

Note: the cost of the ITA is booked 2/3 under output 1 and 1/3 under output 2. Total budget for Technical assistance under output 1 has already been exhausted.

### 2.4.3 Quality criteria

| Criteria | Score |
|---|---|
| **Efficiency** | A |
| **Effectiveness** | C |
| **Sustainability** | A |

## 2.5 Output 3

### 2.5.1 Analysis of progress made

| Indicators | Baseline value | Progress yr N-1 | Progress year N | Target year N | End Target | Comments |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Output 3: Cost efficient rural water systems designed for both flooding and dry seasons, for 5+2 communes are implemented, while, possibly Hoc Mon dam, its spillway and the related irrigation canals are rehabilitated** | | | | | | |
| **Phu Cat – Tuy Phuoc RWS** | | | | | | |
| By 2012, complete the design and construction tendering for the rural water supply scheme serving the target communes (5+2) of Phu Cat and Tuy Phuoc Districts; | Tendering launched for the DD of the PC-TP RWS scheme serving the 7 target communes of Phu Cat and Tuy Phuoc Districts;<br>Number of target communes included in the design extended from 5 to 7 communes | pCERWASS split this component up into 14 packages; including 1 construction supervision contract implemented by a consultant, 11 works contracts and 12 supply contracts, both implemented by contractors;<br>9 out of 11 packages for construction works, 1 out of 2 packages for equipment supplies and 1 supervision contract for the works have been awarded, signed and contractors/suppliers started implementation of their contracts | 13 contracts for all packages of construction works, equipment supplies and supervision of the works and supplies have been signed and contractors/suppliers started implementation;<br>1 remaining package for equipment supply has been tendered and contract award is being proposed;<br>Waiting for BTC non-objection on this package | 14 contracts for all packages of construction works, equipment supplies and supervision of the works and supplies have been awarded and all contracts signed and started implementation; | idem | Some delays in the tendering and contract awarding process are due to difficulties by the bidders to meet the project's high criteria;<br>Many delays are equally due to difficulties by the project owner to obtain BTC's non-objection |
| By 2013, complete the construction of the rural water supply scheme serving the target communes (5+2) of Phu Cat and Tuy Phuoc Districts; | No construction started | By 2011, work progress approximately 35% | By 2012, works on 7out of 10 works contracts are completed;<br>3 works contracts, 2 equipment supplies contracts and 1 supervision contract are still ongoing;<br>Payment progress is approximately 60%; | Work progress and payment progress are approximately 80% | All works completed and put into operation in June 2013 | Difficulties with tendering procedures delayed progress;<br>One contractor went bankrupt and failed to implement his contract and the contract was terminated;<br>The contract for the remaining work for this package was re- |

| Indicators | Baseline value | Progress yr N-1 | Progress year N | Target year N | End Target | Comments |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | Real work progress is approximately 80% completion | | | tendered |
| By 2014, 50 per cent of the households in the target communes (5+2) of Phu Cat and Tuy Phuoc Districts are connected and able to receive at least 40-60 liters per capita per day of safe drinking water in accordance with Vietnamese standards; | No running water available; hhs have only access to groundwater wells with low quality water and open water sources;<br>Some households buy water for drinking from venders;<br>80% of households expressed interest in connection to the system | - | - | - | By 2014, 7,000 hhs request and pay for water meter, spare parts and pipes at hhs and pCERWASS connects them to the PC-TP RWS network;<br>Clean water supply service are delivered with maximum a water production rate of 5,000 m3/ day to these households;<br>Hhs connections are implemented immediately after completion of the networks as follows:<br>In 2013: 2,400 hhs<br>In 2014: 7,000 hhs<br>In 2015: 11,000 hhs<br>In 2016: 12,000 hhs<br>In 2017: 13,000 hhs<br>In 2018: 14,000 hhs | Installing water meters, spare parts and pipes at hhs, for making hhs connection to the PC-TP RWS system is paid from People contribution and these connections can only be made after clean water is proved to the network;<br>Project design for Phu Cat – Thuy Phuoc RWS has been made for the usual norm for RWS in Binh Dinh, which is 80 liters per capita per day, but actual consumption is expected to be only about 40-60 liters per capita per day |
| By 2014, 90 per cent of the households billed for water connection and use in the target communes (5+2) of Phu Cat and Tuy Phuoc Districts are regularly paying these charges. | 80% of households expressed willingness to pay the fee | - | - | - | In 2014, 7,000 households connected to the PC-TP RWS network are billed for the water connection and water use and 90% of them regularly pay the charges;<br>pCERWASS applies social tariffs for the poor, which are | |

| Indicators | Baseline value | Progress yr N-1 | Progress year N | Target year N | End Target | Comments |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | | | approved and subsidized by PPC | |
| **Hoc Mon reservoir and irrigation system** | | | | | | |
| By 2012, complete the design and construction tendering for the upgrading of the Hoc Mon dam and irrigation system serving My Chau & My Duc commune; | Tender dossier completed and bids received, but the tendering process followed by Phu My DPIU received negative legal advice;<br>BTC requested re-tendering | Re-tendering completed;<br>Contract for the DD for the upgrading of the Hoc Mon dam and irrigation system serving My Duc and My Chau communes signed (after 1 revision);<br>Field surveys implemented by the consultant were rejected by BTC in first instance, but the surveys were then repeated and accepted; | Detailed design and construction tendering for the upgrading of the Hoc Mon dam and irrigation system serving My Duc and My Chau communes completed;<br>An international dam safety consultant reviewed the final design to ensure appropriate safety levels in the upgrading works;<br>Appraisal of cost estimate and tender plan approved | Detailed design and construction tendering for the upgrading of the Hoc Mon dam and irrigation system serving My Duc and My Chau communes completed and approved;<br>An international dam safety consultant reviewed the final design, ensuring appropriate safety levels in the upgrading works;<br>Contract for construction of the works tendered and awarded | Construction contract awarded and signed;<br>Construction completed | Phu My district handled the procurement tendering procedures for recruiting a consultant for the DD of the rehabilitation works poorly, as well as the supervision of the surveys during the design, which caused serious delays |
| By 2014, complete the construction of the upgrading of the Hoc Mon dam and irrigation system; | | | PPMU is awaiting DPC approval of tender plan;<br>Completion of tendering dossier for construction is in progress, to be implemented by Phu My DPIU | Phu My DPIU signs construction contracts and contract for construction supervision;<br>Works implementation start in December 2012 | Construction contract awarded and construction completed; | Slow management by Phu My DPIU of the DD process and tendering process for construction causes delays;<br>Strict control of the works implementation will be required in order to be able to complete the upgrading of Hoc Mon dam and Irrigation System within the planned duration of the project |
| By 2014, the upgrading of Hoc Mon dam and associated irrigation channels in My Chau & | | | | | The upgrading of Hoc Mon dam and associated irrigation channels in My Chau & | |

| Indicators | Baseline value | Progress yr N-1 | Progress year N | Target year N | End Target | Comments |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| My Duc commune, Phu My District is complete and farmers having land in the irrigated perimeter receive sufficient irrigation water to increase agricultural production. | | | | | My Duc communes in Phu My District is complete;<br>The reservoir stores sufficient irrigation water to increase agricultural production for the farmers having land in the irrigated perimeter | |

| **Progress of <u>main</u> activities** | **Progress:** | | | | **Comments** (only if the value is C or D) |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | A | B | C | D | |
| **PC-TP RWS** | | | | | |
| Definition of the responsibility for the good execution of the project, while guaranteeing the availability of resources | A | | | | PPC appointed pCERWASS to implement the investment component for PC-TP RWS before the start of the project |
| Revision of the detail design leading to the non-objection of BTC before approval procedure | | B | | | |
| Bidding procedure, following the Vietnamese procurement rules | | | C | | Delays occurred due to difficulties to obtain the non-objection of BTC |
| Site supervision of the works, with a responsibility of good results | | B | | | |
| Handover of the water scheme to the designated owner | | | C | | Delays occurred during handing over due to work overload by pCERWASS to make the final balance payments of the many contracts and other reasons such as reluctance by pCERWASS to assume responsibility over the completed works, before the completion of the headworks |
| Coordination with the social policy bank to make the loans for the households connections affordable and accessible on time | | B | | | |
| Conduct surveys to define the population willingness to pay for the services | | B | | | |
| **Rehabilitation of Hoc Mon reservoir and canal system** | | | | | |

| Indicators | Baseline value | Progress yr N-1 | Progress year N | Target year N | | | End Target | Comments |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Definition of the responsibility for the good execution of the project, while guaranteeing the availability of resources | | | | A | | | | Phu My DPC appointed the DCIPMU to implement the investment component for rehabilitation of Hoc Mon reservoir and canal system before the start of the project |
| Detail design leading to the non-objection of BTC before approval procedure | | | | | | C | | Serious delays occurred during tendering as well as contract implementation of the surveys and DD |
| Bidding procedure, following the Vietnamese procurement rules | | | | | | C | | Serious delays occurred due to poor management of all phases of the design;<br>Some additional delays also occurred due to the MTR's recommendation and BTC's request to engage an international dam safety consultant to review the final design in order to ensure appropriate safety levels in the upgrading works to Hoc Mon dam |
| Site supervision of the works, with a responsibility of good results | | | | | B | | | |
| Handover of the water scheme to the designated owner | | | | | B | | | |

**Analysis of progress made towards output:**

| | |
|---|---|
| *Relation between activities and the Output. (how) Are activities contributing (still) to the achievement of the output (do not discuss activities as such?):* | For PC-TP RWS: The investment in construction of the water plant and distribution systems, together with the CD and AR activities implemented by the project partners will help to assure that the intended output will be realized;<br>For Hoc Mon Reservoir and Canal Rehabilitation: The investment in construction of the rehabilitation works on the headworks and canal systems will contribute to the improvement of irrigation and crop production in the area covered by this component, but the inability by the project to implement the PIM component prevents setting up monitoring and reporting tools and mechanisms for O&M, service provision, water fee collection and effectiveness in general of the investment in the rehabilitation of Hoc Mon Reservoir and canal system |
| *Progress made towards the achievement of the output (on the basis of indicators):* | PC-TP RWS: Delays occurred during tendering; Delays also occurred in establishing final balance of works before acceptance, and therefore in handing over of the infrastructure, as well as payments to the contractors; The system will be put into use in June 2013, about 1 year behind schedule;<br>Rehabilitation of Hoc Mon Reservoir and Canal System: there have been serious delays in completion of DD and tender documents for construction; this project component is about 18 months behind schedule and may extend beyond the scheduled duration of the project |

| Indicators | Baseline value | Progress yr N-1 | Progress year N | Target year N | End Target | Comments |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| *Issues that arose, influencing factors (positive or negative):* | The PPMU initiated the PIM component of the project in 2011, based on the recommendation of the FE of VIE0202211 (Phu My Irrigation), to move to a sector strategy and planning modality, to address issues relating to PIM and crop diversification at the appropriate institutional level, but the TFF did not foresee this activity and therefore did not provide any budget for it. Since BTC advised that no additional funding can be provided to the project, the MTR recommended that these activities should not proceed (MTR recommendation 22) | | | | | |
| *Unexpected results (positive or negative):* | During the PIM stakeholder analysis, the PPMU learned that Phu My District had planned to set up inter-commune irrigation works management unit between My Chau and My Duc communes, however this did not happen yet and there is no effective cooperation between two communes. | | | | | |

### 2.5.2 Budget execution

| Output 3 | Item | Budget | Actual up to year N-1 | Actual up to year N | Balance | Progress to now in % |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| NatEx | Rural water systems | 3,001,000 | 1,053,764 | 1,885,650 | 1,115,350 | 63% |
| Counterpart | Rural water systems | 650,000 | 273,447 | 669,225 | -19,225 | 103% |
| Study Fund | Rural water systems | 135,703 | 69,277 | 94,046 | 34,223 | 69% |

Note 1: The budget execution only relates to the construction of the investment component. Costs related to either CD, or AR, or RWS, was paid from the respective CD or AR budget lines (in line with MTR recommendation 4).

Note 2: PPC increased the share of the Counterpart fund contribution for PC-TP RWS was increased from 20% to 30%, in order to make the increase from 5 to 7 communes served by PC-TP RWS possible.

Note 3: The Belgo-Vietnamese Study and Consultancy fund paid for cost of the DD for PC-TP RWS and of the DD for the rehabilitation of Hoc Mon Reservoir and Canal System.

### 2.5.3 Quality criteria

| Criteria | Score |
|---|---|
| **Efficiency** | A |
| **Effectiveness** | C |
| **Sustainability** | B |

## 2.6 Output 4

### 2.6.1 Analysis of progress made

| Output 4: Infrastructure to treat solid waste for the target areas of all or part of 4 districts. | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Indicators** | **Baseline value** | **Progress yr N-1** | **Progress year N** | **Target year N** | **End Target** | **Comments** |
| By 2012, complete the design and construction tendering for the landfills serving the target communities in Phu My and Tay Son Districts; | There are no sanitary landfills in the districts;<br>All collected waste is currently dumped in illegal dumpsites or temporary landfills;<br>PPC approved an IP, EIA and basic design for a district sanitary landfill in Tay Xuan commune, Tay Son district and in My Phong commune, Phu My district | Tendering completed for detailed design of 2 landfills (Phu My and Tay Son Districts);<br>Bid evaluation in progress | Detailed design of 2 landfills (Phu My and Tay Son Districts) completed;<br>Unscheduled review by external specialist of the proposed leachate treatment systems of the 2 landfills completed and consultant advised design revision;<br>Design revision is in progress | Detailed design of 2 landfills (Phu My and Tay Son Districts) completed and approved | DD and tender documents completed;<br>Only the first two of 4 landfill cells are tendered for construction in each landfill during the project's lifetime (i.e. 1st phase) | Designers must propose adapted low cost technologies that reduce future O&M and re-investment costs |
| By 2012, relocate the planned landfill and complete the IP, EIA and Basic Design for the landfill serving the target communities Hoai Nhon District; | There is no sanitary landfill in the district;<br>All collected waste is currently dumped in illegal dumpsites or temporary landfills<br>The district prepared an IP, EIA and basic design for a district sanitary landfill in Nhon Tan commune, but the local population object to it being built | Landfill relocated to Bong Son Bourg, Hoai Nhon district;<br>Tendering completed for the revision of IP, EIA and Basic Design of Hoai Nhon landfill;<br>Bid evaluation in progress | IP and Basic Design of Hoai Nhon landfill completed ;<br>Unscheduled review by external specialist of the proposed leachate treatment systems of the landfill completed and consultant advised design revision;<br>Revision of Basic Design and preparation of EIA are in progress | IP, EIA and Basic Design of Hoai Nhon landfill completed and approved | idem | Designers must propose adapted low cost technologies that reduce future O&M and re-investment costs |
| By 2013, complete the design and construction tendering for the landfill serving the target | There is no sanitary landfill in the district;<br>All collected waste is | - | Tendering for DD of Hoai Nhon landfill under preparation | DD of Hoai Nhon landfill ongoing | DD and tender documents completed;<br>Only the first two of 4 | Awaiting approval of Basic Design |

| | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| communities in Hoai Nhon District; | currently dumped in illegal dumpsites or temporary landfills | | | | landfill cells are tendered for construction in each landfill during the project's lifetime (i.e. 1st phase) | |
| By 2014, complete the construction of the landfills (2 cells) in Phu My, Tay Son and Hoai Nhon District; | | - | - | - | 1st phase of the construction of the landfills is completed | |
| By 2014, procurement of solid waste collection equipment for Hoai Nhon, Phu My, Tay Son and An Nhon District; | Districts use a small number of waste bins and trucks for waste collection and transport to the dumpsites;<br>Hoai Nhon, Tay Son and An Nhon District use subcontractors who provide the equipment and the collection service | DSWMPs specify the equipment needed | PPMU informs the districts about the lists of solid waste collection equipment the project will provide and the available budget | idem | PPMU procures the solid waste collection equipment and hands it over to the districts | |
| By 2014, 60 per cent of the households in the target Districts of Phu My, Tay Son, An Nhon and Hoai Nhon are participating in solid waste collection and treatment services; | The DPC's of the 4 partner districts Hoai Nhon, Phu My, An Nhon and Tay Son and some communes operate waste collection services in the markets and main streets;<br>Phu My districts manages the service in own management, other districts signed contracts with suppliers;<br>The services cover about 33 out of 66 towns/communes and 17% of hhs;<br>About 32% of all waste generated is treated, including about 21% of | idem | idem | By 2012 solid waste collection and treatment services have increased to about 26 per cent of the households in the target Districts of Phu My, Tay Son, An Nhon and Hoai Nhon;<br>About 40% of solid waste generated in the partner districts is treated, including about 11%of recyclable waste sold or given to itinerant waste collectors and 29% of domestic waste collected by the SWM service (based on the targets of the DSWMPs for 2012) | The SW service is extended to cover 64 towns/communes of the 4 target districts, reaching about 250,000 people;<br>About 64% of waste generated is treated, of which 11 % sold to recyclers, 14%, is treated at source and 38% is collected and treated in landfills;<br>The 4 target districts operate adequate collection equipment and 3 districts operate sanitary landfills | Preparation and approval of DSWMPs was delayed by nearly 1 year and also implementation of DSWMPs is still slow, mainly due to the need to preliminary establish a better overall institutional and organizational framework and because of insufficient financial and technical support to the districts |

| | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | domestic waste collected and about 11% recyclable waste sold to or collected by itinerant waste collectors | | | | | |
| By 2014, 90 per cent of the households receiving solid waste collection services in the target Districts of Phu My, Tay Son, An Nhon and Hoai Nhon billed for solid waste tariffs are regularly paying these charges | About 70% of hhs receiving solid waste collection services pay the waste collection fee | idem | idem | About 90% of hhs receiving solid waste collection services pay the waste collection fee | About 90% of the households receiving solid waste collection services in the target Districts of Phu My, Tay Son, An Nhon and Hoai Nhon billed for solid waste tariffs are regularly paying these charges | Families in 4 partner districts participate in waste separation at source, recycling and/or home composting |

| **Progress of <u>main</u> activities** [5] | **Progress:** | | | | **Comments** (only if the value is C or D) |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | A | B | C | D | |
| Definition of the responsibility for the good execution of the project, while guaranteeing the availability of resources | | B | | | |
| Development and Revision of the detail design leading to the non-objection of BTC before approval procedure | | B | | | |
| Bidding procedure, following the Vietnamese procurement rules | | | C | | Unscheduled review of the landfill leachate systems delayed the bidding procedure |
| Construction of the landfills; Site supervision of the works, with a responsibility of good results | | B | | | |
| Handover of the solid waste infrastructure and equipment to the designated owner | | B | | | |
| Conduct surveys to define the population willingness to pay for the services | | B | | | |

| | |
|---|---|
| *Relation between activities and the Output. (how) Are activities contributing (still) to the achievement of the output (do not discuss activities as such?):* | Although the investment in the landfills has met with some delay, the project has otherwise raised considerably the capacity of the related project partners to understand ISWM, 3R and the need to reduce waste to landfill;<br>It is likely that the activities implemented by the project, including the investment in 3 sanitary landfills and SW collection equipment for 4 district will considerably contribute to improved DSWM, the protection of the environment and the wellbeing of the people |

[5] A: The activities are ahead of schedule
B The activities are on schedule
C The activities are delayed, corrective measures are required.
D The activities are seriously delayed (more than 6 months). Substantial corrective measures are required.

| | |
|---|---|
| *Progress made towards the achievement of the output (on the basis of indicators):* | The project has made good progress with the SWM component as a whole, despite the delay with the investments in the landfills |
| *Issues that arose, influencing factors (positive or negative):* | The delay in the construction of the landfills is also partly due to the management decision adopted at PSC2 in June 2010, to delay the design of these landfills, until after the review of the Provincial Solid Waste Master Plan (PSWMP) and the approval of the four District Solid Waste Management Plans (DSWMP's), in order to be able to preliminary study the situation better, as well as build the capacity of the district leaders for better understanding of modern principles of solid waste management; |
| *Unexpected results (positive or negative):* | |

### 2.6.2 Budget execution

| Output 4 | Item | Budget | Actual up to year N-1 | Actual up to year N | Balance | Progress to now in % |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| NatEx | Solid waste | 5,718,000 | 0 | 193,322 | 5,524,678 | 3% |
| Counterpart | Solid waste | 800,000 | 0 | 0 | 800,000 | 0% |
| Study Fund | Solid waste | 61,665 | 43,159 | 61,665 | 0 | 100% |

Note 1: Apart from payments for the Designs of the landfills, no costs for investment in Solid Waste Management equipment or infrastructure have yet been made. Other costs related to either CD or AR on Sanitation, were paid from the respective CD and AR budget lines, while studies were paid from the Regie budget under the Consultants Budget Line.

Note 2: The cost of the preparation of the DSWMPs was paid from the Belgo-Vietnamese Study and Consultancy fund. This includes the

### 2.6.3 Quality criteria

| Criteria | Score |
|---|---|
| **Efficiency** | A |
| **Effectiveness** | C |
| **Sustainability** | B |

# 3 Transversal Themes

## 3.1 Gender

Preserving water resources and better public services for water supply and solid waste collection and treatment will have a direct and positive impact on the quality of the environment and on the standard of living of about 300,000 to 400,000 people in the 6 target districts. Especially the women and children, who traditionally have a direct interest in better access to safe drinking water, will benefit most. The projects awareness raising programs also address school children directly, who in turn are likely to positively impact the use of clean water and better sanitation of the family at home.

## 3.2 Environment

Preserving water resources and better solid waste management will have a direct and positive impact on the quality of the environment and of the standard of living of the people in the 6 target districts. Local capacities and the population's awareness will be enhanced and this will lead to more effective measures in controlling and mitigating pollution of local resources. Clean drinking water will be available for over 80,000 people and around 250,000 people will benefit from a cleaner and healthier environment, thanks to better solid waste management and waste treatment, instead of dumping it into open spaces and rivers.

## 3.3 Other

The socio economic situation in the project area is expected to improve, in particular in the 4 districts with enhanced solid waste management, thanks to the creation of job in waste management, material recovery, material recycling or revaluing of waste materials and by enhancing the working environment and/or improving profitability for waste pickers, waste processors, farmers and small businesses engaged in waste recycling and revaluing activities.

# 4 Steering and Learning

## 4.1 Action Plan

| Action plan | Source | Actor | Deadline |
|---|---|---|---|
| Speed up delivery of BTC's non-objection on the contract award, as well as the construction of the PC-TP RWS system in order to allow putting into use of the PC-TP RWS in June 2013 | 2.3 | BTC pCERWASS | Q1 |
| Speed up the progress of the tendering and construction of the rehabilitation of Hoc Mon Reservoir and canal System in order to complete the investment before end of the project in July 2014 | 2.3 | Phu My DPC | Q1 |
| Speed up the design revision of the leachate systems as well as progress in general of the tendering and construction of the sanitary landfills of Phu My and Tay Son in order to complete the investment before January 2014, putting into use the landfills and test their proposed O&M procedures | 2.3 | Phu My DPC and Tay Son DPC | Q1 |
| Speed up the design revision of the leachate systems the EIA prepare the DD swiftly, and then, speed up the progress the tendering and construction of the sanitary landfill of Hoai Nhon in order to complete the investment before the end of the project in July 2014 | 2.4 | Hoai Nhon DPC | Q2 |
| Speed up the progress for signing contracts between PPMU and DTF's/ECTeams for implementing the AR activities for RWS as well as for SWM in order to allow more actual working time to these teams | 2.4 | PPMU | Q1 |
| Facilitate procurement under the NEX program by allowing the project partners to use the Vietnamese bidding law fully, so that the first 4 actions in this table can be realised easier | 2.2 | BTC | Q1 |

## 4.2 Lessons Learned

| Lessons learned | Target audience |
|---|---|
| It is important to allow enough time to a project team at the start of the project and during its initial phases to assess fully the institutional, organizational and individual parameters that will condition the success of the project and to build enough capacity. For example, for SWM, it would have been possible to hire a consultant to make a District Solid Waste management Plan for the target districts, while at the same time continuing the design and construction of the landfill, but this approach would not have realized the necessary change process that was required for improving solid waste management as comprehensively as needed. | Representation, relevant BTC HQ departments, partner departments |
| PPMU should respect the responsibilities, the ownership and the leading role of the local stakeholders. PPMU should involve the local stakeholders in every step of the CD process, in order to identify an approach in mutual consent. PPMU can take up a role of partner, who provides technical expertise, facilitates processes and takes coordinating responsibilities in designated intervention areas | Project, Representation, relevant BTC HQ departments, partner departments |
| CD should be Multi-level approach (individual, organizational and institutional) | Project, partner departments |
| PPMU of WSSP hired several local and international resource person to implement often sensitive or advanced activities, which required high level expertise or where innovative. This has brought a lot of advantage to the project, but there was not a specific budget provision for these consultancies. Enough resources must be foreseen in the TFF for mobilizing external expertise and services for PPMU and stakeholder activities. PPMU staff alone will not master top level expertise in all professional domains of most projects | Relevant BTC HQ departments |

# 5 Annexes

## 5.1 Original Logical framework

| description | indicator | Source of verification | assumptions |
|---|---|---|---|
| **Overall objective:**<br>poverty reduction, enhancing public health and improving quality of life | | | |
| **Specific objective1:**<br>living condition of population improved through the provision of sufficient drinking and irrigation water throughout the year & operational solid waste treatment systems | | | |
| Result1: agencies in charge of planning, design, implementation, of the rural water schemes and the solid waste management systems are reinforced | • data on the existing and ongoing water projects are systematically collected and monitored<br>• ground & surface water assessment carried out<br>• innovative and efficient techniques and lay-out are integrated in the new schemes<br>• implemented staff training programs | • provincial reports<br>• training evaluation reports | • clear mandates, tasks and responsibilities of the related institutions<br>• adequate and accurate data made available<br>• provincial institutions ready to participate, deliver and cooperate<br>• suitable trainers available in the country<br>• trainers available for training in the province |
| Result2: a strategy to raise awareness on the use of safe drinking water and on resource preservation as well as on environment protection through proper collection and treatment of solid waste is set up | • regular public awareness campaigns provided<br>• hygienic behaviours are endorsed by the population<br>• communities understand the different measures for protecting the environment and use the waste collection system<br>• reduction in dumping waste in water bodies and public areas | • campaign impact assessment reports<br>• annual reports of the urban environment companies<br>• campaign materials | • governmental and none governmental organizations with sufficient experience in the field available<br>• province has adequate funds to implement professional awareness campaigns |
| Result3: cost efficient rural water systems designed for both flooding and dry seasons, for 5 + 2 communes are implemented, while, possibly, Hoc Mon dam, its spillway and the related irrigation canals are rehabilitated, with efficient operation & maintenance modalities for the new investments and secured funding. | • provision of 80 litres per capita per day of safe drinking water, following the Vietnamese standards to the target areas<br>• number of hhs effectively connected to the network<br>• water-born diseases reduced<br>• agricultural production increased<br>• monitoring and reporting tools and mechanisms for the o & m of the water scheme are operational<br>• objectives criteria as well as the financial | • operation and maintenance reports<br>• number of payment made and level of the fees<br>• province budget reports<br>• operation and maintenance reports | • none polluted water resources<br>• operator has adequate funds for O&M |

| | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| | means and wiliness to pay of the population are integrated in the water and tariffs<br>• fees duly collected<br>• schemes in proper operation, maintenance activities carried out on time | | |
| Result4: infrastructure to treat solid waste for the target areas of all or part of 4 districts | • provision of landfills properly designed and sized to absorb the waste of the target areas for a medium time frame with possibility of extension<br>• monitoring and reporting tools and mechanisms for the o & m of the landfills are operational<br>• objectives criteria as well as the financial means and wiliness to pay of the population are integrated in the solid waste tariffs definition<br>• fees duly collected<br>• schemes in proper operation, maintenance activities carried out on time | • environment impact assessment<br>• operation and maintenance reports<br>• number of payment made and level of the fees<br>• province budget reports<br>• operation and maintenance reports | • available land with geological and environmental conditions fitting with the requirements<br>• operator has adequate funds for o |

## 5.2 Updated Logical framework

| OUTPUT | INDICATORS | SOURCES OF VERIFICATION | ASSUMPTIONS |
|---|---|---|---|
| **Overall objective (impact):**<br>Poverty reduction, enhancing public health and improving quality of life<br><br>**Indicator:**<br>By 2014, the living conditions of the population of some communes in 6 districts of Binh Dinh Province (Hoai Nhon, Phu My, Tay Son, An Nhon, Phu Cat and Tuy Phuoc) improved through the provision of sufficient drinking and irrigation water throughout the year and operational solid waste management systems. | | Annual economic & health data published by General Statistics Office, Binh Dinh | |
| **Specific objective(outcome)**<br>Living conditions of population improved through the provision of sufficient drinking and irrigation water throughout the year and operational solid waste treatment systems.<br><br>**Indicators:** | | Annual economic & health data published by General Statistics Office, Binh Dinh<br><br>Annual household data published by General Statistics Office, Binh Dinh | |

| | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| By 2014, around 80.000 people in Phu Cat and Thuy Phuoc Districts, Binh Dinh Province derive improved public health and quality of living environment benefits through all year access to sufficient drinking water;<br>By 2014, around 10.000 people in My Chau and My Duc commune, Phu My District, Binh Dinh Province derive improved agricultural production benefits through all year access to sufficient irrigation water;<br>By 2014, around 60% of the people in An Nhon, Phu My, Tay Son and Hoai Nhon Districts, Binh Dinh Province derive improved public health and quality of living environment benefits through access to more sustainable solid waste management services. | | | |
| **Result (Output) 1:**<br><br>**Agencies in charge of planning, design, implementation of the rural water schemes and solid waste management systems are reinforced, with efficient operation & maintenance modalities for the new investments and secured funding.** | **Water supply**<br>By 2012, an Institutional-Organizational Capacity Assessment (IOCA) of the Rural Water Supply Sector is conducted and IOCA recommendations agreed upon by all stakeholders involved;<br>By 2012, PPC assigns the most appropriate owner and operator of the Phu Cat - Tuy Phuoc Rural Water Supply system;<br>By 2012, the most appropriate participatory Rural Water Supply Management Model is selected for the service delivery, with a suitable organization set up for O&M of the Phu Cat - Tuy Phuoc Rural Water Supply scheme;<br>By 2012, Capacity Building Strategy Concept & Costed Action Plan 2011-2014 is prepared and approved;<br>By 2013, carry out a training needs assessment and roadmap for the provincial and district agency staff and community representatives for service delivery and O&M of the Phu Cat - Tuy Phuoc Rural Water Supply Scheme;<br>By 2014, training provided for the Water Safety Plan Team, focusing on data collection, reporting and customer relations<br>By 2014, training provided for pCERWASS general management and district staff, focusing on management, water resource protection and customer relations<br>By 2014, training provided for Scheme Management Staff (white collar) on human resources, financing, accounting and planning<br>By 2014, training provided for operational staff (blue collar), focusing on Operation & Maintenance and Network<br>By 2014, training provided for commune and hamlet staff , focusing on network management and protection, data collection, reporting and customer relations<br><br>**Solid waste**<br><br>By 2012, the of four approved District Solid Waste Management Plans for the Districts of An Nhon, Phu My, Tay Son and Hoai Nhon, while reviewing the global strategy for solid waste collection in the Province;<br>By 2012, the Institutional Arrangements for the implementation of the four District Solid Waste Master Plans are finalized and approved;<br>By 2012, the Capacity Building Strategy Concept & Costed Action Plan 2011- | **General**<br>PPC Decisions<br><br>Capacity Building Strategy Concept & Costed Action Plan 2011-2014<br><br>Operation and maintenance reports<br><br>Budget reports<br><br>Training and Workshop Evaluation Reports<br><br>Workshop Handouts and Visual Presentations<br><br>Training Needs Assessments and Roadmaps<br><br>**Water Supply**<br><br>Institutional-Organizational Capacity Assessment (IOCA) Report and Recommendations<br><br>Phu Cat - Tuy Phuoc Rural Water Supply Model<br><br>**Solid Waste**<br><br>District Solid Waste Master (Detailed) Plans<br><br>Appropriate Institutional Arrangements for | Adequate and accurate data made available<br><br>Provincial institutions ready to participate, deliver and cooperate<br><br>Suitable trainers available in the country<br><br>Trainers available for training in the province |

| | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| | 2014 is prepared and approved;<br>By 2014, decision to establish a Provincial Solid Waste Resource Center and selection of the appropriate owner, with establishment of the Center; using ODA funds;<br>By 2013, the establishment of the District Steering Committees for SWM, including the development of an implementation manual;<br>By 2013, District Management Models for the solid waste service delivery in the four targeted districts are finalized and approved;<br>By 2013, a training needs assessment and roadmap for the training of provincial and district agency staff and community representatives for solid waste service delivery and O&M in the four targeted districts;<br>By 2014, training provided on Management for district leaders and SC members (white collar)<br>By 2014, training provided for drivers, collectors, operators (blue collar), including on-the-job coaching<br>By 2014, 2 day seminar and on the job training provided to community representatives | Solid Waste Management<br><br>ODA Funding obtained for the Provincial Solid Waste Resource Center<br><br>Provincial Solid Waste Resource Center<br><br>District Steering Committees<br><br>Solid Waste Implementation Manual<br><br>District Management Models for Solid Waste Management | |
| **Result (output) 2:**<br><br>**A strategy to raise awareness on the use of safe drinking water and on preservation of the water sources as well as on environment protection through proper collection and treatment of solid waste is set up and implemented** | By 2012, prepare an approved Adapted Awareness Raising Strategy, Guidelines & Costed Action Plan 2011-2014 for the Extension Phase, detailing the delivery mechanisms, messages, support materials and training for all provincial and district agency staff and community representatives involved in the awareness raising activities supporting project rural water supply schemes in Phu Cat and Tuy Phuoc; and solid waste management in Hoai Nhon, Phu My, Tay Son and An Nhon;<br>By 2012, establishment and training of the 6 District Task Forces (DTF), 30 Environmental Communication (EC) Team schools and 15 ECTeam in communes;<br>By 2013, the appointment of hamlet communicators in most of the hamlets in the participating communes in the 6 target districts;<br>Annually, the 6 DTF develop their supervision plan, sign a contract with PPMU for financing and provide support to the ECTs (school & communes) for implementation of Awareness Raising Activities;<br>Annually, the 30 ECTs (schools) and 15 ECTs (communes) develop a budgeted communication plan, sign a contract with PPMU for financing and implement the Awareness Raising activities;<br>By 2012, development of the Information-Education-Communication Materials to support the Awareness Raising Activities and the Radio Programs;<br>By 2014, 85% of students in participating classes of the 30 targeted schools endorse hygienic behaviors that recognize the importance of clean water use, water resource protection and the importance of solid waste reduction, collection, treatment and recycling; | Impact Assessment Reports and/or Evaluation Reports on the Awareness Raising Strategy<br><br>Contracts/Agreements of implementation in districts, communes and schools<br><br>Supervision Plans of the 6 District Task Forces<br><br>Communication plan of commune and school ECTeams<br><br>Minutes of regular meetings<br><br>Quarterly reports, wrap-up reports<br><br>Information-Education-Communication Materials | Government and non government organizations with sufficient experience in the field available<br><br>Province and districts have adequate funds to implement professional awareness campaigns |

| | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| | By 2014, 70% of the population in the participating hamlets of the 15 target communes endorse hygienic behaviors that recognize the importance of clean water use, water resource protection and the importance of solid waste reduction, collection, treatment and recycling; | Workshop Evaluation Reports<br><br>Workshop and Training Manuals | |
| **Result (output) 3:**<br><br>**Cost efficient rural water systems designed for both flooding and dry seasons, for 7 communes are implemented, while, Hoc Mon dam, its spillway and the related irrigation canals are rehabilitated.** | **Phu Cat - Tuy Phuoc Rural Water Supply**<br>By 2012, complete the design and construction tendering for the rural water supply scheme serving the target communes (5+2) of Phu Cat and Tuy Phuoc Districts;<br>By 2013, complete the construction of the rural water supply scheme serving the target communes (5+2) of Phu Cat and Tuy Phuoc Districts;<br>By 2014, 50 per cent of the households in the target communes (5+2) of Phu Cat and Tuy Phuoc Districts are connected and able to receive at least 40-60 liters per capita per day of safe drinking water in accordance with Vietnamese standards;<br>By 2014, 90 per cent of the households billed for water connection and use in the target communes (5+2) of Phu Cat and Tuy Phuoc Districts are regularly paying these charges.<br><br>**Hoc Mon Dam**<br>By 2012, complete the design and construction tendering for the upgrading of the Hoc Mon dam and irrigation system serving My Chau & My Duc commune;<br>By 2014, complete the construction of the upgrading of the Hoc Mon dam and irrigation system;<br>By 2014, the upgrading of Hoc Mon dam and associated irrigation channels in My Chau & My Duc commune, Phu My District is complete and farmers having land in the irrigated perimeter receive sufficient irrigation water to increase agricultural production. | Detailed Design Documents<br><br>Bid documentation (including bid plan, and technical specifications)<br><br>Bid Evaluation Reports<br><br>Legal and Audit Advice received<br><br>Site construction reports and/or photographic records<br><br>Number of payment made and level of the fees | Non polluted water resources<br><br>Operator has adequate funds and human resources |
| **Result (output) 4:**<br><br>**Infrastructure to treat solid waste for the target areas of all 4 districts, including 3 sanitary landfills.** | By 2012, complete the design and construction tendering for the landfills serving the target communities in Phu My and Tay Son Districts;<br>By 2012, relocate the planned landfill and complete the IP, EIA and Basic Design for the landfill serving the target communities in Hoai Nhon District;<br>By 2013, complete the design and construction tendering for the landfill serving the target communities in Hoai Nhon District;<br>By 2014, complete the construction of the landfills (2 cells) in Phu My, Tay Son and Hoai Nhon District;<br>By 2014, procurement of solid waste collection equipment for Hoai Nhon, Phu My, Tay Son and An Nhon District;<br>By 2014, 60 per cent of the households in the target Districts of Phu My, Tay Son, An Nhon and Hoai Nhon are participating in solid waste collection and treatment services; | Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA)<br><br>Detailed Design Documents<br><br>Bid documentation (including bid plan, and technical specifications)<br><br>Bid Evaluation Reports<br><br>Legal and Audit Advice received<br><br>Site construction reports and/or photographic records | Available land with geological and environmental conditions fitting with the requirements of the 3 landfills<br><br>Operator has adequate funds and human resources |

| | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| | By 2014, 90 per cent of the households receiving solid waste collection services in the target Districts of Phu My, Tay Son, An Nhon and Hoai Nhon billed for solid waste tariffs are regularly paying these charges. | Number of payment made and level of the fees | |

| No. | ACTIVITIES | MEANS | COST (EURO) |
|---|---|---|---|
| **Result 1:** | **Water supply**<br>Establish effective institutional arrangements, based on the Institutional-Organizational Capacity Assessment (IOCA) to ensure an efficient and appropriate institutional-organizational framework for the Phu Cat - Tuy Phuoc Rural Water Supply Plant;<br>Assessment of the most operationally capable and efficient agency to take over the investment projects regarding the service delivery and O&M of the Phu Cat Rural Water Supply Plan;<br>Support project partners in developing and implementing an appropriate participatory Rural Water Supply Management Model for the service delivery and O&M of the Phu Cat - Tuy Phuoc Rural Water Supply Scheme;<br>Conduct a detailed Training Needs Assessment (TNA), prepare a comprehensive and costed training strategy and develop a roadmap for the provincial and district agency staff and community representatives for the service delivery and O&M of the Phu Cat - Tuy Phuoc Rural Water Supply Scheme;<br>Develop a comprehensive and approved Capacity Building Strategy Concept & Costed Action Plan 2011-2014;<br>Organize seminars and study tours in Vietnam related to the good management practices in rural water supply;<br>Supervise, evaluate and provide training to the Water Safety Plan Team, focusing on data collection, reporting and customer relations;<br>Supervise, evaluate and provide training for pCERWASS general management and district staff, focusing on management, water resource protection and customer relations;<br>Supervise, evaluate and provide training for scheme management staff (white collar) on human resources, financing, accounting and planning;<br>Supervise, evaluate and provide training for operational staff (blue collar), focusing on O&M and Network;<br>Supervise, evaluate and provide training for commune and hamlet staff, focusing on network management and protection, data collection, reporting and customer relations.<br><br>**Solid Waste**<br>Guidance on the development of a the four District Solid Waste Master Plan in the 4 targeted districts of An Nhon, Tay Son, Phu My and Hoai Nhon;<br>Assessment of the most operationally capable and efficient agency to take over the investment projects regarding solid waste management (landfills);<br>Establish effective institutional arrangements to ensure an efficient institutional-organizational framework for the implementation of the four District Solid Waste Management Plans;<br>Develop a comprehensive and approved Capacity Building Strategy Concept & Costed Action Plan 2011-2014;<br>Assessment of the most appropriate agency to run the Provincial Solid Waste Resource Center;<br>Support the selected agency in establishing the Provincial Solid Waste Resource Center;<br>Support project partners (the four target districts) in establishing the four district steering committees, including the development of an implementation manual;<br>Support project partners (districts) in finalizing the four district management models for the solid waste service delivery in the four target districts;<br>Conduct a detailed Training Needs Assessment (TNA), prepare a comprehensive and costed training strategy and develop a roadmap for the provincial and district agency staff and community representatives for solid waste service delivery and O&M in the four target districts;<br>Organize seminars and study tours in Vietnam and regional countries related to the good management practice on solid waste Issues | CTA<br>Support staff<br>Consultants<br>Trainers | 575,000 |

| | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| | Supervise, evaluate and provide training on management for district leaders and SC members (white collar)<br>Supervise, evaluate and provide training for drivers, collectors, operators (blue collar)<br>Supervise, evaluate and provide a 2-day seminar and on the job training to community representatives. | | |
| **Result 2:** | Assessing the agencies involved in awareness raising issues, to ensure that the coordination of the awareness raising component is being coordinated by the appropriate agencies;<br>Develop an adapted awareness raising strategy and guidelines (based on the Awareness Raising Strategy of the Pilot Phase) related to both water resources and solid waste with short, medium, and long-term, costed action plans;<br>Establish and provide training to the 6 DTFs, 30 ECTeams (schools) and 15 ECTeams (communes)<br>Appoint the hamlet communicators in most of the hamlets in the participating communes in the 6 targeted districts;<br>Supervise and support the development of the supervision plans of the 6 DTFs and arrange the necessary contracts;<br>Supervise and support the development of the budgeted Communication Plans of the 30 ECTeams (schools) and 15 ECTeams (communes) and arrange the necessary contracts;<br>Develop IEC Materials and supervise the Radio Programs;<br>Supervision, follow-up and evaluation of the Awareness Raising Activities at district, commune and hamlet level. | CTA<br>Support staff<br>Consultants | 390,000 |
| **Result 3:** | **PC-TP RWS**<br>Definition of the responsibility for the good execution of the project, while guaranteeing the availability of resources<br>Revision of the detail design leading to the non-objection of BTC before approval procedure<br>Bidding procedure, following the Vietnamese procurement rules<br>Site supervision of the works, with a responsibility of good results<br>Handover of the water scheme to the designated owner<br>Coordination with the social policy bank to make the loans for the households connections affordable and accessible on time<br>Conduct surveys to define the population willingness to pay for the services<br>**Rehabilitation of Hoc Mon reservoir and canal system**<br>Definition of the responsibility for the good execution of the project, while guaranteeing the availability of resources<br>Detail design leading to the non-objection of BTC before approval procedure<br>Bidding procedure, following the Vietnamese procurement rules<br>Site supervision of the works, with a responsibility of good results<br>Handover of the water scheme to the designated owner | CTA<br>Support staff<br>Consultants<br>pCERWASS supervision | 3,056,000 from BE and 650,000 from VN |
| **Result 4:** | Definition of the responsibility for the good execution of the project, while guaranteeing the availability of resources;<br>Development and Revision of the detail design leading to the non-objection of BTC before approval procedure;<br>Bidding procedure, following the Vietnamese procurement rules;<br>Construction of the landfills; Site supervision of the works, with a responsibility of good results;<br>Handover of the solid waste infrastructure and equipment to the designated owner;<br>Conduct surveys to define the population willingness to pay for the services; | CTA<br>Support staff<br>Consultants<br>District PMU<br>Supervision | 2,962,000 from BE and 805,000 from VN |

## 5.3 MoRe Results at a glance

| | |
|---|---|
| Logical framework's results or indicators modified in last 12 months? | Logical framework's result 1 and 3 were reorganised in December 2012, in order to group all CD activities and investment activities together, but in separate results. The sub-result: "with efficient operation & maintenance modalities for the new investments and secured funding" which was included under Result 3 for investment Rural Water, was changed to Result 1 for CD. This change facilitates reporting and it is also in line with the budget revision proposed by the MTR recommendation 4 which proposed relocating the budgets lines "Definition of responsibilities", "Set-up monitoring & reporting tools" and "Definition of financial means for O & M" from the investment components for RWS and SWM (Results 3 and 4) to the CD component (result 1)<br>Indicators were reformulated in December 2012, in order to be less general and better reflect the concrete work actually performed by the project |
| Baseline Report registered on PIT? | Completed 10/08/2010 |
| Planning MTR | Completed 10/06/2012 |
| Planning ETR | 01/06/2014 |
| Backstopping missions since 01/01/2012 | 1 backstopping mission performed by Mr. Jeroen Michels (Governance) took place between 13 and 18 September 2012, for supporting the PPMU to set out the capacity development (CD) targets, objectives and activities of the WSSP intervention until the end of the lifecycle of the project |

## 5.4 "Budget versus current (y – m)" Report

*See annex*

## 5.5 Resources

Bi-weekly news is published on the project website and some of the materials prepared by/for and used by the project and project partners can be downloacded from the project website. Please consult either https://binhdinhwssp.wordpress.com (en) or https://duancapnuocvavesinh.wordpress.com (vn)

## 5.6 Decisions taken by the JLCB and follow-up

| Decision to take | | | | | Action | | | Follow-up | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Decision to take** | **Period of identification** | **Timing** | **Source** | **Actor** | **Action(s)** | **Resp.** | **Deadline** | **Progress** | **Status** |
| Recommendations of MTR, adopted by PSC5 | | | | | | | | | |
| The project prepare a collaborative, unified capacity building approach and overall budgeted plan with schedule urgently for Result 1: Capacity Building and Result 2: Awareness Raising activities | Q2 2012 | Q1 - Q3 2012 | MTR | Project | Result 1: Capacity Building: Backstopping mission to support and coach the PPMU in the development of an operational CD approach for the remaining phase of the project (up to August 2014) implemented in September 2012<br>Result 2: Awareness Raising : Environmental Awareness Raising Plan for Extension phase prepared and approved by PPC on 27/4/2012 | PPMU | Q4 2012 | completed | completed |
| The collaborative capacity building approach and plan addresses, at least, the issues in Sections 2.2.1.2 and 2.2.2.3 of the Technical and Financial File "Water Supply and Sanitation Programme in Binh Dinh Province", Navison Code: VIE 0703511 plus other issues described in the recommendations provided in the Final MTR Report and approved by PSC | Q2 2012 | Q1 - Q3 2012 | MTR | Project | The capacity building approach and plan addresses the issues in Sections 2.2.1.2 and 2.2.2.3 of the TFF (see recommendation 6 above) | PPMU | Q4 2012 | completed | completed |
| The project ensure that the design of upgrading works to Hoc Mon dam meet and are limited to the basic design issues outlined in Section 2.2.1.3 of Technical and Financial File "Water Supply and Sanitation Programme in Binh Dinh Province", Navison Code: VIE 0703511 | Q2 2012 | Q1 - Q3 2012 | MTR | Project | ITA verified the design upon completion and compared it to the requirements in the TFF;<br>Besides, an independent appraisal mission by external consultants (international and national) was completed on 15 August 2012. | PPMU | Q4 2012 | completed | completed |
| Upon the completion of current project partner agreements/contracts, determine if the awareness raising activities can be delivered through the use of | Q2 2012 | Q1 - Q3 2012 | MTR | Project | The extension phase the AR program uses lower cost mechanisms than during the pilot | PPMU | Q1 2012 | completed | completed |

| | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| lower cost contracting mechanisms | | | | | phase by no longer making use of subcontractors. Instead PPMU signed contracts directly with DTFs and CTeams and assures supervision by its own resources | | | | |
| Examine the feasibility of the project supporting the procurement of facilities (items such as waste bins) that could enhance the sustainability of current and future awareness raising activities in schools | Q2 2012 | Q1 - Q3 2012 | MTR | Project | PPMU made field visits to the 16 schools in which the project's AR programs for SWM are run. The visits allowed to reach personalized agreements with each school about which type and quantity of facilities (items such as waste bins) the schools need, the equipment has been supplied to these schools | PPMU | Q3 2012 | completed | completed |
| Re-examine the costs of the proposed expanded awareness campaign activities and reduce the scope, as necessary, to suit the project's human and budgetary resources | Q2 2012 | Q1 - Q3 2012 | MTR | Project | For the extension phase and for the Solid Waste component, the scope of the AR activities for SWM was reduced from 21 communes to 8 communes, in order to suit the project's human and budgetary resources;<br>For the RWS component, all 7 targeted communes are reached | PPMU | Q1 2012 | completed | completed |
| The project, through BTC facilitation, is encouraged to build project stakeholder awareness and networks to relevant Vietnamese professional organizations (e.g. VUREIA), other donor approaches, programs and projects as well relevant infrastructure, particularly new, modern engineered landfills | Q2 2012 | Q1 - Q3 2012 | MTR | Project | A study trip was successfully organized in Vietnam to visit four national landfills (Tuy Hoa Landfill in Phu Yen Province, Tuy Phong Landfill in Binh Thuan Province, Lang Co Landfill in Hue City and Dong Ha Landfill in Quang Tri Province). The study tour allowed 23 participants (from provincial and district level) to acquire more knowledge and practical insight on operation and management of modern engineered landfills<br>A study trip was successfully organized in Vietnam to visit 3 RWS models (Vung Tau, Binh Thuan Province and Tra Vinh | PPMU | Q2&3 2012 | completed | completed |

| | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | | | Province). The study tour allowed 22 participants (from provincial and district level) to evaluate the performance of the model used for the supply of the clean water service and learn lessons for their own model | | | | |
| The project should ensure that all contractors and suppliers engaged by the project provide, where relevant, proper attention to public safety and protection | Q2 2012 | Q1 - Q3 2012 | MTR | Project | Contract specifications for Phu Cat RWS specify clearly under Chapter 8 (technical requirement) the necessary safety measures for workers, site safety, as well as measures for signaling road works to the public for the safety of road users;<br>Construction supervisors and staff from the project owner verify the contractor's compliance with these specifications. Violations are recorded in the site diary and minutes of supervision meetings | PPMU | Q1 2012 | Not a problem in the project | complied |
| The project monitors the occupational health and safety of workers on all construction work sites shall also be monitored by the construction supervisor to ensure that all relevant Vietnamese laws and regulations are complied with | Q2 2012 | Q1 - Q3 2012 | MTR | Project | PPMU discussed the issue with the project owner, who reminded the construction supervision consultant to be vigilant | PPMU | Q1 2012 | completed | completed |
| O&M training and manuals for any new project infrastructure or equipment constructed and/or installed should be provided. This O&M training may be provided by the successful contractors/suppliers or the owner of the project infrastructure | Q2 2012 | Q1 - Q3 2012 | MTR | Project | O&M manuals for the operation of all new infrastructure built by the project will be prepared in due time. In first instance the operators of the service must be assigned and the models for management, operation and maintenance of these infrastructures decided as well as the necessary O&M staff recruited | PPMU | Q2 2013 | For RWS: it has already been decided that pCERWASS will be the service provider and pCERWASS prepared a suitable management model for delivering service and O&M of the new infrastructure. TNA and road map | ongoing |

| | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | | | | | | for training are under preparation O&M manuals will be prepared<br>For SWM: a similar process is being followed. The preparation of the management models has already started. It will receive strong focus during the 2nd semester of 2012 and the whole of 2013. | |
| To ensure the development of an appropriate collaborative, unified capacity building approach and overall budgeted plan with schedule, BTC closely monitors progress and, if needed, assists with the deployment of capacity building technical assistance from another project under the BTC development program in Viet Nam | Q2 2012 | Q1 - Q3 2012 | MTR | BTC Brussels | The project developed an appropriate collaborative, unified capacity building approach and overall budgeted plan with schedule | PPMU | Q1 2012 | completed | completed |
| Future ITA services are provided on a part time basis for the remainder of the project to maximize the effectiveness of the remaining budget. It is estimated that 16 person months of inputs remain to be provided over the remaining 32 months of project implementation | Q2 2012 | Q1 - Q3 2012 | MTR | BTC Brussels | IT services were extended by 1 year full time | PPMU | Q1 2012 | completed | completed |
| Insist upon collaborative, co-management based on written agreement before expenditure commitments on both BTC and PPMU managed funding mechanisms are made | Q2 2012 | Q1 - Q3 2012 | MTR | BTC Brussels | PPMU has written agreements signed before expenditure commitments on all NatEx and on Regie budgets used by the PPMU | PPMU | Q1 2012 | completed | completed |
| Expedite the BTC “no objection” procedures and advise the PPMU and project partners of the expected duration for the provision of a “no objection” decision | Q2 2012 | Q1 - Q3 2012 | MTR | BTC Brussels | No action | | | No change | |
| PPMU presented a new proposal for “The Study Tour on Solid Waste and Water Supply Management and Operation Models to Europe” to the MTR team. Considering previous disapproval of similar proposals | Q2 2012 | Q1 - Q3 2012 | MTR | BTC Brussels | BTC approved a study tour to Belgium, taking into consideration that: | PPMU | Q1 2012 | completed | completed |

| | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| at PSC meetings 3 and 4, the MTR does not consider that the study tour proposed will make a positive contribution to the project's outcomes. Given the limited funding resources available to complete the project, it is suggested that more use is made of study tours within Vietnam and regional countries | | | | | - A study tour in the region is more difficult to organize without specific contacts in the destination country<br>- The budget to organize such a study tour is similar to that necessary for a study tour in Belgium<br>- The possibility for the project to visit BTC HQ<br>- The proposal for the study tour is very clear and well defined. | | | | |
| The Final Evaluation Report of the Phu My Irrigation Project recommended that the project implement a PIM program and water supply scheme associated with the Hoc Mon dam upgrading. As BTC has advised that no additional funding can be provided to the project, these activities should not proceed | Q2 2012 | Q1 - Q3 2012 | MTR | BTC Brussels | The project halted all PIM activity | | | | |
| To ensure appropriate safety levels in the upgrading works to Hoc Mon dam, BTC engage an international dam safety consultant to review the final design | Q2 2012 | Q1 - Q3 2012 | MTR | BTC Brussels | An international dam safety consultant from AF consult reviewed the DD design and the designer applied all comments in his final design | PPMU | Q1 2012 | completed | completed |
| The decision of the PSC meeting no. 4 to approve the proposed investment for the design and construction of three (3) landfills in Hoai Nhon, Phu My and Tay Son Districts is supported. Final project financing approvals, to be provided by the PSC, are to be based on the detailed designs and cost estimates and fit within project budget. In meetings with An Nhon DPC, the MTR was advised that alternative funding sources are being sought for the construction of the An Nhon landfill | Q2 2012 | Q1 - Q3 2012 | MTR | BTC Brussels | The project will invest in 3 sanitary landfills only | PPMU | Q1 2012 | completed | completed |