



BTC



RESULT REPORT 2014

**INTERVENTION:
“INTEGRATED WATER MANAGEMENT AND URBAN
DEVELOPMENT IN RELATION TO CLIMATE CHANGE IN HA TINH
PROVINCE”**

ACRONYMS.....	4
1 INTERVENTION AT A GLANCE	5
1.1 INTERVENTION FORM.....	6
1.2 BUDGET EXECUTION	7
1.3 SELF-ASSESSMENT PERFORMANCE.....	7
1.3.1 Relevance.....	7
1.3.2 Effectiveness	8
1.3.3 Efficiency	8
1.3.4 Potential sustainability.....	8
1.4 CONCLUSION	8
2 RESULT MONITORING	10
2.1 EVOLUTION OF THE CONTEXT	10
2.1.1 General context	10
2.1.2 Institutional context.....	10
2.1.3 Management context: Execution modalities.....	10
2.1.4 Hamor context	10
2.2 PERFORMANCE OUTCOME	10
2.2.1 Progress of indicators.....	11
2.2.2 Analysis of progress made	12
2.2.3 Potential impacts.....	14
2.3 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 1	15
2.3.1 Progress of indicators.....	15
2.3.2 Progress of key activities	16
2.3.3 Analysis of progress made	16
2.4 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 2	17
2.4.1 Progress of indicators.....	17
2.4.2 Progress of main activities	17
Progress of main activities	17
2.4.3 Analysis of progress made	17
2.5 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 3	18
2.5.1 Progress of indicators.....	18
2.5.2 Progress of main activities	18
Progress of main activities	18
2.5.3 Analysis of progress made	18
2.6 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 4	19
2.6.1 Progress of indicators.....	19
2.6.2 Progress of main activities	19
2.6.3 Analysis of progress made	19
2.7 TRANSVERSAL THEMES.....	20
2.7.1 Gender	20
2.7.2 Environment.....	20
2.7.3 Other.....	21
2.8 RISK MANAGEMENT	22
3 STEERING AND LEARNING.....	23
3.1 STRATEGIC RE-ORIENTATIONS.....	23
3.2 RECOMMENDATIONS	23
3.3 LESSONS LEARNED	23

4	ANNEXES.....	25
4.1	QUALITY CRITERIA	25
4.2	DECISIONS BY THE STEERING COMMITTEE AND FOLLOW-UP	29
4.3	UPDATED LOGICAL FRAMEWORK	32
4.4	MoRE RESULTS AT GLANCE	32
4.5	BUDGET REPORT	33
4.6	SOURCES OF INFORMATION.....	38

ACRONYMS

ADB	Asian Development Bank
BTC	Belgian Technical Cooperation
CA	Cities Association
CC	Climate Change
GGSF	Green Growth Support Facility
GIZ	German Technical Organization
HQ	Head Quarter
IMHEN	Institute for Meteorology, Hydrology and Environment
ITA	International Technical Assistant
IWRM	Integrated Water Resource Management
M&E	Monitoring & Evaluation
MPI	Ministry of Planning and Investment
PSC	Project Steering Committee
PPC	Provincial People's Committee
TOR	Terms of Reference
WB	World Bank

1 INTERVENTION AT A GLANCE

Personnel:

Project Steering Committee, was established under Decision No. 2492/QĐ-People's Committee dated 08/14/2013 and the Decision No. 4064/QĐ-People's Committee dated 17/12/2014 regarding amendments to certain provisions of Decision No. 2492/QĐ-People's Committee, consists of six official members, as follow:

1. Mr. Nguyen Thien, Standing Vice Chairman of Ha Tinh PPC – Chairman of PSC
2. Mr. Alain Devaux, Chief of BTC Representatives in Viet Nam- Co-Chairman of PSC
3. Mr. Nguyen Hoang Lam - Head of Bilateral division, Department of debt management and external finance, Ministry of Finance- PSC member
4. Mr. Chau Tran Vinh, Deputy of Water Resource Mangement Department, MONRE-PSC member;
5. Mr. Le Hung Nam, Deputy of Water Resource Management and Rural Water, Directorate of Water Resources-PSC member;
6. Mrs. Vo Hong Anh, External Economic Department (MPI)-PSC member;

There are also unofficial members, include:

1. Mr. Nguyen Tuan Anh-Deputy Director of Department of Science, Education, Natural Resources and Environment (MPI);
2. Mr. Phan Thanh Bien, Director of SRDP-IWMC Ha Tinh PCU, Secretary of PSC

The Project Coordination Unit was established pursuant to Decision No. 2287/QĐ-UBND dated 26/7/2013 and Decision No. 3198/QĐ-UBND dated 15/10/2013 on revision on some articles of Decision No. 2287/QĐ-UBND; Currently, project staff include:

Function	Name	First name	M/F	Start	End
Project Director	Bien	Phan Thanh	M	20/8/2013	31/12/2020
Deputy Director	Minh	Le Tien	M	20/8/2013	31/12/2020
Chief accountant	Huu	Doan Chinh	M	20/8/2013	31/12/2020
Coordinator	Quang	Tran Dinh	M	20/8/2013	31/12/2020
Interpreter/Translator	Thao	Tran Thi	F	21/01/2014	31/12/2020
Technical staff	Thin	Nguyen Phi	M	20/8/2013	31/12/2020
Technical staff	Phuong	Dang Huu	M	15/10/2013	31/12/2020
Technical staff	Son	Le Anh	M	15/10/2013	31/12/2020
Technical staff	Ha	Nguyen Thi	F	15/10/2013	31/12/2020
Accountant	Hung	Dang Tuan	M	15/10/2013	31/12/2020
Admin assistant	Hien	Dao Xuan	M	15/10/2013	31/12/2020
Cashier	Hoa	Ho Thi	F	15/10/2013	31/12/2020
Driver	Mai	Le Dinh	M	15/10/2013	31/12/2020

Logistics

The Project Coordination Unit has office building in No. 12 Liem Vo Son, Ha Tinh, and procured project vehicles and equipment for project operation.

Key events:

On June 20th, 2013: The Specific Agreement between The Government of Kingdom of Belgium and the Government of the Socialist Republic of Vietnam was signed

On October 22nd, 2013: The first meeting of the Project Steering Committee (inception) and Project Inception Workshop were organized;

On January 12th, 2015: The second meeting of Project Steering Committee on evaluation of results of 2014 and plan of 2015 plan to solve a number of problems in order to promote progress in 2015.

Components:

Result 1: Strengthening capacity of governments in climate change, integrated water resources management and urban planning (EURO 1.405.000);

Result 2: Overall strategy on Climate Change (EURO 990.000);

Result 3: Prioritized strategic piloting activities on Climate Change adaptation (EURO 4.042.800);

Result 4: Mobilization of communities' involvements (EURO 660.000);

1.1 INTERVENTION FORM

Intervention title	INTEGRATED WATER MANAGEMENT AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT IN RELATION TO CLIMATE CHANGE IN HA TINH PROVINCE.
Intervention code	VIE 1204411
Location	Ha Tinh province
Total budget	Total budget: EURO 8,800,000 Of which: - Belgian Contribution: EURO 7,800,000 - Contribution of Viet Nam: EURO 1,000,000
Partner Institution	HA TINH Provincial People's Committee
Start date Specific Agreement	20/6/2013
Date intervention start /Opening steering committee	22/10/2013
Planned end date of execution period	JUNE 20 th , 2019
End date Specific Agreement	JUNE 20 th , 2020
Target groups	Communities, authorities and institutional policies related to Climate Changes.
Impact	To contribute to the sustainable development of Ha Tinh province
Outcome	To support the institutional capacity in Ha Tinh Province in integrated water resources management and urban development in relation to Climate Change

Outputs	Result 1. The capacity of the authorities of the province and Ha Tinh city in terms of Climate Change, Integrated Water Resources Management and urban planning are improved with appropriate monitoring and evaluation mechanisms in place.
	Result 2. A comprehensive strategy on CC is in place. It is based on various studies, including CC data and hydraulic modeling focused on operational impact on settlements of Rao Cai river catchment and the revision of the existing master plans of both Ha Tinh city and Hong Linh town, while key priorities of the CC action plan of the Rao-Cai river basin are defined.
	Result 3. Priority strategic pilot activities are developed for lessons learned targeting Tinh city to increase resilience to CC, with appropriate operational and maintenance modalities.
	Result 4. The provincial CC strategy is supported by the active involvement of the communities and the private sector.
Year covered by the report	2014

1.2 BUDGET EXECUTION

	Budget	Expenditure		Balance	Disbursement rate at the end of year 2014
		Previous years	Year covered by the report (2014)		
Total	6,335,000		113,003	6,221,997	1,78
Output 1	1,405,000		101,919	1,303,081	7,25
Output 2	990,000		3,061	986,939	0,31
Output 3	3,280,000		7,580	3,272,420	0,23
Output 4	660,000		443	659,557	0,07

1.3 SELF-ASSESSMENT PERFORMANCE

1.3.1 Relevance

	Performance
<p><i>Project is in relevance with priorities of the Government of Vietnam, contributing to implementation of the National Strategy and Action Plan of Vietnam for sustainable development, adaptation and mitigation of climate change approved in decision No. 158/2008/QĐ-TTg dated December 2nd, 2008 of the Prime Minister on approval the National Target Program to respond to Climate Change.</i></p> <p><i>Project is in relevance with priorities of Ha Tinh province, contributing to implementation of the Provincial Strategy and Action Plan of Ha Tinh province on Sustainable Development, Adaptation and Mitigation of Climate Change approved in Decision No. 2313/QĐ-People Committee dated July 14th, 2011 of Ha Tinh province on issuing Action Plan to respond to climate change in Ha Tinh province in 2011-2015 and orientation up to 2020.</i></p>	A

1.3.2 Effectiveness

	Performance
<p><i>The project has just been implemented for 15 months, and currently in the phase of research and preparing legal procedures for operation. Therefore, there have not been concrete results for assessment. However, through seminars and training courses, authorities at all levels and relevant departments were clearly aware of the facts that, the effectiveness of project will, after project finished, ensure at least the following achievements:</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <i>1. Awareness of staff and communities on water resources are enhanced; their behaviors to reduce environmental pollution and climate change are improved;</i> <i>2. Integrated water resources management: changes of institutional and policies on water management at all levels.</i> <i>3. Urban Planning: Climate changes elements are integrated into urban planning.</i> <i>4. Interaction between climate change and water management and urban planning: Improving policies to mitigate the impacts of climate change on water resources and urban planning; concurrently using water resources and urban planning in order to minimize climate change.</i> 	A

1.3.3 Efficiency

	Performance
<p><i>The project has just been implemented for 15 months and currently in the research phase and preparing the legal procedures for operation, no concrete results should not be assessed.</i></p>	

1.3.4 Potential sustainability

	Performance
<p><i>The project has just been implemented for 15 months and currently in the research phase and preparing the legal procedures for operation, no concrete results should not be assessed.</i></p>	

1.4 CONCLUSION

✓ **Technical and Financial File (TFF)**: Basically, content and activities are consistent with long-term goals and objectives of the project. Logical framework of the project is appropriate. However, specific indicators are not provided, a baseline database and M & E system need to be established; activities need to be annually re-evaluated for adjustments and supplements related to activities, results, fund allocation to achieve the expected goals (outcome).

✓ **Institutional**: Need to establish a mechanism to clearly assign responsibilities and obligations, information exchange to create the synergies and efficiency between BTC, TSU with PCU in administration of activity deployment through development of POM. Therefore, development and approval of Project Operation Manual (POM) should be considered as important issue and priority in the first six months of 2015.

✓ **Fund disbursement:** 22 % of Plan 2014 was achieved. Low rate of fund disbursement due to the following key causes:

- The project approaches, content, activities and implementation processes are new therefore lack of experience in planning and implementation of activities;
- Evaluation and issuance of no objection is slow, causing delays in the implementation of activities
- Experts supposed to be recruited by BTC and TSU has yet been provided;
- The recruitment of capable experts and technical staff for project implementation has faced many difficulties.

✓ **The involved parties need to improve the following key problems :**

- The involved in implementing the coordination mechanism as proposed TFF;
- BTC and TSU provide the PCU with the required experts to implement the results accordingly to the project schedule;
- PCU suggests to be allowed to recruit technical staff and experts under the authority of PCU recruitment;
- Pursuant to the PSC meeting minutes dated 22.10.2013, request for allowing to conduct surveying, planning and designing of Dap Bot Retention Lake to ensure the progress ;
- Please allow a deduction from the fund in the budget line A.3.2 (The investment priorities for Ha Tinh city) to use for designing Eco-house ;
- Suggest BTC to study and put an oriented time frame for ‘No Objection’ issuance process in to POM;

<p align="center">Project Director “INTEGRATED WATER MANANGEMENT AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT IN RELATION TO CLIMATE CHANGE IN HA TINH PROVIDCE”</p>	<p align="center">Resident Representative Belgian Development Agency to Vietnam</p>
 <p align="center">Mr. Phan Thanh Bien</p>	 <p align="center">Mr. Alain Devaux</p>

2 RESULT MONITORING

2.1 EVOLUTION OF THE CONTEXT

2.1.1 General context

The Project implemented in the context of the Government of Vietnam and Ha Tinh provincial government are giving priorities to reducing the impacts of climate change towards economy and society; as well as focusing on minimizing factors of economic activities impacting climate change; Decision No. 2313/QD-UBND dated July 14th, 2011 of Ha Tinh provincial People's Committee on issuing the Action Plan responding to Climate Change in Ha Tinh province in the period 2011-2015 and vision up to 2020 which referring to the important decisions on reduction and adaptation to Climate Change in Ha Tinh.

2.1.2 Institutional context

After 15 months, the project has not yet had the Project Operation Manual (POM), while this document is the legal and institutional basis for operation, procedures, and coordination mechanisms between the projects in the program.

In order to ensure a smooth operation of the project without POM in place, BTC and Ha Tinh province have applied the laws of the Government of Vietnam and the Government of the Kingdom of Belgium to create a legal framework for implementation of project activities.

2.1.3 Management context: Execution modalities

The CC program consists of four interventions and the organizational design of the program helps ensuring a physical link between the projects. Ha Tinh PCU has managed to maintain a good coordination, experience sharing between BTC, TSU and PCU, therefore in 2014, despite the low disbursement rate, Ha Tinh PCU has evenly deployed the planned activities of year 2014.

2.1.4 Hamor context

The project operation is operating with two parallel systems/regulations of the Government of Vietnam and BTC. In 2014, BTC managed to harmonize M & E and reporting systems with those of the Government of Vietnam, making things become much easier than the year before. However, for those procurement activities applicable of both Procurement Law of Vietnam and parts of BTC's regulations, and need to be approved by the two systems too, it took a long process, delayed other activities and reduced the ownership/autonomy of the project coordination units.

2.2 PERFORMANCE OUTCOME



2.2.1 Progress of indicators

M&E system is currently being developed therefore indicators have not been identified.

Result: Support for water resource management and urban development in relevance to climate change in Ha Tinh					
Indicators	Baseline value	Value year N-1	Value year N	Target year N	End target
Result 1: The capacity of the authorities of the province and Ha Tinh city in terms of Climate Change, Integrated Water Resources Management and urban planning are improved with appropriate monitoring and evaluation mechanisms in place.					
Indicator 1-1 : Urban planning is improved and the process of water treatment and operation are developed, approved and applied;					
Indicator 1-2: Need assessment;					
Indicator 1-3: Capacities of water resource management and urban planning are enhanced;					
Indicator 1-4: Mechanism for monitoring and evaluation (M & E) and methods of operation and maintenance (O&M) are developed.					
Result 2: A comprehensive strategy on CC is in place. It is based on various studies, including CC data and hydraulic modeling focused on operational impact on settlements of Rao-Cai river catchment and the revision of the existing master plans of both Ha Tinh city and Hong Linh town, while key priorities of the CC action plan of the Rao-Cai river basin are defined.					
Indicator 2-1 : The priorities in climate change action plan for Rao Cai river basin and Ha Tinh province relating to water and sanitation are based on the results of Climate Change study and modeling consistently being used and applied; Indicator 2-2 : Awareness of climate change and understanding of hydrology related to urban planning and water management is improved;					
Indicator 2-3: Awareness of climate change					

and meteorological models is improved;					
Indicator 2-4 : Capacities of urban planning and overall water treatment are improved;					
Indicator 2-5 : Awareness of how to integrate the priorities of CC action plan into water planning and urban sanitation.					
Result 3. Priority strategic pilot activities are developed for lessons learned targeting Ha Tinh city to increase resilience to CC, with appropriate operational and maintenance modalities.					
Indicator 3-1: Flooding conditions of Ha Tinh city improved;					
Indicator 3-2: Adaptive measurements tested in Ha Tinh city (physical infrastructure);					
Only 3-3: Mangroves along Rao Cai river basin restored and expanded					
Result 4. The provincial CC strategy is supported by the active involvement of the communities and the private sector.					
Indicator 4-1: Awareness of communities and private sector on climate change improved;					
Indicator 4-2: Active participations of the most vulnerable communities to CC					
Indicator 4-3 : The active participation of the private sector with the most relevance to the impacts of climate change (e.g., provide products supporting communities to improve housing conditions and surroundings);					
Indicator 4-4 : More support to poor households affected by CC					

2.2.2 Analysis of progress made

Due to lack of baseline database and M&E, the analysis mentioned below based on the implemented or verifiable activities in 2014.

Result 1:

The capacity of the authorities of the province and Ha Tinh city in terms of Climate Change, Integrated Water Resources Management and urban planning are improved with appropriate monitoring and evaluation mechanisms in place.

- **Indicator 1-1:** This is an indicator of results therefore not able to be evaluated in year 2014;

- **Indicator 1-2:** PCU has organized a technical and institutional capacity assessment (TICA) to the related provincial departments and agencies; expectedly at early February 2015 the official results and a technical and institutional capacity building strategy will be submitted to Ha Tinh province.

- **Indicator 1-3:** A seminar on climate change, integrated water resources management and urban planning was held with 59 participants from technical departments of Ha Tinh Provincial People's Committee and Ha Tinh city, the discussions made by scientists from institutes and the largest universities in Vietnam, and managers in Ha Tinh province. Through awareness seminar on climate change, integrated water resources management and urban planning, especially the physical relationship on these topics between managers of Ha Tinh government was significantly improved. A study tour on climate change, integrated water resources management and urban planning to Da Nang and Can Tho cities was also held by PCU Ha Tinh with 24 participants from related technical departments. Coordinate with TSU to organized an oversea study tour to Belgium and the Netherlands for 4 decision makers participants;

- Supported equipment for 12 meteorological stations and also Ha Tinh provincial Meteorological Monitoring Station to improve the quality of communication and ensure smooth communication in any circumstances.

- Assigned project staff to participate in capacity training by BTC and TSU on project management.

- **Indicator 1-4:** A ToR for baseline survey and establishment of M & E systems have been developed and approved; expectedly M & E system will be established by June 2015 with specific indicators of the logical framework and baseline data system reliable for monitoring and evaluation later.

Result 2:

A comprehensive strategy on CC is in place. It is based on various studies, including CC data and hydraulic modeling focused on operational impact on settlements of Rao-Cai river catchment and the revision of the existing master plans of both Ha Tinh city and Hong Linh town, while key priorities of the CC action plan of the Rao-Cai river basin are defined.

- **Indicator 2-1:** PCU Ha Tinh considered the detailed study on climate change study and hydrological/ hydraulic modeling of Rao The river basin are the backbones of project; Project will succeed or fail depending very much on the results of these studies. Currently, these activities are on stage of selecting consulting units, and expectedly by the end of February 2015 contracts will be signed with the successful bidders, and study results will be in place by beginning of 2016. A prioritized action strategy will be submitted to the PPC;

- **Indicator 2-2:** This indicator will be implemented after having results of CC modeling and hydrological/hydraulic modeling of Rao Cai river basin.

- **Indicator 2-3:** This indicator will be implemented after having results of CC modeling and hydrological/hydraulic modeling of Rao Cai river basin.

- **Indicator 2-4:** This indicator will be implemented after having results of CC modeling and hydrological/hydraulic modeling of Rao Cai river basin.

- **Indicator 2-5:** This indicator will be implemented after having results of CC modeling and hydrological/hydraulic modeling of Rao Cai river basin..

Result 3: Priority strategic pilot activities are developed for lessons learned targeting Ha Tinh city to increase resilience to CC, with appropriate operational and maintenance modalities.

- **Indicator 3-1:** This indicator will be implemented after having results of CC modeling and hydrological/hydraulic modeling of Rao Cai river basin.

- **Indicator 3-2:** A TOR for selection of consultancy for planning and designing (preparation of investment) of Dap Bot retention lake was built. Expectedly by the end of 2015 the investment project will completed; the results of hydrological/hydraulic modeling of Rao Cai river basin will integrated into construction project of Dap Bot retention lake. Expectedly by June 2016, construction work will be launched.

- **Indicator 3-3:** A survey and study on mangroves in Rao Cai river basin is being implemented by PCU Ha Tinh. The study stage is expectedly completed by March 2015. A

mangroves development and conservation strategy will be submitted to Ha Tinh PPC.

Result 4:

The provincial CC strategy is supported by the active involvement of the communities and the private sector.

- **Indicator 4-1:** This indicator will be implemented after having results of CC modeling and hydrological/hydraulic modeling of Rao Cai river basin.

- **Indicator 4-2:** This indicator will be implemented after having results of CC modeling and hydrological/hydraulic modeling of Rao Cai river basin.

- **Indicator 4-3:** A set of criteria/standards design and sample design in the framework of eco-house project will be established expectedly by June, 2015. This set would attract more households to adopt renovating houses with water resources, energy efficiency as well as improving living conditions and proper mitigation to the effects of climate change.

- **Indicator 4-4:** An eco-house Credit Facility is established to support the poor communities renovating their houses accordingly to the indicator 4-3 mentioned above. Currently, the draft version of Regulations of Eco-house Credit Facility has been submitted to BTC for consideration.

2.2.3 Potential impacts

Basically, the logical framework of project is still in effect during the process of project implementation and M & E. The update of indicators after developing baseline database and M&E system in June 2015 will consolidate the logical framework.

Logic of intervention is still valid, and will be integrated into the operations, after having results of hydraulic/hydrological study, in order to providing scientific basis for the formulation and adjustment of urban development and planning, integrated water resources management in relation to climate change, towards sustainable development and capacity building for technical and managerial staff of the related fields. Then summarizing and drawing institutional and practical lessons learnt to influence the related national policies.

2.3 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 1



2.3.1 Progress of indicators

Result 1: The capacity of the authorities of the province and Ha Tinh city in terms of Climate Change, Integrated Water Resources Management and urban planning are improved with appropriate monitoring and evaluation mechanisms in place.					
Indicators	Baseline value	Value year 2013	Value year 2014	Target year 2015	End target
Total	1,405,000		101,919	364,000	
A.1.1 Capacity building of PCU in project management, procurement, project & M&E and reporting.	240,000		32,935	90,000	
A.1.2 Technical Institutional and Capacity Needs Assessment (TICA)	50,000			19,000	
A.1.3 Capacity building of related agencies and stakeholders in CC, IWRM, urban development & community involvement	340,000		30,308	100,000	
A.1.4 Strengthen operation/coordination mechanisms among agencies with regards to CC, IWRM & urban planning	110,000			30,000	
A.1.5 Data collection: Baseline survey, collect existing data and additional surveys	255,000			45,000	
A.1.6 Support monitoring meteorological and hydrological stations	210,000		33,611		
A.1.7 Data processing	100,000			60,000	
A.1.8 Information exchange and dissemination of lessons learned	100,000		5,065	20,000	

2.3.2 Progress of key activities

Progress of key activities	Progress			
	A	B	C	D
1. Training on Project Management, Procurement		x		
2. Oversea study tour in cooperation with TSU			x	
3. Domestic study tours			x	
4. Workshops on CC, IWRM and Urban Planning for provincial agencies			x	
5. Support hydro meteorological monitoring stations with equipment	x			
6. Development project logo and website.		x		

2.3.3 Analysis of progress made

Most of the activities carried out later than the planed schedule, caused by long process of BTC's no objection. This also affects the disbursement rate in 2014 but not affecting much the project outcome. Factors affecting the progress of activities were resolved in the second meeting of PSC dated on January 12th, 2015.

2.4 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 2

2.4.1 Progress of indicators

<i>Result 2: Development of Overall CC adaptation strategy</i>					
Indicators	Baseline value	Value year 2013	Value year 2014	Target year 2015	End Target
Total	990,000		3,061	330,000	
Hydrological/hydraulic study and modeling of Rao Cai river basin	580,000		3,061	330,000	
Comprehensive strategy of Climate Change for river basin	80,000				
Adjustment of overall master planning	230,000				
Establishment of prioritized action plan	100,000				

2.4.2 Progress of main activities

Progress of main activities	Progress			
	A	B	C	D
1. Climate Change modeling			x	
2. Hydro/hydraulic modeling of Rao Cai river basin			x	

2.4.3 Analysis of progress made

The operation was performed on behind the project schedule, due to: the TORs of these activities developed by consultants with not high quality, requiring many editions, and also an another separate consultant hired to develop cost estimates for these activities. To overcome this delay, the Project Steering Committee and BTC agreed to implement a number of quick-win investment activities prepared in parallel with the researches, on the principle that the final results of implementing these activities must be integrated with the results of hydraulic / hydrologic study of Rao Cai river basin.

2.5 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 3

2.5.1 Progress of indicators

Result 3 : Physical conditions, oriented to Ha Tinh city in order to increase resilience to climate change, are enhanced					
Indicators	Baseline value	Value year 2013	Value year 2014	Target year 2015	End Target
Total	3,280,000		7,580	130,000	
Mangroves restoration and expanding in Cai river	200,000		7,580	100,000	
Infrastructures for Ha Tinh city	3,000,000			30,000	
O&M measurements of the built infrastructure works	80,000				

2.5.2 Progress of main activities

Progress of main activities	Progress			
	A	B	C	D
1. Study and survey of mangroves in Rao Cai river		x		
2. Developing ToR for consultancy of planning, survey, design of Dap Bot Retention Lake	x			

2.5.3 Analysis of progress made

The activities mentioned above performed in ahead of the project schedule, in order to make up for those delayed activities under Result 2. The early implementation does not affect the progress and quality of the project as a result of investment preparation must integrate the results of hydraulic/hydrologic study of Rao Cai river basin into (i) the final investment report and; (ii) report on environmental impact assessment; (iii) The technical design of this investment, to the BTC and PPC for approval before construction bidding;

2.6 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 4

2.6.1 Progress of indicators

Result 3 : Physical conditions, oriented to Ha Tinh city in order to increase resilience to climate change, are enhanced					
Indicators	Baseline value	Value year 2013	Value year 2014	Target year 2015	End Target
Total	660,000		443	115,000	
Awareness raising of all stakeholders with an early warning system	220.000			15,000	
Establishing different corridors for dialogue with stakeholders	270.000				
Savings and credit facility to support communities to improve housing conditions and ambient conditions to improve resilience to climate change.	170.000		443	100,000	

2.6.2 Progress of main activities

Progress of implementation of main activities	Progress:			
	A	B	C	D
Establishment of Eco-house Credit Facility and its Regulation		x		

2.6.3 Analysis of progress made

The activities mentioned above have been implemented complying with the project's schedule. Ha Tinh PCU has currently been working on development of criteria/standards and sample design of Eco-house. This activity aims to poor households in need of renovating/building their house with trend of saving energy, water resources and reducing factors to climate change.

2.7 TRANSVERSAL THEMES

2.7.1 Gender

Gender balance is very important for the results and impact of development interventions and essential for enhancing effectiveness. One strategy to consider the integration of crosscutting issues in the decision-making process, from planning to evaluation and feedbacks to the new decision-making process, to review the effectiveness and impact of these decisions of PCU related to gender issues.

In recent years the project has really focused on the issue of gender balance, typical percentage of women participating in seminars, training, study tours experience reached over 30 %; In particular, Eco-house Credit Facility is under the management of the Women 's Union of Ha Tinh city. 65 % of participants were women in the meeting, for discussing about ground clearance for building Dap Bot Retention Lake, between the Project Coordination Unit, Ha Tinh city People's Committee of Ha Tinh and households, So far, the mobilization of women's participation in the project activities is entirely normal, due to:

- Ha Tinh PPC is focused on promoting ownership of women;
- Ha Tinh PCU (through previous projects) has 14 years of experience in mobilizing women to participate in the project activities, therefore involving women into project activities of IWMC hardly faced any difficulties.
- The clearly analyzing transparency, accountability, obligations and rights of women to participate in the project is a very important condition for the mobilization of women.

2.7.2 Environment

The objectives and results of project are very much related to environmental issues. Therefore, PCU Ha Tinh specially focuses on the two important fields as integrated water resources management and urban planning, through:

1. For integrated water resources management, Ha Tinh PCU pays attentions to the following aspects:
 - Through the technical and institutional capacity assessment, consultants to propose responsibilities, coordination mechanisms of the departments in the management of surface water, groundwater, and wastewater;
 - Through studies for hydro/hydraulic modeling and mangroves status in Rao Cai river basin, consultants to emphasize in the prioritized investment strategy about management of river water quality of Rao Cai river and the neighborhood rivers;
 - PCU Ha Tinh has been sent to the BTC report on the implementation of these research projects
 - Application of GIS technology to develop a database of sewerage system and trees;
 - Researches on applicable of water quality index (WIG) to assess the water quality of Rao Cai river - Ha Tinh ;
 - Research on impacts of climate change on underground water resources. Proposed solutions and storage of fresh water for the coastal rural areas of Ha Tinh;
 - Study on impacts of climate change and sea level rise affecting irrigation infrastructure in coastal communes of Cue Sot areas, Ha Tinh Province ;
- If BTC has no objections on these sub-projects, they will be implemented in 2015
2. For urban planning, PCU would focus on the following aspects:
 - Through the technical and institutional capacity assessment, consultants to propose responsibilities, coordination mechanisms of related agencies in management of green

environment urban planning;

- In the framework of project, PCU Ha Tinh builds a set of criteria/standards and template designs for eco-house adaptive to climate conditions of Ha Tinh city and energy/water effective and for a clean living environment;

- To integrate climate change issues into city planning, research consultants of hydraulic/hydrologic modeling to give a model and an inundation map corresponding to different rainfall scenarios, in order to mitigate and adapt to environmental pollution caused by flooding;

- To organize training courses and seminars on sustainable development and environmental management issues in order to give the authorities, social organizations, civil society and the private sector a common slogan of "green environment" and "green culture" in accordance with the particular context and potentials of the area.

2.7.3 Other

2.8 RISK MANAGEMENT

Risk Identification			Risk analysis			Risk Treatment			Follow-up of risk	
Description of Risk	Period of identification	Risk category	Probability	Potential impact	Total	Actions	Responsible	Deadlines	Progress	Status
Issuances of approvals and decisions of BTC and PPC are slow	Implementation	OPS	High	High	High				Solved in the second meeting of PSC (12/01/2015)	
						Quickly processing Puce's recommendations	BTC & PPC	30/6/2015		
POM is not yet in place	Implementation	JUR	Low	High	Medium				On-going	
						BTC supports in developing POM	BTC	30/6/2015		
Existing data not accurate, up-to-date and/nor made available		OPS	Medium	Medium	Medium	Capacity building of the related departments.	PCU	30/12/2016	On-going	
						Share data and information at the beginning of the project	TSU-PCU	30/6/2015	On-going	
						Use experience from CAPAS project	TSU-PCU	30/6/2015	Yet to execute	

3 STEERING AND LEARNING

3.1 STRATEGIC RE-ORIENTATIONS

The project has just been implemented for 15 months and currently in the research phase and preparing the legal procedures for operation, there has not yet been concrete results therefore the issue of strategic re-orientations is not considered at this stage.

3.2 RECOMMENDATIONS

The project has just been implemented for 15 months and currently in the research phase and preparing the legal procedures for operation. Therefore, we have not had any recommendations yet.

Recommendations	Actor	Deadline
<i>Description of the recommendations</i>	<i>The actor responsible for (dis)approving the recommendation</i>	<i>e.g. Q1, Q2, Q3 or Q4 of year N+1</i>

3.3 LESSONS LEARNED

The project has just been implemented for 15 months and currently in the research phase and preparing the legal procedures for operation, there has not yet been concrete results for lessons learned.

Lessons learned	Target audience
<i>Description of the lesson learned.</i>	The audience that may be interested in the lesson learned. (intervention, Representation, BTC HQ department, partner department...).

4 ANNEXES

4.1 QUALITY CRITERIA

1. RELEVANCE: The degree to which the intervention is in line with local and national policies and priorities as well as with the expectations of the beneficiaries				
<i>In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as follows: 'At least one 'A', no 'C' or 'D' = A; Two times 'B' = B; At least one 'C', no 'D' = C; at least one 'D' = D</i>				
Assessment RELEVANCE: total score	A	B	C	D
1.1 What is the present level of relevance of the intervention?				
X	A	Clearly still embedded in national policies and Belgian strategy, responds to aid effectiveness commitments, highly relevant to needs of target group.		
	B	Still fits well in national policies and Belgian strategy (without always being explicit), reasonably compatible with aid effectiveness commitments, relevant to target group's needs.		
	C	Some issues regarding consistency with national policies and Belgian strategy, aid effectiveness or relevance.		
	D	Contradictions with national policies and Belgian strategy, aid efficiency commitments; relevance to needs is questionable. Major adaptations needed.		
1.2 As presently designed, is the intervention logic still holding true?				
X	A	Clear and well-structured intervention logic; feasible and consistent vertical logic of objectives; adequate indicators; Risks and Assumptions clearly identified and managed; exit strategy in place (if applicable).		
	B	Adequate intervention logic although it might need some improvements regarding hierarchy of objectives, indicators, Risk and Assumptions.		
	C	Problems with intervention logic may affect performance of intervention and capacity to monitor and evaluate progress; improvements necessary.		
	D	Intervention logic is faulty and requires major revision for the intervention to have a chance of success.		

2. EFFICIENCY OF IMPLEMENTATION TO DATE: Degree to which the resources of the intervention (funds, expertise, time, etc.) have been converted into results in an economical way				
<i>In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as follows: 'At least two 'A', no 'C' or 'D' = A; Two times 'B', no 'C' or 'D' = B; at least one 'C', no 'D' = C; at least one 'D' = D</i>				
Assessment EFFICIENCY : total score	A	B	C	D
2.1 How well are inputs (financial, HR, goods & equipment) managed?				
X	A	All inputs are available on time and within budget.		
	B	Most inputs are available in reasonable time and do not require substantial budget adjustments. However there is room for improvement.		

	C	Availability and usage of inputs face problems, which need to be addressed; otherwise results may be at risk.
	D	Availability and management of inputs have serious deficiencies, which threaten the achievement of results. Substantial change is needed.
2.2 How well is the implementation of activities managed?		
	A	Activities implemented on schedule
X	B	Most activities are on schedule. Delays exist, but do not harm the delivery of outputs
	C	Activities are delayed. Corrections are necessary to deliver without too much delay.
	D	Serious delay. Outputs will not be delivered unless major changes in planning.
2.3 How well are outputs achieved?		
X	A	All outputs have been and most likely will be delivered as scheduled with good quality contributing to outcomes as planned.
	B	Output delivery is and will most likely be according to plan, but there is room for improvement in terms of quality, coverage and timing.
	C	Some output are/will be not delivered on time or with good quality. Adjustments are necessary.
	D	Quality and delivery of outputs has and most likely will have serious deficiencies. Major adjustments are needed to ensure that at least the key outputs are delivered on time.

3. EFFECTIVENESS TO DATE: Degree to which the outcome (Specific Objective) is achieved as planned at the end of year N

The project has just been implemented for 15 months and currently in the research phase and preparing the legal procedures for operation, there are not concrete results to be assessed.

In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as follows: 'At least one 'A', no 'C' or 'D' = A; Two times 'B' = B; At least one 'C', no 'D' = C; at least one 'D' = D

Assessment	A	B	C	D
EFFECTIVENESS : total score				

3.1 As presently implemented what is the likelihood of the outcome to be achieved?

	A	Full achievement of the outcome is likely in terms of quality and coverage. Negative effects (if any) have been mitigated.
	B	Outcome will be achieved with minor limitations; negative effects (if any) have not caused much harm.
	C	Outcome will be achieved only partially among others because of negative effects to which management was not able to fully adapt. Corrective measures have to be taken to improve ability to achieve outcome.
	D	The intervention will not achieve its outcome unless major, fundamental measures are taken.

3.2 Are activities and outputs adapted (when needed), in order to achieve the outcome?

	A	The intervention is successful in adapting its strategies / activities and outputs to changing external conditions in order to achieve the outcome. Risks and assumptions are managed in a proactive manner.
--	----------	--

B	The intervention is relatively successful in adapting its strategies to changing external conditions in order to achieve its outcome. Risks management is rather passive.
C	The intervention has not entirely succeeded in adapting its strategies to changing external conditions in a timely or adequate manner. Risk management has been rather static. An important change in strategies is necessary in order to ensure the intervention can achieve its outcome.
D	The intervention has failed to respond to changing external conditions, risks were insufficiently managed. Major changes are needed to attain the outcome.

4. POTENTIAL SUSTAINABILITY: The degree of likelihood to maintain and reproduce the benefits of an intervention in the long run (beyond the implementation period of the intervention).

The project has just been implemented for 15 months and currently in the research phase and preparing the legal procedures for operation, there are not concrete results to be assessed.

In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as follows: At least 3 'A's, no 'C' or 'D' = A ; Maximum two 'C's, no 'D' = B; At least three 'C's, no 'D' = C ; At least one 'D' = D

A	B	C	D
Assessment POTENTIAL SUSTAINABILITY : total score			

4.1 Financial/economic viability?

A	Financial/economic sustainability is potentially very good: costs for services and maintenance are covered or affordable; external factors will not change that.
B	Financial/economic sustainability is likely to be good, but problems might arise namely from changing external economic factors.
C	Problems need to be addressed regarding financial sustainability either in terms of institutional or target groups costs or changing economic context.
D	Financial/economic sustainability is very questionable unless major changes are made.

4.2 What is the level of ownership of the intervention by target groups and will it continue after the end of external support?

A	The steering committee and other relevant local structures are strongly involved in all stages of implementation and are committed to continue producing and using results.
B	Implementation is based in a good part on the steering committee and other relevant local structures, which are also somewhat involved in decision-making. Likelihood of sustainability is good, but there is room for improvement.
C	The intervention uses mainly ad-hoc arrangements and the steering committee and other relevant local structures to ensure sustainability. Continued results are not guaranteed. Corrective measures are needed.
D	The intervention depends completely on ad-hoc structures with no prospect of sustainability. Fundamental changes are needed to enable sustainability.

4.3 What is the level of policy support provided and the degree of interaction between intervention and policy level?

A	Policy and institutions have been highly supportive of intervention and will continue to be so.
B	Policy and policy enforcing institutions have been generally supportive, or at least have not hindered the intervention, and are likely to continue to be so.
C	Intervention sustainability is limited due to lack of policy support. Corrective

	measures are needed.
D	Policies have been and likely will be in contradiction with the intervention. Fundamental changes needed to make intervention sustainable.
4.4 How well is the intervention contributing to institutional and management capacity?	
A	Intervention is embedded in institutional structures and has contributed to improve the institutional and management capacity (even if this is not an explicit goal).
B	Intervention management is well embedded in institutional structures and has somewhat contributed to capacity building. Additional expertise might be required. Improvements in order to guarantee sustainability are possible.
C	Intervention relies too much on ad-hoc structures instead of institutions; capacity building has not been sufficient to fully ensure sustainability. Corrective measures are needed.
D	Intervention is relying on ad hoc and capacity transfer to existing institutions, which could guarantee sustainability, is unlikely unless fundamental changes are undertaken.

4.2 DECISIONS BY THE STEERING COMMITTEE AND FOLLOW-UP

4.3 UPDATED LOGICAL FRAMEWORK

Not appropriate to update logical framework at this stage.

4.4 MoRe Results AT GLANCE

Logical framework's results or indicators modified in last 12 months?	M&E system is being developed therefore there is no modification of logical framework's results.
Baseline Report registered on PIT?	Non
Planning MTR (registration of report)	September 2016 (estimate)
Planning ETR (registration of report)	September 2016 (estimate)
Backstopping missions since 01/01/2012	Project staff joined 2 MoRe Results training courses: April 21-25 (5 days) and May 27-30, 2014 (4 days)

4.5 BUDGET REPORT

BUDGET REPORT UP 31/12/2014

M	Activities	FIN mod e	Budget	Belgium	Vietnam	Figure in: EURO					
						Disbursement of the first year		Balance			
						BEL	VN	BEL	VN		
A	Specific objective: "To support the institutional capacity in Ha Tinh Province in integrated water resources		6.847.800	6.335.000	512.800	113.003	0	6.221.997	512.800		
A	1		1.405.000	1.405.000	0	101.919	0	1.303.081	0		
A	1	1	Capacity building for PCU in project management, procurement, M&E and reporting	OM	240.000	240.000		32.935		207.065	
A	1	2	Need assessment of capacity and institutional techniques	PM	50.000	50.000				50.000	
A	1	3	Specific CC, IWRM and urban management CD activities for province, line agencies and stakeholders	PM	340.000	340.000		30.308		309.692	
A	1	4	Strengthening cooperation/collaboration mechanism between relevant agencies on CC, IWRM and urban planning issues	PM	110.000	110.000				110.000	
A	1	5	Data collection (including baseline survey)	PM	255.000	255.000				255.000	
A	1	6	Supporting to hydrological and meteorological monitoring stations	PM	210.000	210.000		33.611		176.389	
A	1	7	Comprehensive data management with GIS	PM	100.000	100.000				100.000	
A	1	8	Communication and experience/lesson learnt sharing	PM	100.000	100.000		5.065		94.935	
A	2		Result 2: Developing comprehensive CC	PM	990.000	990.000	0	3.061	0	986.939	0

M	Activities	FIN mod e	Budget	Belgium	Vietnam	Disbursement of the first year		Balance	
	<i>strategy</i>								
A 2	1 Comprehensive studies and modeling the Rao Cai river basin		580.000	580.000		3.061		576.939	
A 2	2 Support to revision of participatory CC strategy basing on study results		80.000	80.000				80.000	
A 2	3 Revision of master plan of Ha Tinh city and urbanized areas basing on CC strategy and SSP principles		230.000	230.000				230.000	
A 2	4 Prioritized action plan, methodologies, tools, processes and consultancy		100.000	100.000				100.000	
A 3	Result 3: Priority strategic pilot activities are developed for lessons learned targeting Tinh city to increase resilience to CC, with appropriate operational and maintenance mode	PM	3.792.800	3.280.000	512.800	7.580	0	3.272.420	512.800
A 3	1 Mangrove extension and reforestation		200.000	200.000		7.580		192.420	0
A 3	2 Prioritized investments for Ha Tinh city		3.512.800	3.000.000	512.800			3.000.000	512.800
A 3	3 Supports to suitable M&O measures		80.000	80.000				80.000	0
A 4	Result 4: Active involvement of the communities and the private sector		660.000	660.000	0	443	0	659.557	0
A 4	1 Awareness raising for all stakeholders relevant to CC issues and early warning system		220.000	220.000				220.000	
A 4	2 Establish Rao Cai basin forum with participation of key stakeholders		270.000	270.000				270.000	
A 4	3 Credit and saving communities to improve housing situations adaptable to CC		170.000	170.000		443		169.557	
X	Contingency		304.500	304.500	0	0	0	304.500	0
X 1	Contingency		304.500	304.500	0	0	0	304.500	0

M			Activities	FIN mod e	Budget	Belgium	Vietnam	Disbursement of the first year		Balance	
X	1	1	PM contingency	PM	254.500	254.500					
X	1	2	PM contingency	OM	50.000	50.000					
Z			Vehicles		1.647.700	1.160.500	487.200	55.703	77.310	1.104.797	409.890
Z	I		Personnel		1.099.400	712.200	387.200	9.125	60.778	703.075	326.422
Z	1	1	Technical Assistance specifically for the province	OM	431.000	381.000	50.000	119	1.174	380.881	48.826
			National technical assistant on water management and TSU liaison officer		180.000	180.000				180.000	0
			National community and communication specialist		36.000	36.000				36.000	0
			Independent quality control consultancy for second opinion		70.000	70.000				70.000	0
			Provision for consultancy specific to the province needs		50.000	50.000		119		49.881	0
			Provision for national consultancy for VN procedures	NA	50.000		50.000		1.174	0	48.826
			Legal advice		45.000	45.000				45.000	0
Z		I	PCU staff	PM	668.400	331.200	337.200	9.006	59.604	322.194	277.596
			Allowance to part-time Project Director (funded by PPC)		21.600		21.600		3.600	0	18.000
			Allowance to full-time Project Deputy Director, expert in water management and M&E		36.000		36.000		6.000	0	30.000
			Allowance to collaborators from other departments		21.600		21.600		3.600	0	18.000
			CC and environment officer		50.400	50.400				50.400	0
			Data management, GIS & IT expert		72.000	72.000				72.000	0
			Urban planning officer		50.400	50.400				50.400	0
			Hydro-Met officer		50.400	50.400				50.400	0
			Financial Manager		50.400		50.400		7.400	0	43.000

Figure in: EURO

M	Activities	FIN mod e	Budget	Belgium	Vietnam	Disbursement of the first year		Balance	
	Accounting and Administrative assistant		36.000		36.000		4.600	0	31.400
	Translators		108.000	108.000		9.006		98.994	0
	Driver		21.600		21.600		2.400	0	19.200
	Salaries for other PCU staff		150.000		150.000		32.004	0	117.996
Z 2	Investments	PM	57.200	57.200	0	39.283	0	17.917	0
Z 2 1	Vehicles		31.000	31.000		31.337		-337	0
Z 2 2	Office equipment		4.500	4.500		1.129		3.371	0
Z 2 3	IT equipment		16.700	16.700		6.817		9.883	0
Z 2 4	Office rehabilitation & LAN installation		5.000	5.000				5.000	0
Z 3	Operational cost	PM	343.600	243.600	100.000	4.782	16.532	238.818	83.468
Z 3 1	Office rent				Actual costs			0	
Z 3 2	Facilities		21.600	21.600				21.600	0
Z 3 3	Vehicle operational cost		36.000	36.000				36.000	0
Z 3 4	Communication and internet		18.000	18.000				18.000	0
Z 3 5	Operational cost		57.600	57.600		4.782		52.818	0
Z 3 6	Flights and per diem (to attend to TSU activities)		84.000	84.000				84.000	0
Z 3 7	Representation cost		14.400	14.400				14.400	0
Z 3 8	Provincial Steering Committee		12.000	12.000				12.000	0
Z 3 9	Other expenditures relevant to operational activities financed by counterpart fund				100.000		16.532	0	83.468
Z 4	Audit, follow-up and evaluation	OM	147.500	147.500	0	2.513	0	144.987	0
Z 4 1	Backstopping		12.500	12.500		2.513		9.987	0
Z 4 2	Audit		55.000	55.000				55.000	0
Z 4 3	MTR, Final evaluation cooperation with TSU and other 2 provinces		80.000	80.000				80.000	0
TOTAL				7.800.000	1.000.000	168.706	77.310	7.631.294	922.690

Figure in: EURO

M	Activities	FIN mod e	Budget	Belgium	Vietnam	Figure in: EURO	
						Disbursement of the first year	
				818.500		35.567	
				6.981.500		133.139	77.310

4.6 SOURCES OF INFORMATION

1. Technical and Financial Files of “Integrated water resources management and urban development in relation to Climate change in Ha Tinh province”;
2. Project Document of “Integrated water resources management and urban development in relation to Climate change in Ha Tinh province”;
3. Implementation report of 2014 and AWP &B of 2015 of “Integrated water resources management and urban development in relation to Climate change in Ha Tinh province”;
4. The minutes of first meeting of PSC dated on 22/10/2013;
5. Contents of second meeting of PSC dated on 12/01/2015.