



BTC VIETNAM

RESULTS REPORT 2015

PROJECT INTEGRATED WATER MANAGEMENT AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT IN RELATION TO CLIMATE CHANGE IN NINH THUAN PROVINCE VIE 11 040 11



January, 2016

TABLE OF CONTENT

1	INTERVENTION AT A GLANCE	4
	1.1 INTERVENTION FORM:.....	5
	1.2 BUDGET EXECUTION.....	6
	1.3 SELF ASSESSMENT PERFORMANCE	6
	1.3.1 Relevance.....	6
	1.3.2 Efficiency	6
	1.3.3 Effectiveness	7
	1.3.4 Potential sustainability	7
	1.4 CONCLUSION	8
2	RESULTS MONITORING	9
	2.1 EVOLUTION OF THE CONTEXT.....	9
	2.1.1 General context.....	9
	2.1.2 Institutional context	9
	2.1.3 Management context: execution modalities.....	9
	2.1.4 Harmo context.....	9
	2.2 PERFORMANCE OUTCOME.....	10
	2.2.1 Progress of indicators	10
	2.2.2 Analysis of progress made.....	10
	2.2.3 Potential Impact	10
	2.3 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 1.....	11
	2.3.1 Progress of indicators	11
	2.3.2 Progress of main activities	11
	2.3.3 Analysis of progress made.....	12
	2.4 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 2.....	12
	2.4.1 Progress of indicators	12
	2.4.2 Progress of main activities	12
	2.4.3 Analysis of progress made.....	12
	2.5 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 3.....	13
	2.5.1 Progress of indicators	13
	2.5.2 Progress of main activities	13
	2.5.3 Analysis of progress made.....	13
	2.6 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 4.....	14
	2.6.1 Progress of indicators	14
	2.6.2 Progress of main activities	14
	2.6.3 Analysis of progress made.....	14
	2.7 TRANSVERSAL THEMES.....	15
	2.7.1 Gender.....	15
	2.7.2 Environment.....	15
	2.8 RISK MANAGEMENT.....	16
3	STEERING AND LEARNING	17
	3.1 STRATEGIC RE-ORIENTATIONS.....	17
	3.2 RECOMMENDATIONS.....	17
	3.3 LESSONS LEARNT.....	17
4	ANNEXES	18
	4.1 QUALITY CRITERIA.....	18
	4.2 DECISIONS TAKEN BY THE STEERING COMMITTEE AND FOLLOW-UP.....	21
	4.3 UPDATED LOGICAL FRAMEWORK.....	24
	4.4 MORE RESULTS AT A GLANCE.....	24
	4.5 BUDGET VERSUS CURRENT (Y – M) REPORT.....	24
	4.6 COMMUNICATION RESOURCES.....	24
	4.7 BASELINE WORKPLAN.....	24

ACRONYMS

BTC	<i>Belgium Development Agency</i>
CC	<i>Climate change</i>
ETR	<i>End-term Review</i>
FS	<i>Flexibility Study</i>
IWRM	<i>Integrated Water Resource Management</i>
IT	<i>Information Technology</i>
GIS	<i>Geography Information System</i>
M&E	<i>Monitoring and Evaluation</i>
MCDU	<i>Management and Capacity Development Unit</i>
MTR	<i>Mid-Term Review</i>
n/a	<i>Not available</i>
NOL	<i>Non Objection Letter</i>
O&M	<i>Operation and Maintenance</i>
PCU	<i>Project Cooperation Unit</i>
PIT	<i>Report sharing system within National office and Belgium Headquarter</i>
POM	<i>Project Operation Manual</i>
PSC	<i>Project Steering Committee</i>
tbc	<i>to be confirmed</i>
TICA	<i>Technical and Institutional Capacity Assessment</i>
TFF	<i>Technical and Financial File</i>
ToR	<i>Terms of Reference</i>
TSU	<i>Technical Support Unit</i>
WB	<i>World Bank</i>

1 INTERVENTION AT A GLANCE

Human resource

The PCU includes 8 staff members

1. Director;
2. Deputy director
3. Interpreter.
4. IT expert
5. CC and environment officer;
6. Data management and GIS expert;
7. Secretary;
8. Accountant.

Logistics

The PPC has allocated working premises for the project (according to document 2224/QĐ-UBND dated 09/10/2015).

Working equipment and vehicles have been bought.

Major events

On 28/01/2015 – 2nd PSC meeting: Mr. Vo Ngoc Minh was appointed as Deputy Director. In addition, Dam Nai was excluded from project scope.

From 22-24/4/2015, Ian Wood was introduced as the international coordinator

On 05/9/2015 – 3rd PSC meeting: the investments of an eco-house and siphons were agreed to be conducted

From 08-10/12/2015, a workshop was held to get agreement on project baseline workplan

1.1 Intervention form:

Intervention title	Integrated water resources management and urban planning in relation to climate change in Ninh Thuan province
Intervention code	VIE1104011
Location	Ninh Thuan province
Total budget	9,5 mil EUR
Partner Institution	People's Committee of Ninh Thuan Province
Start date Specific Agreement	20/6/2013
Date intervention start /Opening steering committee	5/11/ 2013
Planned end date of execution period	19/6/2019
End date Specific Agreement	19/6/2020
Target groups	Poor people less resilient to climate change
Impact¹/ Global objective	To contribute to the sustainable development of Ninh Thuan province
Outcome/ Specific Objective	To support the institutional capacity in Ninh Thuan Province in integrated water resources management and urban development in relation to Climate Change
Outputs/ Results	Result 1. The capacity of the authorities of the province and Phan Rang – Thap Cham city in terms of Climate Change, Integrated Water Resources Management and urban planning are improved with appropriate monitoring and evaluation mechanisms in place.
	Result 2. A comprehensive strategy on CC is in place. It is based on various studies, including CC data and hydraulic modelling focused on operational impact on settlements of Dinh river catchment and the revision of the existing master plans of Phan Rang city and its hinterland, with a focus on Dam Nai lake and Dinh river mouth, while key priorities of the CC action plan of the Dinh river basin are defined.
	Result 3. Priority strategic pilot activities are developed for lessons learned targeting either Dam Nai lake or-Dinh river mouth areas to increase resilience to CC, with appropriate operational and maintenance modalities.
	Result 4. The provincial CC strategy is supported by the active involvement of the communities and the private sector.
Year covered by the report	2015

¹ Impact refers to global objective, Outcome refers to specific objective, output refers to expected result

1.2 Budget execution

Unit: EUR

content	Budget	Expenditure			Balances	Disbursement rate at the end of year (%)
		Previous years		Year covered by report		
		2013	2014	2015		
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)=((2)+(3)+(4))/(1)*100
Total	8,000,000	1,193	127,808	359,835	7,511,165	6.11
Output1	1,335,000		20,500	136,952	1,177,548	11.79
Output2	1,140,000		7,556	88,842	1,043,649	8.45
Output3	3,400,000				3,400,000	
Output4	710,000		11,481	27,338	671,180	5.47
Contingencies	304,900				304,900	
General means	1,110,100	1,193	88,270	106,750	913,887	17.68

1.3 Self assessment performance

1.3.1 Relevance

The degree to which the intervention is in line with local and national policies and priorities as well as with the expectations of the beneficiaries	Performance
The degree of relevance fits in the national policy framework and Belgium's strategy, satisfies commitments on aid effectiveness, close to the target group's demand. However, the indicators in the logical framework is quite general.	A

The project's objective is relevant to Ninh Thuan's socio-economic development objective towards 2020, namely "to turn Ninh Thuan into Vietnam's future destination, having consistent infrastructure, open business environment, adaptive to climate change and disaster". However, there were some adjustments/clarifications of indicators in the logical framework in 2015.

1.3.2 Efficiency

<i>Degree to which the resources of the intervention (funds, expertise, time, etc.) have been converted into results in an economical way.</i>	Performance
Most inputs have been mobilized in a timely manner and no sustainable budget adjustments are necessary. Activities have been implemented as scheduled while some improvements were made.	B

The study on early warning system is important to the province and needs more funding. Therefore, in 2014, PCU incorporated some budget lines for conducting the study.

Baseline survey has not been conducted due to the time-consuming process of ToR approval. Time for hydraulic/hydrological study for Dinh River was reduced from 15 to 12 months to ensure progress of pilot investments.

1.3.3 Effectiveness

Degree to which the outcome (Specific Objective) is achieved as planned at the end of year 2015

	Performance
The project was relatively successful in adapting strategies to the changing context to achieve the specific objectives.	B

There were a change made in 2015 that pilot investments were implemented in parallel with studies to ensure project progress.

1.3.4 Potential sustainability

The degree of likelihood to maintain and reproduce the benefits of an intervention in the long run (beyond the implementation period of the intervention).

	Performance
<p>The degree of financial/economic sustainability of the project may be high but some problems may arise from the changes of external factors.</p> <p>Project progress is based on the Steering Committee and local relevant agencies involved in the decision-making process. The project's sustainability is satisfactory, though it may be improved more.</p> <p>The project is too dependent and structures are short-term one instead of long-term mechanisms; capacity building has not been conducted in a satisfactory way to ensure its sustainability. Improvements are needed.</p>	B

Pilot investments are expected to be handed over to local authorities for management, with annual local budget for operation and maintenance. However, local budget may not be sufficient for this activity.

Staff transfer may affect the continuity of activities after project closure. To minimize this risk, the project is working hard to provide training to all levels in an organization.

The local authorities are currently in needs of capacity building in water & urban management, however, TICA study has not been finalized yet to play a role in improvement.

1.4 Conclusion

In 2015, in the close cooperation with stakeholders, the donor and experts, PCU successfully carried out the following activities: strengthening the cooperation between TSU and PCU through technical support and joint working sessions; an overall work plan was made and TOR for studies were approved.

Also in the same year, some activities were not implemented due to delays in approval of plans/ToRs. In 2016, emphasis should be made on boosting the cooperation among stakeholders, more specific and clearer planning, accelerating progress of activities executed as planned.

PP. Director
Vice Director



Vo Ngoc Minh

Resident Representative
of BTC Vietnam

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'Alain Devaux', is written over the text.

Alain Devaux

2 RESULTS MONITORING

2.1 Evolution of the context

2.1.1 General context

It can be said that 2015 was the year when Ninh Thuan suffered from extreme drought. The Prime Minister and many central missions, WB missions paid visits to the province to overview the situation for urgent financial support for hunger prevention. The provincial authority also conducted a series of investments for water supply.

2.1.2 Institutional context

The irrigation master plan is being reviewed towards 2020. No differences with TFF were found.

2.1.3 Management context: execution modalities.

One of the PSC chairman was changed due to retirement, a new provincial vice chairman of the PPC was temporarily appointed to replace and the project is waiting for an official decision.

POM was basically finalized, however, it has not been approved, which leads to confusion whether UN-EU or Circular 219/2009/TT-BTC (promulgating cost norms applicable to projects/programs funded by official development assistance funding) is applicable to some certain activities.

7 staff of the PCU has been recruited.

2.1.4 Harmo context

In 2015, BTC and TSU provided timely support in implementing studies. The cooperation between PCU and stakeholders is quite good. PCU has organized meetings to clarify project management responsibilities with stakeholders, accordingly, officials from these agencies were appointed to join the project's technical advisory team. A submission on establishment of the team has been submitted to the PPC by DoHA.

2.2 Performance Outcome



2.2.1 Progress of indicators

Indicators	Baseline value	Value 2014	Value 2015	Target 2015	End Target
Number of trained stakeholders or trained staff who contribute newly acquired CC knowledge to decision-making processes	tbc	0	0	n/a	tbc
Number of trained stakeholders or trained staff who contribute newly acquired CC knowledge to decision-making processes	0	n/a	0	n/a	tbc
Percentage of provincial budget invested in activities related to Climate Change	tbc	n/a	0,07%	n/a	tbc
Measurable increase in institutional capacity with respect to assessment criteria from the TICA	TICA will announce baseline values	n/a	n/a	n/a	No target needed

2.2.2 Analysis of progress made

Throughout the year, activities have been accelerated thanks to the support from TSU and BTC experts. Assistance requests from PCU were considered and commented as per actual situation, for example, some activities have not been implemented in the year as planned, i.e A0202- Developing CC adaptation action plan was cancelled as BTC and TSU experts agreed that instead of conducting the time-consuming process of documents approval, consultant selection, PCU should have prior discussion in implementation modalities and preparation of ToR. Simultaneously, the approval process of proposals is also more quickly than in 2014.

2.2.3 Potential Impact

Not seen yet

2.3 Performance Output 1



2.3.1 Progress of indicators

Indicators	Baseline value	Value 2014	Value 2015	Target 2015	End Target
Number of staff trained on climate change, integrated water resource management and/or urban development	0	62	0	tbc	TICA will announce baseline values
Average change in scores on entry and exit tests	0	n/a	0	tbc	tbc
Appropriate equipment and software systems are in place	0	0	0	0	tbc
Responsiveness of data (CC-IWRM & UD) management system to the provincial users	0	0	0	0	tbc
Coordination and communication mechanism responds to the knowledge management need of the provincial authorities	0	0	tbc	tbc	tbc
New and relevant information is available from the expanded hydrological & meteorological monitoring network	0	0	0	0	tbc

2.3.2 Progress of main activities

Progress of main activities	Progress			
	A	B	C	D
Training/ Education for PCU member in project management		x		
Project Operational Manual				x
Needs assessment on technical and institutional capacity about water resources management, urban development and Climate change		x		
Performing training activities in water resources management, climate change and urban development for relevant agencies.	x			
Organizing study tours in foreign countries		x		
Connecting with research institutes/centres		x		
Establishing Project Technical Advisory team.			x	
Implementing socio-economic survey for the project				x
Provision of equipment for hydro-meteorologic monitoring station				
Building GIS system		x		

2.3.3 Analysis of progress made

Proactively proposing priority capacity building activities to the donor and competent agencies, then implementing them after approval during the early stage of the project in order to equip project staff and stakeholders with update knowledge and skills for project implementation. Other capacity building activities are to be continued after implementation of TICA study. **2.4 Performance Output 2**



2.4.1 Progress of indicators

Indicators	Baseline value	Value 2014	Value 2015	Target 2015	End Target
No. of conducted research	0	0	0	0	4
A CC adaptation action plan is approved	0	0	0	0	1
Master plans (provincial, cities/town) revised with regard to CC	0	0	0	0	
Prioritised proposals on CC are developed	0	0	0	0	tbc

2.4.2 Progress of main activities

Progress of main activities	Progress			
	A	B	C	D
Develop CC downscaling model for Ninh Thuan province.		X		
Develop hydraulic model for Dinh River.		X		
Salinity impact study		X		
Building comprehensive strategy for Climate Change response				
Revising master plan for Phan Rang – Thap Cham city				
Building priority action plan for Climate Change adaptation				
Selecting pilot investments	X			

2.4.3 Analysis of progress made

PCU had some suggestions on ensuring the achievement of result 2:

- Following project design, the study on climate scenario downscaling for Ninh Thuan province will be conducted and once finished, it will provide input database for hydraulic/hydrological study on Dinh river. However, not until the beginning of 2015 did the project start to perform research activity and until the end of 2015, the 02 studies were carried out so BTC has approved the proposal of PCU to conduct them in parallel.

- As planned, pilot investments are selected only after the studies on Dinh river basin were completed. However, as the project must be finished before June 2019 and it takes quite a long time to carry out investments (particularly for construction works, which may be affected by stormy weather). Therefore, after taking a field trip, BTC and TSU experts have flexibly approved the simultaneous implementation of pilot investments and studies, necessary revisions for pilot investment will be made later based on studies' results.

2.5 Performance Output 3



2.5.1 Progress of indicators

Indicators	Baseline value	Value 2014	Value 2015	Target 2015	End Target
No of (pilot) investments implemented, complying with CC adaptation specifications	0	0	0	0	3
Effective O&M is implemented for each priority investment	0	0	0	0	3
No. of lessons-learned documents prepared on innovative features of the priority investments and of other aspects of the Project	0	0	tbc	n/a	tbc
No. of new households benefiting from pilot activities	0	0	0	0	tbc

2.5.2 Progress of main activities

Progress of main activities	Progress			
	A	B	C	D
Upgrade & repair siphons	x			
Cau Ngoi channel reinforcement	x			
Build an eco-house model demonstrating CC response measures	x			
Develop O & M mechanisms for 03 pilot investments				

2.5.3 Analysis of progress made

Under process of FS fulfillment

2.6 Performance Output 4



2.6.1 Progress of indicators

Indicators	Baseline value	Value 2014	Value 2015	Target 2015	End Target
A public CC awareness raising strategy is developed	0	0	0	0	1
A disaster early warning system is developed	0	0	0	0	1
No. of beneficiaries of newly upgraded CC resilient houses	0	0	0	0	tbc
No. of new households participating in CC credit program	0	0	0	0	tbc
No. of people participating in newly established committees	0	0	0	0	tbc
Sample evidence of attempts to involve communities and/or private sector	0	0	10	No target needed	No target needed
Sample evidence of changed behaviour due to increased awareness	0	0	n/a	No target needed	No target needed

2.6.2 Progress of main activities

Main activities	Progress			
	A	B	C	D
The propaganda activities to raise public awareness		X		
Develop early flood warning system		X		
Establish river basin committee		X		
CC resilient housing credit fund			X	

2.6.3 Analysis of progress made

- In 2015, there have not been many communication activities conducted but mostly the publication of communication materials (including desk calendars & handbags). On December 29, TSU communication experts discussed and agreed with the PCU on project communication plan framework for 7 targeted communication groups. PCU has been elaborating this plan.
- TSU and PCU discussed on establishment of river basin committee.
- The operational manual for CC resilient housing credit fund has been submitted to BTC for NoL.

2.7 Transversal themes

2.7.1 Gender

Gender has always been addressed in studies and project decisions. This issue was brought to the Terms of Reference of the hydraulic studies, especially the social-economic survey also included a gender perspective.

Training and communication activities were implemented taken into account the participation, benefit of children, women, ethnic minorities.

2.7.2 Environment

Environment is the key transversal theme of the programme, its aim is to promote sustainable urban development and more resilient cities.

Currently the project is in the study phase, namely being done to study of river hydrodynamics in Dinh river under the impact of climate change, support the province tackle flooding in Phan Rang - Thap Cham residential areas, thus contributing to management of waste water causing environmental pollution.

2.8 Risk management

Risk identification			Risk analysis			Risk Treatment			Follow-up of risks	
Description of Risk	Period of identification	Risk category	Probability	Potential Impact	Total	Action(s)	Resp.	Deadline	Progress	Status
Responsibilities of TSU, BTC and PCU has not been clear.	Quarter II/2014	REP	High	Medium	High Risk	Organization of meeting between TSU, BTC and PCU	BTC	Dec 14		Terminated
The PSC did not make the decision in a timely manner (through the Steering Committee meeting's minutes)	Quarter II/2014	REP	Medium	Medium	Medium Risk	BTC is requested to promptly handle pcu's proposals.	BTC			Terminated
TSU does not provide expert timely	Quarter II/2014	REP	Medium	Medium	Medium Risk	Hold a meeting to agree on project timeline for timely provision of experts	TSU			Terminated
Project Operation Manual is not issued in a timely manner.	Quarter II/2014	OPS	Medium	Low	Low Risk		BTC	March 2016	BTC is preparing POM.	In progress
Slow recruitment of project assistants	Quarter IV/2014	REP	Medium	Medium	Medium Risk	Promptly provide input on PCU's personnel proposals	BTC	June 2015	BTC has issued NOL for some positions.	Terminated
TFF doesn't match Ninh Thuan's reality (research in Dam Nai lake should be excluded)	Quarter I/2015	DEV	Medium	Medium	Medium Risk	Hold a meeting to revise the TFF.	BTC	July 2015	BTC has agreed to exclude Dam Nai from project scope (as per 2nd PSC meeting minutes)	Terminated
Change of a PSC chairman representing the province	Quarter III/2015	OPS	Medium	Low	Low Risk	Appoint alternative personnel	PPC			In progress
Substitute studies do not follow findings of previous ones	Quarter III/2015	DEV	Low	High	Medium Risk	Specify clearly in ToRs for studies	PCU			Terminated

3 STEERING AND LEARNING

3.1 Strategic re-orientations

No changes was found. However, the project must end by 30/6/2019.

Due to devaluation of EUR currency, the total budget (in Vietnam dong) has decreased by 12.5%. This will affect the accomplishment of outputs.

3.2 Recommendations

Recommendations	Actor	Deadline
PCU needs to boost cooperation with BTC and TSU to ensure project progress.	PCU	2016
Work plan needs to be made in a practical manner	PCU	2016
The provincial PSC needs to hold meetings regularly (twice per year)	PCU	2016
PCU needs to boost cooperation with BTC and TSU to ensure project progress.	PCU	2016
As informed recently, the project must close by 30/6/2019, as a result, expected activities specified in the TFF should be reviewed soon so as to find out infeasible, unpractical activities or those that may lead to delays in project closure and adjust or replace them with new ones.	PCU	2016

3.3 Lessons learnt

Lessons learnt	Target audience
The clarification of responsibility of relevant PCUs under 01 program has accelerated project implementation progress.	BTC, PCU
The missions of TSU, with the participation of BTC for face-to-face discussions on PCU's difficulties has boosted the coordination in project implementation.	BTC, PCU

4 ANNEXES

4.1 Quality criteria

1. RELEVANCE: The degree to which the intervention is in line with local and national policies and priorities as well as with the expectations of the beneficiaries				
In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as follows: 'At least one 'A', no 'C' or 'D' = A; Two times 'B' = B; At least one 'C', no 'D' = C; at least one 'D' = D				
ASSESSMENT RELEVANCE: total score	A	B	C	D
	X			
1.1 What is the present level of relevance of the intervention?				
X	A	Clearly still embedded in national policies and Belgian strategy, responds to aid effectiveness commitments, highly relevant to needs of target group.		
	B	Still fits well in national policies and Belgian strategy (without always being explicit), reasonably compatible with aid effectiveness commitments, relevant to target group's needs.		
	C	Some issues regarding consistency with national policies and Belgian strategy, aid effectiveness or relevance.		
	D	Contradictions with national policies and Belgian strategy, aid efficiency commitments; relevance to needs is questionable. Major adaptations needed.		
1.2 As presently designed, is the intervention logic still holding true?				
	A	Clear and well-structured intervention logic; feasible and consistent vertical logic of objectives; adequate indicators; Risks and Assumptions clearly identified and managed; exit strategy in place (if applicable).		
X	B	Adequate intervention logic although it might need some improvements regarding hierarchy of objectives, indicators, Risk and Assumptions.		
	C	Problems with intervention logic may affect performance of intervention and capacity to monitor and evaluate progress; improvements necessary.		
	D	Intervention logic is faulty and requires major revision for the intervention to have a chance of success.		

2. EFFICIENCY OF IMPLEMENTATION TO DATE: Degree to which the resources of the intervention (funds, expertise, time, etc.) have been converted into results in an economical way				
In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as follows: 'At least two 'A', no 'C' or 'D' = A; Two times 'B', no 'C' or 'D' = B; at least one 'C', no 'D' = C; at least one 'D' = D				
Assessment EFFICIENCY: total score	A	B	C	D
		X		
2.1 How well are inputs (financial, HR, goods & equipment) managed?				
	A	All inputs are available on time and within budget.		
X	B	Most inputs are available in reasonable time and do not require substantial budget adjustments. However there is room for improvement.		
	C	Availability and usage of inputs face problems, which need to be addressed; otherwise results may be at risk.		
	D	Availability and management of inputs have serious deficiencies, which threaten the achievement of results. Substantial change is needed.		

2.2 How well is the implementation of activities managed?		
	A	Activities implemented on schedule
X	B	Most activities are on schedule. Delays exist, but do not harm the delivery of outputs
	C	Activities are delayed. Corrections are necessary to deliver without too much delay.
	D	Serious delay. Outputs will not be delivered unless major changes in planning.
2.3 How well are outputs achieved?		
	A	All outputs have been and most likely will be delivered as scheduled with good quality contributing to outcomes as planned.
X	B	Output delivery is and will most likely be according to plan, but there is room for improvement in terms of quality, coverage and timing.
	C	Some output are/will be not delivered on time or with good quality. Adjustments are necessary.
	D	Quality and delivery of outputs has and most likely will have serious deficiencies. Major adjustments are needed to ensure that at least the key outputs are delivered on time.

3. EFFECTIVENESS TO DATE: Degree to which the outcome (Specific Objective) is achieved as planned at the end of year N					
In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as follows: 'At least one 'A', no 'C' or 'D' = A; Two times 'B' = B; At least one 'C', no 'D' = C; at least one 'D' = D					
Assessment total score	EFFECTIVENESS :	A	B	C	D
			X		
3.1 As presently implemented what is the likelihood of the outcome to be achieved?					
	A	Full achievement of the outcome is likely in terms of quality and coverage. Negative effects (if any) have been mitigated.			
X	B	Outcome will be achieved with minor limitations; negative effects (if any) have not caused much harm.			
	C	Outcome will be achieved only partially among others because of negative effects to which management was not able to fully adapt. Corrective measures have to be taken to improve ability to achieve outcome.			
	D	The intervention will not achieve its outcome unless major, fundamental measures are taken.			
3.2 Are activities and outputs adapted (when needed), in order to achieve the outcome?					
	A	The intervention is successful in adapting its strategies / activities and outputs to changing external conditions in order to achieve the outcome. Risks and assumptions are managed in a proactive manner.			
X	B	The intervention is relatively successful in adapting its strategies to changing external conditions in order to achieve its outcome. Risks management is rather passive.			
	C	The intervention has not entirely succeeded in adapting its strategies to changing external conditions in a timely or adequate manner. Risk management has been rather static. An important change in strategies is necessary in order to ensure the intervention can achieve its outcome.			
	D	The intervention has failed to respond to changing external conditions, risks were insufficiently managed. Major changes are needed to attain the outcome.			

4. POTENTIAL SUSTAINABILITY: The degree of likelihood to maintain and reproduce the benefits of an intervention in the long run (beyond the implementation period of the intervention).					
In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as follows: At least 3 'A's, no 'C' or 'D' = A ; Maximum two 'C's, no 'D' = B; At least three 'C's, no 'D' = C ; At least one 'D' = D					
Assessment POTENTIAL SUSTAINABILITY :		A	B	C	D
total score			X		
4.1 Financial/economic viability?					
	A	Financial/economic sustainability is potentially very good: costs for services and maintenance are covered or affordable; external factors will not change that.			
X	B	Financial/economic sustainability is likely to be good, but problems might arise namely from changing external economic factors.			
	C	Problems need to be addressed regarding financial sustainability either in terms of institutional or target groups costs or changing economic context.			
	D	Financial/economic sustainability is very questionable unless major changes are made.			
4.2 What is the level of ownership of the intervention by target groups and will it continue after the end of external support?					
	A	The steering committee and other relevant local structures are strongly involved in all stages of implementation and are committed to continue producing and using results.			
X	B	Implementation is based in a good part on the steering committee and other relevant local structures, which are also somewhat involved in decision-making. Likelihood of sustainability is good, but there is room for improvement.			
	C	The intervention uses mainly ad-hoc arrangements and the steering committee and other relevant local structures to ensure sustainability. Continued results are not guaranteed. Corrective measures are needed.			
	D	The intervention depends completely on ad-hoc structures with no prospect of sustainability. Fundamental changes are needed to enable sustainability.			
4.3 What is the level of policy support provided and the degree of interaction between intervention and policy level?					
X	A	Policy and institutions have been highly supportive of intervention and will continue to be so.			
	B	Policy and policy enforcing institutions have been generally supportive, or at least have not hindered the intervention, and are likely to continue to be so.			
	C	Intervention sustainability is limited due to lack of policy support. Corrective measures are needed.			
	D	Policies have been and likely will be in contradiction with the intervention. Fundamental changes needed to make intervention sustainable.			
4.4 How well is the intervention contributing to institutional and management capacity?					
	A	Intervention is embedded in institutional structures and has contributed to improve the institutional and management capacity (even if this is not an explicit goal).			
	B	Intervention management is well embedded in institutional structures and has somewhat contributed to capacity building. Additional expertise might be required. Improvements in order to guarantee sustainability are possible.			
X	C	Intervention relies too much on ad-hoc structures instead of institutions; capacity building has not been sufficient to fully ensure sustainability. Corrective measures are needed.			
	D	Intervention is relying on ad hoc and capacity transfer to existing institutions, which could guarantee sustainability, is unlikely unless fundamental changes are undertaken.			

4.2 Decisions taken by the steering committee and follow-up

N°	Decision				Action			Follow-up	
	Decision	Identification period (mmm.yy)	Source*	Actor	Action(s)	Resp.	Deadline	Progress	Status
1	Agreed using some of MCDU human resources for implementing the CC project and will be paid the maximum allowance of 50%	Thg11-13/Nov-2013	1st PSC meeting	PPC	Signing of concurrent labor contract	PCU			CLOSED
2	BTC will organize a meeting to discuss and clarify the duties, responsibilities and coordination mechanism among relevant agencies as TSU, PPC, BTC and MCDU	Thg11-13/Nov-2013	1st PSC meeting	TSU	Organization of meeting between BTC, TSU and Ninh Thuan PCU	BTC			CLOSED
				PPC					
3	BTC will provide a technical support on flood control study on Dinh river from the Belgian Research Foundation. Ninh Thuan province should work with the Ministry of Planning and Investment and the Belgian Embassy to receive this funding	Thg11-13/Nov-2013	1st PSC meeting	MPI		BTC			ON GOING
				Embassy of Belgium					
4	Appoint Mr. Vo Ngoc Minh as Vice Project Director for CC project, to be paid from the province's counterpart fund	28/01/2015	2nd PSC meeting	PSC	Issue decision	PPC		1419/QĐ-UBND dated 25/6/2015	CLOSED
5	Exclude Dam Nai from project scope	28/01/2015	2nd PSC meeting	PSC	Exclude Dam Nai from studies under result 2	PCU			CLOSED
6	Modify the logical framework (after mid-term review)	28/01/2015	3rd PSC meeting	BTC		BTC PCU			ONGOING
7	Priority for NoL to be given to Dinh river's hydraulic/hydrological, CC scenario downscaling, TICA and baseline survey packages.	28/01/2015	2nd PSC meeting	BTC	BTC to issue NoL to the above-mentioned contents				CLOSED

8	BTC will discuss with TSU and 3 project provinces for clarification of each party's roles, functions and responsibilities	28/01/2015	2nd PSC meeting	BTC	Organize meetings	BTC TSU		Meetings have been organized	CLOSED
9	Transfer 36,000 EUR from Z01-03 - National Communication & community development expert (under Belgium's management) to Z01-05 - Provision of consultants as per the province's needs (under Belgium's management)	28/01/2015	2nd PSC meeting	BTC		BTC			CLOSED
10	Recruit communication & community development consultant	28/01/2015	3rd PSC meeting	BTC		BTC			CLOSED
11	Develop ToR for expert for capacity development in financial management and project assistants	28/01/2015	2nd PSC meeting	BTC	Develop ToR for activities for submission to BTC	PCU			CLOSED
12	Develop ToR for project assistants	28/01/2015	2nd PSC meeting	BTC	Develop ToR for project assistants Lập ToR các vị trí cán bộ hỗ trợ dự án	PCU	Jul-15	BTC has issued NoL to positions of human resources management officer, accountant, environment & climate change project, secretary, clerical clerk	CLOSED
13	PPC to rent premises for MCDU	28/01/2015	2nd PSC meeting	BTC	Rent premises	PPC	May-15	PPC has issued decision 2114/UBND-TH dated 22/5/2015 on renting premises for PCU Ninh Thuan	CLOSED

14	Develop cash fund limit for the project	15/8/2015	Meeting minutes	Ernst & Young Audit Company		PCU		Cash fund limit is being developed in POM	CLOSED
15	Regularly check the project's assets' labelling status	15/8/2015	Meeting minutes	Ernst & Young Audit Company	Review the project assets' labeling status	PCU			CLOSED
16	Work with relevant agencies on tax refund for expenses under CC project but using tax code of the CD project (generated during the early stage of the CC project)	15/8/2015	Meeting minutes	Ernst & Young Audit Company	Work with stakeholders	PCU		Working sessions have been held with the provincial tax bureau	CLOSED
17	Agree to construct a CC resilient eco house at the PR-TC city's central park.	05/9/2015	3rd PSC meeting	Ian Wood	Issue investment preparation policy	UBND	Oct-15	4139/UBND-QHXD dated 26/10/2015	CLOSED
					Agree location for construction of the eco house		Dec-15		CLOSED
					Finalize procedures for handing over construction site for MCDU		Dec-15		ONGOING
18	Agree to rehabilitate siphons 12, 13 and 18 under Lu river drainage system, Ninh Phuoc district	05/9/2015	3rd PSC meeting	Ian Wood	Issue investment preparation policy	UBND	Oct-15		ONGOING
					Formulate investment project	PCU			ONGOING
19	Agree to construct Cau Ngoi channel	21/9/2015	the meeting minute	Ian Wood	Issue investment preparation policy	UBND	Oct-15	4139/UBND-QHXD dated 26/10/2015	ONGOING
					Formulate investment project	PCU			ONGOING

4.3 Updated Logical framework

No change in the project's initial logical framework.

4.4 MoRe Results at a glance

Logical framework's results or indicators modified in last 12 months?	No change in the logical framework
Baseline Report registered on PIT?	Not yet registered in the system as baseline survey has not been done
Planning MTR (registration of report)	mm/yyyy (estimate)
Planning ETR (registration of report)	mm/yyyy (estimate)
Backstopping missions since 01/01/2015	From April 22 - 24, BTC introduced Mr. Ian Wood to be the program coordinator and Mr. Dominique to discuss on POM
	From July 21 – 22 BTC and TSU experts discussed on ToR for studies.
	Between September 10 -11, BTC experts assisted the development of project master plan and discussed on ToR for studies.
	On September 21, BTC experts Ian Wood and Phil Graham took field trip to Cau Ngoi channel pilot investment works.
	On November 11, TSU experts mission learned about PCU's demand for technical support
	On December 29, TSU communication experts supported to develop a communication plan framework

4.5 Budget versus current (y – m) Report

(Please see Disbursement 2015 in attachment)

4.6 Communication resources

Documentaries were broadcasted on the local media:

1. Propaganda on Electricity energy and water saving.
2. Documentary on properly hand-washing with soap.
3. Propaganda of diseases related to water pollution.
4. Documentary to introduce the project.

4.7 Baseline workplan

In attachment