



**RESULT REPORT 2017
INTERVENTION:
“INTEGRATED WATER MANAGEMENT AND URBAN
DEVELOPMENT IN RELATION TO CLIMATE CHANGE IN HA TINH
PROVINCE”**

ACRONYMS	2
1 INTERVENTION AT A GLANCE	5
1.1 INTERVENTION FORM.....	7
1.2 BUDGET EXECUTION	8
1.3 SELF-ASSESSMENT PERFORMANCE	9
1.3.1 Relevance	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
1.3.2 Effectiveness.....	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
1.3.3 Efficiency.....	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
1.3.4 Impacts	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
1.3.5 Potential sustainability	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
1.4 CONCLUSION	ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.
1.5 RECOMMENDATIONS.....	ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.
2 RESULT MONITORING.....	17
2.1 OVERVIEW OF THE CONTEXT	17
2.1.1 General context.....	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
2.1.2 Institutional context.....	17
2.1.3 Management context: Execution modalities	17
2.2 PERFORMANCE OUTCOME.....	ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.
2.2.1 Progress of indicators	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
2.2.2 Analysis of progress made.....	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
2.2.3 Potential impacts.....	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
2.4 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 1.....	ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.
2.4.1 Progress of indicators	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
2.4.2 Progress of main activities	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
2.4.3 Analysis of progress made.....	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
2.5 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 3.....	ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.
2.5.1 Progress of indicators	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
2.5.2 Progress of main activities	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
2.5.3 Analysis of progress made.....	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
2.6 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 4.....	ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.
2.6.1 Progress of indicators	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
2.6.2 Progress of main activities	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
2.6.3 Analysis of progress made.....	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
2.7 TRANSVERSAL THEMES	ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.
2.7.1 Gender.....	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
2.7.2 Environment	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
2.8 RISK MANAGEMENT.....	ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.
3 STEERING AND LEARNING	37
3.1 STRATEGIC RE-ORIENTATIONS.....	37
3.2 RECOMMENDATIONS.....	ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.

3.3 LESSONS LEARNED **ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.**

4 ANNEXES.....ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.

4.1 QUALITY CRITERIA **ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.**

4.2 DECISIONS BY THE STEERING COMMITTEE AND FOLLOW-UP
44

4.3 UPDATED LOGICAL FRAMEWORK..... **ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT
DEFINED.**

4.4 MORE RESULTS AT GLANCE **ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.**

4.5 BUDGET REPORT **ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.**

4.6 SOURCES OF INFORMATION..... **ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.**

ACRONYMS

BTC	Belgian Technical Cooperation
PMU	Project Management Unit
CC	Climate Change
IWRM	Integrated Water Resource Management
M&E	Monitoring & Evaluation
MPI	Ministry of Planning & Investment
MTA	Mid Term Review
OM	Own Management (Regie)
PM	Project Management
IWRM	Integrated Water Resource Management
M&E	Monitoring & Evaluation
PSC	Project Steering Committee
TOR	Terms of Reference
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
VUF	Viet Nam Urban Forum
WSP	Water and Sanitation Program

INTERVENTION AT A GLANCE

Personnel:

Project Steering Committee, was established under Decision No. 2492/QĐ- People's Committee dated 08/14/2013 and the Decision 1243/QĐ-UBND dated 24/5/2016 regarding amendments to certain provisions of Decision No. 2492/QĐ- People's Committee, consists of six official members, as follow:

1. Mr. Dang Ngoc Son, Vice Chairman of Ha Tinh PPC – Chairman of PSC (Replacing Mr. Nguyen Hong Linh, Standing Vice Chairman of PPC)
2. Mrs Krista Francisca J.Verstraelen Chief of BTC Representatives in Viet Nam- Co-Chairman of PSC
3. Mr. Nguyen Hoang Lam - Head of Bilateral division, Department of debt management and external finance, Ministry of Finance- PSC member
4. Mr. Chau Tran Vinh, Deputy of Water Resource Mangement Department, MONRE-PSC member;
5. Mr. Le Hung Nam, Deputy of Water Resource Management and Rural Water, Directorate of Water Resources-PSC member;
6. Mr. Le Viet Anh, Deputy Director, Department of Foreign Economic Relations, Ministry of Planning and Investment (replaced Ms. Vo Hong Anh, Deputy Director, Foreign Economic Relations, (MPI)-PSC member;

There are also unofficial members, include:

1. Mr. Nguyen Tuan Anh - Deputy Director of Department of Science, Education, Natural Resources and Environment (MPI);
2. Mr. Le Anh Dung , Director of SRDP-IWMC Ha Tinh PCU, Secretary of PSC(In replacement of Mr Phan Thanh Bien, Deputy Director of the Department of Planning and Investment of Ha Tinh province since 20/11/2017);

PMU was reorganized in accordance with Decision No. 3024 / QĐ-UBND dated 18/10/2017 and transferred the Client and project owner according to Decision No. 3601 / QĐ-UBND dated 06/12/2017 of the People's Committee of Ha Tinh province; with following titles:

Function	Name	First	M/F	Start	End
Project Director (PD)	Biển	Phan Thành	M	20/8/2013	20/11/2017
Project Director (PD)	Dũng	Lê Anh	M	20/11/2017	30/6/2019
Deputy PD	Tài	Phan Văn	M	20/8/2013	30/6/2019
Chief accountant	Hữu	Đoàn Chính	M	20/8/2013	30/6/2019
Coordinator	Quang	Trần Đình	M	20/8/2013	30/6/2019
Interpreter/Translator	Thảo	Trần Thị	F	21/01/2014	30/6/2019
Assistant	Thìn	Nguyễn Phi	M	20/8/2013	30/6/2019
Assistant	Phương	Đặng Hữu	M	15/10/2013	30/6/2019
Assistant	Thuận	Trần Thị	F	01/7/2016	30/6/2019
Assistant	Hồng	Nguyễn Thị Thúy	F	01/7/2016	30/6/2019
Assistant	Đại	Võ Tá	M	01/9/2014	30/6/2019
Assistant	Yến	Phan Thị Hải	F	01/8/2016	30/6/2019
Technical staff on urban planning	Cường	Trịnh Thế	M	25/5/2015	30/6/2019
Technical staff on Environment	Loan	Hoàng Thị	F	01/12/2015	30/6/2019
Accountant	Trang	Trần Quỳnh	F	15/10/2013	30/6/2019
Assistant	Hiên	Đào Xuân	M	15/10/2013	30/6/2019
Cashier	Hoa	Hồ Thị	F	15/10/2013	30/6/2019
Driver	Hoàn	Nguyễn Quốc	M	15/10/2013	30/6/2019

Logistics

PMU has office building in No. 12 Liem Vo Son, Ha Tinh, and procured project vehicles and equipment for project operation.

Key events:

On 07/3/2017, first meeting of PSC in 2017 to evaluate the results of the project implementation in 2016, deploy plan in 2017;

On 05/6/2017, second meeting of PSC to agree to adjust plan in 2017 and solve some problems ;

On 18/10/2017, establish Ha Tinh provincial project management unit of civil and industrial works construction on Decision No.3024/QĐ- UBND of

People's Committee of Ha Tinh province.

On 06/12/2017, transferred the investors, project owners, project implementing agencies and agencies to monitor and synthesize programs to be under the Project Management Unit of civil and industrial works construction investment of Ha Tinh province as stated Decision No. 3601/QD-UBND of the People's Committee of Ha Tinh province;

On 14/12/2017, the 3rd Steering Committee meeting in 2017 was held to evaluate the progress of Plan 2017 and to approve plan 2018.

Components:

Result 1: Strengthening capacity of governments in climate change, integrated water resources management and urban planning (EURO 1.405.000);

Result 2: Overall strategy on Climate Change (EURO 990.000);

Result 3: Prioritized strategic piloting activities on Climate Change adaptation (EURO 3.280.000);

Result 4: Mobilization of communities' involvements (EURO 660.000);

1.1 INTERVENTION FORM

Intervention title	INTEGRATED WATER MANAGEMENT AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT IN RELATION TO CLIMATE CHANGE IN HA TINH PROVINCE.
Intervention code	VIE 1204411
Location	HÀ TĨNH PROVINCE
Total budget	Total budget: EURO 8,800,000 Of which: - Belgian Contribution: EURO 7,800,000 - Contribution of Viet Nam: EURO 1,000,000
Partner Institution	HA TINH Provincial People's Committee
Start date Specific Agreement	20/06/2013
Date intervention start /Opening steering committee	22/10/2013
Planned end date of execution period	20 /06/ 2019
End date Specific	20/06/2019

Agreement	
Target groups	Communities, authorities and institutional policies related to Climate Changes.
Impact	To contribute to the sustainable development of Ha Tinh province
Outcome	To support the institutional capacity in Ha Tinh Province in integrated water resources management and urban development in relation to Climate Change
Outputs	Result 1. The capacity of the authorities of the province and Ha Tinh city in terms of Climate Change, Integrated Water Resources Management and urban planning are improved with appropriate monitoring and evaluation mechanisms in place.
	Result 2. A comprehensive strategy on CC is in place. It is based on various studies, including CC data and hydraulic modeling focused on operational impact on settlements of Rao Cai river catchment and the revision of the existing master plans of both Ha Tinh city and Hong Linh town, while key priorities of the CC action plan of the Rao-Cai river basin are defined.
	Result 3. Priority strategic pilot activities are developed for lessons learned targeting Tinh city to increase resilience to CC, with appropriate operational and maintenance modalities.
	Result 4. The provincial CC strategy is supported by the active involvement of the communities and the private sector.
Period of report	2017

1.2 BUDGET EXECUTION

Figure: EUR

	Budget	Expenditure ¹		Previous years	Disbursement rate at the end of year 2017 (%)
		Previous years	Year of report (2017)		
Total	7.800.000	864.452	331.231	6.662.318	15,1
Output 1	922.900	222.901	75.974	624.025	32,4

¹ Exclusive OM Expensed amount
RESULT REPORT

Output 2	747.900	474.416	123.174	150.310	79,9
Output 3	5.025.000	29.742	72.740	4.922.518	2,0
Output 4	158.100	2.985	3.632	151.483	4,2
Contingency	50.000	0	0	50.000	-
General means	896.100	134.407	37.710	723.983	19,2

1.3 SELF-ASSESSMENT PERFORMANCE

1.31 Relevance

	Performance
<p><i>1. Clearly still embedded in national policies and Belgian strategy, responds to aid effectiveness commitments, highly relevant to needs of target group.</i></p> <p><i>2. Clear and well-structured intervention logic; feasible and consistent vertical logic of objectives; adequate indicators; Risks and Assumptions clearly identified and managed; exit strategy in place</i></p>	A

Relevance with development policies of Ha Tinh province up to 2020

“...Strongly develop industry and services, associated with high-tech, large-scaled agriculture in the direction of industrialization and modernization; investment in socio-cultural development and urban systems commensurate with economic development; environment protection; actively responding to climate change ... ”

Relevance with the needs for awareness raising of local communities on climate change and for the solutions/measures to mitigate and adapt to climate change impacts.

Relevance with the People's Committee of Ha Tinh and Ha Tinh city, Hong Linh town and the departments and institutions in improvement of the policy and flexibility to address the problems of water resource management, urban planning under the CC impact;

Innovation in requirements to integrate climate change factors into planning social economy, investment projects...

1.32 Effectiveness

	Performance
--	-------------

<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. <i>All inputs are available on time and within budget.</i> 2. <i>Most activities are on schedule. Delays exist, but do not harm the delivery of outputs</i> 3. <i>All outputs have been and most likely will be delivered as scheduled with good quality contributing to outcomes as planned.</i> 	B
--	---

With the results of the project, the People's Committee of Ha Tinh city, Hong Linh town has saved a lot of time and fund to make sustainable and effective strategic decisions about CC adaptation; Integrated water resources management; CC-integrated urban development.

During implementation, these inputs are completely adequate in terms of progress, however, due to many different reasons some of the outputs were behind the plan. The main causes are:

- Delays in recruitment of officials and experts for BTC and TSU;
- Some fields are lack of expertise due to staff have not been recruited;
- In the first 3 years of the project, delays in BTC's NOL granting and too many stages of an activity required NOL.
- Adjustments of some non-feasible/ineffective activities and it affects the overall progress of project.

Project Coordination Unit always seeks for ways to deploy the activities to achieve the highest performance. Thus, with minimal fund, the target outputs are ensured with good quality.

Some deliverables of consultants were submitted later than scheduled due to the unsatisfactory quality of the products. PCU requested for support of TSU experts in ensuring the quality of research.

Counterpart contribution in terms of both personnel and finance were sufficiently provided by Ha Tinh province, enabling the PCU to complete tasks.

Up to the present, PCU has completed all 4 studies and their outputs are the inputs for the effective operation of project. The later project activities will rely on at least one output of the studies. Effective use of study outputs will ensure the achievement of the project targets.

1.3.3 Efficiency

		Performance
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. <i>Full achievement of the outcome is likely in terms of quality and coverage</i> 	A	

<p><i>2. The intervention is successful in adapting its strategies / activities and outputs to changing external conditions in order to achieve the outcome. Risks and assumptions are managed in a proactive manner.</i></p>	
---	--

The outputs (study results) have been used effectively; Specific activities will be implemented based on the main study as TICA; H/H modeling in Rao Cai river; Study of mangroves;

For example, result of CC study was used for H/H model in Rao Cai river study whose results are used as inputs for other activities, such as climate change strategy, early warning system, priority investment projects, revision of Ha Tinh city master plan with integration of CC factors...;

The study results also help provincial, municipal People's Committee of Ha Tinh, Hong Linh Town and departments to have a better overall view of the CC adaptation strategy, a more realistic vision of urban planning...

In the past few years, due to delays of NOL granting, some of activities couldn't be deployed such as the CC resilient house Credit Fund, priority investment projects ... However, BTC, TSU and PCUs have fixed the delays since middle of 2017.

Up to the present, the achieved output of the project are relevant to the project strategy and the expected results of the project will completely meet the requirements of the project design. Project stakeholders can access the existing outputs without any hindering factors. For example, (1) the study outputs of mangroves and H/H model in Rao Cai river has been handed over to the Department of Agriculture and Rural Development, (2) outputs of Climate Change study has been for Department of Natural Resources and Environment, (3) outputs of construction study of green building criteria in Ha Tinh city has been handed over to the Department of Construction and Ha Tinh city...Project outputs will systematize the data of climate, urban planning, water resources and will help the province's leaders making effective macro policies, and relevant departments can easily access the data with less time and resources.

So far the project has achieved highly strategic important results, built a solid foundation for the activities to be deployed later to ensure the achievement of project overall goals.

Impacts

	Performance
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The study results have a major impact on the institutional changes of provincial and city government policies. 2. Communities change their perceptions and skills in CC mitigation and adaptation. 3. Changes to environmentally friendly lifestyle, smart consumers. 4. The technical and institutional capacity of relevant agencies enhanced; impact on more flexible measures to response to climate change scenarios; better meet the needs of the people. 	A

The results of the project have strong impact to Ha Tinh province with the following specific aspects:

- Impact on provincial/cities governments in the issuance of institutional policies to integrate climate change issues and a strategy on Climate Change will be issued in order to minimize the negative impacts of climate change.

- Impact on the communities: Awareness raising on CC mitigation and adaptation enhanced as well as aware of green living and environmental friendliness; An early warning system, a system of priority investment projects supported in order to limit the damage caused by natural disasters;

- Impact on enterprises: Enterprises are more aware in reducing greenhouse gas emissions and producing more environmentally friendly and green products;

- Social organizations: Social organizations are more aware of climate change and promote more green activities;

- The most obvious impact is the impact on the provincial /city government and communities;

Potential sustainability

	Performance
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Financial/economic sustainability is potentially very good: costs for services and maintenance are covered or affordable; external factors will not change that. 2. The steering committee and other relevant local structures are strongly involved in all stages of implementation and are committed to continue producing and using results. 3. Policy and institutions have been highly supportive of intervention and will continue to be so. <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Intervention is embedded in institutional structures and has contributed to improve the institutional and management capacity 	A

The research results are handed over to the People's Committee of Ha Tinh province, Ha Tinh City People's Committee and relevant government departments at all levels; Based on initial findings, the annual PPC will direct to PC of Ha Tinh city and related departments to update data for more complete database and put into the geographic information system (GIS), accessible to the relevant authorities and also investors, developers and researchers. PPC can fully provide funding for annual data update to long-term stability of the databases.

Economic/Financial sustainability:

The projects will support to develop sets of operation & maintenance (O&M) regulations for construction investments, and handover to the People's Committee of Ha Tinh city for management. City People's Committee will use local budget and assign relevant units to be in charge of O&M. The annual funding for operation and maintenance of priority investment projects is not large (about € 8,000/ per public works/per year), the People's Committee of Ha Tinh city is fully capable to provide the fund for O&M to ensure sustainability

The agencies are equipped and ensure the funds for operation and maintenance and exploitation.

For the research results, PPC assigned the relevant departments to manage and provide information to partners when necessary.

Local requirements are satisfied and maintained after the project completion

Technical & institutional capacity assessment identified the institutional vulnerabilities, policies and capacities. Based on study results, the project supports a part of capacity building training and procurement of equipment for the related departments. PPC will investigate and issue appropriate policies to finalize the mechanisms and policies on water resources management and urban planning in line with the state of climate change increasingly unpredictable.

The study of mangroves correctly identified the decrease of mangrove forest area and proposed strategies to maintain mangrove forests sustainably.

CC downscaling study and hydro/hydraulic modeling in Rao Cai river basin have given PPC and city PC a strategic vision for water management and urban planning with integration of climate change factors.

The priority investment projects which implemented on the basis of hydro/hydraulic modeling in Rao Cai river basin have fully met the needs drainage, landscape and environment friendly to the nature.

Based on the above analysis, it is clear that the activities of project have met the needs of Ha Tinh province and cities so far and will be sustainable in the long term.

Supported the potential sustainability of the benefits and results

- The results of studies will be approved by the PPC and delivered to relevant departments for utilization, maintaining and sharing to other beneficiaries.

- For priority investment projects, the project will support PC of Ha Tinh city in drafting Regulation on management, operation and maintenance, as well as establishment of O&M team. The operational cost for this team will be allocated from the budget of the City People's Committee.

- Other activities will be handed over to the relevant authorities in order to sustain the results achieved.

Thus, the results of project will be sustained on the basis of management of the provincial agencies for long-term utilization.

However, fund is required to strongly promote the achievements from local and foreign investment for updating data by times and implementation of investments recommended by the studies.

1.4 Conclusion

Basically, content and activities are consistent with long-term goals and objectives of the project. Logical framework of the project is appropriate. Monitoring indicators of impacts, Outcome, Outputs were agreed; However, activities need to be annually re-evaluated for adjustments and supplements related to activities, results, fund allocation to achieve the expected goals (outcome).

TSU basically recruited enough technical experts therefore the biggest challenge in term of communication between PCU with BTC and TSU was solved. A communication mechanism between PCU and TSU was established to support TSU to contribute to preparation of activity before submitting to BTC for approval. Roles of BTC and TSU become clearer and more supportive to accelerate activities. Communication mechanism in the remaining years of the project should be promoted to accelerate the implementation and effectiveness of the project.

Fund disbursement of 2017 reached 18,2% of annual plan. Although the rate of fund disbursement is not high, the studies have completed, giving favourable and stable conditions for later implementation of activities.

Main causes of low rate of fund disbursement include:

- Progress and procedures for implementation of each project activity must comply with the provisions of BTC and regulations of Vietnam, which waste;

- In 2017, IWMC deployed synchronously in all fields, including pilot investment activities, research activities, which result in mass of works and long time ;

- In some activities, the consultancy results were not satisfactory and it required many changes and supplementation between TSU and provincial sectorial verification agencies.

1.5 RECOMMENDATION

a. For TSU:

To accelerate reading and commenting on files submitted by the provincial PMU at least 3 days for response, focusing on factors compatible with the criteria of the Project (Technically, files have been assessed through the relevant departments based on local regulations).

b. For BTC

- No objection to the use of counterpart funds for activities: Preparation and evaluation of bidding documents, bidding; contingency ;
- To support in urging consultants, (Maximum 5 days for comments); After obtaining the consent of the consultant, NOI. should be issued immediately and sent via email to the provincial PMU for further implementation. (NOL sent by post usually takes 3-5 days). Setting up a hotline for the provincial PMU to work / explain directly with the consultant.
- To allow the Provincial PMU to submit request for NOL, Bidding Documents with TOR for the consultant selection and the PMU shall be legally responsible for the submitted contents.
- Selected works will complete work design in January 2018, request BTC not to oppose further investment in other priority projects in Ha Tinh city, Hong Linh town and the sub- region funded by Belgium. *(PMU will send details of proposal of investment file and adjustment of budget)*. The total amount of budget is 1,555,834 EURO (about 42.3 billion VND), including:
 - + Unallocated funds: EUR 793,972 (approximately VND 21.6 billion);
 - + Estimated capital but used with counterpart funds for 11 works approved: 500,000 EUR (about 13.6 billion VND);
 - + Contingency capital: 50,000 EUR (about 1.36 billion VND);
 - + OM not used: 211,862 EUR (about 5.8 billion VND). For BTC:

Domestic staff



Le Anh Dung

Staff of BTC



2 RESULT MONITORING

2.1 OVERVIEW OF THE CONTEXT

2.1.1 General context

The intervention has been implemented in the context that the Government of Vietnam and Ha Tinh province are giving priorities to reducing the impacts of climate change to economy and society; as well as focusing on minimizing factors of economic activities impacting to the climate change

2.1.2 Institutional context

The project is implemented under the agreement signed between the Government of Vietnam and the Government of the Kingdom of Belgium dated 20/06/2013; regulations follow TFF and the current laws of Vietnam.

New POM approved in 2017.

2.1.3 Management context: (Execution modalities)

The program consists of four interventions and the organizational design of the program helps ensuring a physical link between the projects. Ha Tinh PCU has maintained a good coordination, experience sharing between BTC, TSU and PCU, therefore in 2017, despite the low disbursement rate, Ha Tinh PCU has evenly deployed the planned activities of year 2017.

2.1.4 Harmo context

- The project has been operating with two parallel systems/regulations of the Government of Vietnam and BTC.
- PMU, BTC and TSU agreed a cooperation mechanism to accelerate the progress of project activities, such as:
- TSU monthly shares a work plan of TSU to PCUs to agree on the cooperation between TSU and PCU;
- TSU and PMU quarterly organize meetings on implementation of activities and solutions for obstacles and further acceleration of project progress;

2.2 PERFORMANCE OUTCOME



2.2.1 Progress of indicators

Results - Indicators		Baseline value	Value 2014	Value 2015	Value 2016	Value 2017	Target 2017	Final target value	Unit
OC 1	Number of documents issued which address CC	11	0	0	01	03	01	16	Document
OC 2	Number of trained stakeholders or trained staff who contribute newly acquired CC knowledge to decision-making processes	0	0	0	0	79	40	50	Staff
OC 3	% of provincial budget is invested in activities related to CC	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC	200	TBC	Billions
OC 4	Measurable increase in institutional capacity with respect to assessment criteria from the TICA	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC	TBC

2.2.2 Analysis of progress made

- *OC1. Number of documents issued which address CC:*

In 2017, Ha Tinh has issued 03 documents dealing with climate changes. (three times compared to the set target for 2017: 01 document).

-Particularly: (1) Decision No. 1043/QD-UBND dated 19/04/2017 on assessment study of current status, developing detail of planning of extending and rehabilitation of mangroves.) and mangrove conservation park in Rao Cai river, Ha Tinh Province; (2) Decision No. 2201 / QD-UBND dated 07/08/2017 approving the report on the results of technical consultancy research on hydraulic / hydrological modeling in Rao Cai river basin and water drainage system in Ha Tinh city ; (3) Decision No. 2696 / QD-UBND dated 20/09/2017 approving the report on the results of "Consulting on the construction of green building design criteria and designs in Ha Tinh city" and Research on the quality of Rao Cai river water is being approved.

- *OC2. Number of stakeholders or trained staff using the trained CC knowledge to decision-making processes.*

There are 264 staff (84 females, 180 males) trained about climate change in 2017, results of post-training evaluation showed that 77% of staff have been improved their knowledge, 30 staff (6 females, 24 males) were trained TICA and 80% of them improved their knowledge

In 2018, surveys will be conducted in the departments which have trained staff to define how trained knowledge is being used in decision-making process.

- *OC3. % of provincial budget has been invested in activities related to CC:*
According to data provided by Economic sector division of Provincial Department of Planning & Investment, Ha Tinh province invested more than 200 billions VND to the related CC activities
- *OC4. The institutional capacity can be measured by using the assessment criteria of TICA.* Based on the results of the TICA evaluation activities, NOL of BTC and approval of PPC, equipment for some units in the province purchased.

The TICA training plan expired on 20/12/2017, but 3 training courses (total 09 courses) have not been conducted due to inability to organize the courses at the end of the year when all the authorities are very busy. Therefore, the contract is extended until 20/02/2018.

For the 6 completed training courses, 30 trainees from CC related departments attended each course. Through training courses, trainees from

departments are equipped with basic knowledge on climate change, applying GIS and remote sensing to urban planning, integrated water resources management and CC adaptation risk management in Ha Tinh province. After training, 80% of trained staff have improved knowledge in their field.

2.2.3 Potential impacts

Project activities will strongly improve the awareness of provincial authorities in their policies for CC adaptation, especially for IWRM and Urban Planning.

Besides of policies, provincial budget for CC related activities will be more focused. Private sector, beneficiaries will be more accessible to policies, increasing the level of investment from non-budgetary resources for a better adaptation to CC.

2.3 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 1



2.3.1 Progress of indicators

OUTPUT 1: Capacity of Ha Tinh province and city department on CC, IWRM and UD enhanced with appropriate M & E mechanism								
Indicators		Baseline value	Value 2015	Value 2016	Value 2017	Target 2017	Final target value	Unit
1.1	Number of staff trained on climate change, integrated water resource management and/or urban development	0	0	50	294	132	132	Staff
1.2	Average change in scores on entry and exit tests	0	0	20	77	80	80	%
1.3	Appropriate equipment and software systems are in place	0	0	0	02	1	3	System
1.4	Responsiveness of data (CC-IWRM & UD) management system to the provincial users	0	0	0	Not yet evaluated	40	70	%
1.5	Coordination and communication mechanism responds to the knowledge management need of the provincial authorities	0	0	0	71	50	80	%
1.6	New and relevant information is available from the expanded hydrological & meteorological monitoring network	0	0	0	Not yet evaluated	80	90	%

2.3.2 Progress of key activities

Progress of key activities	Progress			
	A	B	C	D
1. Number of staff trained on climate change, integrated water resource management and/or urban development	X			
2. Average change in scores on entry and exit tests	X			
3. Appropriate system of equipment and software are in place	X			
4. Responsiveness of data (CC-IWRM & UD) management system to the provincial users		X		

2.3.3 Analysis of progress made

In 2017, study and consultancy activities investment preparations have mostly been completed, includes:

Indicator 1.1 and 1.2: Capacity Building on Climate Change, Integrated Water Resources Management and Urban Development

In 2017, IWMC Ha Tinh organized 10 training courses for 154 staff in Cam Xuyen, Thach Ha, Loc Ha and one training course for 294 staffs, surpassing the target set (132 staff). Of which, there were 03 training courses for 154 staff (46 female and 108 male) in Cam Xuyen district, Thach Ha, Loc Ha; 01 training course for 110 trainees (38 females and 72 males) in Ha Tinh city on climate change, integrated water resources management and urban development by TSU experts; 06 training courses on TICA for 30 trainees (6 female, 24 male), from departments in charge of CC in the province. Evaluation after the training showed that 78% of staff improves their professional knowledge in their fields (results from the post-training quality assessment). Trainees are very pleased and recommended to have such training every year to improve their knowledge as well as awareness raising for village people during weekends with support of propagandists indirectly or indirectly (through the village loudspeakers)

Indicator 1.3 Appropriate equipment and software systems are in place: Equipment and software including: The target set for 2017 is a system of equipment and software installed. Up to now, the project has been installed and handed over 02 equipment systems and in the process of deploying 03 equipment & software systems.

The completed packages include: (1) hydro/hydraulic- handed over in 2017; (2) Equipment for TICIA training – purchased laptops, A0 printers for departments in 2017;

On-going packages: (3) GIS- Signed the contract with the contractor namely Joint Venture of environmental resources technology consulting JSC (TECOS) and Geo Viet Consulting Ltd will be handed over in quarter 1, 2018. (4) early warning system – TOR being developed for EWS consultancy and to be completed before August 2018, (5) Equipment for monitoring stations- TOR being developed (to be completed before 5/2018).

For qualitative indicators 1.4; 1.5; 1.6, the project will use a satisfaction survey to evaluate feedback from provincial agencies on the systems, mechanisms and networks that have been or are being developed by the project.

Indicator 1.4. Database management system (CC-IWRM & UD) management system to serve the provincial users: Database management system (GIS) has not established yet. Expected to hand over in March 2018, when the project starts to survey and evaluate this indicator using the forms provided by BTC.

Indicator 1.5 Coordination and communication mechanism responds to the knowledge management need of the provincial authorities: The project has conducted a survey on impact assessment of cooperation mechanism and exchange on knowledge management needs of provincial agencies in 19 units in the locality.

The results show that the average score was 3.55 based on the scoring system given by BTC, corresponding to 71% of satisfaction (exceeding 21% of the target in 2017 which was set for 50% of satisfaction). Specifically: (i) Score of self-evaluated importance of the agencies to CC is 3.95/5 points; (ii) 67.4% of staff in the agency understand their role in climate change adaptation (3.37/5 points); (iii) Evaluated effectiveness of CC adaptation cooperation and information exchanges of their own agencies 3.53/5 points; (iv) Evaluated effectiveness of CC adaptation cooperation and exchange between the agencies and organizations of the province 3.37/5 points.

Indicator 1.6 New and relevant information is available from the expanded hydrological & meteorological monitoring network: Equipment for monitoring stations - expected to complete procurement by May 2018.

2.4 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 2

2.4.1 Progress of indicators

OUTPUT 2: Comprehensive CC strategy established								
Indicators		Baseline value	Value 2015	Value 2016	Value 2017	Target 2017	Final target value	Unit
2.1	Progress on the implementation of the studies	0	0	01	03	03	05	Number
2.2	A CC adaptation action plan is approved	0	0	0	0	01	01	Number
2.3	Master plans (provincial, cities/town) revised with regard to CC	0	01	0	Not realized; Transferred funds for construction investment	0	01	Number
2.4	Prioritized proposals on CC are developed	0	TBC	TBC	4	TBC	TBC	Number

2.4.2 Progress of main activities

Progress of main activities		Progress			
		A	B	C	D
1	Progress of implementation of studies	X			
2	Action Plan of Climate Change Adaptation approved		X		
3	Priority proposals on climate change are developed		X		

2.4.3 Analysis of progress made

Indicator 2.1 Progress on the implementation of studies

Target set for 2017 was to complete 3 studies. In the total of 8 studies, 05 completed studies were approved by PPC, the 03 remaining studies are on-going (almost double of the year target)

The completed studies include:

- Technical study on current and future climate data and analysis for the management of water resources in Ha Tinh province: study report approved

on 20/02/2016 by PPC under Decision 3492/QĐ-UBND and handed over to DONRE, Ha Tinh city PC;

- Research on assessment of current status, development of a detailed plan for rehabilitation and expansion of mangrove forest area and mangrove preservation area of Rao Cai river in Ha Tinh province: The research report approved by PPC under Decision No. 1034/QĐ-UBND dated 19/4/2017.
- Technical consultancy on hydropower/hydraulic modeling of Rao Cai river basin and drainage system in Ha Tinh city: Research report was approved by PPC under Decision 2201/QĐ-UBND dated 7/8/2017, and handed over to DARD, DONRE, Ha Tinh city PC. The recommended construction works are being realized and in the process of design consultancy ;
- Consultancy on formulation of criteria/standard set and sample design for CC resilient house in Ha Tinh city: Final report was approved by PPC under Decision 2696/QĐ-UBND dated 20/9/2017.
- Research on Rao Cai river water quality: Final report was approved by PPC under Decision 258/QĐ-UBND dated 17/01/2018; Training on handover for local authorities were organized on 22-23/01/2018.

On-going studies include:

- Study on the impact of climate change on coastal water resources and proposing sustainable management solutions: Expected to complete on 15/05/2017 but extend to 18/2/2018 because of delay in approval of budget plan, at the end of the year departments cannot arrange to send staff to the training;
- Vulnerability Assessment of irrigation infrastructure in Cua Sot coastal area: On-going (consultancy contract is valid from 13/10/2017 to 14/08/2018).
- Vulnerability Assessment and Climate Change Action Plan for Ha Tinh: On-going (contract is valid from 08/09/2017 to 08/09/2018).

Indicator 2.2 Action plan of Climate Change Adaptation approved: After completion of Vulnerability Assessment and Climate Change Action Plan for Ha Tinh (on-going) PMU will base on the recommendations to adjust the CC action plan accordingly;

Indicator 2.3: Master plans (provincial, city/town) adjusted to climate change adaptation: Conclusions after the Steering Committee meeting on 5/6/2017: this activity will not be realized and agreed to transfer of investment capital for construction of additional works for Hong Linh town.

Indicator 2.4 Priority climate change proposals have been developed:
There are 12 priority proposals in hydrographical report (Chapter 5: Proposed measures for flood mitigation inside and around Ha Tinh city, pages from 168 to 240). IWMC Ha Tinh project has selected and implemented four priority priorities in relevance to urgency and funding includes: (1) Dap Hau Dam; (2) the western channel; (3) Ben Da Lake; (4) Thach Quy Ward. Currently the works are in the design process, expected to complete the design phase on 30/01/2018, and hand over at the end of 2018;

2.5 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 3

2.5.1 Progress of indicators

OUTPUT 3: Prioritized strategic piloting activities are developed for lessons learned								
Indicators		Baseline value	Value 2015	Value 2016	Value 2017	Value 2017	Final target value	Unit
3.1	No of (pilot) investments implemented, complying with CC adaptation specifications	0	0	0	0	0	12	Number
3.2	Effective O&M is implemented for each priority investment	0	0	01	0	0	12	Number
3.3	No. of lessons-learned documents prepared on innovative features of the priority investments and of other aspects of the Project	0	TBC	TBC	1	TBC	TBC	Number
3.4	Number of hectares of mangroves area restored and developed	0	TBC	TBC	15	TBC	TBC	ha

2.5.2 Progress of main activities

No	Progress of main activities	Progress			
		A	B	C	D
1	No of (pilot) investments implemented, complying with CC adaptation specifications		x		
2	Effective O&M is implemented for each priority investment		x		
3	No. of lessons-learned documents prepared on innovative features of the priority investments and of other aspects of the Project	x			
4	Number of hectares of mangroves area restored and developed	x			

2.5.3 Analysis of progress made

Indicators 3.1 and 3.2 Relevant to investment items and attached O&M mechanism: The project is speeding up the implementation of 12 pilot projects to fulfill the target of the last year, of which:

– **Ha Tinh city: 7 Construction works**

+ Culvert through the intersection of Phan Dinh Phung street - Nguyen Chi Thanh street and intersection of Quang Trung street- Xo Viet Nghe Tinh street: The Economic-Technical Report was submitted for approval on 20/01/2018 and expected to sign construction contract on 20th of March 2018 and hand over on 10/2018;

+ Thach Quy drain channel: Being implemented by Branch No. 1-ACC Engineering Consultancy Company-Design consultancy (Design contract signed on 8/9/2017) and expected to sign construction contract on 20/03/2018 and hand over in 10/2018;

+ Dap Hau drain channel: Submitted to Department of Agriculture and Rural Development for project appraisal, after having verification of Vietnam Hydrology & Engineering Consulting Corporation (HEC);

+ Drain channel in the West of city: Engineering Bidding Document was granted NOL by BTC dated 22/11/2017; expected to realize bidding in quarter I 2018 and hand over in 10/2018,

+ Ben Da retention lake: Submitted the bidding results to BTC for NOL on 22/11/2017;

+ Construction and renovation of works to enhance green space for Ha Tinh city: Economic-Technical Report was submitted to PPC for approval on 22/01/2018, and expected to sign construction contract on 27/03/2018 and hand over in 10/2018;

+ Mangroves nursery: Completed contract negotiation with Tan Viet Construction and Consulting Ltd-Ha Tinh branch dated 12/01/2018;

– **Hong Linh town: 5 construction works**

+ Duc Thuan Channel; Thuan Loc channel; Trung Luong T1 + T2 drainage channel : Economic-Technical report was submitted to PPC for approval on 22/01/2018, and expect to sign the construction contract on 20/03/2018 and hand over in October 2018;

+ Thuan Loc drain, Trung Luong drain: Contract signed with VINAXIM company for design consultancy dated on 3/11/2017. Expected to sign construction contract on 20/03/2018 and handover in 10/2018;

+ □ Bac Hong retention lake: Design contract signed with Irrigation Consulting company dated 10/11/2017; Expect to sign construction contract on 24/04/2018 and hand over in 10/2018;

+ Binh Lang retention lake: Economic-Technical Report was submitted to Department of Construction for verification dated 17/01/2017; expect to sign construction contract on 12/05/2018 and hand over in 10/2018;

+ *Indicator 3.3. Number of lessons learned on innovations in priority investment items and other aspects of the project:* Rao Cai river Water Quality Manual was finalized by the consulting unit and will be handed over to the provincial PMU. In 2017, PMU cooperated with relevant departments to broadcasted 10 categories on Ha Tinh Televisions, 10 articles in printed newspapers and more than 30 articles in electronic news, 12 videos introducing project activities sharing advantages and disadvantages in project implementation. It would require a certain time to withdraw lessons learnt. Hopefully, the project would conclude some lessons learnt for relevant parties after 2018.

+ *Indicator 3.4. Number of hectares of mangroves restored and enlarged:* NOL of BTC granted on 21/11/2017 for TOR and cost estimates for the consultancy: Survey and formulation of Economic & Technical Report for planting new 15 hectares of mangroves in Thach Mon commune in Ha Tinh city. Contract to be signed in June 2018.

2.6 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 4

2.6.1 Progress of indicators

OUTPUT 4: The provincial CC strategy supported with active involvement of communities and private sector.								
Indicators		Baseline value	Value 2015	Value 2016	Value 2017	Target 2017	Final target 2017	Unit
4.1	A public CC awareness raising strategy is developed	0	0	01	0	0	01	Number
4.2	A disaster early warning system is developed	0	0	0	0	0	01	Number
4.3	No. of beneficiaries of newly upgraded CC resilient houses	0	0	TBC	Canceled and transferred to Hong Linh town	TBC	TBC	Number
4.4	No. of new people participating in CC credit program	0	0	TBC		TBC	TBC	Number
4.5	No. of people participating in newly established committees	0	TBC	TBC	Canceled and transferred to Ha Tinh city	TBC	No target applicable	Number
4.6	Proof of attempts to involve communities and/or private sector	0	TBC	TBC	3	TBC	No target applicable	Description
4.7	Proof of behavior changed due to increased awareness	0	TBC	TBC	0	TBC	No target applicable	Description

2.6.2 Progress of main activities

Progress of main activities		Progress			
		A	B	C	D
1	A public CC awareness raising strategy is developed	x			
2	A disaster early warning system is developed	x			
3	No. of beneficiaries of newly upgraded CC resilient houses	Canceled			
4	No. of new people participating in CC credit program	Canceled			
5	No. of people participating in newly established committees	Canceled			
6	Proof of attempts to involve communities and/or private sector		x		
7	Proof of behavior changed due to increased awareness		x		

2.6.3 Analysis of progress made

- *Indicator 4.1 A public CC awareness raising strategy in place:* A public CC awareness raising strategy was approved by PPC Ha Tinh in 2016. In 2017, the project implemented the activities outlined in the strategy: (i) A Communication & Community Development (C&CD) network established which includes 48 members from related departments, and companies; (ii) 4 training courses held for 264 staff (84 female, 180 male) in Cam Xuyen, Thach Ha, Loc Ha districts and Ha Tinh city in the fields of climate change, urban development by TSU experts; (iii) 10 project videos developed; Coordinated with newspapers and radio stations to broadcast 30 project articles to the local newspaper (baohatinh.vn); (iv) Collaborated with Ha Tinh University to organize painting competition for 500 pupils of primary and secondary schools in Ha Tinh city, organized the forum namely: Climate change and responsibility of youth; (v) Organized Earth Hour 2017 in Ha Tinh "Turn off lights - Turn on the future".

C & CD Plan 2018: To work with Ha Tinh Provincial Youth Union and other vocational training schools, colleges and universities to agree on program of contest “Youth’s Action for Environment”; to publish some publications: such as: Green Living Handbook, Environment Protection Handbook, some leaflets, poster, ...; To use publications as tools for all

communication activities; To organize large-scale contests for groups such as students, staff from departments/sectors and communities; To continue communicating on mass media; To organize Communication workshops on project results; To conduct Communication campaign to the community, focusing on project areas which have project activities/works; To document lessons learned during the project implementation;

- *Indicator 4.2 A disaster early warning system is developed:* BTC's NOL was granted on 31/01/2018 to ToR of Consultancy on Development of EWS and expected to complete and hand over in June 2018;
- *Indicators 4.3 and 4.4 credit savings fund to improve housing conditions to enhance adaptation to climate change:* Credit saving fund is a very essential activity, however according to expertise of financial experts, a duration of 36 months would not enough to define the impacts of the Facility, therefore this activity is not realized. Conclusions made in 5th PSC meeting dated 05/06/2017 stated that budget of this activity will be transferred to construction investment for Hong Linh town;
- *Indicator 4.5 Establishing a discussion forum for the Rao Cai River Basin with all stakeholders:* this activity to be not realized (2.4.2) after the conclusion of the Fifth meeting of PSC on 05 / 06/2017. Budget from this activity was transferred to investment projects for Ha Tinh city.
- *Indicators 4.6 and 4.7 Efforts to call for community and/or private sector participation:* In order to call for community involvement, the project has undertaken activities such as: (1) Drawing Contest Theme by "Green House, Green School"; "Save Water," "Ha Tinh City in the Future", "Impacts of climate change on living environment and students involved in responding to climate change" for children in primary and secondary schools. Ha Tinh city with the participation of more than 500 students; (2) Forum on "Climate Change and Youth Responsibility". After the forum, students also participated in integrating climate change responses into their lessons (architectural students designing green houses for their projects, environmental students studying the topics of scientific protection environment, preschool students teach children to recycle rubbish into toys so that children consciously take advantage of rubbish at a very young age, ...); (3) Earth Hour 2017 in Ha Tinh "Turn off lights - Turn on the future". The activities took place well, strongly impact on citizens in Ha Tinh city, called for involvement of authorities and private sector such as: Ha Tinh University Students' Association, Ha Tinh city Youth Union, Ha Tinh

Electricity, Coopmart supermarket, Viettel corp. –Ha Tinh branch; 666 Advertisement Company; Youth Union of Enterprise group, Ha Tinh News, Ha Tinh Televisions;

- *Indicator 4.7 The evidence base for behavioral changes due to awareness has been improved:* New communication activities have been implemented since the beginning of 2017, until the end of the year the exact changes in the behavior of the community and the private sector have not been recorded. In 2018, PMU will have quarterly detailed plans to assess behavioral change of these subjects.

2.7 TRANSVERSAL THEMES

2.7.1 Gender

Gender balance is very important for the results and impact of development interventions and essential for enhancing effectiveness. One strategy to consider the integration of crosscutting issues in the decision-making process, from planning to evaluation and feedbacks to the new decision-making process, to review the effectiveness and impact of these decisions of PCU related to gender issues.

In recent years the project has really focused on the issue of gender balance, typical percentage of women participating in seminars, training, study tours experience reached over 33%. Mobilizing women's participation in project activities is completely normal, due to:

- Ha Tinh PPC focuses on promoting ownership of women;
- Ha Tinh PCU has 15 continuous years of experience in mobilizing women to participate in the project activities, therefore IWMC project has hardly faced any difficulties in this issue.
- Clear arrangement and transparent defining of accountability, obligations and rights of women when participating in project activities are significant conditions for mobilizing the involvement of women.

2.7.2 Environment

The project focuses on environmental remediation and environmental pollution; Prioritized investment projects focus on water drainage, environmental pollution treatment and landscaping for recreational activities of the community.

The objectives and results of project are very much related to environmental issues. Therefore, PCU Ha Tinh specially focuses on the

two important fields include integrated water resources management and urban planning:

1. *For integrated water resources management*

– Through the technical and institutional capacity assessment, consultants to propose responsibilities, coordination mechanisms of the departments in the management of surface water, groundwater, and wastewater;

– Through studies for hydro/hydraulic modeling and mangroves status in Rao Cai river basin, consultants to emphasize in the prioritized investment strategy about management of river water quality of Rao Cai river and the neighborhood rivers; Themes of research are as follow:

- + Research on application of water quality index (WQI) to evaluate the quality of Rao Cai River - Ha Tinh;
- + Research on the impact of climate change on groundwater resources. Proposing solutions for reserving and supplying fresh water to rural areas in Ha Tinh coastal area;
- + Study on the impact of climate change and sea level rise on irrigation infrastructure of coastal communes in Cua Sot, Ha Tinh province.

2. *Urban Planning.*

- Through the technical and institutional capacity assessment, consultants to propose responsibilities, coordination mechanisms of related agencies in management of green environment urban planning

- In the framework of project, PCU Ha Tinh builds a set of criteria/standards and template designs for eco-house adaptive to climate conditions of Ha Tinh city and energy/water effective and for a clean living environment

– To integrate climate change issues into city planning, research consultants of hydraulic/hydrologic modeling to give a model and an inundation map corresponding to different rainfall scenarios, in order to mitigate and adapt to environmental pollution caused by flooding

– To organize training courses and seminars on sustainable development and environmental management issues in order to give the authorities, social organizations, civil society and the private sector a common slogan of "green environment" and "green culture" in accordance with the particular context and potentials of the area.

3. *For priority investment projects*

Prioritized investment projects will focus on the use of available building materials, friendly with environment, balancing of excavated soil in place, minimizing land transportation from other places; minimizing the amount of concrete and enhancing the vegetation, respecting the nature and enhancing the surface water permeability of natural soils.

RIST MANAGEMENT

Risk Identification			Risk analysis			Risk treatment			Follow-up risk	
Description of Risk	Period of identification	Risk category	Probability	Potential impact	Total	Actions	Responsible	Deadline	Progress	Status
Not timely access to data			Medium	Medium	Medium	PMU and TSU will establish channels for the exchange of information between partners	PCU	31/12/2019	Completed	
Delay in submitting			Medium	Medium	Medium	Regular and close contact with PPC and relevant ministries through PMU and TSU	PCU	31/12/2019	Completed	
Geological / natural risks			Low	Low	Low	Field surveys and monitoring can overall reduce these risks	TSU-PCU	31/12/2018	Implementing	
Delay in the compensation process, site clearance			Medium	High	Medium	Coordination between PSC and PMU, continuous monitoring during site purchase and compensation	TSU-PCU	31/12/2018	Start to implement	
Heavy and persistent rainy season, floods or cyclones			High	High	High	Make use of dry season for construction	PCU	31/12/2019	Start to implement	

3. STEERING AND LEARNING

3.1 STRATEGIC RE-ORIENTATIONS

The implementation of Ha Tinh IWMC project has been fully compliant to the Specific Agreement between the two governments and the current law of Vietnam, under the direction of BTC, Project Steering Committee, PPC.

3.2 RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendation	Responsible	Deadline
To allow the use of reciprocal capital for activities of elaborating and evaluating bidding documents; redundancy costs	BTC	
Allow the PMU to submit request for NOL, Bidding Documents together with the TOR for selection of the consultant and PMU is responsible for the content submitted.	BTC	
<p>To allow additional investment in other priority projects in Ha Tinh, Hong Linh town and surrounding areas will , use to 1.555.834 EURO (about 42.3 billion VND) of Belgian funding, including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> + Unallocated funds: EUR 793,972 (approximately VND 21.6 billion); + Estimated capital but used with counterpart funds for 11 approved works: 500,000 EUR (about 13.6 billion VND); + Reserve capital: 50,000 ERU (about 1.36 billion VND); + OM not used: 211,862 EUR (about 5.8 billion VND). 	BTC	

3.3 LESSONS LEARNED

Lessons learned	Target audience
<p>From end of 2015, PCU Ha Tinh and TSU established a monthly communication mechanism on progress of activities, request for expertise or experts...This communication mean is very supportive to accelerate the implementation of activities.</p>	<p>BTC, TSU, PCU</p>

4. ANNEXES

4.1. QUALITY CRITERIA

In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as follows:
 ‘At least one ‘A’, no ‘C’ or ‘D’ = A; Two times ‘B’ = B; At least one ‘C’, no
 ‘D’ = C; at least one ‘D’ = D

RELEVANCE: The degree to which the intervention is in line with local and national policies and priorities as well as with the expectations of the beneficiaries				
Assessment total score	RELEVANCE:			
	A	B	C	D
	X			
1.1 What is the present level of relevance of the intervention?				
	X	A		
		B		
		C		
		D		
1.2 As presently designed, is the intervention logic still holding true?				
	X	A		
		B		
		C		
		D		

2. EFFICIENCY OF IMPLEMENTATION TO DATE: Degree to which the resources of the intervention (funds, expertise, time, etc.) have been converted into results in an economical way				
Assessment	A	B	C	D
EFFICIENCY : total score		X		
2.1 How well are inputs (financial, HR, goods & equipment) managed?				
X	A	All inputs are available on time and within budget.		
	B	Most inputs are available in reasonable time and do not require substantial budget adjustments. However there is room for improvement.		
	C	Availability and usage of inputs face problems, which need to be addressed; otherwise results may be at risk.		
	D	Availability and management of inputs have serious deficiencies, which threaten the achievement of results. Substantial change is needed.		
2.2 How well is the implementation of activities managed?				
	A	Activities implemented on schedule		
X	B	Most activities are on schedule. Delays exist, but do not harm the delivery of outputs		
	C	Activities are delayed. Corrections are necessary to deliver without too much delay.		
	D	Serious delay. Outputs will not be delivered unless major changes in planning.		
2.3 How well are outputs achieved?				
	A	All outputs have been and most likely will be delivered as scheduled with good quality contributing to outcomes as planned.		
X	B	Output delivery is and will most likely be according to plan, but there is room for improvement in terms of quality, coverage and timing.		
	C	Some output are/will be not delivered on time or with good quality. Adjustments are necessary.		
	D	Quality and delivery of outputs has and most likely will have serious deficiencies. Major adjustments are needed to ensure that at least the key outputs are delivered on time.		

3. EFFECTIVENESS TO DATE: Degree to which the outcome (Specific Objective) is achieved as planned at the end of year 2017				
Assessment	A	B	C	D
EFFECTIVENESS : total score	X			
3.1 As presently implemented what is the likelihood of the outcome to be achieved?				
	A	Full achievement of the outcome is likely in terms of quality and coverage. Negative effects (if any) have been mitigated.		
X	B	Outcome will be achieved with minor limitations; negative effects (if any) have not caused much harm.		
	C	Outcome will be achieved only partially among others because of negative effects to which management was not able to fully adapt. Corrective measures have to be taken to improve ability to achieve outcome.		
	D	The intervention will not achieve its outcome unless major, fundamental measures are taken.		
3.2 Are activities and outputs adapted (when needed), in order to achieve the outcome?				
X	A	The intervention is successful in adapting its strategies / activities and outputs to changing external conditions in order to achieve the outcome. Risks and assumptions are managed in a proactive manner.		
	B	The intervention is relatively successful in adapting its strategies to changing external conditions in order to achieve its outcome. Risks management is rather passive.		
	C	The intervention has not entirely succeeded in adapting its strategies to changing external conditions in a timely or adequate manner. Risk management has been rather static. An important change in strategies is necessary in order to ensure the intervention can achieve its outcome.		
	D	The intervention has failed to respond to changing external conditions, risks were insufficiently managed. Major changes are needed to attain the outcome.		

4. POTENTIAL SUSTAINABILITY: The degree of likelihood to maintain and reproduce the benefits of an intervention in the long run (beyond the implementation period of the intervention).					
Assessment	POTENTIAL	A	B	C	D
		X			
4.1 Financial/economic viability?					
X	A	Financial/economic sustainability is potentially very good: costs for services and maintenance are covered or affordable; external factors will not change that.			
	B	Financial/economic sustainability is likely to be good, but problems might arise namely from changing external economic factors.			
	C	Problems need to be addressed regarding financial sustainability either in terms of institutional or target groups costs or changing economic context.			
	D	Financial/economic sustainability is very questionable unless major changes are made.			
4.2 What is the level of ownership of the intervention by target groups and will it continue after the end of external support?					
X	A	The steering committee and other relevant local structures are strongly involved in all stages of implementation and are committed to continue producing and using results.			
	B	Implementation is based in a good part on the steering committee and other relevant local structures, which are also somewhat involved in decision-making. Likelihood of sustainability is good, but there is room for improvement.			
	C	The intervention uses mainly ad-hoc arrangements and the steering committee and other relevant local structures to ensure sustainability. Continued results are not guaranteed. Corrective measures are needed.			
	D	The intervention depends completely on ad-hoc structures with no prospect of sustainability. Fundamental changes are needed to enable sustainability.			
4.3 What is the level of policy support provided and the degree of interaction between intervention and policy level?					
X	A	Policy and institutions have been highly supportive of intervention and will continue to be so.			
	B	Policy and policy enforcing institutions have been generally supportive, or at least have not hindered the intervention, and are likely to continue to be so.			
	C	Intervention sustainability is limited due to lack of policy support. Corrective measures are needed.			
	D	Policies have been and likely will be in contradiction with the intervention. Fundamental changes needed to make intervention			

		sustainable.
4.4 How well is the intervention contributing to institutional and management capacity?		
X	A	Intervention is embedded in institutional structures and has contributed to improve the institutional and management capacity (even if this is not an explicit goal).
	B	Intervention management is well embedded in institutional structures and has somewhat contributed to capacity building. Additional expertise might be required. Improvements in order to guarantee sustainability are possible.
	C	Intervention relies too much on ad-hoc structures instead of institutions; capacity building has not been sufficient to fully ensure sustainability. Corrective measures are needed.
	D	Intervention is relying on ad hoc and capacity transfer to existing institutions, which could guarantee sustainability, is unlikely unless fundamental changes are undertaken.

4.2. DECISIONS BY THE STEERING COMMITTEE AND FOLLOW-UP

Decisions						Actions			Follow-up	
	Made decisions	Identified Time	Time	Source	Responsible	Actions	Responsible	Deadline	Progress	Status
1	Approval on AWP&Budget 2017	March 2017	March 2017		PCU	Approval on plan in 2017	PCU		Completed	
2	Deploy activities approved in meeting of PCS on 03/2017	3/2017	3/2017	Minute of	BTC	<p>Transfer € 38,000 from budget A.01.03.02 (PM) - "Training on updated models and workgroups sharing experiences on specific topics with the province" to the A- 02-01-01 (PM) "Hydraulic model of Rao Cai River" for additional payment due to exchange rate reduction.</p> <p>Transfer 170,000 euros from the budget A.4.3 (PM) to the budget A.3.4 - Investment activities in Hong Linh town</p> <p>Transfer € 268,000 from budget A-04-02 (PM) to budget A-3-4 (PM)</p> <p>To invest in building and renovating some urban works to enhance the green space in Ha Tinh city</p> <p>Transfer of 16,000 euros from the budget A.01.03.02 (PM) - "Training on updated models and workgroups sharing experiences on specific topics with the province" to the A- 02-01-03 (PM) - Climate change</p>	PCU		Completed	

Decisions						Actions			Follow-up	
Made decisions	Identified Time	Time	Source	Responsible	Actions	Responsible	Deadline	Progress	Status	
					model "for additional payment due to exchange rate reduction.					
3	Deploy progress of adjustment AWPB 2017	7/2017	7/2017		PCU	Approval on adjustment plan in 2017	PCU		completed	
4	Deploy activities approved in meeting of PCS on 06/2017	6/2017	6/2017	Minute of meeting	BTC	Not build Dab Bat lake. As the design of consultant has completed the work, the PCU is allowed to pay according to the contents of the signed contract and based on the actual volume completed.	PCU		completed	
						No amendment of the Ha Tinh City Planning is under the SSP principle.				
						For the residual budget of the activities; Budget of non-performing activities; Part of the backup budget; Transfer these budget to invest in construction of new priority projects in Ha Tinh city, Hong Linh town.				
						Two major investment projects in the budget A0304 - new priority investment projects in Ha Tinh city will have a total budget of 644,000 euros.				

Decisions						Actions			Follow-up	
Made decisions	Identified Time	Time	Source	Responsible	Actions	Responsible	Deadline	Progress	Status	
					New budget A0304 - new priority projects in Hong Linh town with a total budget of € 1,401,400.					
					To unify the list of priority investment projects using the surplus and non-implementation budget sources and part of the reserve sources as proposed by the Project Coordinating Board.					
					Agreed to apply EU norms to project implementation as proposed by the Project Coordination Committee.					

4.3. UPDATED LOGICAL FRAMEWORK

4.4. MoRe Results at glance

Logical framework's results or indicators modified in last 12 months?	M&E and logical framework being developed therefore there is no change
Planning of final MTR (registration of report)	June 2019 (estimate)

4.5. BUDGET REPORT (UP 31/12/2017)

Figure : EUR

M	Activities	FIN	Budget			Fund disbursement up 31/12/2017		Remaining fund	
			Total	Belgum	Viet Nam	BEL	VN	BEL	VN
A	Specific objective: "To support the institutional capacity in Ha Tinh Province in integrated water resources management and urban development in relation to CC in Ha Tinh province"		7.436.700	6.853.900	582.800	1.260.565		5.593.335	582.800
A	1 OC1: Capacity of the authorities in terms of CC, WRM and urban planning are improved		922.900	922.900	0	553.875 ²	0	369.025	0
A	2 OC2: Developing comprehensive CCPM strategy		747.900	747.900	0	597.590	0	150.310	0
A	3 OC3: Improving infrastructure conditions with integration of CC factors in Ha Tinh city	PM	5.607.800	5.025.000	582.800	102.482	0	4.922.518	582.800
A	4 OC4: Active involvement of the communities and the private sector		158.100	158.100	0	6.618	0	151.483	0
X	Contingency		50.000	50.000	0	0	0	50.000	0
Z	General means		1.313.300	896.100	417.200	214.755 ³	343.766	681.345	73.434
	Total		8.800.000	7.800.000	1.000.000	1.475.320	343.766	6.324.680	656.234

4.6. SOURCES OF INFORMATION

1. Technical and Financial Files of "Integrated water resources management

² Of which: Disbursement OM: 255.000 EURO (data provided by BTC)

³ Of which: Disbursement OM: 42.637 EURO (data provided by BTC)

and urban development in relation to Climate change in Ha Tinh province”;

2. Project Document of “Integrated water resources management and urban development in relation to Climate change in Ha Tinh province”;;
3. Implementation report of 2014 and AWP &B of 2015 of “Integrated water resources management and urban development in relation to Climate change in Ha Tinh province”;;
4. Contents of fourth meeting of PSC dated on 07/03/2017;
5. Contents of fifth meeting of PSC dated on 05/06/2017;
6. Contents of sixth meeting of PSC dated on 14/12/2017.