

AIDE-MEMOIRE

RWANDA: Transformation of Agriculture Sector Program Phase 4 PforR-2 (IDA Credit No. 6256-RW\P161876) and Additional Financing

Implementation Support Mission November 16 - 25, 2020

I. INTRODUCTION

1. A virtual¹ implementation support mission for the **Transformation of Agriculture Sector Program 4 PforR-2 (6256-RW\P161876)** was conducted from November 16 to 25, 2020. It was led by Winston Dawes, Senior Agriculture Economist & Task Team Leader, and included a World Bank (WB) team² and Development Partners (DPs) contributing to the Additional Financing (AF) Multi-Donor Trust Fund (MTDF)³.

2. This aide-mémoire summarizes the mission's main findings, recommendations and agreements reached to help facilitate achievement of the Program Development Objective (PDO), the remaining DLI targets and resulting disbursements. These were discussed in a wrap-up meeting on November 24, 2020 chaired by Mr. Jean Claude Musabyimana, Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Agriculture and Animal Resources (MINAGRI). The mission wishes to thank MINAGRI, the Rwanda Agriculture Board (RAB), the National Agricultural Export Board (NAEB), and Province/District authorities for the continued collaboration in implementing the Program. The aide-mémoire will be classified as a public document as per the World Bank's Access to Information Policy.

II. KEY PROGRAM DATA AND RATINGS

3. The objective of the PforR-2 Program is **“to promote the commercialization of agriculture value chains in Rwanda”**. It is funded by a World Bank IDA credit of US\$100 million and grant of US\$71 million channeled through a MDTF. The Credit was approved by the World Bank Board of Directors (BoD) on May 29, 2018. It became effective on June 26, 2018 and is scheduled to close on December 31, 2021. The MDTF was approved on May 15, 2019, became effective on August 14, 2019 and will close on December 31, 2021.

Table 1: Key Program Data and Ratings as of November 25, 2020

Program Data	USD (millions)
Original IDA Credit Amount	US\$100.00 million
Total Disbursement	US\$74.95 million
Closing Date	December 31, 2021
MDTF Amount	US\$71.00 million
Total Disbursement	US\$40.72 million
FY 21 Disbursement Ratio	48%
Closing Date	December 31, 2021

¹ Due to COVID 19 related travel suspensions, all support missions are being conducted virtually.

² Irina Schuman (Sr. Agriculture Economist), Irene Bomani (Agriculture Specialist), Esdras Byiringiro (Agriculture Economist), Mkombozi Bosco Karake (Sr. Financial Management Specialist), Mulugeta Dinka (Sr. Procurement Specialist), Christine Anyango Owuor (Sr. Public Sector Specialist); Christine Kasedde (Environmental Specialist), George Bob Nkulanga (Social Development Specialist), Abhinav Gupta (Private Sector Specialist), Dany Jones (Sr. IT Specialist), Chris Brett (Lead Ag. Specialist), Farbod Youssefi (Program Coordinator), Samjhana Thapa (Sr. Ag. Economist), Samuel Tadesse (Sr. Ag. Economist), Toshiaki Ono (Sr. Financial Sector Specialist), Asuka Okumura (Operations Officer), Belinda Mutesi (Program Assistant).

³ funded by the Foreign, Commonwealth & Development Office (FCDO) formally United Kingdom's Department for International Development (DFID) (GBP 36 million); the Kingdom of the Netherlands - Ministry of Foreign Trade and Development Cooperation (US\$14.4 million); and Enabel – the Belgian development agency (EUR14.5million).

Key Program Ratings		
Program Ratings:	Previous	Current
Development Objective	S	S
Implementation Progress	S	MS

III. IMPLEMENTATION PROGRESS AND KEY FINDINGS

4. **Overall Summary.** Based on the mission discussions and review of the documentation made available by MINAGRI, progress towards achieving the PDO is rated “**Satisfactory**”. Overall implementation progress continues to be “**Moderately Satisfactory**” and Environmental and Social Safeguards performance has been upgraded from “**Moderately Unsatisfactory**” to “**Moderately Satisfactory**”. The Program remains on-track to achieve its development objective, barring the currently unknown full impact of the corona virus pandemic. All of the year 1 targets⁴ for the nine Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) against which the Program funds are being disbursed, were met and corresponding disbursements from both the IDA credit and MDTF were made in 2019. Eight of the year 2 DLI targets were met and disbursed against. Activities to meet the year 3 DLI targets are ongoing. As of November 25, 2020, US\$74.95 million of the IDA credit and US\$40.72 million of the MDTF has been disbursed (see table 2). Overall, implementation of the 19 actions of the Program Action Plan (PAP) is on track. The Program’s overall risk rating remains “**Moderate**”.

Table 2: Summary IDA & MDTF AF Disbursements (US\$ million) as of 11/25/2020

DLIs	IDA Credit	MDTF
	Years 1 & 2 Disbursements	Years 1 & 2 Disbursements
1. Organizational Development Plan successfully prepared and implementation on track	\$ 7,987,789.68	\$ 6,647,014.00
2. Improved analytical and policy reform competencies demonstrated (PSLS)	\$ 5,998,020.36	\$ 5,405,140.00
3. Digital information platforms designed and operational	\$ 1,999,100.84	\$ 2,602,041.00
4. Mechanism to strengthen Ag PPD and VC Platforms designed and implemented	\$ 3,998,201.70	\$ 4,364,324.00
5. New irrigation area identified, developed and/or managed, where commercial viability has been a determining appraisal criterion	\$ 4,282,254.91	\$ 3,944,444.00
6. New terracing area identified, developed and/or managed, where commercial viability has been a determining appraisal criterion	\$ 2,034,358.33	\$ 3,293,213.83
7. Volume of private sector investment (in US\$) matching public financing in PPP infrastructure projects	\$ 5,722,378.98	\$ 3,108,339.22
8. Private sector extension service models designed, launched and achieving positive response	\$14,987,814.86	\$ 7,888,889.00
9. Reform of RAB	\$ 3,000,445.80	\$ 3,469,388.00
Advance payment	\$24,505,464.00	\$ 4,250,000.00
TOTAL	\$74,990,153.18	\$40,722,793.05

5. As program implementation enters the 3rd and final year, the World Bank and DPs are urging MINAGRI to focus on ensuring long-term results, sustainability of the program’s impacts and other critical factors in order to safeguard and advance the resilience of the agri-food sector. To support lasting economic, social and operational impacts within Rwanda, due attention is needed on the scale up of ongoing program interventions; implementing the MINAGRI reforms as laid out in its Organizational Development Plan; and strengthening MINAGRI’s/RAB’s cooperatives’ capacity. In addition, well-coordinated strategic engagement between MINAGRI and the private sector, and DPs is essential to address the wide-ranging impacts of COVID-19 on the agri-food sector, including

⁴ Each DLI has annual targets, but only DLIs 1, 2, 3, 4 and 9 have targets for year 1.

the economic dip, effects on new investments and new PPPs, and financial performance of public agencies, which have yet to be fully tabulated.

6. **Overall DLI Status.** Below is a summary of the current DLI status and priority actions for MINAGRI and its implementing partners to ensure achievement of the remaining DLI targets.

7. **DLI-1** (*preparation and successful implementation of an Organizational Development Plan [ODP]*). The years 1 & 2 DLI targets have been met. The mission was pleased to note progress towards achievement of the year 3 target i.e. *upgrading the HR management function as laid out in the ODP*. Since the last mission, the new organizational structure has been approved, and the redeployment/recruitment of staff processes was scheduled to be completed by January 2021. The mission reviewed and discussed the ToRs for Technical Assistance (TA) to MINAGRI, which is expected to begin in February 2021 (aligning with the completion of the recruitment process). The mission identified a number of areas requiring urgent and immediate attention:

- (i) **MINAGRI and World Bank Consensus on Scope of the OD Plan.** As per the approved OD plan, 17 activities/actions were proposed and mapped out to 4 Key Results Areas. Any implementation changes will need to be formally communicated to the Bank and approved by the Task Team.
- (ii) **OD Plan implementation milestones.** Only some of the 17 activities will be supported by the proposed TA (with completion timelines proposed in the above-mentioned ToRs). As at the time of writing the aide memoire, it remained unclear what process and timelines MINAGRI had established for implementing the non TA supported activities (updating of the Human Resource Information System (HRIS), roll out of the staff training plan, and conducting an HR Audit). The mission recommends that MINAGRI share with the WB task team a clear implementation pathway for these activities. MINAGRI also explained to the World bank that the staffing of the newly approved organizational structure is not fully under its responsibilities, however any delays in implementation of any key action/activity, would impact negatively on the achievement of the DLR.
- (iii) **PDO indicator progress tracking.** In the absence of clarity on (i) and (ii) above, the mission noted that it would be difficult to map out progress in achievement of the PDO indicator. The mission recommends that the bi-annual report⁵ on progress in implementation of this DLI specify the universe of actions to be implemented as per the OD Plan, so as to establish what each step implemented measures up to (as a sum of the total).

8. **DLI-2** (*preparation of a Private Sector Leveraging Strategy and implementation plan*). The year 1 and 2 targets, i.e. preparation of a Private Sector Leveraging Strategy (PSLS) and its implementation plan, and, respectively, publishing by MINAGRI of the annual implementation report on public-private investment in agriculture were met and the corresponding amounts disbursed. The year 3 target involves a review of Rwanda's agricultural input subsidy schemes, an assessment of alternative models for increased efficiency and the implementation of agreed reforms. The GoR and the Bank mission extensively discussed the scope of the review that needs to be undertaken, which will rely on assessments and evidence already widely available. While the PAD refers specifically to a review limited to the agricultural input subsidy schemes, the GoR expressed an interest in a broader undertaking that would comprehensively look at all or at least the major government support schemes in the sector. Given the technical depth and specificity of this work, the GoR also stated a preference for recruiting an external consultant to support their decision process. The Bank stands ready to provide the needed TA and evidence that will enable the GoR to adopt the most appropriate reform pathway. ToRs for the TA were prepared and discussed during the mission. Following further internal consultations within the GoR, the ToRs was finalized and the consultant hiring process is to be completed no later than end February 2021.

9. **DLI-3** (*development of an agriculture sector data warehouse*). Activities to meet the year 2 and 3 targets are in progress. MINAGRI has requested World Bank technical assistance (TA) to complete the remaining tasks and deliverables. Year 2 pending deliverables are the LODA and LAIS integrations. A Sector Performance

⁵ Was due in December 2020.

Dashboard is in place, publicly accessible online, and is able to provide reports on national agricultural macro indicators, the national Indicator of Food Security and PSTA 4 results indicators. The final deliverable for year 3 is the integration of the Livestock registration application (national cow data) with MIS, ALIS I and II.

10. As noted in prior support missions, MINAGRI has limited and stretched internal IT capacity to adequately support the existing applications and data warehouse dashboard currently under development. This continues to put the full achievement of DLI 3 at a considerable risk. The mission would like to reiterate the urgency of addressing this issue both in the immediate and long-term. For the former, the mission recommends MINAGRI establish a Working Group to specify requirements, coordinate deliverables and support the full rollout of the data warehouse. To be effective, the group would need to consist of data warehouse stakeholders led by a Project Coordinator assigned by MINAGRI. A proposed Terms of Reference for the group is attached as annex 4. For the latter, MINAGRI's investment in its long-term IT capacity building needs remains critical, given its goal of developing an integrated data warehouse with advanced reporting, forecasting and planning capabilities. As highlighted in previous aide-memoires, the following skillsets in MINAGRI are crucial to achieve that goal: (a) Database administrator; (b) Extract, Transform, and Load (ETL) developer; (c) Data management specialist; and (d) Data scientist and analyst. Finally, the Bank has committed to providing additional technical support to MINAGRI through the hiring of a local ICT specialist who would collaborate with the MINAGRI Working Group and IT team.

11. **DLI-4** (*design, piloting and budgeting of National Agriculture Public-Private Dialogues and selected value chain platforms*). MINAGRI has successfully met the years 1 and 2 targets and the corresponding disbursements were made in June 2019 and June 2020 respectively. Work is ongoing to achieve the year 3 target "Additional 2 Ag. PPDs held", and "Agriculture VC platforms are fully functional and yielded evidence of satisfactory results (as per M&E of operating plan)". MINAGRI will provide further documentation on the value chain platforms and Agri – PPD meetings based on the semi-annual report. MINAGRI and the Bank defined the parameters for: 'fully functional value chain platforms', 'satisfactory results of value chain platforms', and 'progress on the aimed results of value chain platforms'.

12. **DLI-5** (*new irrigation area identified, developed and/or managed, where commercial viability has been a determining appraisal criterion*). DLI 5 did not have year 1 targets. Progress has been made towards meeting the year 2 target "1,260 ha identified, developed and put under recognized PPPs". The target will be surpassed as long as the remaining process-oriented activities are successfully completed. To-date, 1,807 ha (vs the 1,680 ha end of program target) under seven irrigation schemes have been identified and are in different stages of development. Of the seven schemes two of them (Rwinkwavu scheme and Kanyonyomba system) accounted for 1,587 ha under irrigation.

13. Going forward, as part of the PForR-2 program consolidation phase under this DLI, MINAGRI will need to focus on sustainability and other factors that will ensure the resilience of the system. Specifically: (i) establishing long-term term contracts as part of the PPP arrangement; (ii) improving the commercial viability and feasibility studies -- available data indicates that only 3 out of the 7 schemes have provided an acceptable feasibility study that includes financial and economic rates of return; and (iii) ensuring consistency of data and information. Identifying and addressing potential risks to the expected DLI outcomes will ensure sustainability of the Program. MINAGRI and the Bank team will work together to address these issues: This includes clarifying the minimum years for a contract to be considered a PPP arrangement (*before the end of February 2021*); providing documentation of commercial viability and feasibility of these schemes (*April 2021*); documenting the arrangements for O&M of these schemes (*end of May 2021*); assessing the ex-ante feasibility of the PForR-2 Program and potential risks facing the schemes (*May 2021*). The ex-ante analysis will provide resources and data for the final evaluation of the Program and specifically the contribution of DLI5 (noting that this DLI directly contributes to improved access to markets, enhanced income of producers, use of improved seeds, among others). MINAGRI could seek external consultant services to support these tasks. The Bank stands ready to discuss and agree with MINAGRI on the specific areas for which consultant services may be needed before the end of February 2021.

14. **DLI-6** (*new terracing area identified, developed and/or managed, where commercial viability has been a determining appraisal criterion*). DLI 6 did not have year 1 targets. The year 2 target of “745 ha to be identified, developed and put under recognized PPP increased” was met and disbursed against. The year 3 target is “2,310 ha to be identified, developed and put under recognized PPP increased”. As of the end of the mission, 2,900 ha of new radical terraces have been identified for year 3 and the largest project covers 1,200 ha. The mission was informed that field teams are evaluating all projects and verifying availability of the required documents in accordance with the established eligibility criteria (evidence of commercial viability, signed PPP agreements, social and environmental documents, etc.). The teams are also holding consultations with District officials who are closely monitoring the activities of the relevant cooperatives, including those that were verified in year 2. It was agreed that MINAGRI will share the list of new projects and copies of agreed supporting documents for year 3 verification by April 2021.

15. As this is the final year for the Program, the mission emphasized the importance of long-term results to be achieved under this DLI. Improved capacity of the cooperatives and access to markets leading to increased farmer incomes are critical for sustainability and would require MINAGRI’s due attention. The Bank team will work with MINAGRI to ensure timely progress in selecting appropriate projects against the eligibility criteria. MINAGRI could seek TA to support these tasks. MINAGRI and the Bank team will agree on the required services by or before the end of February 2021.

16. **DLI-7** (*volume of private sector investment matching public financing in PPP infrastructure projects*). The year 2 target was met. The GoR provided evidence of new infrastructure investment projects with private investment totaling US\$3,152,119. Work towards achieving the year 3 target of US\$7,997,881 is underway. MINAGRI suggested two large scale PPPs for this target and committed (once it becomes available) to sharing detailed information for verification against the PPP eligibility criteria from the PAD and previous missions. There are four PPP projects with a total private sector contribution of about US\$860,000 from the Climate Resilient Post-harvest and Agribusiness Support Project (PASP), which could not be verified in year 2 due to lack of information. MINAGRI shared the documents of these PPPs for assessment by the World Bank team during the mission. Two of the large PPPs are under consideration to achieve the disbursement target of year 3. To this end, the mission urged swift disclosure of the relevant documents and reiterated the importance of establishing the capacity and process to identify and design high-quality PPP projects within the MINAGRI.

17. **DLI-8** (*Private sector extension service models designed, launched and achieving positive response*). The year 1 and 2 targets were met and fully disbursed against in the first and second years as follows: (i) Year 1 - ‘6000 of farm households reached by private advisory services (non-out grower scheme); (ii) Year 2 - ‘8000 of additional farm households reached by private advisory services (non-outgrower-schemes’, and ‘10,000 of new farm households participating in outgrower schemes has increased’. To further strengthen the work on promoting private sector extension and consolidate the DLI 8 results, it was agreed MINAGRI will:

- elaborate on the operational aspects and compliance with the definition of DLI 8; and
- prepare a short white paper to assess: (i) alignment of the work done on the ‘Customized Agriculture Extension System in Rwanda’; and (ii) the potential of replication of the out-grower and non out-grower models (regarding private sector extension services) under the ‘Customized Agriculture Extension System in Rwanda’ Work done to date.

18. **DLI-9** (*reform of the Rwanda Agriculture and Animal Resources Development Board [RAB]*). The year 2 DLI target has not yet been met due to several issues. These include: (i) due to COVID 19, a delay in contract execution by suppliers mainly in irrigation, and thus on expenses and payment to those suppliers; (ii) ongoing rationalization, new placement and recruitment of public servants and staffing at RAB, thus delays in compensation of employees budget execution; and (iii) externally funded projects, mainly for scientists were not implemented as planned due to delays in DP fund transfers which affected the law budget execution rate. As such the corresponding DLI disbursements have not been made.

19. The mission was informed that the OAG is in the process of auditing the financial statements for the year ended June 30, 2020. RAB is receiving TA from the TECAN project to build RAB's capacity to resolve audit issues and avoid adverse audits from the OAG. A consultant has been stationed at RAB since February 2020. The World Bank is waiting for a progress report on the TA. On August 20, 2020, a new structure for RAB was published. RAB has hired a Chief Finance Officer (CFO), a position that did not previously exist, and an additional accountant to strengthen the finance function. However, the Internal Audit function has been restructured. RAB previously had 5 staff (a Director of Internal Audit and four (4) Internal Audit officers). It now only has a single Internal Auditor. This staff reduction could impact the sustainability of a 'clean audit opinion'. RAB has also hired two procurement specialists, another key area which needed strengthening. It was agreed that: (i) MINAGRI and RAB will share with the Bank the 2019/20 budget execution report and OAG 2019 audit report; (ii) RAB will provide an update to the Bank on the PwC findings and share the report outlining the TECAN and PwC TA support; and (iii) MINAGRI and RAB will explore the possibility of having OAG carry out an interim audit (mid-year review) to assess RAB's readiness to obtain an unqualified audit.

Program Action Plan (PAP): Implementation Progress

20. As of November 25, 2020, (11) actions have been completed, some of which are annual deliverables (see annex 3 for detailed progress); four are ongoing; one is partially completed (implementation of additional procurement related recommendations); one is delayed (ESIM training at the District level was scheduled for March 2020 but has been postponed due to COVID-19); one is not yet due (assessment of the application of the private sector screening procedure); and another one is not yet applicable (consolidated resettlement and expropriation completion report for potential Land and Resettlement (LAR) issues which would only be prepared in the event there is land acquisition. Challenges still remain in fully implementing the E&S related PAP actions. Per PAP 13, an environmental screening checklist is imbedded in the completed Private Sector Leveraging Strategy, however, use of the checklist remains a challenge. Per PAP 14, selection/performance criteria for private sector entities consistent with ESIM & the Government's Environmental Safeguards regulations are imbedded in the PSLs. However, implementation is also challenging (see paragraph 21 for additional details). The previous support mission recommended additional actions to strengthen the fiduciary related actions. As of the end of the mission, MINAGRI had implemented 1 of the 3 additional procurement related recommendations. Of the 3 additional financial management recommendations, MINAGRI has fully implemented 1, partially implemented 1 and has not yet implemented the third recommendation. Agreed follow up actions are detailed under the E&SS and fiduciary sections.

Environmental and Social Safeguards (E&SS)

21. **Environmental Safeguards.** The mission reviewed overall Program E&S performance, including measures to enhance E&S implementation, and ensure monitoring and reporting for DLIs 5, 6 & 7; and discussed the scope of the E&S Audit in line with PAP 17. Based on the findings, the Program safeguards performance rating has been upgraded from "**Moderately Unsatisfactory**" to "**Moderately Satisfactory**" given: (i) the existence of a functional GRM; (ii) the existence of clear guidance for E&S implementation in the Program's Private Sector Leveraging Strategy (PSLS), as well as various GoR Environmental and Social legislations and guidelines; (iii) MINAGRI's efforts to screen E&SS risks and prepare site specific instruments; and (iv) MINAGRI's commitment to address the current gaps in monitoring and reporting on E&S implementation at project level. The mission also notes the E&S highlights are provided in the annual PPI report.

22. The mission notes that a number of challenges in MINAGRI's current safeguards arrangement are affecting ES monitoring and reporting. Key among them is MINAGRI's lack of dedicated ES staff for the Program. In addition, ES capacity building activities in line with PAP 12 have been delayed by COVID-19. Plans however are underway to carry out the trainings as soon as conditions allow. The Bank has not yet received a progress report on ES compliance for DLIs 5, 6, & 7. It was agreed that MINAGRI will conduct field visits to assess ES implementation for approved projects, including checking on implementation of E&S measures by contractors developing sites under DLIs 5 & 6, as well as performance/existence of Environment and Social Management System (ESMS) for private entities engaged in DLIs 5, 6 & 7, and prepare a progress report.

MINAGRI will also prepare TORs for the E&S Audit and share it with the Bank for review. Moving forward MINAGRI is advised to: (a) consolidate environmental and social risk management for DLIs 5, 6, and 7; (b) ensure that before large-scale private sector entities (e.g. Gabiro Agribusiness Hub, Gako Beef projects) are selected to participate in the program under DLI7, they should have a functional environment and social management system (ESMS) in line with PAP 14, and have PPP agreements which reflect PAP 16 on E&S compliance requirements during implementation; and (c) engage a consultant to sample and assess private companies participating under DLIs 5, 6 and 7 to assess their implementation of ESMS in line with the scope of the E&S Audit required under PAP 17. MINAGRI has requested and the Bank has agreed to provide short-term TA to strengthen E&S implementation and monitoring. The Bank has proposed ToRs for the TA which it will share and finalize with MINAGRI.

23. **Social Safeguards.** The social safeguards performance remains “**Moderately Satisfactory**”. MINAGRI has fully operationalized its Grievance Redress Mechanism (GRM), which tracks and records complaints received through a call center, the MINAGRI website, and District based staff in-charge of agriculture. MINAGRI prepares and shares with the Bank quarterly consolidated reports which record grievances, queries and comments on a range of issues (Crop Insurance, Livestock Insurance, Inputs, Farming, Irrigation, Agro-dealer License, Agro-forestry, Horticulture, Livestock and other non-related to agriculture sector issues). The most recent report shared with the Bank is for the period July to September 2020. The Bank recommends that grievances and corresponding resolutions be detailed in a dedicated section of the report separate from the general queries and comments.

Fiduciary Management

24. **Procurement.** Based on an assessment of the PForR procurement risks using the World Bank’s Procurement Risk Assessment and Management System (P-RAMS) the Program procurement risk remains “**Moderate**” and procurement performance is rated “**Moderately Satisfactory**”. MINAGRI shared its updated Program procurement plan for 2020-2021. Its implementation will be evaluated in the next mission. MINAGRI also confirmed that there have been no reports of incidences of fraud and corruption in implementation of the Program’s procurement. The mission reviewed the implementation status of the previously recommended 3 actions needed to strengthen completion measurement actions for the procurement related PAPs (see table 3). On November 20, 2020, MINAGRI sent an official letter to the Director General of the Rwanda Public Procurement Authority requesting their implementation. The status will be updated in the next mission aide-memoire.

Table 3: Implementation Status of Additional Follow up Procurement Recommendations from Previous Missions as of November 25, 2020

PAP	Recommended Action	Status as of 11/25/2020	Completion Date
Ensure WB debarred firms are excluded from participating in procurement bids	MINAGRI to remind all implementing agencies, including RAB & districts, to strictly check Bank debarred firms in every procurement activity under the program. MINAGRI shall copy OAG & RPPA so that they will verify at their annual financial/procurement audit.	Not implemented	June 30, 2020
Some procuring entities negotiate bid prices	MINAGRI in consultation with RPPA should send out a directive to all PForR implementing agencies to refrain from price negotiation”.	Not implemented.	June 30, 2020
Delays in contract awards	MINAGRI in coordination with RAB & districts shall prepare action plan on how to improve procurement efficiency.	Implemented.	June 30, 2020

25. **Financial management (FM).** FM performance is rated “**Moderately Satisfactory**”. The WB fiduciary team reviewed progress on the Program’s fiduciary arrangements and related PAP actions. The FM arrangements remain fully mainstreamed into the country-level Public Financial Management (PFM) systems maintained by MINAGRI, NAEB and RAB. As recommended by the MTR, MINAGRI has deployed 2 additional accountants to the headquarter office of the Director of Administration & Finance to help monitor & supervise the 14 district stations (including necessary FM support), review, consolidate financial reports from the stations, and submit

relevant reports to management. The 14 district level accountants received generic FM training from the OAG, however the Bank has not received confirmation of training of the 3 new internal auditors. The Bank is requesting a status update.

26. Monthly management monitoring of the implementation status of audit recommendations and maintaining documented evidence of actions on each pending issue remain key. RAB Management should submit an action plan for the partially or not yet implemented issues by no later than end February 2021. The plan should clearly show the issues that need Board intervention.

Results Monitoring

27. **Results Framework (RF).** Further progress has been made towards tracking the Program results indicators relative to the previous mission but some important gaps remain, especially with regard to measurement of PDO indicators. The following issues are still pending and it is critical to provide timely resolution on these:

(i). The PDO indicator based on the Enabling the Business of Agriculture (EBA) scores was extensively discussed, in view of the adjustments in the methodology for data selection and scoring by the World Bank EBA team since the publication of the 2017 indicator scores. Considering these changes and to ensure data collection consistency throughout the PforR-2 program lifetime, the GoR and the mission agreed on following a revised and tailored methodology for tracking this indicator in the RF. The Bank EBA team shared with the GoR the proposed revisions, which extend over baselines, intermediary and final targets. Subject to feedback from the GoR, these revisions will be processed through a formal level-2 restructuring that will be initiated without delay, in line with the Bank policies and guidelines;

(ii). The PDO indicator related to the assessment of MINAGRI's performance in achieving the milestones established in the OD Plan was discussed in light of the adoption of the OD Plan in August 2020. MINAGRI will define the specifics of the methodology for calculating this indicator, in line with the PAD methodological framework and considering the exact milestones foreseen in the OD Plan; an intermediary progress assessment against the targets set for this indicator will need to be captured in the next semi-annual progress report, which is due no later than 6 months after the adoption of the OD Plan;

(iii). The PDO indicator on the volume of private sector investment (in US\$) matching public financing in PPP infrastructure projects had not yet been measured at the time of the mission. MINAGRI is working jointly with RDB to determine the required updated investment values;

(iv) The survey for calculating the outstanding baseline for the indicator on the business leaders' perceptions of the agricultural investment climate in Rwanda was stalled because of the COVID restrictions. The questionnaire has been finalized and arrangements had originally been made to conduct this survey in conjunction with (or as a module of) the regular investor survey carried out jointly by the National Bank of Rwanda (NBR), the National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda (NISR), RDB and the Private Sector Federation (PSF). However, given the lingering pandemic, the survey has been suspended. The mission and the GoR discussed alternative ways that would enable data collection virtually (e.g. by phone or online surveys) for the purposes of the program's RF. Based on this, MINAGRI in collaboration with PSF will make the necessary arrangements. This survey needs to be treated with priority and completed without delay; and

(v) MINAGRI has provided a progress update on the number of productive alliances under implementation (for which baselines needed to be established after the start of the program); however, the baseline MINAGRI determined for high value crops is higher than the target originally included in the PAD. A technical discussion will be conducted on this issue to determine whether adjustments to this indicator or its targets are needed and will be included in the upcoming restructuring package.

Multi-Donor Trust Fund (MTDF) – Development Partner Contributions

28. As of November 25, 2020, the World Bank has disbursed to the GoR US\$40.72 million of the committed US\$71 million from the MDTF⁶ for achieved years 1 and 2 DLI targets. The balance will cover disbursements against achievement of the year 3 targets as detailed in the AF financing agreement. A portion of the funds from the Bank Executed (BE) component of the MDTF has and will continue to cover costs for TA to MINAGRI to advance achievement of the remaining DLI targets.

Agriculture Public Expenditure Review (AgPER) 2019

29. The AgPER⁷ has two objectives: (i) to conduct a “deep dive” of the adequacy and composition of the approved agriculture sector budget and its alignment with the objectives of GoR’s Fourth Strategic Plan for Agriculture Transformation (PSTA4) within a medium-term expenditure framework; and (ii) to develop in-house capacity on conducting thematic PERs in MINECOFIN and MINAGRI. Its finalization fell behind due to delays in the timely provision of needed data. A draft report is now available and review comments have been provided by both the MINAGRI and MINECOFIN technical teams. Finalization of the AgPER report is expected in March 2021. A workshop to present the findings to the stakeholders will be planned.

30. During the mission the GoR raised the issue of including the apportionment of cross-cutting expenditures from other Ministries in the AgPER. However, this exercise will require significantly more time on both the part of the GoR and the AgPER preparation consulting team. The mission therefore recommended that the apportionment exercise be conducted as a separate activity which falls outside the scope of the AgPER.

IV. NEXT STEPS

31. The next support mission will be conducted in May 2021.

⁶ It has 2 components: a recipient executed (RE) component which funds implementation of the GoR executed PForR-2 activities; and a Bank-executed (BE) component which finances the cost of the WB’s administration, management, technical support and supervision of the implementation of the MDTF.

⁷ A PAP action launched in October 2019

Annex 1: List of People Virtually Met and Task Team

Names	Organization	Position
GOVERNMENT		
Jean Claude Musabyimana	MINAGRI	Permanent Secretary
Octave Semwaga	MINAGRI	Director General Planning
Gatera I. Eric	MINAGRI	Advisor DG Planning
Niyonsaba Evergiste	MINAGRI	IT Officer
Edith Kagwera	MINAGRI	Agri-finance Specialist
Beatrice Uwumukiza	MINAGRI	DG RALIS
Arnauld Ishimwe	MINAGRI	Investment Specialist/Advisor to Minister of State
Sam Barigye	MINAGRI	IT consultant
Daniel Mirimo	MINAGRI	Extension
Nirere Marion	MINAGRI-SPIU	Coordinator
Ntakirutimana Corneille	NAEB	Planning Division Manager
Charles Murekezi	MINAGRI	DG Agriculture Development
Jules Rutebuka	RAB	Project Officer
Birasa Nyamurinda	RDB	Agriculture Investments
Emmanuel Twagira yezu	MINAGRI	Soil and Water Management Specialist
DEVELOPMENT PARTNERS		
Ton Negenman	Embassy, Kingdom of the Netherlands	First Embassy Secretary
Annie Chapados	FCDO	Livelihoods Advisor
Dirk Deprez	ENABEL	Head of Belgian Cooperation
WORLD BANK TASK TEAM		
Winston Dawes	WB	Sr. Agriculture Economist, Task Team Leader
Irene Bomani	WB	Agriculture Specialist
Irina Schuman	WB	Senior Agriculture Economist
Dany Jones	WB	Senior IT Officer
Abhinav Gupta	WB	Private Sector Specialist
Esdra Byiringiro	WB	Agriculture Economist
Lobna Ahmed	WB	Senior Public Sector Finance Specialist
George Bob Nkulanga	WB	Social Development Specialist
Christine Kasedde	WB	Environmental Specialist
Belinda Mutesi	WB	Program Assistant
Chinedum Nwoko	WB	Consulting Executive
Christopher Ian Brett	WB	Lead Agribusiness Specialist
Toshiko Ono	WB	Senior Financial Sector Specialist
Asuka Akumura	WB	Operations Officer
Samjhana Thapa	WB	Senior Agriculture Economist
Samuel Taffesse	WB	Senior Agriculture Economist
Mkombozi Bosco Karake	WB	Financial Management Specialist

Annex 2: Year 2 DLI Implementation Status as of November 25, 2020

DLI	YEAR 1			Actions and DLR for year 2 (2019/20)	DLR for year 3 (2020/21)
	DLR	Accomplished activities	Status		
DLI 1: Organizational Development Plan successfully prepared and implementation on track	Organizational Review, including capacity needs assessment of MINAGRI completed and new functional structures in place	Organizational review was finalized and MINAGRI prepared management letter and comments (the latter will inform the preparation of the Organizational Development Plan).	Year 1 target met and corresponding funds disbursed in 2019.	Preparation of an Organizational Development Plan is ongoing. The World Bank has recruited Ernst & Young to support MINAGRI with this task.	Upgrade of HR Management Function
DLI 2: Improved analytical and policy reform competencies demonstrated	Private sector leveraging strategy (PSLS) with implementation plan published	MINAGRI presented the Strategy in the Agricultural Sector Working Group (ASWG) meeting on 09/24/19. The ASWG endorsed the strategy subject to final comments being addressed.	Year 1 target met and corresponding funds disbursed in 2019. Implementation of the PSLS is ongoing.	MINAGRI is implementing the PSLS and shared with the Bank the annual implementation progress report in March 2020. MINAGRI is updating the report based on an agreed format with the Bank.	Agriculture input subsidy schemes reviewed, alternative models for increasing efficiency assessed, reforms agreed and implemented
DLI 3: Digital information platforms designed and operational	Common Data Warehouse platform is designed and ready for use, where existing data in MIS and Agriculture Land Information System I (ALIS) are fully interfaced (at least down to the level of all districts).	MINAGRI successfully interfaced MIS and ALIS; the corresponding dashboard is available to MINAGRI management and staff. This constitutes a critical step towards the completion of a full-fledged data warehouse before the end of the Program. To achieve this goal and stay on schedule, the mission and MINAGRI agreed on a high level workplan, outlining the steps and milestones to be achieved in the next two years.	Year 1 target met and corresponding funds disbursed in 2019.	MINAGRI's current reporting infrastructure (data collection, reporting and aggregation processes and dashboard) built as part of phase 1 of the CDW needs to be improved with additional quality data sets to meet the year 2 deliverables (see details in paragraph 9 of this AM).	Livestock registration application (holding cow data with national coverage) will be interfaced with MIS, ALIS 1 and 2, farmer registration application in the common data warehouse. Sector performance dashboard is in place and publicly accessible online, and provides reports on national agriculture macro indicators, national indicator on food security and PSTA 4 results indicators.
DLI 4: Mechanism to Strengthen Agriculture Public-Private Dialogues (Ag. PPD) and Agriculture Value	Two mechanisms designed, piloted, and budgeted: (1) National Agriculture Public-Private Dialogues (Ag. PPD) on themes with strategic relevance and (2)	Completed. MINAGRI provided the Agri-PPD and VC strategy document.	Funds were disbursed against the year 1 target in 2019.	Two national Ag. PPDs held and at least 3 AVCP established with operating plans. Subject to OAG verification, 2 Agricultural PPDs on "Access to	Additional 2 Ag. PPDs and Agriculture VC platforms are fully functional and yielded evidence of satisfactory results (as per M&E of operating plan)

DLI	YEAR 1			Actions and DLR for year 2 (2019/20)	DLR for year 3 (2020/21)
	DLR	Accomplished activities	Status		
Chain Platforms designed and implemented	Commodity value chain platforms.			Agriculture Inputs” and on “Local Production and Marketing of Seeds” were conducted and 6 Value Chain (VC) Platforms on milk, coffee, fishery, horticulture, Irish potato, and tree-tomato were organized. Abi-annual report on VC platforms with detailed operating plans and budgets was shared with the Bank and revised to incorporate the Bank’s comments and guidance.	
DLI 5: New Irrigation area identified, developed and/or managed where commercial viability has been a determining appraisal criterion	NONE			<p>Number of hectares identified, developed and put under recognized PPP increased: 1,260.</p> <p>1807 ha (vs the 1,680ha end of program target) under seven irrigation schemes have been identified and are in different stages of development. Of the seven schemes two of them (Rwinkwavu scheme and Kanyonyomba system) account for 1,587ha under irrigation.</p>	Number of hectares identified, developed and put under recognized PPP increased: 1,680.
DLI 6: New Terracing area identified, developed and/or managed where commercial viability has been a determining appraisal criterion	NONE			<p>The year 2 target of “745 ha to be identified, developed and put under recognized PPP increased” has been met and disbursed against.</p> <p>As of the end of the mission, 2,900 ha of new radical terraces have been identified for year 3. The largest project covers 1,200 ha.</p>	Number of hectares identified, developed and put under recognized PPP increased: 2,310

DLI	YEAR 1			Actions and DLR for year 2 (2019/20)	DLR for year 3 (2020/21)
	DLR	Accomplished activities	Status		
DLI7: Volume of private sector investment (in US\$) matching public financing in PPP infrastructure project	NONE			<p>Volume of private sector investment (in US\$) matching public financing in PPP infrastructure projects: \$4 million (or more)</p> <p>New infrastructure investment projects with private investment totaling US\$3,152,119 were identified.</p>	<p>Volume of private sector investment (in US\$) matching public financing in PPP infrastructure projects: \$7.15 million (or more)</p>
DLI8: Private sector extension service models designed, launched and achieving positive response	NONE			<p>Number of farm households reached by private advisory services (non-outgrower scheme) has increased: 6,000</p> <p>8000 of additional farm households were reached by private advisory services (non-outgrower-schemes', and '10,000 of new farm households participating in outgrower schemes has increased.</p>	<p>Number of farm households reached by private advisory services (non-outgrower scheme) has increased: 8,000</p> <p>Number of new farm households participating in out grower schemes has increased: 10,000</p>
DLI9: Reform of RAB	<p>Report on RAB restructuring was completed.</p> <p>The disbursement against the year 1 target was completed.</p> <p>Implementation of the RAB restructuring is ongoing. Some staff gaps (about 15% of the needs) still need to be covered and are awaiting Cabinet approval. The Procedures Manual was approved, and the Internal Rules and Regulations are expected to be approved in October.</p>			<p>+/- 3% Deviation between budget and out turn expenditure 2019/20</p> <p>The year 2 DLI target has not yet been met due to: (i) a delay in contract execution by suppliers mainly in irrigation due to COVID 19, and thus on expenses and payment to those suppliers; (ii) new placement and recruitment of public servants and staffing at RAB, thus delays in compensation of employees budget execution; and (iii) externally funded projects, mainly</p>	<p>Unqualified audit opinion on financial statement of RAB</p> <p>RAB improved its internal auditing capacity by increasing the number of internal auditors from 2 to 5, and by assigning more specific oversight responsibilities to them. These measures will help tighten controls and ensure that RAB will achieve a clean audit opinion by the end of the Program.</p>

DLI	YEAR 1			Actions and DLR for year 2 (2019/20)	DLR for year 3 (2020/21)
	DLR	Accomplished activities	Status		
	Preparation of the Strategic Plan for RAB for the next 5 years should start in October with TECAN support.			for scientists were not implemented as planned due to delays in DP fund transfers which affected the law budget execution rate.	

Annex 3: Program Action Plan (PAP) Implementation Progress as of November 25, 2020

Action Description	Completion Measurement	Timing as per PAD	Status	Comments
1. Map external capacity support against priorities of Organizational Development of MINAGRI	External Capacity Support Strategy prepared and approved by ASWG	30/06/2019	Fulfilled as an outcome of the Organizational Development (OD) Plan. It was approved by the OAG. COVID-19 prevented the ASWG meeting to approve the document.	This PAP is an outcome of the Organizational Development (OD) Plan.
2. Assess current agriculture financial guarantee scheme	Agriculture guarantee scheme review undertaken and reviewed by the ASWG	01/09/2019	Completed	Discussed in the ASWG. The evaluation is ongoing under the design of the Rwanda Risk Sharing Facility
3. Ensuring gender equity	Gender mainstreaming strategy developed and endorsed	01/09/2019	Completed	The strategy was validated and launched by the Hon. Minister in October 8, 2019
4. MINAGRI Strengthens the monitoring and reporting on food security and nutrition	FSNMS developed and endorsed	01/09/2019	Completed	The Food Security and Nutrition Monitoring System (FSNMS) study for the year 2020 was interrupted by NISR due to irregular data collection caused by COVID-19 pandemic. Currently the CFSVA 2021 survey is being planned and will include components of FSNMS.
5. Annual financial Audit Action Plan for RAB developed and endorsed by the Audit Committee.	Annual action plan to address the weaknesses identified in RAB's financial audit developed, endorsed by the Audit committee and shared with the World Bank.	Yearly	Completed for year 2	The Annual Action Plan for FY 2020/21 is available and was shared with Bank.
6. MINAGRI mainstreams Climate Change into the sector's planning, budgeting, monitoring and implementation.	Strategy developed with action plan (including a section on MINAGRI on building capacity focal points, new staff, links to relevant Ministries, projects and	30/09/2018	Completed	The 'Environment, Natural Resources and Climate Change Mainstreaming Strategy' was shared with the ASWG members on December 7, 2018.

Action Description	Completion Measurement	Timing as per PAD	Status	Comments
	staff training identified) approved by ASWG.			
7. Stakeholders, beneficiaries using Grievance System and MINAGRI responding appropriately.	Report provides a summary of grievances received by MINAGRI and the response provided annually by June 30th	Quarterly	Completed for Q1 and Q2.	The quarterly reports (Q1 & Q2) are available and have been shared with the Bank.
8. Public expenditure review	A Report providing detailed analysis of sector spending among all key stakeholders.	15/01/2020	Ongoing	AgPER draft report available. MINAGRI is to provide comments on draft.
9. Establish within MINAGRI a mechanism for assessing progress toward establishing systems for IT, Monitoring and Evaluation and Statistics.	Annual report on the quality of information systems, key challenges and action plan to be provided annually by June 30th.	Yearly	Ongoing	There are regular meetings between MINAGRI, MYICT and RISA. A complete file of existing minutes to be provided by January 30 th .
10. Systems for tracking the quality of coordination designed and operational.	Methodology agreed action approved, and implementation plan agreed.	01/09/2018	Completed	Online satisfaction survey (https://docs.google.com/forms/d/e/1FAIpQLSddMOQxldGQuIAoexmZxK1cEESmFYzV6-MK2C9t-0viisYMFg/viewform) ASWG members surveyed in September 2020 reported a 100% satisfaction rate about the way the ASWG meeting was organized. The meeting theme was the PSTA 4 MTR.
11. Review of Medium-Term Expenditure Framework.	Medium-Term Expenditure Framework review completed.	31/12/2018	Completed	
12. Develop and implement capacity building training program on ESIM to improve understanding and application of GoR E&S policies for National and District level staff. Audience should include	Increase in trained staff at the national and district levels.	Yearly	Delayed	Planned trainings at the District level postponed due to COVID-19. Training will be resumed online in Q2.

Action Description	Completion Measurement	Timing as per PAD	Status	Comments
any private sector entities participating in the Program.				
13. Compliance checklist to ensure that activities that are not legally permissible are not undertaken and that requisite permissions are taken before any scheme/intervention is financed.	The Checklist should follow the criteria for ineligible infrastructure for financing under the PforR-2 Program, presented in the ESSA.	30/06/2019	Completed in 10/31/2019	The Private Sector Leveraging Strategy (PSLS) captured the checklist for ineligible infrastructure. However, the use of the screening checklist remains a challenge. MINAGRI will need to ensure close follow up and compliance with the applicable E&S requirements.
14. Private Sector Leveraging Strategy, establish selection/ performance criteria for private sector consistent with ESIM & gov E&S regs. For selected private sector orgs, required quality ESMS developed & adopted prior to participation in PforR-2 Program.	Mechanism for selection of private sector entities with enough capacity for diligent environmental and social management. Increase capacity of other private sector entities participating in the Program implementation.	30/06/2019	Completed in 10/31/2019	The PSLS captured the mechanism for selection of private sector entities but implementation is inadequate and MINAGRI has not yet provided evidence of existence of ESMS for participating private sector entities. MINAGRI should provide evidence by 03/30/2020.
15. Private Sector Leveraging Strategy to include conditions for GoR land acquisition and Compensation management and exclude high risk investments financing.	Design model for PPP investments that reduces potential negative environmental and social risks and continues good practices established by the Districts under MINAGRI publicly financed projects.	30/06/2019	Completed in 10/31/2019	The PSLS includes conditions for GoR land acquisition.
16. PPP Agreement to include a requirement to comply with ESIM through implementation.	Establish a legal requirement to comply with established sectoral Environmental and Social risk management practices.	30/06/2019	Completed in 10/31/2019	The PSLS includes requirements for PPPs that comply with ESIM. The WB has not yet received verifiable evidence of compliance of private sector entities and farmers to Environmental and Social requirements. Private sector entities are yet to develop Environmental and Social Management System (ESMS). MINAGRI will prepare a consolidated report on E&S implementation and share it with the Bank by February 26, 2020.

Action Description	Completion Measurement	Timing as per PAD	Status	Comments
17. Conduct an audit to assess the application of the private sector screening procedure.	Assess effectiveness of the private sector screening to establish the quality and application of the environmental and social system of the participating private sector entity.	30/06/2019	Not yet due	To be conducted in year 3
18. Procurement Action Plan developed to address procurement risks.	Procurement action plan addresses: exclusion of Bank debarred firms, negotiating on bid prices, delays in contract award, incomplete Program procurement records, and use of inappropriate selection methods.	30/06/2019	Action Plan was prepared. Three additional recommendations were made by the Bank to strengthen completion measurement actions for the procurement related PAPs.	Two of the 3 recommendations are outstanding (MINAGRI to remind all implementing agencies, including RAB & districts, to strictly check Bank debarred firms in every procurement activity under the program & MINAGRI in consultation with RPPA to send out a directive to all PForR implementing agencies to refrain from price negotiation).
19. MINAGRI to report on screening and management of Land Acquisition and Resettlement (LAR) issues in program activities.	Program consolidated resettlement and expropriation completion report.	Quarterly	Not yet applicable	

Annex 4: DLI – 3 Terms of Reference PforR-2 Data Warehouse MINAGRI IT Project Working Group

Purpose of the Working Group

The overall objective of the Data Warehouse IT Project Working Group is to support the development and implementation phase of the PforR DLI3 component. The working group will carry out the following responsibilities as part of joint application development effort:

- Collaborate and work with external government and private agencies for data access and retrieval. External agencies include but are not limited to RAB, LODA, RLUMA, NISR, etc.;
- Provide specification and requirements for overall data warehouse including specific Dashboard / Reports;
- Provide support in identifying and agreeing on data governance and analysis;
- Personnel, organizational and business process management;
- Roll-out and maintenance planning; and
- Sign-off for production release.

Each of the above specific aspects of the project will be managed as a sub-project, with an agreed set of deliverables and timeline. They will comprise several discrete tasks and activities with the aim of ensuring satisfactory and timely delivery of the agreed products.

Completion of the tasks and activities leading to a satisfactory outcome of the project will require specialists input from individuals possessing knowledge of the relevant functional areas as well as expertise in disciplines applicable to the various work streams. The Working Group is designed to bring together individuals possessing the relevant knowledge and skills who will act either individually or collectively to undertake assigned tasks and activities in order to achieve the project's objectives.

Terms of Reference

The Working Group will:

- be led by a Project Coordinator assigned by MINAGRI.
- work jointly with the Project Coordinator and other members of the Working Group within and across work streams to define tasks and activities, and the processes and resources for their accomplishment.
- undertake allocated tasks within specific work streams.
- identify and bring to the attention of the Project Coordinator any additional tasks that may be necessary in order to achieve a specific outcome.
- bring to the attention of the Project Coordinator any problems and issues that may adversely affect the timely accomplishment of allocated tasks, such as a lack of resources to meet deadlines, skill shortage areas, etc.
- coordinate data warehouse implementation with the World Bank IT team and consultants.
- contribute to the project's Communications Plan, e.g. by participating in system demonstrations, briefing sessions, etc.

Membership

The Working Group will include in its membership representatives of functional areas to be selected by MINAGRI. Its chair will be nominated by MINAGRI.

Working Group meetings

- The Working Group will meet on a biweekly basis with an agenda that will include monitoring progress against achievement of project objectives, any problems or issues encountered, and demonstration of the work completed.
- An agenda will be produced and issued to members before each meeting.
- Members will be invited to contribute items to the agenda if they wish.
- The Project Coordinator will be responsible for producing and circulating the agenda and minutes which should be shared with the World Bank.

Annex 5: DLI – 4 “Agriculture VC platforms are fully functional and yield evidence of satisfactory results”

1. Criteria for Fully Functional Value Chain Platforms (VCPs)

The VCP should focus on only one commodity. Each VCP should focus on only one commodity at a time. Additionally, private sector stakeholders engaged in that particular value chain commodity should attend the dialogue and should be actively involved in the resolution of the issues.

The VCP should have a well-planned agenda that is provided in advance to the attendees. The agendas of the VCPs should be well planned and thoroughly researched. The Agenda of the meeting should be clearly documented and distributed to the participants way in advance, to ensure that the participants prepare thoroughly for the VCP. The agenda should be split into small durations and for each duration, the activity to be performed should be specified.

The VCP should bring together the relevant stakeholders of the value chains. Participants representing various sectors should attend the VCP meetings. The VCPs should be attended by representatives of private producers, aggregators, processors, other ancillary businesses involved in the value chain such as micro-finance institutions and transporters, donors, and government entities and these representatives were actively engaged in the VCP.

The VCP attendees should discuss over various relevant and crucial topics. The VCP attendees should conduct discussions over various aspects of the value chain commodity. These discussions should focus around topics such as: the competitiveness of various support services (such as access to finance, storage, Access to power, transport, packaging and market information) available for the value chain; the performance of value chain nodes (such as Research & Development, Input Supply, Production & Post Production, Processing and Distribution & Marketing) pertaining to the value chain.

The VCP should consist of a representative ‘committee’. The VCP should maintain a representative ‘committee’ which will include the VCP Chair, Vice Chair and Secretary. For issues that cannot be resolved within the VCP, these representatives should act as local and mid-level Agri-PPD Champions and move issues forward through the Agri-PPD issue channel to the necessary mechanism where the issues can be discussed and resolved.

2. Criteria for Satisfactory Results of Value Chain Platforms (VCPs)

The VCP should develop an action plan: To address the constraints of the value chain in a more organized and coordinated way, each VCP should develop its own vision, strategy, action plans that generally consist of: (i) the agreed upon resolutions; (ii) the agency responsible for implementation of the resolution; and (iii) the time allocated to implement the resolution. The VCPs should also allocate a reasonable deadline and budget for the implementation of each resolution and should develop a strategy for reporting on activities.

