

# MANAGEMENT RESPONSE

To the final evaluation of DGD funded WWF Programme:

# PROTECTION DES COMMUNAUTÉS, PEUPLES INDIGÈNES ET LEURS FORÊTS TROPICALES (2017 – 2021)

External evaluation caried out by Cota from November 2021 to April 2022

## 1. Introduction

The 2017-2021 DGD-funded Programme of WWF-Belgium aimed at supporting the livelihood of local communities and the protection of their tropical forests across three continents. The Program consisted of four projects: one in Cambodia (Mekong Flooded Forest landscape in the Kratie province), one in Ecuador (in the Mira-Mataje, Pastaza and Putumayo landscapes), and two projects in DR Congo (in the Maï-Ndombe and Virunga - North Kivu province - landscapes respectively).

After an open tender procedure in October 2021, WWF-BELGIUM commissioned the final evaluation of the programme to Cota, with Jean-Paul Ledant as team leader, and evaluators Victor Hugo Inchausty for Ecuador, Thérèse Kilensele for DR Congo and Piseth Vann for Cambodia. The evaluation process started with a kick-off meeting in November 2022 and was concluded through the submission of the final version of the evaluation report on 16 May 2022.

The main objectives of this independent evaluation required by DGD was to account for the results achieved by the programme between 2017 and 2021 and to draw a set of lessons learned and recommendations that will guide WWF-BELGIUM''s future strategies, programmatic priorities, and implementation approach.

The 35 recommendations formulated in the evaluation report were made to the different WWF offices involved in the programme. This management response provides a response to each of the 35 recommendations. There are 3 types of response (UNAIDS, p6):

- Fully Accepted: Responsible managers consider that this recommendation should be completely implemented, and the response shows how, and who and when it will be done.
- Partially Accepted: Responsible managers consider that part of the recommendation is off target and not suitable and will therefore not be acted upon, but recognise and will take action on specific parts; an explanation for a partial acceptance should be provided.
- Not Accepted: Responsible managers consider that the recommendation is based on inaccurate findings or does not address the findings suitably; the reason for non-acceptance must be explained.

This document was prepared by the WWFBELGIUM throughout May and June 2022, in consultation with the WWF partner offices in DR Congo, Ecuador and Cambodia, who, in turn, consulted stakeholders where needed. The document was shared with and signed off by the WWF-BELGIUM Senior Management Team. This management response will help to ensure that the DGD1 final evaluation is acted upon, contributing to organizational effectiveness, accountability and learning.



# 2. Overall response to the evaluation

WWF appreciates the important work of the evaluation team. It's impressive how the team understood and appropriated the complex programme in a relatively short period of time, and in a difficult context where international travel was highly restricted (due to the COVID 19 situation), and where even national travels were difficult (DR Congo) or sometimes even impossible (Ecuador).

WWF had some comments on the evaluation process (e.g. on the methodological approach and sampling design, which could have been better elaborated) and the report (structure and language sometimes difficult to understand), but these comments have been discussed constructively with the team and lead to improvements in the final report. Hence WWF is satisfied with the quality of the final report.

The profound understanding and appropriation of the programme by the team allowed the evaluation team to formulate a targeted set of conclusions and recommendations, which will help WWF to improve its work in the future, both for the second phase of the DGD funded programme and beyond.

It has to be highlighted, however, that due to the timing of the evaluation (mainly driven by the DGD requirement of having 2 evaluations during the 5-year programme cycle), the conclusions and recommendations of this evaluation only became available after the formulation of the second DGD programme phase was completed. The extent to which the recommendations could be taken up in (the formulation of) the 2<sup>nd</sup> phase of the DGD programme is therefore relatively limited. It would be advisable to have the conclusions and recommendations of the evaluation available before (or even during) the formulation of the second phase of the DGD programme (cfr. recommendations 7).

# 3. Management response to recommendations of the evaluation

# 3.1. Recommendations to WWF-BEGLIUM, WWF-ECUADOR, WWF-CAMBODIA and WWF DRC

Recommendation 1: Ensure more transpare	ency on the links between conservation and socio-
economic goals	
Management Response:	Fully accepted
Findametica of the accounts	

#### **Explanation of the response:**

WWF agrees that the lack of an overall objective at project level contributed to ambiguity. Moreover, it is acknowledged that the links (including potential trade-offs) between conservation and socio-economic development should be identified more clearly at the level of the overall and/or specific objective level and ToC (Theory of Change) in order to increase transparency and reduce ambiguity. This will also facilitate adaptive management.

WWF acknowledges that local human well-being and conservation concerns are equally important and that they are intrinsically intertwined.

Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:
In the ToC of the second phase DGD projects,	2021 (done)	WWF-BELGIUM and
the goals and values that drive the		partners
formulation of the projects have been made		
more explicit (as compared to the Phase 1,		
when the ToC was indeed too 'light') and the		



links between socio-economic development		
and conservation are clarified (concentrical		
and without subordination link, as suggested		
by the final evaluation report)		
For the Phase 2 for the Ecuador project,	2021 (done during the	WWF-ECUADOR
actions which have a clear link between	design of the proposal	(Planning and
conservation and human well-being were	for Phase 2 and will be	Monitoring Team
prioritised as well as those that provide	implemented	together with the
specialised support to the local economy	throughout the project	Landscape Conservation
without harming the environment	2022 – 2026)	team)
For the Phase 2 for the Cambodia project,	2021 (done during the	WWF-CAMBODIA
Result 3 has been formulated to focus	design of the proposal	
specifically on community livelihoods and has	for Phase 2 and will be	
strengthened the links between socio-	implemented	
economic wellbeing objectives (improved	throughout the project	
food security, improved revenue from	2022 – 2026)	
sustainable activities, and improved land		
security through titling processes).		
For the Phase 2 Mai Ndombe project: Identify	2022 – 2026	WWF DRC
and explain to communities in Maseke &		
Mongama the links/trade-offs and the		
timeframe (e.g. trade-off between short term		
economic benefits and long-term benefits),		
e.g., related to zoning, logging in the short		
term) versus Payment for Ecosystem Services		
(PES) in the longer term), hunting (e.g., need		
to stop hunting to allow bushmeat species to		
recover versus short term bushmeat). Try to		
quantify the trade-off as a basis for mitigating		
action. Seek complementary funding to		
implement mitigating measures		
The high-level (impact) goals (overall goals	2023 onwards	WWF-BELGIUM (MEAL
beyond the SO level) and the difference		specialist)
between both will be made more explicit in		
the logical frameworks of future projects.		
This might require additional training of staff		
(both at WWF-BELGIUM and partner level)		

Recommendation 2: Improve approaches for project design		
Management Response:	Fully accepted	
Explanation of the response:		
Although all staff contributed to the formulation of the phase 1 DGD projects to the best of their		
ability, it is acknowledged that in hindsight, the design of the projects could have been stronger,		
including the vision on the post-implementation project. This was mainly due to the fact that this		
was the first experience WWF-BELGIUM and its partners had with the elaboration of a multiannual		
DGD programme. The experiences and lessons learned of the first phase are in line with this		
recommendation and have already been taker	n into account for the formulation of the 2 <sup>nd</sup> phase.	

Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:	
Since 2016, when the 1st programme phase	As from 2017	WWF-BELGIUM and	k
was developed, WWF-BELGIUM and the		country offices	
country offices invested to improve its MEAL			



capacity, in terms of dedicated MEAL staff,  M&E systems and training towards staff and partners. For example:  - WWF-BELGIUM IP team has a dedicated MEAL specialist now who is supporting the formulation, monitoring and evaluation of WWF- BELGIUM international programmes - Inspired by the evaluation requirements of the DGD programme, WWF-BELGIUM is investigating the allocation of a specific budget for the (internal) evaluation of projects funded with own funding - WWF-BELGIUM staff participate in (M&E) training organised by the NGO federations - WWF DRC and KH also recruited dedicated M&E staff - WWF-ECUADOR reviewed its M&E system during the implementation of the 1st phase of the DGD project Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to: - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr. Recommendation 10)
partners. For example:  - WWF-BELGIUM IP team has a dedicated MEAL specialist now who is supporting the formulation, monitoring and evaluation of WWF-BELGIUM international programmes  - Inspired by the evaluation requirements of the DGD programme, WWF-BELGIUM is investigating the allocation of a specific budget for the (internal) evaluation of projects funded with own funding  - WWF-BELGIUM staff participate in (M&E) training organised by the NGO federations  - WWF DRC and KH also recruited dedicated M&E staff  - WWF-ECUADOR reviewed its M&E system during the implementation of the 1st phase of the DGD project Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
- WWF-BELGIUM IP team has a dedicated MEAL specialist now who is supporting the formulation, monitoring and evaluation of WWF-BELGIUM international programmes - Inspired by the evaluation requirements of the DGD programme, WWF-BELGIUM is investigating the allocation of a specific budget for the (internal) evaluation of projects funded with own funding - WWF-BELGIUM staff participate in (M&E) training organised by the NGO federations - WWF DRC and KH also recruited dedicated M&E staff - WWF-ECUADOR reviewed its M&E system during the implementation of the 1st phase of the DGD project Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to: - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
- WWF-BELGIUM IP team has a dedicated MEAL specialist now who is supporting the formulation, monitoring and evaluation of WWF-BELGIUM international programmes - Inspired by the evaluation requirements of the DGD programme, WWF-BELGIUM is investigating the allocation of a specific budget for the (internal) evaluation of projects funded with own funding - WWF-BELGIUM staff participate in (M&E) training organised by the NGO federations - WWF DRC and KH also recruited dedicated M&E staff - WWF-ECUADOR reviewed its M&E system during the implementation of the 1st phase of the DGD project Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to: - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
dedicated MEAL specialist now who is supporting the formulation, monitoring and evaluation of WWF-BELGIUM international programmes  Inspired by the evaluation requirements of the DGD programme, WWF-BELGIUM is investigating the allocation of a specific budget for the (internal) evaluation of projects funded with own funding  WWF-BELGIUM staff participate in (M&E) training organised by the NGO federations  WWF DRC and KH also recruited dedicated M&E staff  WWF-ECUADOR reviewed its M&E system during the implementation of the 1st phase of the DGD project  Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
is supporting the formulation, monitoring and evaluation of WWF-BELGIUM international programmes  Inspired by the evaluation requirements of the DGD programme, WWF-BELGIUM is investigating the allocation of a specific budget for the (internal) evaluation of projects funded with own funding  WWF-BELGIUM staff participate in (M&E) training organised by the NGO federations  WWF DRC and KH also recruited dedicated M&E staff  WWF-ECUADOR reviewed its M&E system during the implementation of the 1st phase of the DGD project  Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
monitoring and evaluation of WWF-BELGIUM international programmes  - Inspired by the evaluation requirements of the DGD programme, WWF-BELGIUM is investigating the allocation of a specific budget for the (internal) evaluation of projects funded with own funding  - WWF-BELGIUM staff participate in (M&E) training organised by the NGO federations  - WWF DRC and KH also recruited dedicated M&E staff  - WWF-ECUADOR reviewed its M&E system during the implementation of the 1st phase of the DGD project  Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
BELGIUM international programmes  - Inspired by the evaluation requirements of the DGD programme, WWF-BELGIUM is investigating the allocation of a specific budget for the (internal) evaluation of projects funded with own funding  - WWF-BELGIUM staff participate in (M&E) training organised by the NGO federations  - WWF DRC and KH also recruited dedicated M&E staff  - WWF-ECUADOR reviewed its M&E system during the implementation of the 1st phase of the DGD project Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
- Inspired by the evaluation requirements of the DGD programme, WWF-BELGIUM is investigating the allocation of a specific budget for the (internal) evaluation of projects funded with own funding  - WWF-BELGIUM staff participate in (M&E) training organised by the NGO federations  - WWF DRC and KH also recruited dedicated M&E staff  - WWF-ECUADOR reviewed its M&E system during the implementation of the 1st phase of the DGD project Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
requirements of the DGD programme, WWF-BELGIUM is investigating the allocation of a specific budget for the (internal) evaluation of projects funded with own funding  - WWF-BELGIUM staff participate in (M&E) training organised by the NGO federations  - WWF DRC and KH also recruited dedicated M&E staff  - WWF-ECUADOR reviewed its M&E system during the implementation of the 1st phase of the DGD project Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
programme, WWF-BELGIUM is investigating the allocation of a specific budget for the (internal) evaluation of projects funded with own funding  - WWF-BELGIUM staff participate in (M&E) training organised by the NGO federations  - WWF DRC and KH also recruited dedicated M&E staff  - WWF-ECUADOR reviewed its M&E system during the implementation of the 1st phase of the DGD project Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
investigating the allocation of a specific budget for the (internal) evaluation of projects funded with own funding  - WWF-BELGIUM staff participate in (M&E) training organised by the NGO federations  - WWF DRC and KH also recruited dedicated M&E staff  - WWF-ECUADOR reviewed its M&E system during the implementation of the 1st phase of the DGD project Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
specific budget for the (internal) evaluation of projects funded with own funding  - WWF-BELGIUM staff participate in (M&E) training organised by the NGO federations  - WWF DRC and KH also recruited dedicated M&E staff  - WWF-ECUADOR reviewed its M&E system during the implementation of the 1st phase of the DGD project Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
specific budget for the (internal) evaluation of projects funded with own funding  - WWF-BELGIUM staff participate in (M&E) training organised by the NGO federations  - WWF DRC and KH also recruited dedicated M&E staff  - WWF-ECUADOR reviewed its M&E system during the implementation of the 1st phase of the DGD project Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
evaluation of projects funded with own funding  - WWF-BELGIUM staff participate in (M&E) training organised by the NGO federations  - WWF DRC and KH also recruited dedicated M&E staff  - WWF-ECUADOR reviewed its M&E system during the implementation of the 1st phase of the DGD project  Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
own funding  - WWF-BELGIUM staff participate in (M&E) training organised by the NGO federations  - WWF DRC and KH also recruited dedicated M&E staff  - WWF-ECUADOR reviewed its M&E system during the implementation of the 1st phase of the DGD project Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
- WWF-BELGIUM staff participate in (M&E) training organised by the NGO federations - WWF DRC and KH also recruited dedicated M&E staff - WWF-ECUADOR reviewed its M&E system during the implementation of the 1st phase of the DGD project Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to: - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
(M&E) training organised by the NGO federations  - WWF DRC and KH also recruited dedicated M&E staff  - WWF-ECUADOR reviewed its M&E system during the implementation of the 1st phase of the DGD project Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
federations  - WWF DRC and KH also recruited dedicated M&E staff  - WWF-ECUADOR reviewed its M&E system during the implementation of the 1st phase of the DGD project  Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary,  WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
- WWF DRC and KH also recruited dedicated M&E staff - WWF-ECUADOR reviewed its M&E system during the implementation of the 1st phase of the DGD project Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
dedicated M&E staff  - WWF-ECUADOR reviewed its M&E system during the implementation of the 1st phase of the DGD project Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
- WWF-ECUADOR reviewed its M&E system during the implementation of the 1st phase of the DGD project  Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
system during the implementation of the 1st phase of the DGD project  Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
the 1st phase of the DGD project Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
the 1st phase of the DGD project Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
Although it is acknowledged that this is an ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
ongoing trajectory and that continued capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
capacity strengthening remains necessary, WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
WWF is confident that it has already made substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
substantial progress and is evolving in the right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
right direction  During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
During the formulation of future project proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
proposals, more attention will be given to:  - A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
- A clear needs assessment and problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
problem analysis as a basis for project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
project formulation (including an analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
analysis of the causal links between problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
problems), linking the proposal to the relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
relevant landscape ToC (cfr.
' '
Recommendation 10)
,
- Clearer distinction between the
situation to be reached by the end of
the implementation period (in
principle the Specific Objective SO)
and the Overall Objective (longer
term impact to contribute to)
- Improve the formulation of SMART
results and more RACER indicators
- The formulation of causal links
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
(Expected Results), outcome (Specific
Objective), and impact (Overall
Objectives) are logical and
straightforward (using more detailed



result chains or ToC), and base the analysis of risks and assumptions on such causal chains  The incorporation of sustainability requirements and cross-cutting issues in the formulation of expected results and objectives and translate them in the indicators	2021 (dono)	MANE DELCHIM
The actions above have already been taken into account during the formulation of the 2 <sup>nd</sup> phase project proposals. The new project ToCs are more explicit when it comes to specific objectives and expected results, the indicators are more SMART and the baseline and monitoring methodology are better elaborated, which will facilitate the comparison between the initial situation and the expected changes of the variables	2021 (done)	WWF-BELGIUM and partners
Continue to work on the well-being score card to monitor the DGD program	2022 - 2023	WWF-BELGIUM and partners
Elaboration of indicators to monitor resilience	2022 - 2025	WWF-BELGIUM and SECORES partners (Belgian network of NGO's working on socio- ecological resilience)
Development of internal guidelines (handbook) for project preparation.	2023	WWF-BELGIUM (MEAL Specialist)
Assessment of project development skills of candidates during selection of new staff at WWF-BELGIUM and partner level	2022 onwards	WWF-BELGIUM (HR and Director) and partners

Recommendation 3: Improve integration of cross-cutting issues			
Management Response:	Fully accepted		
Explanation of the response:			
Although gender has been integrated in the de	esign of the phase 1 project	ts, it is acknowledged that	
more can be done to methodologically mai	nstream gender, and that	t, more broadly, a more	
consistent approach for cross-cutting theme	s can be adopted, includi	ing the other transversal	
theme of the Belgian indirect cooperation 'environment'. Even if 'environment' is the thematic			
focus of all WWF interventions, it doesn't imply automatically that it is transversally mainstreamed.			
Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:	
Integration of gender, social inclusion and	2021 (done)	WWF-BELGIUM and	
environment / climate change in the risk		partners	
analysis and the environmental and social			
safeguards framework (ESSF) during the			
formulation of the phase 2 projects			
WWF-ECUADOR incorporated cross-cutting	Done (during the design	WWF-ECUADOR (Policy	
issues verified by the Policy and Governance	of the proposal for	and Governance Officer)	
Officer (gender, LBNO principles, FPIC of	Phase 2) and will be		
IPLCs), to be followed by its implementation	implemented		
	throughout the project		



WWF-ECUADOR will develop basic manuals to incorporate the working principles for: gender approach, inclusive conservation, rights-based approach, social and environmental safeguards and others.  Incorporating cross-cutting issues in the problem and risk analysis of future project proposals	2 <sup>nd</sup> semester of 2022  2022 onwards	WWF-ECUADOR (Policy and Governance Officer and Landscape Conservation team)  WWF-BELGIUM
A few years ago, WWF-BELGIUM started a collaboration with the Belgian NGO 'le monde selon les femmes' (specialising on gender) in order to improve gender mainstreaming in projects and to better support partners on gender related issues. This initiative, which was put on hold during the COVID pandemic, will be relaunched. This could lead to the elaboration of practical guidelines for the integration of gender (not only working with women but also with men) and LNOB in project elaboration and implementation to be applied across the DGD programme (and beyond)	2022-2023	WWF-BELGIUM (with support from partners)
Participate in relevant gender workshops and trainings organised by the WWF network (e.g. sessions on gender mainstreaming using tools developed by CARE International will be organised within the network in October 2022)	2022 onwards	WWF-BELGIUM and partners

Recommendation 4: Improve consideration for Local human needs	
Management Response:	Fully accepted
Evalenation of the recognics	

#### Explanation of the response:

It is acknowledged that for the DGD projects, satisfying local human needs is both a goal and a condition for appropriation and social support. In the formulation and implementation of the phase 1 projects, considerable effort has been made to identify and respond to local human needs, both on the short- as well as on the long-term. The identification of human needs was based on the consultations with local people. Moreover, a long-term involvement in the same project areas allows a good analysis of the evolving socio-environmental context in each landscape (good knowledge of the local culture and society, and hence human needs, e.g., the report "The Indigenous People and Local Communities State of the Land and Territory" with a case study in Ecuador).

Nevertheless, it is acknowledged that (especially for some projects like Mai Ndombe), probably too little attention was given to the short-term needs and its trade-offs with the conservation goals. Hence it is agreed that the way local human needs were considered could be improved in future project formulation and implementation. This is also strongly linked to recommendations 1 and 2, being the acknowledgement of the importance of addressing local needs as an overall objective and the importance of continuously satisfying local expectations as a condition to get social support and sustainability.

Actions:	Timeframe:	Responsible:



Adopt a more demand-driven and needs- driven approach during the identification of projects and activities  This was already done during the phase 2 elaboration (2022) and will continue to be done for the elaboration of future project proposals  Continue to improve the understanding of local culture and society through collaboration with social scientist and	and
projects and activities  elaboration (2022) and will continue to be done for the elaboration of future project proposals  Continue to improve the understanding of local culture and society through approved)  elaboration (2022) and will continue to be done for the elaboration of future project proposals  2022 onwards (if www-belgium partners)	
will continue to be done for the elaboration of future project proposals  Continue to improve the understanding of local culture and society through approved)  will continue to be done for the elaboration of guture project proposals  will continue to be done for the elaboration of guture project proposals  approved)	
for the elaboration of future project proposals  Continue to improve the understanding of local culture and society through approved)  for the elaboration of future project proposals  2022 onwards (if WWF-BELGIUM partners	
Continue to improve the understanding of local culture and society through approved)  future project proposals  2022 onwards (if WWF-BELGIUM approved)  partners	
Continue to improve the understanding of local culture and society through approved) (if WWF-BELGIUM partners	
local culture and society through approved) partners	and
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	unu
conduction with social scientist and	
capitalizing on the experience and knowledge	
acquired.	
In order to improve our understanding of	
indigenous knowledge on forest conservation	
in DRC, a project proposal was elaborated in	
cooperation with social scientists of Antwerp	
University and the University of Kisangani and	
submitted for funding to VLIR-UOS	
	MEAL
system through a more systematic approach   Specialist)	
to data management and visualization	
(dashboard), among others to obtain a basis	
for future decision making	
Promote continued long-term involvement 2022 onwards WWF-BELGIUM	and
of WWF in the same areas (for good partners	
knowledge of the context) but base	
interventions on up-dated needs	
assessments (not just continuation of past	
actions).	
Throughout the implementation of the 2 <sup>nd</sup> 2022 - 2026 WWF-ECUADOR,	KH
phase project, building confidence, ensuring and DRC	
transparency on goals and constraints,	
adopting participatory approaches,	
developing listening capacities and mutual	
dialogue and avoiding one-way sensitization	
and awareness raising campaigns	
Where possible and where this hasn't been 2022 - 2026 WWF-ECUADOR,	KH
done yet, WWF will link target communities and DRC with	the
with NGOs (or other actors) able to provide support of N	NWF-
them with services and support which goes BELGIUM	
beyond the mandate, remit and capacities of	
WWF or the project	
More specifically, WWF-ECUADOR will sign   2 <sup>nd</sup> semester of 2022   WWF-ECUADOR	
agreements with organizations and (Landscape	
consultants specialized in these areas, with Conservation team	1)
complementary expertise to improve	
production and marketing systems activities,	
etc.	
WWF-ECUADOR will prioritize actions with 1st and 2nd semester of WWF-ECUADOR	
clear linkages between conservation and 2022 and throughout (Planning	and
human wellbeing based on the participatory   the project   Monitoring	Team
approach (FPIC with the IPLC) together with	the



		Landscape Conservation
		team)
WWF-CAMBODIA will consider to provide	To be determined based	WWF-CAMBODIA
small grants to communities, and to provide	on needs	
backstopping on internal policy		
development, book-keeping, and other		
management aspects.		
WWF DRC will update the priority local	As from September	WWF DRC – Malebo
human needs (in Maseke, Mongama, Mpelu,	2022 onwards	team
Nkala) and find ways to address some of		
them, and raise additional funds for the		
needs which cannot be addressed within the		
2 <sup>nd</sup> phase project		
WWF DRC will strengthen the economic	During the whole	WWF DRC – Malebo
capacities of the local development	project (already begun	team
committees, and support them to elaborate a	on the 15 <sup>th</sup> June 2022)	
local development plan		
WWF DRC will increase cooperation with	During the whole	WWF DRC (EcoMakala
organizations in North Kivu having	project	Project manager)
complementary expertise to support the		
activities of the project (value chains,		
marketing, business plans, economics,		
techno-economic feasibility studies, legal		
advice)		

Recommendation 5: Adopt result-based management with attention on the impacts		
Management Response: Partially accepted		
Explanation of the response:		
Result-based management is a WWF core value and was already adopted and applied throughout		
the 1 <sup>st</sup> phase projects, with a varying degree of success, nonetheless. Hence it is acknowledged that		
the result-based management of the projects can be improved (but not adopted since it was already		

the result-based management of the projects can be improved (but not adopted since it was already adopted)

Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:
WWF International reviewed its internal	2021 (already done),	WWF International, to
progress reporting template (which has to be	applied as from 2022	be applied by all WWF
used by all WWF projects for internal		offices including WWF-
reporting every 6 months), increasing the		BELGIUM and partners
attention for logframe monitoring (hence		
increasing the attention to monitor results		
over merely activity reporting and using the		
indicators to check if projects are on track)		
WWF-ECUADOR clearly defined SMART	Done (during the design	WWF-ECUADOR
Indicators as well as the baseline and	of the proposal for	(Planning and
monitoring and evaluation methodology	Phase 2) and will be	Monitoring Team
	used throughout the	together with the
	project	Landscape Conservation
		team)
WWF-ECUADOR will implement a cost-	Every six months from	WWF-ECUADOR
effective monitoring system based on	2022	(Planning and
expected results and impacts.		Monitoring Team
		together with the



		Landscape Conservation team)
WWF-CAMBODIA will use outcome	Every 6 months	WWFe and FLO
harvesting tool to capture unintended outcomes	(reporting period)	
WWF DRC will use community-based	Throughout the project	WWF DRC (Malebo
monitoring of result indicators and	(2022 – 2026)	team) with support of
biodiversity indicators.		WWF-BELGIUM
Organisation of experience sharing on	To be confirmed	WWF-BELGIUM (DGD
monitoring between (WWF-BELGIUM	(between 2023 and	coordinator and MEAL
supported) projects (DGD-funded or not)	2025)	Specialist) and partners
pursuing similar "Expected Results" or having		
similar indicators		

Recommendation 6: Address the need to reduce dependency on external funds

Management Description	Fully assessed	
Management Response:	Fully accepted	
Explanation of the response:		
It is true that many project results can't be		
reduce such dependency on external funds, the projects need to pay more attention to (financial		
sustainability and to diversify sources of income		
Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:
Projects reduce dependency on external	Throughout the project	WWF-ECUADOR, KH
funds by an increased attention to (financial)	duration (2022 – 2026)	and DRC with support of
sustainability, through building sustainable		WWF-BELGIUM
economic models, ensuring sustainable net		
benefits both at the level of individual agents		
and at the level of the communities and		
paying attention to the financial self-reliance		
of the promoted systems (for example		
through local funding mechanisms, links with		
local markets or local willingness to pay,		
payments for environmental services).		
Projects increase resilience against the risk of	Throughout the project	WWF-BELGIUM and
funding interruption, notably through	duration (2022 – 2026)	partners
diversification of potential funding sources,		
preparedness to interruption and preventing		
the creation of new dependencies (e.g.		
support the IPLC organisations in Ecuador to		
manage funds (PSB and others) that help		
them to diversified the source of incomes and		
protect biodiversity)		
Strengthen capacities of partner offices to	Throughout the project	WWF-BELGIUM and
raise funds (how to prepare a proposal, links	duration (2022 – 2026)	partners
with funding sources), potentially as part of	,	•
the WWF-BELGIUM OD (organizational		
development) programme		
WWF-ECUADOR will improve the marketing	1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> semester of	WWF-ECUADOR
mechanisms of local production systems	2022 and throughout	(Landscape
(sustainable economic models or	the project	Conservation team)
approaches), the search for markets	' '	,
(environmentally friendly, social inclusive,		
1 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2	l	<u> </u>



equitable, short supply chain) and the		
profitability of the local economy.  WWF-CAMBODIA will conduct one	2022	WWF-CAMBODIA
assessment of feasibility of sustainable		
charcoal production and its value chains in		
Kratie		
WWF-CAMBODIA will hire a consultant to	2022	WWF-CAMBODIA
develop sustainable financing plan including		
lobbying strategy to the government		
WWF DRC will strengthen the capacity of	_	WWF DRC – Malebo
local people in community forestry	June 2022, ongoing for	team
management and local village based	the whole project until	
expertise (para-foresters, para-socio-	2026	
economists, para-agriculturists ) and find an		
organisational set up in which they can		
professionally operate (like a cooperative, or		
local NGO). This could result in a reduction of		
future project costs	2024 / 1 1 1 1	14845 DDC C .
In North Kivu, WWF DRC experimented the	2021 (already done)	WWF DRC – Goma team
carbon credit fund model to reduce		
dependency on 'traditional' donor funding,		
which led to significant long-term funding for		
the provincial government in North Kivu to		
invest in reforestation projects	2022 – 2023	WWF DRC – Goma team
WWF DRC will draft a business plan for seedlings and the NTFPs to implement the	2022 - 2023	www.pkc-Goma team
simple management plan at community level		
Simple management plan at community level		

#### 3.2. Recommendations to WWF-BELGIUM

<b>Recommendation 7:</b> Use the Next evaluation for subsequent programming phase		
Management Response: Fully accepted		

#### **Explanation of the response:**

Although it was the initial intention to organise a midterm evaluation (MTE) for all 4 projects, in the end only 2 projects benefited from a MTE (North Kivu and Cambodia). Due to different factors, the MTE for the Mai Ndombe and Ecuador projects was initially postponed and, in the end, cancelled (after discussion with and approval from DGD). This was mainly due to the COVID 19 situation and related travel restrictions, but also to internal HR issues (for Mai Ndombe) and M&E raisons (for Ecuador).

Due to this only partial MTE, its specific focus (for North Kivu) and limited quality (for Cambodia), the MTE was not as useful for the design of the second phase of the DGD programme (22-26) as anticipated. Nevertheless, some ideas and suggestions from the MTE have been translated into the 2<sup>nd</sup> phase projects.

Because of the delays with the MTE, the Final Evaluation (FE) process only started in September 2021, after the formulation and submission of the programme proposal for the 2<sup>nd</sup> phase (July 2021). Consequently, the conclusions and recommendations of this evaluation only became available towards the end of the DGD2 programme adaptation period (early 2022). Hence the incorporation of the recommendations of the FE in the final adaption of the DGD2 proposal was too limited. Nevertheless, some recommendations match with lessons that were already learned internally, and which were taken into consideration for the project formulation. (Majority of) The other recommendations will be integrated during implementation (and if the situation arises the



adaptation) of the DGD funded projects, as well as in the formulation and implementation of other WWF projects.

But WWF recognises that it would have been more constructive to have conclusions and recommendations of the evaluation at hand earlier so to directly benefit the formulation of the second phase of the DGD programme. Next (final) evaluation should feed into the formulation of subsequent programme phases (for DGD-funded as well as for other projects). In order to facilitate this, the following actions are proposed:

tins) the following deticins are proposed:	_	
Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:
Advocate to DGD (directly (formally during	2022 - 2023	WWF-BELGIUM (DGD
the yearly institutional dialogues, as well as		coordinator)
informally) and through the federations (NGO		
Federatie and ACODEV)) to limit the number		
of required evaluations per 5-year		
programme phase from 2 to 1 in the		
framework of the revision of the 2016 Royal		
Decree on Indirect Development		
Cooperation. These discussions are already		
on-going		
Plan the DGD2 (final) evaluation in such a way	2024 - 2025	WWF-BELGIUM (DGD
that the conclusions and recommendations		coordinator and MEAL
can inform an exit strategy and/or will feed in		specialist)
the identification and formulation of a		
potential 3 <sup>rd</sup> phase		
Elaborate an evaluation plan / strategy for	2023 - 2024	WWF-BELGIUM (MEAL
projects outside DGD funding		specialist)

	Recommendation 8: Negotiate adaptation of the DGD Format	
Management Response: Partially accepted		Partially accepted
	Explanation of the response:	

#### Explanation of the response:

WWF agrees that there is room to improve the DGD project (and programme) formulation template. The very limited amount of information which needs to be provided at programme level is not conducive for the elaboration of a consistent programme.

It is also acknowledged that the incorporation of a general objective in the DGD logframe template would be helpful during the formulation and would facilitate more impact-oriented management throughout the project implementation.

Nevertheless, WWF is not in the position nor has the mandate to 'negotiate' an adaptation of the format directly with DGD (hence the partial agreement), but WWF agrees with the core of the recommendations and will undertake the following actions:

Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:
Invite the NGO federations (NGO Federatie	2022 - 2023	WWF-BELGIUM (DGD
and ACODEV) to gather and analyse the major		coordinator and IP
findings and lessons learnt on the designs,		deputy director (who
which result from all the evaluations of DGD-		also serves as Acodev
funded programs		CA member))
Advocate to DGD (directly (formally during	2024 - 2025	WWF-BELGIUM (DGD
the yearly institutional dialogues, as well as		coordinator)
informally) and through the NGO federations)		
to adapt the DGD programme template (e.g.,		
to have (the option of) a programme level		
logframe and overall objectives at		
programme and project level), in view of the		



subsequent formulation round (2027 – 2031).
If DGD doesn't approve the changes, WWF-
BELGIUM will consider applying them at
internal level.

Recommendation 9: Support country-level partners to address their recommendations		
Management Response:	Fully accepted	
Explanation of the response:		
Support from WWF-BELGIUM to our partners in the partner countries is the core of our		
international partnerships, so WWF-BELGIUM will definitely support the partner offices to address		
'their' direct recommendations (in fact they are all considered as programme recommendations		
and hence addressing them is a joint undertak	ing).	
Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:
Support partner offices (and their field	Depending on the	WWF-BELGIUM
partners) in executing this managerial	recommendations,	
response	throughout the	
	programme phase	
	(2022 – 2027)	
Facilitate exchanges among the different	Throughout the	WWF-BELGIUM (DGD
projects (e.g., through organising online	programme phase	coordinator)
exchange workshops on specific issues)	(2022 – 2027)	

### 3.3. Recommendations to WWF offices in implementation countries

Recommendation 10: Develop Strategic planning at landscape level		
Management Response: Fully accepted		

#### **Explanation of the response:**

WWF recognizes the need to ensure synergies at landscape level, which can be facilitated by a landscape level strategy, which is unique, long-term and independent from the donors, and based on a vision on and understanding of the dynamics of local socio-ecosystems in the landscapes, taking into account climate change and other drivers of change. This landscape strategy should include a ToC and an indicators framework.

These landscape strategies will be used as basis for the elaboration of future project proposals, clarifying the contribution of the proposal to the landscape strategy.

7 6		
Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:
WWF-ECUADOR will develop a	2 <sup>nd</sup> semester of 2022	WWF-ECUADOR
comprehensive and long-term Strategy for		(Planning and
each Landscape (Choco, Napo-Aguarico and		Monitoring Team
Pastaza).		together with the
An individual TOC will be designed to identify		Landscape Conservation
the dynamics and drivers of change in each		team)
landscape.		
Promote continuous survey of contextual	2 <sup>nd</sup> semester of 2022	WWF-ECUADOR
indicators at landscape level (general	and throughout the	(Planning and
indicators involving social science and	project	Monitoring Team
conservation - remote sensing data on forest		together with the
change) to understand the dynamic of change		Landscape Conservation
and cooperate with other actors		team)
WWF-CAMBODIA already elaborated a	2019 - 2020	WWF-CAMBODIA
strategic plan that identifies specific		
strategies and interventions for each		



landscape. All interventions, including DGD funded projects, support the landscape strategy.		
WWF DRC will maximize learning from other WWF initiatives in the LTMN (Lac Tumba Mai Ndombe) landscape (like from PIREDD Equateur). Organise visit to PIREDD Equateur to understand methods, approaches, results, and challenges in a similar environment.	December 2022	WWF DRC
WWF DRC will develop the wider LTMN landscape strategy with SMART results and RACER indicators to which DGD project contributes. This landscape strategy will be used as basis for additional fundraising to complement the DGD project.	2023	WWF DRC
Support the elaboration of landscape strategies of the partner offices (upon demand)	2022 - 2026	WWF-BELGIUM

#### 3.4. Recommendations to WWF-ECUADOR

Recommendation 11: More Concentration (more thematic and geographic focus)			
Management Response: Partially accepted			
Typic posting of the group group			

## **Explanation of the response:**

During the formulation of the 2<sup>nd</sup> phase, WWF-ECUADOR reduced the number of intervention sites in priority landscapes, but not to extent suggested (to reduce to 1 landscape only). The reduction to a single landscape would have seriously jeopardized the consolidation of several actions that have shown a strong potential for impact and replication with other actors.

Likewise, it was not considered desirable to focus on a single theme, as this - in addition to ignoring the multidimensional nature of inclusive conservation - would have limited the impact of the project.

Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:
Prioritization of activities (thematically) with	1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> semester	WWF-ECUADOR
the greatest potential impact	2022	(Planning and
		Monitoring Team
		together with the
		Landscape Conservation
		team)
Priority intervention plan in communities	1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> semester	WWF-ECUADOR
(geographically) with the greatest potential	2022	(Planning and
for success. Cocoa commercialization will be		Monitoring Team
the focus for the indigenous communities of		together with the
Aguarico; ecotourism ventures in a		Landscape Conservation
community of Cuyabeno and one of the		team)
Pastaza River; watershed management in		
Chocó.		

Recommendation 12: Improve monitoring and results measurement		
Management Response: Fully accepted		
Explanation of the response:		



Based on the experiences of Phase 1, which showed weaknesses in the quality of the indicators and the monitoring system in general, a new and improved monitoring and evaluation system, a robust baseline and a better set of indicators were developed for the Phase 2.

Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:
Clearly define SMART Indicators (result,	Done (during the design	WWF-ECUADOR
impact and process) as well as the baseline	of the proposal for	(Planning and
and monitoring methodology through the	Phase 2) and will be	Monitoring Team
M&E Phase 2 System that is already	implemented	together with the
developed.	throughout the project	Landscape Conservation
		team)
WWF-ECUADOR will establish a system of	2 <sup>nd</sup> semester of 2022	WWF-ECUADOR
lesson learned for the entire office to	and every year for the	(Planning and
capitalize learnings on the landscapes from	duration of the project	Monitoring Team
the past experiences that also include lessons		together with the
learnt during DGD1 project		Landscape Conservation
		team)

Recommendation 13: Improve multistakeholder Strategic approach			
Management Response:	Fully accepted		
Explanation of the response:			
WWF agrees that the approach to involve the diversity of stakeholders is open to improvement			
Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:	
Update the stakeholder mapping, safeguards	2 <sup>nd</sup> semester of 2022	WWF-ECUADOR (Policy	
analysis and design risk mitigation measures		and Governance Officer	
in each landscape.		with the Landscape	
		Conservation team	

Recommendation 14: Improve Knowledge management and communication		
Management Response:	Fully accepted	
Explanation of the response:		
Recommendation already initiated in Phase 1 of the project and in the process of improvement for		
the new phase.		
Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:
Design and implement a system of historical	2 <sup>nd</sup> semester of 2022	WWF-ECUADOR
systematization (institutional memory) and	and throughout the	(Planning and
collective learning and knowledge.	project	Monitoring Team
		together with the
		Landscape Conservation
		team)
Optimize the internal communication spaces	2 <sup>nd</sup> semester of 2022	WWF-ECUADOR
of the projects in each landscape for	and every 6 months	(Landscape
exchange and coordination between project	throughout the project	Conservation team)
implementers (geographic and thematic		
areas).		

Recommendation 15: Improve Gender mainstreaming		
Management Response: Fully accepted		
Explanation of the response:		



WWF-ECUADOR acknowledges that the implementation of a cross-cutting gender strategy to mainstream gender is lacking

manistream gender is identify		
Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:
Develop and implement the gender strategy	2 <sup>nd</sup> semester of 2022	WWF-ECUADOR (Policy
for the management of the project to	and will be	and Governance Officer
promote gender equality and have response	implemented	with the Landscape
protocols in case of violence against women	throughout the project	Conservation team)
(women and girls' participation & leadership,		
impact of gender policies)		

Recommendation 16: Liaise with research			
Management Response:	Fully accepted		
Explanation of the response:			
WWF-ECUADOR agrees that there is a large gap between the generation of scientifically validated			
information and its application in the project s	ites.		
Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:	
Incorporate academia (UDLA) as an	Done (during the design	WWF-ECUADOR	
operational partner in Phase 2 of the project	of the proposal for	(Landscape	
	Phase 2) and will be	Conservation team)	
	implemented		
	throughout the project		
Strengthen agreements (institutional and	In 2022 and throughout	WWF-ECUADOR	
operational) and alliances with researchers,	the project	(Landscape	
universities and others scientific actors in		Conservation team)	
each landscape.			
WWF-ECUADOR contributed as a project	Start at the 2nd	WWF-ECUADOR	
partner to the development of a project	semester of 2022 and	(Landscape	
proposal with HoGent in the Napo-Aguarico	throughout the project	Conservation team)	
Landscape. This proposal is complementary			
to the DGD project and has been submitted			
for funding to VLIR-UOS			

Recommendation 17: Provide attractive alternatives to extractive activities	
Management Response: Partially accepted	

#### Explanation of the response:

Experience in several countries on the relationship between productive alternatives as opposed to extractive activities, determine the impossibility of real competition in economic terms of these economic activities against extractive activities or those with a much higher opportunity cost. Examples of these failures have been the illicit crop substitution programs in Colombia, or productive ventures such as coffee, cocoa, etc., as an alternative to income from mining or oil. What has proven to be most successful with a long-term impact has been the strengthening of local organizations in the governance of their territories and the improvement of their capacities to defend their rights, so it was decided to have this as main project focus.

Moreover, it seems that the recommendation seems to focus more on 'short term financial gains' alternatives, whereas the project (and WWF in general) focusses more on the longer term in a more sustainable way. Hence the partial agreement.

Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:
Develop a component to strengthen local	2 <sup>nd</sup> semester of 2022	WWF-ECUADOR (Policy
governance and the defence of territorial	and throughout the	and Governance Officer
rights to counteract negative social and	project	



environmental	pressures	(extractive	with	the	Landscape
industry).			Conse	rvatio	n team)

#### 3.5. Recommendations to WWF DRC for Mai Ndombe

**Recommendation 20:** Change cooperation with MMT

Recommendation 18: Support the marketing of communities' products				
Management Response:	Fully accepted			
Explanation of the response:	Explanation of the response:			
WWF DRC acknowledges the need for increas	WWF DRC acknowledges the need for increased support for marketing of communities' products.			
However, there is not enough room within the	However, there is not enough room within the current budgetary envelope of the DGD project (after			
budget reduction) to maintain these activities.	. But this will be the priorit	y to raise complementary		
funding.				
Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:		
Raise complementary funding to strengthen	2022 - 2023	WWF DRC		
the agricultural component in the project,				
including improved sustainable agriculture				
and marketing of agricultural products, NTFP				
and handicrafts.				

Recommendation 19: Follow-up management reforms in WWF		
Management Response: Fully accepted		
Explanation of the response:		

A fully empowered project leader who is in charge of the Mai Ndombe CFCL program (DGD and other co-financing as it occurs) is necessary. To allow the project leader to concentrate on the technical work, fund raising and stakeholder relations, it is necessary to ensure support in Malebo of a logistical and financial assistant (one or two positions); and 2) Support from Kinshasa head office for logistical, financial, and human resource management needs.

Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:
Fully empowered project leader in place	Done (hired since Jan 15 <sup>th</sup> 2022)	WWF DRC
Log and/or fin assistant in place	June 30 <sup>th</sup> 2022	WWF DRC

0 1			
Management Response:	Fully accepted		
Explanation of the response:			
MMT is in the lead for the ecotourism operation	MMT is in the lead for the ecotourism operation in Nkala and Mpelu CFCL. It is acknowledged that		
the relationship should be clarified on the	financial, logistical, orga	nisational, and technical	
cooperation. Much more communication is ne	eded between the two org	anisations.	
Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:	
Analysis of critical bottlenecks to improve	2022 - 2023	WWF DRC & MMT	
WWF MMT relations			
Partnership agreement with MMT that	Done (first signed in	WWF DRC & MMT	
clarifies the financial, logistical,	April 2022)		
organisational, and technical cooperation.			
This partnership agreement should end			
December 2024 and be evaluated via a joint			
evaluation.			

16



Recommendation 21: Build appropriation

Funding granted to MMT which takes into account the principles of the partnership agreement (and DGD requirements).		WWF DRC
At least one meeting (if possible physical, if not else virtual) every three months between		WWF DRC & MMT
MN project leader and MMT President	,	

recommendation 21: Bana appropriation	T .		
Management Response:	Fully accepted		
Explanation of the response:			
As the evaluators, WWF also observed that the		•	
$Although \ they \ were \ created \ at \ their \ demand, \ and \ secure \ land \ \& \ access \ for \ the \ communities \ to \ these$			
forests. But they are too much seen as a WWF	driven activity.		
Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:	
Clarify the CFCL perimeters on basis of the	December 2022	WWF DRC	
docs provided for their gazettement and map			
in GIS.			
Organisation of a workshop with each	First meeting done on	WWF DRC	
community explaining CFCL concept &	15 <sup>th</sup> June 2022, ongoing		
legislation, the history of their CFCL, and	during the whole		
showing the CFCL on map, and discussing	project, but mostly		
management needs and value generating	focused before dec		
opportunities, cultural proudness and	2022		
realistic timeframes.			
Invite and strengthen a dialogue with the	First meeting done on	WWF DRC	
communities about how they see the use of	15th June 2022, ongoing		
these CFCL – put them in the lead to decide	during the whole		
management action while providing technical	project.		
advice.			
Given that increased incomes are a priority	December 2023,	WWF DRC	
for communities, sensitising the local	ongoing during the		
communities to be more realistic to the fact	whole project.		
that CFCL are no panacea for quick			
sustainable income increases. This means			
that WWF needs also to focus on increasing			
incomes – by support for marketing			
communities' products and by looking into			
PES opportunities.	Dec 2022	WWE DDC	
Review the Maseke CFCL simple	Dec 2023	WWF DRC	
management plan and in particular review			
the zoning. Make sure that zoning categories are well understood/defined by			
are well understood/defined by communities.			
communicies.			

Recommendation 22: Analyse and improve the ecotourism economy		
Management Response: Partially accepted		
Evalenction of the management		

# **Explanation of the response:**

WWF has not got the ambition to be an ecotourism operator and plans to gradually phase out of its involvement in ecotourism delivery in the project area. WWF sees the operationalisation of the ecotourism to sit with MMT and the private sector, hence WWF will not be involved in direct



ecotourism marketing as such. But WWF could assist MMT with setting up a business plan that demonstrates costs, possible revenue streams and the sharing/attribution of this revenue, as well as other technical advice.

Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:
Support MMT in the development of a	December 2023	WWF DRC
business plan for ecotourism in the MMT		
CFCL.		

Recommendation 23: Continue with support to women groups			
Management Response:	Partially accepted		
Explanation of the response:			
The 2 <sup>nd</sup> phase of the project has no budget to support the same women groups as those from phase			
1 (also because the geographical focus of th	1 (also because the geographical focus of the project shifted to other villages). However, new		
women groups will be supported in the Mongama and Maseke villages, and in particular on non-			
timber forest products (NTFP) and agriculture.			
Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:	
Set up and support women groups in	Ongoing during the	WWF DRC	
Mongama and Maseke communities so as to	whole project.		
understand women's priorities and how to			
address them.			

## 3.6. Recommendations to WWF DRC for North Kivu

Recommendation 24: Develop Production and services from planted forests		
Management Response:	Fully accepted	
Explanation of the response:		
WWF agrees that it is important to increase the annual frequency of plantation as a key componen		
of the overall strategy to reduce deforestation	1	
Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:
WWF DRC will encourage tree planting, more	2021 - 2026	WWF DRC – Goma team
freely oriented towards local needs and		
markets, including for the timber production		
(sticks and planks), taking into consideration		
how to optimize the impact on soil, water,		
biodiversity, agricultural production and		
livestock breeding. This has been partly taken		
into account in the formulation of the $2^{nd}$		
phase project, and will be regarded during		
further implementation		

Recommendation 25: Improve resources efficiency				
Management Response:	Fully accepted			
Explanation of the response:				
It is acknowledged that broader dissemination of improved charcoal production techniques can				
significantly contribute to reduce deforestation rate				
Actions: <u>Timeframe:</u> <u>Responsible:</u>				
Promote wider dissemination of improved 2022-2026 WWF DRC				
charcoal production techniques				



*****			
Recommendation 26: Support more Studies and research			
Management Response: Fully accepted			
Explanation of the response:			
WWF acknowledges that despite the value of p	previous studies, significant	knowledge gaps still exist	
in order to develop future sustainable strategi	es		
Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:	
Organising a feasibility study for the upscaling of biogas production	2022-2023	WWF DRC	
Studying consumers' preferences and selection criteria between energy sources in urban areas	2023	WWF DRC	
Investigating the valorisation of specific NTFP of the CFCL, as part of the implementation of the Simple management plan (part of the 2 <sup>nd</sup> phase project)	2023	WWF DRC	
As mentioned above (recommendation 4), WWF participated in the elaboration of a project proposal (in cooperation with social scientists of Antwerp University and the University of Kisangani and submitted for funding to VLIR-UOS). The Virunga landscape has been selected (together with Malebo) as a research site.  If selected, this proposal will help WWF to improve our understanding of indigenous knowledge on forest conservation in the Virunga landscape, which will support the development of future strategies.	September 2022 onwards (if selected)	Scientific partners (UA and UNIKIS) with support of WWF-BELGIUM and WWF DRC	

Recommendation 27: Establish a decentralized network of technicians		
Management Response:	Fully accepted	
Explanation of the response:		
The establishment of a network of decentralized technicians on the field can indeed contribute to a reduction in the need for travels and hence reduce the impact of the insecurity situation on the project.		
Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:
The project will provide tools and smartphones to local technician to monitor results on a regular basis and to facilitate backstopping and follow-up from the Goma office	2022 - 2023	WWF DRC

Recommendation 28: Encourage authorities' engagement			
Management Response:	Fully accepted		
Explanation of the response:			
WWF agrees that local authorities have a role to play in order to reduce the higher competitiveness			
of illegal and unsustainable charcoal, and that hence their engagement is important.			
Actions: Timeframe: Responsible:			
In the framework of the SIDA funded 'Leading	2022 – 2023	WWF DRC	
the Change' project, WWF DRC (Goma office)			



١	will continue	and	strengthen	advocacy
1	towards local a	uthor	ities on meas	sures than
(	can be taken for	the g	overnance of	the sector

<b>Recommendation 29:</b> Ensure prompt and sustainable Benefits to communities from community			
forests			
Management Response:	Fully accepted		
Explanation of the response:			
WWF acknowledges that is important to meet local needs (see above) in order to guarantee project			
support, but it is also very important to manage these expectations throughout the project in order			
to avoid the creation of expectations which cannot be realistically met by the project.			
Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:	
Ensure the implementation of the Simple	2022 - 2025	WWF DRC	
Management Plans which were elaborate			
during the first phase of the DGD project (this			
is already planned as part of the 2 <sup>nd</sup> phase)			
Identify adequate measures for the	2022-2025	WWF DRC	
sustainable valorisation of the CFCI			

#### 3.7. Recommendations to WWF Cambodia

Recommendation 30: Continue with FA and ICLT, not with CLUP	
Management Response: Fully accepted	
entransa di kananana	

#### Explanation of the response:

This has been incorporated into the formulation of the 2<sup>nd</sup> phase project. The CLUP result was dropped as it had not been achieved in phase 1 (2017-2021) and is not included in phase 2 (2022-2026). The team has identified new ways of engaging with the main government stakeholder, focusing on capacity building on spatial planning. CF and ICLT registration and capacity building will continue under 'Result 1' of the 2nd phase of the DGD project.

Since this recommendation has already been put in practice, no specific new actions are required; activities with FA, CFs, and ICLTs will continue in phase 2, and are already reflected in the formulation of the results and the elaboration of the associated work plans. Activities which respond to the recommendation; and which are already programmed in the DGD2 project are presented below.

Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:
Registration of 3 ICLTs and capacity building	2022 - 2026	FLO
for committees of 6 ICLTs		
CFs agreements approved or renewed	2022 - 2026	FLO
CFs management plans are developed and	2022 - 2026	WWF-CAMBODIA & FLO
implemented		

<b>Recommendation 31:</b> Improve economic and financial sustainability of productive activities	
Management Response: Fully accepted	
Evaluation of the general	

#### **Explanation of the response:**

Financial sustainability of livelihood activities is a precondition to ensure that enterprises are more likely to maintain sustainable practices. During the second phase of the project (22-26), and based on lessons learned from phase 1 (17-21), a review of productive activities will be conducted. A subset of entrepreneurial activities that were originally tested in Phase 1 will be pursued. As a precursor, value chain analysis will be conducted to ensure that only the most promising productive



activities are prioritised. When markets are less susceptible to outside forces (e.g. pandemics, financial crashes, etc.), and production methods do not place extra strains on natural resources, these entrepreneurial and productive activities offer suitable substitutes for illegal activities.

Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:
Conduct value chain assessments of chicken	2022	WWF-CAMBODIA & FLO
production in target communes and modify		
chicken production models		
Value chain stakeholders' engagement	2022 & 2024	WWF-CAMBODIA & FLO
(meeting and workshop, quarterly reflecting		
workshop)		

Recommendation 32: Funding protection activities	
Management Response: Fully accepted	

#### **Explanation of the response:**

This was trailed in phase 1 of the project (2017-2021) and was addressed in the design of phase 2 (2022-2026) as well. In phase 1, the committee members of community forestry (CF) were able to collect contribution fees from their members for use in forest protection, after enhancing the practice of CF by-laws. In phase 2, the project will continue supporting communities' self-financing mechanisms, such as CF credit scheme, mini-trust fund, and community-based agroforestry development, which were supported by another programme of MFF (PaFF3 – The Partnership for Forestry and Fisheries Communities in Cambodia, Phase 3). Capacity building for committee members of CFs, on small proposal writing and other relevant skills, was also integrated as a part of the CF management plan implementation in phase 2. In addition, the FLO, the implementing partner in phase 2 will assist the CF management committees with the integration of the CF management plans into commune investment plans to get funds from the commune administrations.

No specific *new* actions are required, list of programmed activities already foreseen within the phase 2 project is presented below.

Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:
Strengthen the by-laws of CFs to collect	Twice a year (every	WWF-CAMBODIA & FLO
contribution fees through trust building	semester) from 2022	
among CF management committees and	onwards	
members (as part of CF management plan		
implementation)		
Enhance capacity of 5 CFs in operating CF	From July 2023	WWF-CAMBODIA & FLO
credit scheme and savings (as part of CF		
management plan implementation)		
Provide backstopping to 5 CFs to manage	From July 2023	WWF-CAMBODIA & FLO
their mini-trust funds (as part of CF		
management plan implementation)		
Strengthen existing cow banks and buffalo	Twice a year (every	WWF-CAMBODIA
banks to allocate benefits for natural	semester) from 2022	
resource management based on their by-laws	onwards	
Strengthen existing honey and rattan groups	Twice a year (every	FLO
to allocate benefits for natural resource	semester) from 2022	
management based on their by-laws	onwards	
Capacity building for committee members of	2023	FLO
CFs on small proposal writing and other		
relevant skills (as part of CF management		
plan implementation)		



Capacity building for CF management	2023	WWF-CAMBODIA & FLO
committees on integration of the CF		
management plans into commune		
investment plans to advocate for funds from		
the commune administrations		

Recommendation 33: Provide irrigation infrastructure		
Management Response:	Not accepted	
Explanation of the response:		

This recommendation was based mainly on interviews with the staff of FLO, who mentioned the request from a few communities in the project areas. In our opinion, it does not reflect the real needs of the majority of the target communities, although paddy rice farming is generally a primary occupation of the local people for food security. It is also unclear where the irrigation infrastructure is to be built and whether environmental impacts are being duly considered. Neither WWF nor FLO has expertise on irrigation system development and these systems are complex and costly.

Recommendation 34: Complement the support to community-based ecotourism		
Management Response:	Fully accepted	
Explanation of the response:		
The project team agreed with continuing the support to community-based ecotourism which is a		
prioritised approach in the country and has direct linkage between conservation and human well-		
being. This activity has been integrated in the Freshwater Program of the MFF landscape, funded		
by WWF Switzerland. No additional actions ar	e required.	
Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:
With complementary funding (not via WWF-	The other project is	WWF-CAMBODIA &
Belgium), CBET support includes further	from 2022 to 2024	other partners
capacity building on working with the		
Ministry of Tourism		
Additional complementary funding (not via	The other project is	WWF-CAMBODIA &
WWF-Belgium) supplying renewable energy	from 2022 to 2024	other partners
solutions for CBETs (also to showcase		
alternatives to hydropower by engaging with		
the tourism sector and ministry of energy)		

Recommendation 35: Provide Support to communities on legal issues		
Management Response:	Partially accepted	
Explanation of the response:		
The recommendation was based on the existing practice of the project-implementing partner, FLO,		
which approached CLEC to seek legal advice for addressing the land conflicts in the indigenous		
communities.		
Actions:	<u>Timeframe:</u>	Responsible:
Continue the collaboration with CLEC to seek	2022	FLO
legal advisory and to build network between		
CLEC and the target communities		
Provide refresher training on legal process to	2023	WWF and FLO
the target communities		



# 4. Conclusion

The report of the external final evaluation of the DGD supported WWF programme (2017 - 2021) formulated 35 recommendations. This document outlined and explained the WWF response to these recommendations. In total, 27 recommendations were fully accepted, 7 were partially accepted and 1 recommendation was not accepted. Moreover, the document gave an overview of the series of actions to respond to the (partially) accepted recommendations. Some of these actions have already been implemented (e.g. during the formulation of the  $2^{nd}$  phase of the DGD programme) or are currently being implemented. Other actions will be implemented by the relevant responsible parties, according to the timeframe provided. The implementation of the actions identified will be monitored on a yearly basis by WWF-BELGIUM.