



2022 Results Report
Local Government Reform and
Development Program
(LGRDPII) Addendum

Belgian development agency

enabel.be

1	ABB	REVIATIONS	4
2	SUN	IMARY OF THE INTERVENTION	5
	2.1	INTERVENTION FORM	5
	2.2	SELF-EVALUATION OF PERFORMANCE	6
	1.1.1	Relevance	6
	1.1.2	-50	
	1.1.3		
	1.1.4		
	1.1.5		
3	MO:	NITORING OF RESULTS	9
	3.1	EVOLUTION OF THE CONTEXT	
	3.1.1		
	3.1.2		
	3.2	PERFORMANCE OF OUTCOME	
	3.2.1 3.3	Progress of indicators	
			13
		SED CAPACITIES OF LGU'S TO ADDRESS GLOBAL ENVIRONMENTAL ENGES THROUGH LGU COOPERATION	15
	3.3.1		13
		SED CAPACITIES OF LGU'S TO ADDRESS GLOBAL ENVIRONMENTAL ENGES THROUGH LGU COOPERATION	15
_			
	3.3.2	J F G	
	3.3.3 3.4	Analysis of progress made PERFORMANCE OF OUTPUT 7	
			17
M	IONITO	SED CAPACITIES OF MOLG DEPARTMENTS TO SUPPORT, COACH AND OR LGU'S TO ADDRESS GLOBAL ENVIRONMENTAL CHALLENGES GH LGU COOPERATION.	1.5
L	HROUC		
	3.4.1	6	18
M	IONITO	SED CAPACITIES OF MOLG DEPARTMENTS TO SUPPORT, COACH AND OR LGU'S TO ADDRESS GLOBAL ENVIRONMENTAL CHALLENGES	
T	HROUG	GH LGU COOPERATION	18
	3.4.2	of Property of the mean destriction of the second of the s	
	3.4.3	Analysis of progress made	19
4	BUD	OGET	21
5	RIS	KS AND ISSUES	23
6	SYN	ERGIES AND COMPLEMENTARITIES	24
	6.1	WITH OTHER INTERVENTIONS OF THE PORTFOLIO	24
	6.2	WITH THIRD-PARTY ASSIGNMENTS	
		SYNERGIES AND COMPLEMENTARITIES	
7		NSVERSAL THEMES	
	7.1	ENVIRONMENT AND CLIMATE CHANGE	
	7.1	GENDER	
	7.3	DIGITISATION	
			23

2

	7.4	DECENT WORK	25
8	LES	SONS LEARNED	25
	8.1 8.2 8.3	THE SUCCESSES	26
	8.4	SUMMARY OF LESSONS LEARNED.	
9	STE	ERING	28
	9.1 9.2 9.3 9.4	CHANGES MADE TO THE INTERVENTION. DECISIONS TAKEN BY THE STEERING AND MONITORING COMMITTEE. CONSIDERED STRATEGIC REORIENTATIONS. RECOMMENDATIONS.	29
10	ANN	VEXES	31
	10.1 10.2 10.3 10.4 10.5	QUALITY CRITERIA	. 34 . 34 . 34
	10.6	RESOURCES IN TERMS OF COMMUNICATION	

1 Abbreviations

APLA	Association of Palestinian Local Authorities
ARD	Area Resilience Development
Enabel	Belgian development agency
EQA	Environment Quality Authority
JSCs	Joint Service Councils
LED	Local Economic Development
LGRDP	Local Government Reform and Development Programme
LGUs	Local Government Units
MDLF	Municipal Development and Lending Fund
MoLG	Ministry of Local Government
NAP	National Adaptation Plan
NDC	National Determined Contribution
PA	Palestinian Authority
PPP	Public Private Partnership
PSC	Programme Steering Committee
PSU	Programme Support Unit
TA	Technical Assistant/Assistance
TFF Technical and Financial File	
ToR Terms of Reference	
UNFCCC	United Nations Framework convention on Climate Change
NCCC	National Committee on Climate Change
INCR	Initial National Communication Report
GCF	Green Climate Fund
VC	Value Chain
PFI	Palestinian Federation of Industries
PARC	Palestinian Agriculture Relief Committee
LA	Local Authority
MAAP	Multi-Annual Action Plan
EC	European Commission
LTC	Local Technical Committee
STC	Steering Technical Committee
NTC	National Technical Committee
RR	Resident Representative

Results Report 2021 4

Summary of the intervention

2.1 Intervention form

Title of the intervention	Local Government Reform and Development Program (LGRDP) Phase II Addendum
Code of the intervention	PZA 13 033 11
Location:	Palestinian Territory
Total budget	€3 million
Partner institutions	Ministry of Local Government and Environment Quality Authority (EQA)
Start date of the Specific Agreement	June 11, 2015
Start date of the intervention/ Opening steering committee	January 2021
Expected end date of execution	December 2023
End date of the Specific Agreement	10 June 2024
Zina date er ine speemer greenen	- 8 clusters (from both LGRDP I clusters and ARD initiative)
Target groups	 MoLG departments for targeted capacity building activities: Joint Service Council, Planning, LED and Policy departments Association of Local authorities (APLA) Environment Quality Authority (EQA) Municipal Development and Lending Fund (MDLF)
Impact ¹	The management, the development and the administration system of the Local Government Sector in the Palestinian territory are improved within a decentralised framework
Outcome	The capacities of LGUs to cooperate in providing services, promoting local economic development and contributing to territorial integration are strengthened
Outputs	R6 Increased capacities of LGU's to address global environmental challenges through LGU cooperation R7 Increased capacities of MoLG departments to support, coach and monitor LGU's to address global environmental challenges through LGU cooperation
Year covered by the report	2022

 $^{^{1}}$ Impact regards the general objective; outcomes regard the specific objective; output regards the expected result

2.2 Self-evaluation of performance

1.1.1 Relevance

	Performance
Relevance	Α

At **national** level: the intervention is highly relevant and responsive to context needs and priorities of stakeholders:

- The intervention is relevant to the National Policy Agenda 2017-2022 (NPA) as it meets the following priorities:
- Citizen-Centred Government (4th priority under government reform pillar) including the policies: responsive local government and improving services to citizens.
- Effective Government (5th priority under government reform pillar) including the policy Strengthening Accountability and Transparency.
- Economic Independence (6th priority under sustainable development pillar) including the policies: Building Palestine's Future Economy, Improving Palestine's Business Environment.
- Resilient Communities (10th priority under sustainable development pillar) including the policies:
 Ensuring a Sustainable Environment, Revitalizing Agriculture and Strengthening Our Rural Communities,
 and Preserving Our National Identity and Cultural Heritage.
- LGRDP II Addendum interventions are in align with the new developed Palestinian Agenda 2021 –2023 (which is centered around a new development paradigm: cluster development and disengagement from the occupation which Tackle SGDs No. 11, 8, 16
- The interventions are implemented in already defined clusters, where previous projects; studies and initiatives were implemented, and Enabel's last interventions have built on the previous efforts and reflects a kind of relevance to them.

At international level and the policy agenda;

The intervention is aligned with the following SDGs

	and the same control of the control		
SDG 7: Ensure access to affordable, reliable, sustainable and modern energy for all	,7.2: Increasing the share of renewable energy in the global energy mix.		
	8.5: Decent work for women and men, including for young people and persons with disabilities, and equal pay for work of equal value		
	8.6: Reducing the proportion of youth not in employment, education, or training		
inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable	11.6: Reducing the adverse per capita impact of cities on the environment by paying special attention to air quality and municipal and other waste management		
l a	12.5: Reducing waste generation through prevention, reduction, recycling and reuse		
SDG 13: Take urgent action to combat climate change and its impacts	13a: Mobilizing resources to address the needs of developing countries to take meaningful mitigating action		

Relevance with NDC action plans

The Palestinian government with the lead of the Environment Quality Authority has developed sector strategies and action plans for the implementation of the priorities within the National Determined Contributions (NDC). Belgian bilateral cooperation has committed since several years to support EQA in these efforts of establishing a reference framework for climate change in the Palestinian Territory. Through its delegated cooperation to UNDP, it contributed to the development of the 10-year National Plan on Adaptation and

Mitigation in 2017. Later, the NDC Action Plan related to the energy and agriculture sectors, was developed in 2019 through a cooperation agreement (2018-2019) between the Belgian Ministry of the Environment and EQA. Belgium continues to support the implementation of the NDC action plans through LGRDP and Green West Bank through several activities under the different sectors: mainly energy and solid waste.

The intervention is in line with Enabel strategy and priorities.

1.1.2 Effectiveness

	Performance
Effectiveness	Α

To a large extent, the intervention has progressed in an effective way of which objectives, results, and outcomes have a high likelihood of achievement. It is very likely that the outcome will be fully achieved in terms of quality and coverage and negative results have been mitigated.

- Based on the prepared Environmental Assessment studies and strategic plans in the 7 targeted clusters and partners organizations, the priorities have been defined and currently under implementation, including:
 - Interventions/ projects related to environment and climate change in the 7 clusters.
 - Capacity Development at clusters level: including training programs in the fields of environment and climate change, and providing tools related to the same fields.
 - Awareness Campaigns in the fields of Environment and climate change.
 - Capacity Development needs assessment and planning for partners organizations (Ministry of Local Government "MoLG", Environment Quality Authority "EQA", Municipal Development and Lending Fund "MDLF", and association of Palestinian Local Authorities "APLA") in the fields of Environment and Climate change.
- Towards an effective achievement of the intervention's outcome, the Learning Lab and exchange of
 experience platform activities are implemented through an interactive manner that foster
 participatory planning, and consequently respond to the partner's needs, in addition to the capacity
 development activities and training aiming to enhance partners knowledge in green practices as a
 response to climate change adaptation and mitigation.

1.1.3 Efficiency

	Performance
Efficiency	В

- Outputs are available within a reasonable timeline and without any major budgetary adjustments and
 according to quality standards, with room for improvement on different levels mainly related to the
 identification of relevant initiatives, assessment studies and plans were prepared in a participatory approach
 with partners and with targeted clusters, so that to implement the most relevant and agreed on
 interventions in the next step.
- The shortage in the staff has caused the delay of the start of some activities, also, the delay in signing the MDLF Grant Agreement due to the change from the previous procedure in granting MDLF in previous phases of the programme.

1.1.4 Potential sustainability

	Performance
Potential sustainability	В

The LGRDP has a high potential of sustainability due to the following:

- The formed local committees in the targeted clusters will be able to monitor their progress in implementing the prepared plans, and also to update the plans regularly. Similarly, partner organizations will build on the prepared capacity assessment reports and plans in order to continuously improve their capacities.
- The priority interventions will include different factors, including environmental, social, and economic. So, that the design of each initiative is going to consider its sustainability by allocating the suitable resources and by setting indicators to measure the implementation progress. (running / ongoing initiatives that produce overtime)
- The Learning Lab as a sustainable community of practice which has been evolved during the year of 2021 toward a platform for exchanging lessons learned and experience by involving different actors and stakeholder to its meetings. Also, the Learning Lab is expected to involve international experiences in terms of environment and climate change through APLA which will be at the end of the intervention the channel where the platform will be adapted as part of its Project Support Unit "PSU".

1.1.5 Conclusions

- LGRDP is highly relevant and responsive to context needs, priorities of stakeholders, Enabel internal strategy and the SDGs.
- To a large extent, the intervention has progressed in an effective way of which objectives, results, and outcomes have high likelihood of achievement.
- The unstable nature of the context did not affect the efficient implementation of the intervention, although there is room for improvement. Measures have been put into place to mitigate the risks.
- LGRDP has a relatively good level of projected sustainability on both financial and technical levels. Considering environment and climate change are rising as a main challenge worldwide and on the national level, localizing of National Strategies is becoming a priority.

Chair of Steering Committee - MoLG	Intervention Manager - Enabel
Tanfin Boleivi	giver Søreen Alon Jamons

3 Monitoring of results²

3.1 Evolution of the context

3.1.1 General and institutional context

Political instability (situation inside the Palestinian Territory)

The political situation remains fragile due to the Israeli occupation, the continuous threat of annexation of Area C in the West Bank (including East Jerusalem), the lack of Palestinian unity, regular escalations of violence and the financing crisis of the Palestinian Authority.

In August 2022 a breakout of violence took place in Gaza, resulting in a 3-day escalation in the Strip. The war was the result of political tensions in East-Jerusalem. In parallel clashes broke out all over the West Bank and between the Palestinian and Jewish communities in parts of historic Palestine.

The recently formulated extremist Israeli government took over at the end 2022 also is a concern for the Palestinian context, as this government is announcing the intentions expanding settlements and imposing laws and regulations against Palestinians.

The security situation during the reporting period, mainly on the restriction on movement and closure of some check points, had a lot of impact on the execution of the project. Several field visits, were postponed or cancelled, workshops and meetings switched to online ... etc.

Climate change and environmental issues

In the Palestinian Territory climate change exacerbates many of the already pressing environmental challenges including water scarcity, degradation of land and soil, and disaster risks. The Palestinian territory is characterized by both a high bio-physical and socio-economic vulnerability to climate change, and a constrained capacity to respond to it in a context of military occupation and limited political control of its natural resources 3.

In order to respond to projected and current effects of climate change the Palestinian Authority (PA) has embarked in a series of reforms since 2016. Coordinated by the Environment Quality Authority (EQA), the Palestinian National Adaptation Plan (NAP) and the National Determined Contribution (NDC) were submitted in 2016 and 2017 in the context of the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC).

Faced with these challenges in the context of a highly fragmented territory, the resilience of cities and villages is one of the major current urban challenges in the Palestinian Territory and key for achieving the sustainable goals. This resilience development has been the focus of the LGRDP programme from 2015 on by promoting a strategic and bottom-up approach of Local Government Units (LGU's) cooperation, with the aim of providing economic, social and environmental benefits to their populations.

The general context for the addendum has not been changed from the TFF; except for two things which were considered positively impacting the intervention:

- EQA has recently finalized the NDC implementation action plans for 6 sectors in 14 detailed document that can be easily adopted for implementation on the local level.
- The Number of clusters involved in the project has reduced to 7 instead of 8 (at end of LGRDP II) where two clusters in the south, Al Karmel and Khallet el May, have joined to perform as one cluster and Yatta has requested to join. This shows a great progress toward adopting joint work and territorial development among LGUs.

² 'Results' means 'development results'; Impact regards the general objective; outcomes regard the specific objective; output regards the expected result; intermediate outcomes regard changes resulting from the achievement of the outputs allowing progress towards the outcome of the intervention, at a higher level

³ State of Environment and Outlook Report for the occupied Palestinian territory 2020.

3.1.2 Management context

3.1.2.1 Partnership modalities

The following highlights explains the partnerships/ mutual partnerships that were established in the reporting year:

The Palestinian Environmental Quality Authority (EQA) has joined the project as a key partner,
 and a member in the Project Steering and Technical (National and Local) Committees.

Climate change and environmental issues are a rising concern for the Palestinian Authority (PA) that have been translated into a large set of plans, policies and strategies. In its Nationally Determined Contribution (NDC) plan, focus is given on agriculture and energy sectors. In parallel, the development of adaptation to climate change measures is considered as a key priority. The National Adaptation Plan (NAP) presents adaptation actions that will be undertaken locally, but that need to be scaled up and implemented more widely. These plans however still lack endorsement and implementation at both national and subnational levels. At municipality level, downscaled policies are lacking and responsibilities often remain confused despite their recognized powerful catalytic role. On this basis the Palestinian and Belgian Parties decided that the Local Government Reform and Development Programme (LGRDP II) would be extended with a specific focus on addressing environment and climate change challenges, to contribute to develop more green, resilient and sustainable municipalities and territories.

Upon this, EQA joined the program as a main partner and a voting member of its steering and technical committees. At the national level, EQA is the authoritative body for all environmental issues and the focal point for Climate Change being:

- The head of the National Committee on Climate Change (NCCC)
- Responsible for setting up related strategies and policies; also the law gives EQA the power to do its own monitoring activities and insuring compliance to environmental requirements
- Responsible for the preparation of national reports (NAP, INCR and NDC) to be submitted to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC)
- The national designated authority for Green Climate Fund (GCF) which is the financial arm of the UNFCCC

The current mandate and strategy of EQA is considering the environmental and climate change challenges at national level, but this should be strengthened at local governments' level, and here comes the importance of having MoLG and EQA in one committee putting efforts together to localize the national policies and strategies to be adopted and implemented at the local level.

In the frame of the extension, LGRDP II continue the support to EQA "In-Country National Facilitator (ICNF) for NDC Partnership: Climate Change Expert".

The support to this Facilitator serves as the NDC Partnership's interface in country and operates as a liaison between the country and other NDC Partnership members. The Facilitator's role is purely one of coordination and supportive facilitation. Working on behalf of Palestine, the Facilitator plays a key role in ensuring the smooth implementation of the Country Engagement Process, by supporting ongoing coordination efforts between the Support Unit, the various partners in the NDC Partnership, and the Palestinian government. This involves working with EQA to refine Palestine's objectives for support over time (as reflected in the Partnership Plan); coordinating the Partnership Plan at country level (including local and subnational collaboration); and serving as an anchor to assist the NDC Partnership in communicating and coordinating services at country level. The In-Country National Facilitator also liaises with the NDC Partnership Support Unit for vertical information-sharing, including both contributing to and accessing knowledge products.

Partnership with MOLG

In the frame of the extension, LGRDP II continued supporting 5 engineers to work under the supervision of both the Planning Department and Policy Unit at MoLG. The engineers assigned to support LGRDP activities and to

promote the approach of environmental planning and develop the capacity of the joint planning units on this area. The units will also provide technical assistance to the targeted LGUs and clusters and will continue working on territorial integration through master planning, and will promote localizing SDG 11.6, 11.a, 11.b which focus on climate change adaptation and integrating rural and urban areas.

Granting (MDLF) for implementation of the green initiatives (investment projects).

The project has awarded a direct grant to MDLF following the same procedures as it has used since the LGRDP I and II (i.e. using World Bank procedures for procurement as they are part of MDLF procedures) which have proven to be efficient and limiting fiduciary risks.

The detailed investment projects' action plan was developed by MDLF and approved by Enablel. The grant agreement was signed and MDLF started its procurement and works as per the action plan.

Navigating through other partnerships to integrate climate change and environmental concerns.

MoLG has shared with Enabel a Feasibility Study that was submitted by Biet Fajjar Municipality, to establish a private company/ factory to invest in the treatment of the slurry and produce CaCo3 in partnership with local investors from the private sector. The concept was approved by MoLG with conditional support to investigate more in some technical and environmental details.

As part of its efforts in this regard, Enabel has provided technical support represented by organizing an expert's mission from "Almadius" to further investigate the issue and to set recommendations that will support MoLG in their decision; and to support Beit Fajjar Municipality and the investors by further details related to the project's establishment and operation. Currently, Enabel is preparing to contract an engineering lab to test samples of slurry; so that to finalize the recommendations with "Almadius" Expert. Afterwards; Enabel May support revising and updating the feasibility study; which was prepared previously for the project.

Supporting APLA to implement its Multi Annual Action Plan "MAAP" through a grant agreement.

An institutional capacity assessment was conducted to assess APLA's capacities, APLA develop its action proposal listing out activities to support the involvement of the Palestinian LGUs in the process of adopting environmental and climate change priorities, in addition to the process of localizing the SDGs.

Direct Grant was signed with APLA, and APLA started its procurement process for the implementation of the activities as per action proposal submitted and approved by Enabel.

APLA will also implement a raising awareness campaigns that targets its members and the community in general in the themes of SDGs and environmental challenges.

3.1.2.2 Operational modalities

The Program Structure

1. Program Steering Committee (PSC) members: Voting Members.

- Ministry of Local Government MoLG / the Chair of the PSC
- A representative of Environment Quality Authority EQA
- A representative of the Ministry of Finance
- Enabel Resident Representative.
- A representative of the MDLF

Non-Voting members.

- The Programme Support Unit (PSU) participate as regular observers and informants.
- The PSU acts as the secretariat of the PSC.

2. The National Technical Committee (NTC)

NTC members:

- MoLG Policy Unit/ the Chair of NTC,
- Representatives of MoLG / Departments (Planning, JSCs, LED),
- Representative(s) of EQA,
- Representative(s) of APLA, (Depending on the topics to be discussed),
- A representative of MDLF
- The Committee could invite, research institutes and universities, civil society organizations when needed.
- LGRDP Program Support Unit (PSU) being the secretariat for NTC.

- NTC roles and responsibilities:

- Facilitating communication among different stakeholders on programs.
- Developing a strategy to promote and localizing the environmental and climate change agenda by joining forces of MoLG and EQA.
- Supporting the qualitative technical management of the results which includes work planning and preparation of technical proposals for endorsement by the Steering committee.
- Looking for joint arrangements and ensure the consolidation of strategic options and decisions which are taken, regarding the implementation of the programme's activities.

3. Technical Committees at the local cluster level (LTC)

- LTC members
- MoLG Directorate representative
- EQA Directorate representative
- Targeted cluster representatives.
- Local environmental NGOs, CBOs (if any).
- Women and youth associations from the targeted clusters (if any, and according to need)
- MDLF representative
- The LTC is chaired by the representative of the LGRDP II-implementing team.

LTC roles and responsibilities:

- Preparation of work plans and technical proposals to be submitted to National Technical Committee (NTC) and included in the Steering Committee agenda.
- Providing support to the NTC in all components (infrastructure projects, events and communication activities, financial support to employees) based on the Steering Committee decisions.
- Seeking agreement and harmonization among stakeholders
- Implementing strategies and decisions related to project's activities.
- Supporting related activities implementation,
- Identifying and share the lessons learned and challenges.

3.2 Performance of outcome



3.2.1 Progress of indicators⁴

	0.1.1 1.08.000 01 1101000015				
Outcome:					
Strengthen the capacities of LGU's to co-	operate in pro	viding Services,	promoting Loca	l economic	
development, and contributing to territor	rial integratio	n.			
Progress indicators/markers	Base value	Value	Value	Target	Final
		preceding	reporting	reportin	target
		year	year	g year	
# of existing territorial development					
and integration policies & instruments		_		_	_
that integrate environment and	0	0	1	0	1
climate change					
# Successful cooperation initiatives					
between LGUs; around green local	0	0	7	0	7
initiatives (waste and energy)					
% citizens satisfied with the quality of					
services achieved by green local	0%	0%	0%	0%	80%
initiatives in the targeted communities					**************************************

Analysis of progress made

subject	Activity
Overall	 In the pathway towards the above-mentioned outcome, significant progress has been made in terms of the following activities: Environmental and Climate Change Assessments and Strategic Plans in Selected Clusters. These plans were the basis to design 7 Green Initiatives (investment projects) and was awarded to MDLF for implementation in the 7 clusters of the Project. Also, 7 community initiatives were designed to be implemented by the communities in addition to awareness campaigns to be implemented through call for proposals. Capacity Development Needs Assessment and Planning for Partners on Environment and Climate Change; including MoLG, EQA, MDLF and APLA
Conceptual Consolidation Activities	 Promoting new territorial integration approach for the targeted clusters tackling the environmental challenges and climate change by establishing new territorial dynamics in the southern cluster through integrating new Municipality "Yatta" to both Al-Karmel and Khalet El Maya, and in the Middle cluster (Beit Leqya) by integrating new Village councils to the existing JSC to work together.
	 Activities were implemented following the bottom-up approach by engaging LAs actors in addition to community representatives to set up jointly the future of their territory and plan together.
	 Developing an integrated Environmental development plan for the cluster priorities and needs in a wider geographical area, has made LAs understand the cross-cutting needs from projects and initiatives, and the importance of jointly working to act against the climate change and protecting the environment.
Strategic Planning	An environmental assessment on an integrated approach has taken place, in addition to identification of needs and priorities highlighting the crosscuttings once, followed by developing and integrated Environmental Development plan and capacity building activity and awareness raising on the new cluster.

	The prepared strategic Environmental plans in the targeted clusters have also considered the economic factor, so that to increase revenues or to decrease costs, or to achieve both
Capacity Development Assessment	Capacity development Assessment for partner organizations (MoLG, EQA, MDLF and APLA), and preparation of Capacity Development plan for each organization in addition to a plan that reflects common needs of all partners, aim at raising the capacity of our partners in the future to better respond to environment and climate change challenges at the Local government's level
MEAL	 Upgrade monitoring system Revision exercise of the log frame resulted in updating the indicators, and monitoring tools in use. this included team workshops along with the PILOT system update. Context analysis exercise along with the development of planning/ monitoring tools such as actors' analysis and Theory of Change. Conduct a brief capitalisation exercise including individual interviews with LGRDP team members and various beneficiaries/ partners of the earlier stages of the project. Deployment and announcement of the complaint and Feedback handling mechanism as a basic tool for accountability. Revision of received proposals from APLA and MDLF. Revision of received reports in terms of data and quality.
Communication and awareness	The development of awareness strategies per cluster were integrated with the environmental assessment plans to identify the awareness needs and targeting strategies for each cluster, a general awareness raising plan per cluster was developed targeting the most needed awareness activities per cluster, and a specific awareness plan will be developed based on the project's selection on each cluster. The general awareness plan will be implemented in each cluster targeting the general environmental needs in the communities. The specific awareness plan will be implemented to ensure the environmental project implemented in the cluster is achieving its results, and the community acceptance and participation effectively towards the success of the project.
	A call for proposal for developing and implementing awareness-raising activities in the clusters were announced. The Call for proposal will select a grantee to implement the activities on the clusters level. Through the grant agreement with APLA the latter are preparing to implement an awareness raising activities on the themes of SDGs and Environmental challenges targeting APLA's members and the community in general.
Learning	On the institutional level, the Learning Laboratory has evolved during the addendum to be a platform for Learning and exchanging experience and lessons learned, this resulted from the partners and stakeholder feedbacks & suggestions collected through a survey for partners during 2022 workshops, The evolvement of the platform represented by more focus of the environmental and climate change issues, in addition to training and capacity development sessions. Partners "MoLG & EQA" plays important role in raising the capacity of the targeted clusters through their expertise, also more involvements to CBOs specialized in the environmental issues like PalGBC. LGRDP II clusters continue presented their environmental initiatives and started to learn using the climate change language and how to adapt it in a territorial level, moreover, the clusters benefited from the new partners of the project by highlighting their priorities and needs.

3.3 Performance of output 6:

Increased capacities of LGU's to address global environmental challenges through LGU cooperation



3.3.1 Progress of indicators

Output 6:					
Increased capacities of LGU's to address	s global enviror	mental challen	ges through LGU	cooperation	
Indicators	Base value	Value preceding year	Value reporting year	Target reporting year	Final target
# of signed environmental assessment consultancy contracts	0	0	1	1	1
# of delivered environmental assessments	0	0	7	7	7
# of delivered capacity building needs reports	0	0	7	0	7
# of delivered strategic plans	0	0	7	0	7
# of delivered environmental awareness needs reports	0	0	7	0	7
# of identified potential initiatives by technical committee	0	0	7	0	7
# of produced EIA documents	0	0	0	0	7
# of produced feasibility studies	0	0	0	0	7
# of conducted steering committee meetings for initiatives approval	0	0	1	0	1
# of grant agreements signed with MDLF	0	0	1	0	1
# of conducted Learning Lab	0	0	6	4	10
# of conducted awareness activities	0	0	0	7	7
# of approved action plans by PSC with APLA	0	0	1	1	1

It is worth highlighting that due to the steering of the project and its activities in consultation with the relevant steering committee members and other actors, the indicators # of produced EIA documents and # of produced feasibility studies are irrelevant anymore.

3.3.2 State of progress of the main activities

State of progress of the main activities ⁵	State of p			
	Ahead of time	Within deadline	Delayed ⁶	Seriously delayed ⁷
Assign consultants to conduct environmental assessment and Strategic Plans in selected clusters		Х		
produce 7 environmental assessments		Х		
produce 7 Capacity building needs report		Х		
produce 7 strategic plans		Х		
produce 7 environmental awareness needs		Х		1112
Review & identify potential initiatives in strategic plans by technical committee		X		
conduct steering committee meeting to approve chosen initiatives		Х		
Awarding a grant to MDLF for initiatives implementation		X		
Conducting the Learning Lab activities		X		
Conducting 7 awareness campaigns/ activities		Χ		
Awarding a grant to APLA to conduct awareness campaigns and capacity building (including supporting its technical support unit)		Х		

3.3.3 Analysis of progress made

Activity	analysis
Contracts	One major contract was signed to perform this consultancy assignments during the reporting period:
	Environmental and Climate Change Assessments and Strategic Plans in Selected Clusters.
	General objective of the assignment:
	 Support the integration of environment and climate change challenges in the strategic planning at cluster level
	Specific objectives of the assignment:
	 Conduct an Environmental Assessment (Situation Analysis) for the 7 clusters of the LGRDP II.
	 Prepare an Environmental Strategic Plan for each of the 7 clusters and mainstream environment and climate change in the planning processes.
	 Prepare a list of Capacity Building and Environmental Awareness needs related to climate change causes and impact, adaptation and vulnerability.
Granting MDLF to implement Green Initiatives	MDLF has start the implementation of the green initiatives (investment projects) on the cluster level as per the signed grant agreement. As mentioned earlier, these green initiatives are designed based on the Environmental Assessment outcomes in each cluster. The grant agreement already signed with MDLF and will be closed by the end of 2023.

 $^{^6}$ The activities are delayed; corrective measures must be taken. 7 The activities are more than 6 months behind schedule. Major corrective measures are required. Results Report 2022

Conducting the Learning Lab Activities

Four Exchange of Experience and learning workshops took place in the reporting year.

The first on March 16, 2022, the subject of the workshop was "Green projects-opportunities and challenges" With the objective to present LGUs experience in implementing green projects (SW & RE), where clusters learn more about needs and challenges of such projects.

Second Meeting took place on the 29th of June 2022, under the subject of (Green Projects)-institutionalization, development and implementation, the aim of the workshop to guid the clusters for better plan their projects and the importance of conducting the needed studies and survey before any implementation of any projects.

Third workshop conducted on along two days 26/27 July 2022 aims to raise the clusters experience and knowledge in regard to logical framework, proposal development and communication activities.

Forth workshop conducted also along two days on the 7,8/12/2022 titled (Environmental Practices) aims to show clusters partners experience in the green public spaces and urban planning, in addition to their knowledge in the green building concept through the presentation of PALGBC experience – Retrofitting Projects.

Topics tackled at the platform meeting workshops are in line with projects implementation progress (Projects identification, planning and implementation) as its considered that the platform meetings as tool to support clusters in better planning and implementing their projects and activities, in addition to exchange the lessons learnt among them.

Communication and awareness

A Call for proposal was launched to select a partner to implement the awareness raising activities in the 7 partner clusters. The call for proposal submission deadline is mid-February after that, the selection process will be launched, to choose the implementor. The activities will be implemented until the end of year 2023.

Granting APLA for SDGs localization

APLA used the outcomes of the Environmental Assessment Strategic Plans to implement specialized awareness activities at the local level with focus on the related SDG in each cluster. Several meetings were conducted between APLA and Enabel team and partners to prepare a concept on this regard and identify the crosscutting and complementarities with other interventions APLA is implementing with other organizations.

3.4 Performance of output 7

Increased capacities of MoLG departments to support, coach and monitor LGU's to address global environmental challenges through LGU cooperation.



3.4.1 Progress of indicators

Output 7:

Increased capacities of MoLG departments to support, coach and monitor LGU's to address global environmental challenges through LGU cooperation

Indicators	Base value	Value preceding year	Value reporting year	Target reportin g year	Final target
# of green building committee members	0	0	4	4	7
# of identified potential green building activities	0	0	0	0	7
# of initiative support documents	0	0	7	0	7
# of signed capacity development needs assessment consultancy contract	0	0	1	0	1
# of delivered assessment reports	0	0	4	00	4
# of delivered capacity development plans	0	0	4	0	4
# of delivered integrated capacity development plan	0	0	4	0	1
# of hired staff members in MoLG	0	0	5	5	5
# of NDC in-country facilitators supported financially by the project	0	0	1	1	1
# of supported partners' participations in seminars / conferences	0	0	6	5	11
# of produced communication materials	0	0	1	4	5

It is worth highlighting that due to the steering of the project and its activities in consultation with the relevant steering committee members and other actors, the indicators # of green building committee members and # of identified potential green building activities are irrelevant anymore.

Simple verification is necessary to track the reformulated activity of the green building formulation and substituted by green building guidelines update and developing energy efficiency code.

3.4.2 State of progress of the main activities

State of progress of the main activities ⁸	State of p	-		
	Ahead of time	Within deadline	Delayed	Seriously delayed
Update GB guidelines and EE code		Х		delayea
Assign consultants to conduct capacity development needs assessment for Partners		Х		
Produce 4 assessment reports		Х		
Produce 4 Capacity development plans		X		

Produce Integrated capacity development plan	Х	
Support hiring 5 staff members in MoLG for 1 year	Х	
Support NDC in-country facilitator based in EQA for one year	Х	
Support partners to participate in conferences/ seminars	Х	
Production of communication/ learning materials (videos, charts)	Х	

3.4.3 Analysis of progress made

subject	Analysis
approving the	As a consequent of the previous year's consultancy assignment, the deliverables
deliverables of needs	and reports were received, reviewed, and circulated to the relevant actors for
assessment and	approval.
capacity development needs	Follow up on the conclusions was carried out by the implementing partners.
Support hiring 5 staff	Within the support to MoLG and to raise the capacities in terms of the
members in MOLG	institutional level, the LGRDP support hiring five staff (engineers) for one year
for 1 Year	started form December 2021, the duty station of the engineers located in
	different departments of MoLG and directorates. The purpose of hiring the
	engineers is to support the LGRDP activities and to promote the approach of
	environmental planning and develop the capacity of the joint planning units on
	the different areas, the units will provide technical assistance to the targeted
	LGUs and clusters and will continue working on territorial integration through
	master planning, and will promote localizing SDG 11.6, 11.a, 11.b which focus on
Support NDC in-	climate change adaptation and integrating rural and urban areas. LGRDP supported EQA to recruit the "In Country National Facilitator" to
country facilitator	enhance the implementation of Palestine's Nationally Determined Contributions
based in EQA	and to support the LGRDP activities. The facilitator in charge in this position
	January 23, 2022.
Support partners to	COP27: Support Palestinian delegation Partners participation to COP27 in Egypt
participate in	- Sharm El Shaiq, and support the creation of international connection between
conferences,	our Palestinian one and the international one,
seminars,	Clean Up Day: support MoLG to implementation of national clean-up day jointly
International Events	with JICA, one full day of cleaning activity in Bethlehem governorate to promote
	the importance of environment protection and wate collection and separation.
	,
Production of communication/ learning materials (videos, charts)	A video highlighting the success of the LGRDP II on the clusters level was produced. The production aimed at increasing the partners awareness on the achievements that resulted through the project lifetime, raise the Palestinian community awareness on territorial integration and development, and introduce the international community to the challenges and achievements of local
	Government Sector in Palestine. A comprehensive success story is being developed based on the Capitalization exercise developed by the MEAL, the story was submitted to HQ for final revision and will be published on Enabel.be and social media platforms. The success story was developed based on the previous mentioned video, previously developed videos and pictures will also be apart from the story, which will ensure that all the multi-media martials produced under the project are saved on one enabel.be site for sharing benefit and highlighting success.

Update GB guideline and EE code	Another contract was awarded to Al Najah-Pal to update the Green Building guidelines and the Energy Efficiency code.

4 Budget

Budget vs. Actual Review as of 31.12.2022						
	Budget		Ex	Expenditures		
		As of Y20	Y21	Y22	All years	Rate of disbursement at the end of year (2022)
	Total Budget (12M)	UBW Expenditures as of 31/12/2020 (Y20)	Total Y21 Expenditures (Jan21-Dec21)	Total Y22 Expenditures (Jan22-Dec22)	Total Project Expenditure	Percentage Expended from the total Budget
R1	333,200.00	332,681.45	ı	1	332,681.45	100%
R2	2,037,500.00	2,036,619.65	883.18	•	2,037,502.83	100%
R3	951,000.00	948,767.11	1		948,767.11	100%
R4	6,420,000.00	6,419,423.05	3.34	ı	6,419,426.39	100%
RS	3,000.00	2,741.87		1	2,741.87	91%
R6	1,803,500.00		139,590.79	503,003.83	642,594.62	36%
R7	300,000.00		29,693.45	145,336.67	175,030.12	28%
Reserve (PZA1303311_X010100)	38,318.00				ı	%0
General Means (Total Z)	3,113,482.00	2,177,394.11	381,470.19	291,082.75	2,849,947.05	92%
Total Budget	15,000,000.00	11,917,627.24	551,640.95	939,423.25	13,408,691.44	%68

5 Risks and Issues

Risk Identification	1	Risl	c analys	sis	Risk Treatment
Description of Risk	Ris k cat ego ry	Proba bility	Pot enti al Imp act	Tot al	Action / Comment
Threat of Israeli decision on annexation of area C and resulted change in the political situation of the targeted areas/clusters.	SU S	high	Hig h	hig h	Monitoring closely the situation in the West Bank Liaise with General consulate & other donors for linking technical dialogue to policy and political dialogue
lack of Palestinian security police in the targeted clusters due to Israeli proctices and division of land classifications.	OP S	High	Hig h	Hig h	Support partners in developing concerned policies/ policy papers and reactivating the security role of the municipalities.
Restrictions by Israeli Authorities to develop Area C by not allowing permits or risk of demolitions for the programme supported infrastructures (e.g. waste an energy)	OP S	High	Hig h	Hig h	Risk to be assessed on a case-by-case basis. Safer plots in Area B may be privileged if a risk is perceived.
Operational delays concerning importing of tools/ equipment, clearance certificates issuing (Israeli restrictions)	OP S	High	Hig h	Hig h	Modification of time frames, look for local alternatives,

6 Synergies and complementarities

6.1 With other interventions of the Portfolio

LGRDP and Green West Bank (GWB): the study and the mission scope that is ongoing under the marble and stone sector has expands to include different sites of the West Bank and not only Beit Fajjar. The aim is to identify potential activities that can be considered under GWB. See section 8.3 below.

6.2 With third-party assignments

LGRDP and the EU

In the framework of LGRDP extension, the LGRDP team conducted a joint analysis with the EU to farther develop the concept of Green Local Economic Development "GLED" project, several meetings with Team Europe Initiative (TEI)members took place, and draft concept paper and joint analysis report submitted to EU.

LGRDP and the NDC-Partnership

LGRDP, and other interventions designed under the new portfolio, contribute to the implementation of the recently developed NDC action plans. The action plans were developed by EQA with the support of the NDC-Partnership and was completed for 6 sectors of priority at the national level.

Supporting partners

LGRDP continue its support the Association of Palestinian Local Authorities (APLA) to in implementing the project for supporting & strengthening the ability of Palestinian Local Authorities to manage environmental and sanitation services in consortia (Territorial approach) in a complementarity of LGRDP clusters (Beita & Beit Leqya), the project is supported by Italian cooperation and will be implemented jointly with ANCI, FELCOS and the Municipality of Assisi

Other synergies and complementarities

No other synergies/ complementarities to mention.

7 Transversal themes

7.1 Environment and climate change

The ultimate concern of the intervention is to address climate change and environment challenges, so Environment and climate change are not "transversal themes" it's the core of the addendum.

The awareness raising of local communities in the cluster towards Environment and climate change is the main goal of communication during the addendum, it will be implemented in two levels, the first level will increase the community's awareness towards general environment and climate change causes that effects each community and develop a strategy towards increasing the actions by the communities to limit the effects of climate change and environment challenges in their communities. The second level will increase the community's awareness towards the environment project that will be implemented on their communities, increasing the public support for the project, ensuring the understating of its objectives, and encouraging them to guide the progress of the project.

Some of the eligible communication materials produced during the process will be shared and distributed to other clusters, the general Palestinian community to increase their awareness on the environmental challenges and climate change.

7.2 Gender

The intervention is taking the necessary measures to promote and mainstream gender balance participation in all stages of the intervention. Monitoring efforts to track this progress are taken while collecting data about gender participation in the activities of the intervention.

Also, it was indicated during the formulation of the local technical committees in each cluster to engage women in the membership of the committees, and this have been measured from the attendance list, as well as high % of women participation in and during the development of Environmental assessment and plans.

Women participation is encouraged among the partners to take part at all levels, local steering committee memberships, environmental assessment planning sessions, as well as other senior decision-making positions.

7.3 Digitisation

In order to shift into some green practices simple digital tools are being introduced to partners, e.g. QR codes to replace paper agenda, attendance sheets and questionnaires at workshops, E-tendering

Digital literacy skills and green practises are a priority key competence throughout the programme. Digital solutions for project management and implementation were implemented, such as on-line application, virtual exchange of expertise with expertise. LGRDP II team has initiated a serious of green practises and digital tools to promote green practises in the team and within the partners.

Online meetings were encouraged within the team and the partners.

Online solutions were developed to replace the use of papers in the attendance sheets, surveys, questionaries, applications, tenders, grants, meeting minutes, and reports development and signatures.

Collaborative documents development and production was shifted to online platforms (OneDrive, SharePoint).

New guidelines were developed to shift all the data and information storage to online platforms (OneDrive, SharePoint) instead of paper archiving.

Team members and partners are practicing a printing free, paper free, and plastic free policies.

separation of waste is implemented, and an agreement was signed with a company to recycle the office waste.

7.4 Decent work

Promotion of decent work principles are promoted and supported among the partners in all concerned work/ recruitment processes in the intervention. Fair opportunities, as well as minimum wages respect, health and safety measures, and collective governance principles are guiding the procedures of the interventions.

8 Lessons learned

8.1 The successes

 More inclusion: Expanding the boundaries of our already defined clusters to include additional neighbouring villages when preparing environmental and climate change assessments and strategic plans.

25

- **Continuous improvement:** Performed efforts of the intervention have led to integrate new LAs to the existing Cluster (Territorial development & integration) for both Yatta & Beit Leqya. This will multiply the expected impact of the intervention.
- Synergy to complement: the intervention has succeeded to create synergies with other donors like Italian development agency to create complementarity activities for the targeted clusters (Example Beit Leqya & Beita). The created synergy has also increased the responsiveness of the clusters plans to their actual needs while being in line with the newly adapted national agenda.
- Consistent support to partners: the intervention has succeeded to support APLA to develop their MAAP program and get 5 Years support from EC to its action plan.
- Bringing more accreditation: EQA has successfully joined the intervention's list of partners, adding value, and expertise in the field of environment and climate change.
- Learning institutionalization: The Learning Lab evolved into an experience Exchange
 platform and accompanied with a collective consent for further improvement and
 expansion.
- **NDC partnership:** This partnership will enhance the Palestinian representation through EQA on the international level through the support to the NDC in-country facilitator.

8.2 The Challenges

- Partner's expectations: the targeted clusters have high expectations from the
 intervention as a result of being vulnerable to many priorities at their local level. While
 the intervention limits the budget to meet the prioritized Green Initiatives for the selected
 clusters
- Gender balance: low level of Women participation to LTC.
- **Time challenge:** the coordination among the relatively high number of actors is time consuming, it\s effect increase in time of the pandemic.
- HR shortage: LGRDP is understaffed; mainly because of the resignation of one of the team members in May 2022. The resignation was during a period of high workload under LGRDP in addition to the work in the inception phase of the new portfolio, the work on the EU concept note and joint analysis. Contract and procurement related activities and tasks were supported by colleagues from other projects. During Q4 of 2022, the recruitment of two new members to join the team has started. The two staff members are expected to join during Q1 of 2023.

8.3 Strategic learning questions

As part of the preparations for the coming portfolio, Enabel intends to support the MoLG LED unit, "Beit Fajjar" municipality and a group of investors in validating some technical issues related to producing products (such as Calcium Carbonate) out of the slurry, which results from stone and marble cutting process. Once completed, "Beit Bajjar" model can be used as a reference for other geographical areas; and can be used for future interventions within the portfolio.

A ToR was developed together with MoLG for an expert from "Almadius' who has already a framework contract with Enabel, and accordingly; an expert's mission was organized in Palestine between the 9th and 15th of October 2022, where a set of meetings and field visits where organized with partners and stakeholders; stone cutting and slurry production facilities and materials' testing labs, a draft report was received from the expert's side on this regard; while the plan is to implement a set of physical and chemical tests for slurry samples in the next step, and to finalize the expert's report and recommendations' accordingly. These results and recommendations aim to serve "Beit Fajjar" project proposal at the first stage; but can also be used as a reference for other areas later.

8.4 Summary of lessons learned.

Lessons learned	Target group
Involvement of as much as potential/new partners/stakeholders at early stages is more effective, saving time and easily linked to national and local priorities.	Intervention, new portfolio committee, future interventions.
Identification of the intervention activities/ investment should rely on scientific, and participatory assessments including all concerned actors	Intervention, new portfolio committee, future interventions, partners.
lack of involvement of specific actors leads to inadequate implementation, and lack of ownership sense	Intervention, Partners
More time should be invested in planning, this leads to better understanding and consequently, better results	Intervention, new portfolio committee, future interventions, partners
Environmental projects & initiatives need intensive efforts on communication and community awareness to change the community's environmental culture.	Actors in the environment sectors, Partners, new portfolio committee
Clarity of roles and responsibilities for each actor/ partner, foster smooth and fruitful implementation	Intervention, new portfolio committee, future interventions, partners
Effective Environmental interventions and initiatives need allocating more resources	New portfolio committee, DGD
It is important to share plans, studies, or TORs with partners in its early stages of development, in order to collectively reach a consent regarding the expectations, and objectives of the activity/ deliverable	Intervention, new portfolio committee, future interventions, partners
Planning considering clear vision and strategy, leads to more effective results	Intervention, new portfolio committee, future interventions, partners
Deployment of MEAL tools leads to clear understanding, better planning, and performance tracking	Intervention, new portfolio committee, future interventions, Partners
Integration of communication strategies and plans in the implementation of the intervention leads to a more structured communication and awareness results	Intervention, new portfolio committee, future interventions, partners

9 Steering

9.1 Changes made to the intervention.

Green initiatives identification process

The bridging phase (TFF) addendum was designed with four pre-identified green initiatives, to be implemented in four clusters, based on short rapid consultancy on some needs identified during LGRDP II and supported by quick feasibility assessment studies.

At the kick-off of the addendum and in the first Technical Committee (TC) Meeting, the "pre-identification" of the green initiatives was under discussion among partners, where all agreed that there should be a strong basis to set priorities in each cluster and identify green initiatives accordingly. As a result of this TC meeting, a decision was made to start the "Environmental Assessment" study at the cluster level, which is a foreseen activity in the TFF, to be conducted as a first step. The outcomes of this Environmental Assessment were used to identify challenges and priorities in each cluster, prioritize green initiatives, design capacity building and awareness raising programs. Accordingly, this was reflected in the action plan, timeline and logframe.

Staff structure:

As previously mentioned, the ECA of the LGRDP has resigned in May 2022. There was no need to recruit a substitute as Enabel made a decision of having an "Admin, Finance and Contracting" support unit for all the interventions.

Modification of Log-frame

Significant modification of the indicators was made in the logframe that resulted from a collective participatory analysis exercise. This changed the perception of the team members to the project's activities and imposed a more structured action plan. Also, the activities designed upon the Environmental Assessment reports has introduced new indicators, related to the green initiatives' investment projects, awareness campaigns, and capacity building.

The need to this change was raised from the ambiguity of some indicators in the logframe and the difficulty of its measurement.

Involvement of EQA

As previously mentioned, EQA which is considered as a vital and valuable addition to the
partners list of the intervention finally became a voting member in the PSC. This came at
the time of needing more support and expertise in the field of climate change and
environment challenges.

9.2 Decisions taken by the Steering and monitoring committee

STC meetings that took place during the reporting period:

First SC: February 22,2022

Second SC: June 22, 2022

Third SC: August 22, 2022

- Forth SC: September 18, 2022

Decisions to take	Period of identification					
The First SC was a circulation via email to SC member	ers on February 22, 2022, :					
Approval on the annual report of 2021 for the LGRDP II Extension phase.	February 22,2022					
The Second PSC took place June22, 2022, and the decisions below were approved in						
this committee meeting:						
Approve LGRDP Action Plan for 2022						
Approve MDLF Grant Agreement to be signed after						
the OA is completed by Enabel						
Approve APLA Grant Agreement to be signed after the OA is completed by Enabel						
Approve the reallocation from						
"PZA1303311_A060301" to "PZA1303311_A060203"						
to support Community Green Initiatives						
submitted by clusters						
Approve to support capacity building activities for						
the clusters with the budget allocated for partners						
The two suggestions proposed by MoLG and MDLF						
to be discussed in a technical committee in the						
presence of EQA in order to:						
ensure alignment with LGRDPII addendum						
objectives ➤ avoid any duplication with EQA (regarding						
guidelines for CC impact)						
 budget availability 						
avoid overlapping between ARD Platform						
and the proposed LED network						
August 22, 2022						
Reallocation of (50,000) Euro from budget line						
PZA1303311_A060202 to allocate it for MDLF Grant Agreement.						
Grant Agreement.						
September 18, 2022						
Approval to transfer the below budget lines from						
Cog. to Reg., confirming this will not have any						
implication on the grant agreement terms to be						
signed with MDLF; PZA1303311_A060401						
PZA1303311_A060401 PZA1303311_A060402						
PZA1303311_A060403						

9.3 Considered strategic reorientations

- The future interventions will strategically consider the environment and climate change in every implemented action.
- Interventions will be based on assessment reports and strategic plans, considering the priorities of targeted localities that fall within the scope of Enabel.
- Community contribution in implementing the intervention activities (as much as possible) will enhance the ownership and sustainability of the intervention's outputs.

9.4 Recommendations

Recommendations	Actor	Deadline	
Support APLA in the implementation of SDGs localization plan	intervention	Q2-2023	
applying new tools to measure the impact of the green intervention	intervention	Q4-2023	
Enhance future synergies within Enabel interventions and crosscutting themes	Intervention	Q4-2023	
MOLG needs to reflect the updated guidelines and laws with the local Authorities building permits law	Steering committee	Q3-2023	
National partners need to develop joint action plan for supporting the climate change adaptation and mitigation	Steering committee	Q3-2023	
More Inclusion of local CBOs to engage the community members (youth, women) in the planning, implementation, and evaluating initiatives.	intervention	Q3-2023	

10 Annexes

10.1 Quality criteria

For each of the criteria (Relevance, Efficiency, Effectivity and Potential sustainability) several sub-criteria and statements regarding the latter have been formulated. By choosing the formulation that best corresponds to your intervention (add an 'X' to select a formulation) you can calculate the total score applicable to that specific criterion (see infra for calculation instructions).

		ows to calculate the total score for thi one 'C, no 'D' = C; at least one 'D' = E		At least one 'A', n	o 'C' or 'D' = A; t	two 'B's =
Арр	raisal	of RELEVANCE: Total score	А	В	С	D
1.1	1.1. W	hat is the current degree of relevant	ce of the intervention	n?		
	A	Clearly still anchored in national po aid effectiveness, extremely relevan			the commitme	ents on
	В	Still embedded in national policies and the Belgian strategy (even though not always explicitly so), relatively compatible with the commitments on aid effectiveness, relevant for the needs of the target group.				
	С	A few questions on consistency with national policies and the Belgian strategy, aid effectiveness or relevance.				
	D	Contradictions with national policies and the Belgian strategy, the commitments on aid effectiveness; doubts arise as to the relevance vis-à-vis the needs. Major changes are required.				
1.2	ls the	intervention logic as currently design	ned still the good o	ne?		
	A	Clear and well-structured intervention logic; vertical logic of objectives is achievable and coherent; appropriate indicators; risks and hypotheses clearly identified and managed; intervention exit strategy in place (if applicable).				
	В	Appropriate intervention logic even though it could need certain improvement in terms of hierarchy of objectives, indicators, risks and hypotheses.				
	С	Problems pertaining to the interven capacity to control and evaluate pro	tion logic could affo gress; improvemen	ect performance onts required.	of an intervention	on and its
	D	The intervention logic is faulty and requires an in-depth review for the intervention to possibly come to a good end.				

	2. EFFICIENCY OF IMPLEMENTATION TO DATE: A measure of how economically resources of the intervention (funds, expertise, time, etc.) are converted in results.					rvention	
	Do as follows to calculate the total score for this quality criterion: At least two 'A's, no 'C' or 'D' = A; two 'B's = B , no 'C' or 'D' = B ; at least one 'C, no 'D' = C ; at least one 'D' = D						
Арр	Appraisal of the EFFICIENCY: Total score						
2.1	2.1 To what extent have the inputs (finances, HR, goods & equipment) been managed correctly?						
	A	All inputs are available in time and within budget limits.					
	В	Most inputs are available within reasonable time and do not require considerable budgetary adjustments. Yet, there is still a certain margin for improvement possible.					
	The availability and use of inputs pose problems that must be resolved, otherwise the results could be at risk.					ults	
	D	The availability and management of the inputs is seriously lacking and threaten the achievement of the results. Considerable changes are required.					

2.2	2.2 To what extent has the implementation of activities been managed correctly?				
	A	Activities are implemented within timeframe.			
	В	Most activities are on schedule. Certain activities are delayed, but this has no impact on the delivery of outputs.			
	С	The activities are delayed. Corrective measures are required to allow delivery with not too much delay.			
	D	The activities are seriously behind schedule. Outputs can only be delivered if major changes are made to planning.			
2.3	2.3 To what extent are the outputs correctly achieved?				
	А	All outputs have been and will most likely be delivered on time and in good quality, which will contribute to the planned outcomes.			
	В	The outputs are and will most likely be delivered on time, but a certain margin for improvement is possible in terms of quality, coverage and timing.			
	C Certain outputs will not be delivered on time or in good quality. Adjustments are required.				
	D	The quality and delivery of the outputs most likely include and will include serious shortcomings. Considerable adjustments are required to guarantee at least that the key outputs are delivered on time.			

	FFECT of ye	IVENESS TO DATE: Extent to which t	he outcome (speci	fic objective) is ac	hieved as plann	ed at the
Do i B; a	as follo t least	ows to calculate the total score for th t one 'C, no 'D' = C; at least one 'D' = L	is quality criterion:)	At least one 'A', no	o 'C' or 'D' = A; t	wo 'B's =
Арр	raisal	of EFFECTIVENESS: Total score	А	В	С	D
3.1	At the	current stage of implementation, h	ow likely is the out	come to be realise	ed?	
	A	It is very likely that the outcome wi results (if any) have been mitigated	ll be fully achieved	in terms of quality	and coverage.	Negative
	В	The outcome will be achieved with had much of an impact.	a few minor restric	ctions; the negative	e effects (if any)	have not
	С	The outcome will be achieved only partially, among other things due to the negative effects to which the management was not able to fully adapt. Corrective measures should be taken to improve the likelihood of achieving the outcome.				
	D	The intervention will not achieve its outcome, unless significant fundamental measures are taken.			are	
3.2	Are th	e activities and outputs adapted (wh	nere applicable) in	view of achieving	the outcome?	
	A	The intervention succeeds to adapt its strategies/activities and outputs in function of the evolving external circumstances in view of achieving the outcome. Risks and hypotheses are managed proactively.				
	В	The intervention succeeds rather well to adapt its strategies in function of the evolving external circumstances in view of achieving the outcome. Risk management is rather passive.				
	С	The project has not fully succeeded circumstances in an appropriate wa change to the strategies seems nec	y or on time. Risk r	management is rat	her static. A maj	jor
	D	The intervention has not succeeded management was not up to par. Co	d to react to the ev	olving external circ are required to a	cumstances; risk	ome.

4. POTENTIAL SUSTAINABILITY: The degree intervention in the long run (beyond the impl	of likelihood to mementation period	naintain and repr d of the intervent	oduce the benefi	its of an
Do as follows to calculate the total score for this quality criterion: At least three 'A's, no 'C' or 'D' = A; maximum two 'C's, no 'D' = B; at least three 'C's, no 'D' = C; at least one 'D' = D				
Appraisal of POTENTIAL SUSTAINABILITY: Total score				

4.1	Financ	cial/economic sustainability?
	A	Financial/economic sustainability is potentially very good: Costs related to services and maintenance are covered or reasonable; external factors will have no incidence whatsoever on it.
	В	Financial/economic sustainability will most likely be good, but problems may arise in particular due to the evolution of external economic factors.
	С	The problems must be dealt with concerning financial sustainability either in terms of institutional costs or in relation to the target groups, or else in terms of the evolution of the economic context.
	D	Financial/economic sustainability is very questionable, unless major changes are made.
		is the degree of ownership of the intervention by the target groups and will it prevail after the assistance ends?
exte	A	The Steering Committee and other relevant local instances are strongly involved at all stages of execution and they are committed to continue to produce and use the results.
	В	Implementation is strongly based on the Steering Committee and other relevant local instances, which are also, to a certain extent, involved in the decision-making process. The likelihood that sustainability is achieved is good, but a certain margin for improvement is possible.
	С	The intervention mainly relies on punctual arrangements and on the Steering Committee and other relevant local instances to guarantee sustainability. The continuity of results is not guaranteed. Corrective measures are required.
	D	The intervention fully depends on punctual instances that offer no perspective whatsoever for sustainability. Fundamental changes are required to guarantee sustainability.
		is the level of policy support delivered and the degree of interaction between the intervention olicy level?
	А	The intervention receives full policy and institutional support and this support will continue.
	В	The intervention has, in general, received policy and institutional support for implementation, o at least has not been hindered in the matter and this support is most likely to be continued.
	С	The sustainability of the intervention is limited due to the absence of policy support. Corrective measures are required.
	D	Policies have been and will most likely be in contradiction with the intervention. Fundamental changes seem required to guarantee sustainability of the intervention.
4.4	To wh	at degree does the intervention contribute to institutional and management capacity?
	А	The intervention is integrated in the institutions and has contributed to improved institutional and management capacity (even though it is not an explicit objective).
	В	The management of the intervention is well integrated in the institutions and has contributed in a certain way to capacity development. Additional expertise may seem to be required. Improvement is possible in view of guaranteeing sustainability.
	С	The intervention relies too much on punctual instances rather than on institutions; capacity development has failed to fully guarantee sustainability. Corrective measures are required.
	D	The intervention relies on punctual instances and a transfer of competencies to existing institutions, which is to guarantee sustainability, is not likely unless fundamental changes are made.

10.2 Updated Logical framework and/or Theory of Change

Include the updated Logical framework and/or the Theory of Change if it has been profoundly changed over the past 12 months. Profound changes must be understood as: Changes to the formulation of results, new indicators, adapted or dropped indicators.

10.3 Monitoring of change management processes forms (optional)

Monitoring forms to be used for ongoing reflection or for an explicit research-action approach used by the intervention (See Content management guide).

Title Output 1
What is the assumption (1 phrase) leading to the intermediate outcome?
Is the Theory of Change (model, principles, values) underlying the assumption developed in an
explicit manner?
0 No
O Yes
0 Major changes made to the ToC during the year?
If so, which ones? (Adapted ToC may be attached.)
Which are the major decisions taken in the year to realise the change on the basis of the
assumption and which is their justification?
0 Decision 1 : 0 Justification Decision 1:
0 Decision 2: 0 Justification Decision 2:
Were there any opportunities in the context (specifically related to the result) that have facilitated
the change process and the achievement of the intermediate outcome?
Were there any major constraints in the context (specifically related to the result) that have
negatively influenced the change process and the achievement of the intermediate outcome?
Has the (research-action) change process been documented?
0 No.
0 Yes If yes, under which form?
in yes, under which form?
Has the documented change process been communicated in any way?
0 No
0 Yes
lf yes, under which form?

10.4 Summary of MoRe Results

Results or indicators of the logical framework changed during the last 12 months?	
Report of the Baseline registered in PIT?	NA
MTR Planning (registered report)	NA
ETR Planning (registered report)	1/1/2024
Backstopping missions since 01/01/2012	2

10.5 'Budget versus Actuals (2022 - December 31.)' Report

Deliver the 'Budget versus Actuals (2022 -12)' Report.

Annex (1), attached

10.6 Resources in terms of communication

In this optional Annex interventions should list all available materials (articles, books, videos, etc.) regarding the effects of the intervention on the beneficiaries, including studies, knowledge-building reports or (scientific) publications. The use of materials with client-centred approaches ('story telling') is greatly appreciated. Also indicate which documents or publications are related to strategic learning.

Documentation of the project: throughout the year Enabel and its partners were documenting the progress and achievements of the project. The documentation was used in developing the success stories and a series of posts on Enabel and its partners social media platforms.

https://www.facebook.com/EnabelinPalestine/posts/pfbid0ZbQrofop29TLcC6jn39v2MpqX5cSpquwfAQ NxqLwQX8Po3KUpVSKxdCQw2TU3nKil

https://www.facebook.com/EnabelinPalestine/posts/pfbid02QjFUXXFofb3TpYTasCGjE64GggYjF1K7c3LNze8upGjBKwbgvtZYfdQzoZuwP8iYl

https://www.facebook.com/EnabelinPalestine/posts/pfbid09gmimdaUMLhvosKbAYTqbveB7YZrAsdmuj8VUKchrBKz5W31hVK6dwA5VrvLQkrKl

https://www.facebook.com/EnabelinPalestine/posts/pfbid02y2CmdGxfCkNf62PBRg6GuRCB3oDXkDEE1
PyNfQVBsg4udo57XNfGSEahEQ8jGkVVI

https://www.facebook.com/EnabelinPalestine/posts/pfbid02n5N9PAgkbJPTxoNY88arwzB1jeWR6xMYg HC9AdRULhDo9TqaeXxBH6Xqnr75JrgPl

https://www.facebook.com/EnabelinPalestine/posts/pfbid0yGjFaDbkGau5Dca81eCTEEnqXz4AwLhqGgVvYcQZK5ziFLJMpyf31A7jr6TjiMu1l

https://www.facebook.com/EnabelinPalestine/posts/pfbid02YqHp7odoNN66u65Ah5eSeXJU6dGzhkDW K4A4B2Tig63S7AigiqQNBwULckU4SRual

https://www.facebook.com/EnabelinPalestine/posts/pfbid02biVTC68khkrXiUikdommTYWwj8kV8gvnH7JiFTMez6yfc1SUk8Dj5XCYkwnszyDal

 $\frac{https://www.facebook.com/EnabelinPalestine/posts/pfbid02o85xDrKSmJ5CaGWVyHbGqgKLPA14XmDz}{eXnf944W5BeCHgq9wpM9aF8rGMVSp5del}$

 $\frac{https://www.facebook.com/EnabelinPalestine/posts/pfbid0AwHcxCipnp3aw2VenYxuAepiC3UJGa75kTV}{gz1e7GizhaEycPDMsZh5hdmYyLT55I}$

https://www.facebook.com/EnabelinPalestine/posts/pfbid02hxCH3KpKTiv7Fzaj59pCMkdAuoS7XX4UNw1kfM6m3gEz3yGUbdkTERYuwiBnyWsyl

Communication Field visits and workshops to partners were conducted to train the partners under both results on communication, logos guidelines and procedures, coordinate the documentation of training, prepare success stories, sign Enabel consent forms, the use of social media, and the developing of success stories.